

# HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

August 17, 2016

Agenda Item No: 27

**HDRC CASE NO:** 2016-317  
**ADDRESS:** 906 E CROCKETT ST  
**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 583 BLK 8 LOT 8  
**ZONING:** RM4 H  
**CITY COUNCIL DIST.:** 2  
**DISTRICT:** Dignowity Hill Historic District  
**APPLICANT:** Joseph Garcia  
**OWNER:** Joseph Garcia  
**TYPE OF WORK:** Wood window replacement  
**REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install a wrought iron front yard fence featuring a height of 4' – 6" with a gate height of 6' – 6".
2. Replace ten historic wood windows with one over one vinyl windows.
3. Replace the existing, original wood siding with cement board siding.

## APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

*Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

1. Materials: Woodwork

### B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.
- ii. Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.
- iii. Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

### A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

### B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile

of the historic element.

- ii. New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

#### **FINDINGS:**

- a. The structure at 906 E Crockett was constructed circa 1925 in the Folk Victorian style and features a non-contributing rear addition constructed circa 1955. A stop work order was issued on Tuesday, July 19, 2016, for work being done without a Certificate of Appropriateness which included the replacement of the shingle roof. Prior to the replacement of the roof, there was also the replacement of original wood windows and original wood siding as well as the installation of a front yard fence and the construction of a rear covered patio.
- b. Staff finds the replacement of the existing shingle roof is consistent with the Guidelines and eligible for Administrative Approval.
- c. SIDING – The Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations states that when exterior woodwork is beyond repair, in-kind replacement siding should be installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. The introduction of modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials should not be introduced. The applicant has replaced the wood siding on each façade with cement siding. This is not consistent with the Guidelines.
- d. WINDOWS – The applicant has replaced ten historic wood windows with one over one vinyl windows. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.A.iii. historic window should be preserved. Additionally, per 6.B.iv., new windows should be installed to match the existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance and detail. The current vinyl replacement windows are neither appropriate nor consistent with the Guidelines.
- e. FENCING – Along the sidewalk, the applicant has installed a wrought iron fence featuring panels that vary in height from 4’ – 0” to 4’ – 6” and a gate that is 6’ – 6” in height. According to the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B., new fences should feature an appropriate design for the architecture of the house as well as the district and should feature an appropriate height, not to exceed four feet in height in the front yard. The current fence is neither appropriate nor consistent with the Guidelines.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff does not recommend approval of items #1 through #3 based on findings a through e. Staff recommends the following:

- 1. That the applicant reduce the height of the front yard fence to no more than four (4) feet in height.
- 2. That the applicant install wood windows comparable to the original wood windows.
- 3. That the applicant install wood siding comparable to the original wood siding.

If the HDRC approves the existing vinyl windows, staff recommends the applicant install wood screens that match the existing wood screens to screen the vinyl windows.

**CASE MANAGER:**

Edward Hall

**CASE COMMENT:**

The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.



## Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed: Aug 08, 2016

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.



906 East Crockett Street

E Crockett St

Armstrong Pl

Chase Alley

N Mesquite St

N Mesquite St

Armstrong Pl

E Crockett St

N Mesquite St

N Mesquite St

E Crockett St



906

CASA DE GARCIA

Please Seat Yourself















Low-E SC  
w/ Argon Gas

Low-E SC  
w/ Argon Gas







Low-E SC  
W/Argon Gas

Low-E SC  
W/Argon Gas

FRIGIDAIRE















## SELECTING AN APPROPRIATE REPLACEMENT

6.B.iv. *Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.*



### Recommended stipulations for replacement:

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

### Details to avoid:



- Vinyl product changes the material
- Window is not recessed within frame
- Sash components do not feature traditional dimensions



- Track insert alters profile
- Meeting rails thicker than original
- Low-e coating alters hue and reflectivity



- Window trim and sill detail not consistent with original

# SELECTING WINDOWS FOR NEW BUILDINGS

*3.A.i. Complementary materials—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district...*

## Windows used in new construction should:

- Maintain traditional dimensions and profiles;
- Be recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are not recommended;
- Feature traditional materials or appearance. Wood windows are most appropriate. Double-hung, block frame windows that feature alternative materials may be considered on a case-by-case basis;
- Feature traditional trim and sill details. Paired windows should be separated by a wood mullion.

The use of low-e glass is appropriate in new construction provided that hue and reflectivity are not drastically different from regular glass.

## Examples in New Construction:

