



January 9, 2018

Mr. Dean Bayer, PE
SMP Project Manager
City of San Antonio – TCI Department
114 W. Commerce, 9th Floor
San Antonio, TX 78205

Re: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 9 – Contract Award

Dear Mr. Bayer:

On January 5, 2018 contractor bid proposals for the referenced project were opened and read aloud. Four bid proposals were submitted with the bid submitted by Clark Construction containing rounding errors. This error did not impact the outcome of the contract award.

The lowest responsive bidder for this contract is J&P Paving Co Inc with a total base bid of \$8,234,645.90. J&P Paving is headquartered in San Antonio, TX and has done a significant amount of asphalt overlay related projects for the City of San Antonio and others in the surrounding area. J&P Paving has been awarded similar contracts of size and scope in recent years and the City of San Antonio has been pleased with their work. Due to no knowledge of poor performance which would exclude J&P Paving from being recommended for award, LAN recommends the award of this contract to J&P Paving Co Inc. Below is a listing of the contractors who bid on the contract and their total base bids:

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----------------|
| 1. J&P Paving C. Inc | \$8,234,645.90 |
| 2. Asphalt Inc. dba Lone Star Paving | \$8,330,912.50 |
| 3. Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. | \$8,647,745.30 |
| 4. Oldcastle Materials Texas, Inc. | \$9,498,298.85 |

Attached herewith are the following:

- 1) One (1) pdf copy of the bid tabulations
- 2) One (1) pdf copy of the summary of the low bidder's prices, which is 2.0% below the responsive contractor's bid proposal average and 8.5% below the Engineers Estimate. The bid submitted by Oldcastle Materials Texas was removed from the Contractor Average, as this bid is significantly higher than the remaining Contractor's bids and the Engineers estimate and is considered an outlier



**Lockwood, Andrews
& Newnam, Inc.**
A LEO A DALY COMPANY

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (210) 499-5082, or by email at sjaniol@lan-inc.com.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Stephen Aniol, P.E.".

Stephen Aniol, P.E.
Senior Project Manager

Cc: Juan Romero
Francisco Valdez

| BID TABULATION | | | | J&P Paving Co Inc 5002 Sinclair Rd. San Antonio, TX 78222 210-648-4708 | | Asphalt Inc. dba Lone Star Paving 4310 Jung Rd., Bldg 2 San Antonio, TX 78247 210-463-9966 | | Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. 5140 Gibbs Sprawl Rd. San Antonio, TX 78219 210-661-6785 | | Oldcastle Materials Texas, Inc 5723 University Heights Blvd, Ste 115 San Antonio, TX 78249 210-654-5576 | | Engineer's Estimate | | Contractor Average | |
|--|---|----------|------|---|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|--|-----------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|
| Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 9 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Bid Opening: Friday, January 5, 2018 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc. 10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| LAN Project No.: 120-12032-008 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ITEM | DESCRIPTION | QUANTITY | UNIT | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | AVG UNIT PRICE | TOTAL |
| 851 | ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS) | 200 | EA | \$300.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$145.00 | \$29,000.00 | \$350.00 | \$70,000.00 | \$425.00 | \$85,000.00 | \$315.00 | \$63,000.00 | \$265.00 | \$53,000.00 |
| 851A | LOCATING AND ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS) | 20 | EA | \$1.00 | \$20.00 | \$145.00 | \$2,900.00 | \$50.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$520.00 | \$10,400.00 | \$150.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$65.33 | \$1,306.67 |
| TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$60,020.00 | | \$31,900.00 | | \$71,000.00 | | \$95,400.00 | | \$66,000.00 | | \$54,306.67 |
| TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$120,040.00 | | \$78,300.00 | | \$132,000.00 | | \$144,500.00 | | \$123,500.00 | | \$110,113.33 |
| 512.3A | ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY) | 100 | EA | \$200.00 | \$20,000.00 | \$145.00 | \$14,500.00 | \$200.00 | \$20,000.00 | \$225.00 | \$22,500.00 | \$210.00 | \$21,000.00 | \$181.67 | \$18,166.67 |
| TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$20,000.00 | | \$14,500.00 | | \$20,000.00 | | \$22,500.00 | | \$21,000.00 | | \$18,166.67 |
| TOTAL BASE BID: | | | | | \$8,234,645.90 | | \$8,330,912.50 | | \$8,647,745.30 | | \$9,498,298.85 | | \$9,000,011.00 | | \$8,404,434.57 |

BID TABULATION

Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 9

Bid Opening: Friday, January 5, 2018

Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department

Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.

