



**Lockwood, Andrews  
& Newnam, Inc.**  
A LEO A DALY COMPANY

August 30, 2016

Mr. Dean Bayer, PE  
Construction Group Project Manager  
City of San Antonio – TCI Department  
114 W. Commerce, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Antonio, TX 78205

**Re: 2017 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 1 – Award Recommendation Letter**

Dear Mr. Bayer:

On August 23, 2016, contractor bid proposals for the referenced project were opened and read aloud. Five bid proposals were submitted with no bids containing errors.

The low bidder for this contract is Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. with a total base bid of \$8,455,977.00. Clark Construction is headquartered in San Antonio, TX and has done a significant amount of asphalt overlay related projects for the City of San Antonio and others in the surrounding area. Clark Construction has been awarded similar contracts in recent years and the City of San Antonio has been pleased with their work. Due to no knowledge of poor performance which would exclude Clark Construction from being recommended for award, LAN recommends the award of this contract to Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. Below is a listing of the contractors who bid on the contract and their total base bids:

1. Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.	\$8,455,977.00
2. Asphalt Inc., dba Lone Star Paving	\$8,935,617.50
3. Angel Brothers Enterprises, Ltd.	\$9,149,817.50
4. J&P Paving Co., Inc.	\$9,430,759.40
5. Austin Materials, LLC.	\$14,755,597.50

Attached herewith are the following:

- 1) One (1) pdf copy of the bid tabulations
- 2) One (1) pdf copy of the summary of the low bidder's prices, which is 16.7% below the responsive contractor's bid proposal average and 14.6% below the Engineers Estimate.



**Lockwood, Andrews  
& Newnam, Inc.**  
A LEO A DALY COMPANY

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 499-5082, or by email at [sjaniol@lan-inc.com](mailto:sjaniol@lan-inc.com).

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Stephen Aniol, P.E.".

Stephen Aniol, P.E.  
Project Manager

Cc: Hector Reynoso  
Juan Romero



BID TABULATION			Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.		Engineer's Estimate		Unit Price Comparison		
Project: 2017 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 1			5140 Gibb Sprawls Rd. San Antonio, TX 78219 210-661-6785						
Bid Opening: Tuesday, August 23, 2016									
Owner: City of San Antonio Department of Transportation & Capital Improvements									
Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.									
10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082									
LAN Project No.: 120-11729-020			LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER						
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	DELTA	% DELTA
<b>BASE BID</b>									
103.1	REMOVE CONCRETE CURB	2,500	LF	\$1.25	\$3,125.00	\$1.60	\$4,000.00	(\$0.35)	-21.9%
103.3	REMOVE SIDEWALKS AND DRIVEWAYS	12,000	SF	\$1.00	\$12,000.00	\$1.50	\$18,000.00	(\$0.50)	-33.3%
203	TACK COAT	3,500	GAL	\$3.00	\$10,500.00	\$3.50	\$12,250.00	(\$0.50)	-14.3%
205.4A	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22)	4,650	TON	\$76.60	\$356,190.00	\$83.60	\$388,740.00	(\$7.00)	-8.4%
205.4B	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP)	2,000	TON	\$64.50	\$129,000.00	\$89.60	\$179,200.00	(\$25.10)	-28.0%
208.1	SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPH. PVM'T (2")	332,300	SY	\$0.75	\$249,225.00	\$2.85	\$947,055.00	(\$2.10)	-73.7%
230.3A	REPLACING BASE & PVM'T WITH TYPE B PVM'T (6" COMPACTED DEPTH)	23,200	TON	\$103.69	\$2,405,608.00	\$98.30	\$2,280,560.00	\$5.39	5.5%
230.3B	REPLACING BASE & PVM'T WITH TYPE B PVM'T (12" COMPACTED DEPTH)	1,000	TON	\$61.50	\$61,500.00	\$103.20	\$103,200.00	(\$41.70)	-40.4%
250	SEAL COAT	462,000	SY	\$1.04	\$480,480.00	\$1.60	\$739,200.00	(\$0.56)	-35.0%
340	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT, TYPE C (2" THICK) (PG 76-22) (CLASS "A" AGGREGATE)	45,200	TON	\$79.97	\$3,614,644.00	\$88.20	\$3,986,640.00	(\$8.23)	-9.3%
438	CLEANING EXISTING JOINTS	350	LF	\$15.00	\$5,250.00	\$14.20	\$4,970.00	\$0.80	5.6%
454	HEADER TYPE EXPANSION JOINT SEALANT	350	LF	\$52.00	\$18,200.00	\$33.60	\$11,760.00	\$18.40	54.8%
500	CONCRETE CURB, GUTTER, AND CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER	2,500	LF	\$14.00	\$35,000.00	\$13.60	\$34,000.00	\$0.40	2.9%
502.1	CONCRETE SIDEWALKS	1,250	SY	\$42.00	\$52,500.00	\$40.60	\$50,750.00	\$1.40	3.4%
502.1A	CURB RAMPS	280	EA	\$1,100.00	\$308,000.00	\$1,150.00	\$322,000.00	(\$50.00)	-4.3%
503.1	PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE DRIVEWAYS	450	SY	\$54.00	\$24,300.00	\$44.50	\$20,025.00	\$9.50	21.3%
512.1	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (STORM SEWER)	15	EA	\$425.00	\$6,375.00	\$400.00	\$6,000.00	\$25.00	6.3%
512.1B	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (AT&T)	15	EA	\$600.00	\$9,000.00	\$465.00	\$6,975.00	\$135.00	29.0%
515.1	TOPSOIL	450	CY	\$30.00	\$13,500.00	\$21.00	\$9,450.00	\$9.00	42.9%
516.1	SODDING	1,800	SY	\$9.00	\$16,200.00	\$6.00	\$10,800.00	\$3.00	50.0%
533-A	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4")	500	LF	\$1.00	\$500.00	\$0.85	\$425.00	\$0.15	17.6%
533-B	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8")	250	LF	\$2.00	\$500.00	\$1.30	\$325.00	\$0.70	53.8%
533-C	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12")	250	LF	\$3.00	\$750.00	\$1.90	\$475.00	\$1.10	57.9%
533-D	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24")	250	LF	\$4.00	\$1,000.00	\$3.20	\$800.00	\$0.80	25.0%
533-E	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL)	10	EA	\$85.00	\$850.00	\$92.00	\$920.00	(\$7.00)	-7.6%
533-F	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	10	EA	\$85.00	\$850.00	\$92.00	\$920.00	(\$7.00)	-7.6%
533-G	ELIM EXIST PVM'T MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (RR-XING)	10	EA	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$215.00	\$2,150.00	(\$15.00)	-7.0%
535.1	4" WIDE YELLOW LINE	130,000	LF	\$0.30	\$39,000.00	\$0.50	\$65,000.00	(\$0.20)	-40.0%
535.2	4" WIDE WHITE LINE	30,000	LF	\$0.30	\$9,000.00	\$0.50	\$15,000.00	(\$0.20)	-40.0%
535.4	8" SOLID WHITE LINE	4,500	LF	\$0.85	\$3,825.00	\$1.00	\$4,500.00	(\$0.15)	-15.0%
535.5	12" WIDE WHITE LINE	1,000	LF	\$3.00	\$3,000.00	\$3.60	\$3,600.00	(\$0.60)	-16.7%
535.7	24" WIDE WHITE LINE	3,000	LF	\$5.00	\$15,000.00	\$5.50	\$16,500.00	(\$0.50)	-9.1%
535.12	WORD "ONLY"	50	EA	\$110.00	\$5,500.00	\$120.00	\$6,000.00	(\$10.00)	-8.3%
535.14	RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL	5	EA	\$550.00	\$2,750.00	\$515.00	\$2,575.00	\$35.00	6.8%
535.16	STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY	55	EA	\$75.00	\$4,125.00	\$125.00	\$6,875.00	(\$50.00)	-40.0%
535.17	BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL	40	EA	\$110.00	\$4,400.00	\$220.00	\$8,800.00	(\$110.00)	-50.0%
535.22	WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE)	30	EA	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$160.00	\$4,800.00	(\$10.00)	-6.3%
535.23	WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT)	130	EA	\$95.00	\$12,350.00	\$105.00	\$13,650.00	(\$10.00)	-9.5%
537.1	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W)	160	EA	\$1.50	\$240.00	\$4.20	\$672.00	(\$2.70)	-64.3%
537.2	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y)	160	EA	\$1.50	\$240.00	\$4.20	\$672.00	(\$2.70)	-64.3%
537.6	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C)	3,000	EA	\$4.00	\$12,000.00	\$3.40	\$10,200.00	\$0.60	17.6%
537.8	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A)	3,000	EA	\$4.00	\$12,000.00	\$3.40	\$10,200.00	\$0.60	17.6%
537.9	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R)	500	EA	\$4.00	\$2,000.00	\$3.60	\$1,800.00	\$0.40	11.1%
556.1	CAST IN PLACE DETECTABLE WARNING SURFACE TILES	50	EA	\$100.00	\$5,000.00	\$130.00	\$6,500.00	(\$30.00)	-23.1%
624.2	GROUND BOXES TYPE B (122322)	10	EA	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$210.00	\$2,100.00	(\$10.00)	-4.8%
712	JOINT AND CRACK SEALING	6,000	LB	\$3.00	\$18,000.00	\$3.60	\$21,600.00	(\$0.60)	-16.7%
798	ASPHALT CONCRETE CUSHION SPEED HUMPS, TYPE 3	40	EA	\$1,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$2,400.00	\$96,000.00	(\$1,400.00)	-58.3%
SUP 1	DOOR HANGERS	1	LS	\$750.00	\$750.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	(\$250.00)	-25.0%
SUP 2	POLICE OFFICER	1,250	HR	\$45.00	\$56,250.00	\$47.00	\$58,750.00	(\$2.00)	-4.3%
SUP 3	RAILROAD INSURANCE AND PERMIT	1	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$0.00	0.0%
SUP 4	LAPTOP AND INTERNET ACCESS	1	LS	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$0.00	0.0%
SUP 5	TCI AT WORK P ROJECT SIGN	30	EA	\$200.00	\$6,000.00	\$250.00	\$7,500.00	(\$50.00)	-20.0%
SUP 6	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD)	20	MO	\$2,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$2,100.00	\$42,000.00	(\$100.00)	-4.8%
SUP 7	ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION	10	EA	\$1,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$2,600.00	\$26,000.00	(\$1,600.00)	-61.5%
<b>TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS:</b>					\$8,131,477.00		\$9,580,384.00		
826	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT	550	EA	\$200.00	\$110,000.00	\$205.00	\$112,750.00	(\$5.00)	-2.4%
826A	VALVE BOX LOCATE AND ADJUSTMENT (SAWS)	15	EA	\$50.00	\$750.00	\$105.00	\$1,575.00	(\$55.00)	-52.4%
<b>TOTAL SAWS WATER BID ITEMS:</b>					\$110,750.00		\$114,325.00		
851	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	400	EA	\$425.00	\$170,000.00	\$400.00	\$160,000.00	\$25.00	6.3%
851A	LOCATING AND ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	15	EA	\$50.00	\$750.00	\$200.00	\$3,000.00	(\$150.00)	-75.0%
<b>TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:</b>					\$170,750.00		\$163,000.00		
<b>TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:</b>					\$281,500.00		\$277,325.00		
512.1A	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLE (CPS ENERGY)	5	EA	\$600.00	\$3,000.00	\$205.00	\$1,025.00	\$395.00	192.7%
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	200	EA	\$200.00	\$40,000.00	\$205.00	\$41,000.00	(\$5.00)	-2.4%
<b>TOTAL CPS ENERGY BIT ITEMS:</b>					\$43,000.00		\$42,025.00		
<b>TOTAL BASE BID:</b>					\$8,455,977.00		\$9,899,734.00		