10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082

LAN Project No.: 120-12032-008

J&P Paving Co Inc
5002 Sinclair Rd.
San Antonio, TX 78222
210-648-4708

Engineer's Estimate

Unit Price Comparison

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER

| ITEM | DESCRIPTION | QUANTITY | UNIT | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | DELTA | % DELTA |
|-----------------|--|----------|------|------------|----------------|------------|----------------|------------|---------|
| BASE BID | | | | | | | | | |
| 103.1 | REMOVE CONCRETE CURB | 5,600 | LF | \$1.07 | \$5,992.00 | \$1.75 | \$9,800.00 | (\$0.68) | -38.9% |
| 103.3 | REMOVE SIDEWALKS AND DRIVEWAYS | 22,500 | SF | \$0.81 | \$18,225.00 | \$1.75 | \$39,375.00 | (\$0.94) | -53.7% |
| 203 | TACK COAT | 5,600 | GAL | \$1.00 | \$5,600.00 | \$2.50 | \$14,000.00 | (\$1.50) | -60.0% |
| 205.4A | HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22) | 33,230 | TON | \$52.53 | \$1,745,571.90 | \$57.20 | \$1,900,756.00 | (\$4.67) | -8.2% |
| 205.4B | HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP) | 8,000 | TON | \$52.25 | \$418,000.00 | \$57.50 | \$460,000.00 | (\$5.25) | -9.1% |
| 208.1 | SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPH. PVM'T (2") | 425,600 | SY | \$1.26 | \$536,256.00 | \$1.35 | \$574,560.00 | (\$0.09) | -6.7% |
| 230.3A | REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (6" COMPACTED DEPTH) | 27,400 | TON | \$67.25 | \$1,842,650.00 | \$69.00 | \$1,890,600.00 | (\$1.75) | -2.5% |
| 230.3B | REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (12" COMPACTED DEPTH) | 3,200 | TON | \$61.16 | \$195,712.00 | \$63.00 | \$201,600.00 | (\$1.84) | -2.9% |
| 250 | SEAL COAT | 567,100 | SY | \$0.87 | \$493,377.00 | \$1.20 | \$680,520.00 | (\$0.33) | -27.5% |
| 30.6 | HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT, TYPE C (2" THICK) (PG 76-22) (CLASS "A" AGGREGATE) | 29,150 | TON | \$60.25 | \$1,756,287.50 | \$65.20 | \$1,900,580.00 | (\$4.95) | -7.6% |
| 438 | CLEANING EXISTING JOINTS | 550 | LF | \$1.00 | \$550.00 | \$5.20 | \$2,860.00 | (\$4.20) | -80.8% |
| 454 | HEADER TYPE EXPANSION JOINT SEALANT | 550 | LF | \$1.00 | \$550.00 | \$26.50 | \$14,575.00 | (\$25.50) | -96.2% |
| 500 | CONCRETE CURB, GUTTER, AND CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER | 5,600 | LF | \$12.00 | \$67,200.00 | \$15.00 | \$84,000.00 | (\$3.00) | -20.0% |
| 502.1 | CONCRETE SIDEWALKS | 2,500 | SY | \$37.60 | \$94,000.00 | \$44.00 | \$110,000.00 | (\$6.40) | -14.5% |
| 502.1A | CURB RAMPS | 350 | EA | \$1,100.00 | \$385,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$350,000.00 | \$100.00 | 10.0% |
| 503.1 | PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE DRIVEWAYS | 1,125 | SY | \$43.36 | \$48,780.00 | \$45.00 | \$50,625.00 | (\$1.64) | -3.6% |
| 512.1 | ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (STORM SEWER) | 20 | EA | \$300.00 | \$6,000.00 | \$320.00 | \$6,400.00 | (\$20.00) | -6.3% |
| 512.1B | ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (AT&T) | 20 | EA | \$300.00 | \$6,000.00 | \$365.00 | \$7,300.00 | (\$65.00) | -17.8% |
| 515.1 | TOPSOIL | 125 | CY | \$20.00 | \$2,500.00 | \$30.00 | \$3,750.00 | (\$10.00) | -33.3% |
| 516.1 | SODDING | 3,500 | SY | \$5.00 | \$17,500.00 | \$6.00 | \$21,000.00 | (\$1.00) | -16.7% |
| 533-A | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4") | 1,200 | LF | \$0.45 | \$540.00 | \$0.55 | \$660.00 | (\$0.10) | -18.2% |
| 533-B | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8") | 600 | LF | \$0.90 | \$540.00 | \$1.20 | \$720.00 | (\$0.30) | -25.0% |
| 533-C | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12") | 600 | LF | \$1.90 | \$1,140.00 | \$1.80 | \$1,080.00 | \$0.10 | 5.6% |
| 533-D | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24") | 600 | LF | \$3.30 | \$1,980.00 | \$2.90 | \$1,740.00 | \$0.40 | 13.8% |
| 533-E | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL) | 20 | EA | \$60.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$65.00 | \$1,300.00 | (\$5.00) | -7.7% |
| 533-F | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD) | 20 | EA | \$60.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$65.00 | \$1,300.00 | (\$5.00) | -7.7% |
| 533-G | ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (RR-XING) | 20 | EA | \$73.00 | \$1,460.00 | \$220.00 | \$4,400.00 | (\$147.00) | -66.8% |
| 535.1 | 4" WIDE YELLOW LINE | 168,750 | LF | \$0.38 | \$64,125.00 | \$0.38 | \$64,125.00 | \$0.00 | 0.0% |
| 535.2 | 4" WIDE WHITE LINE | 40,000 | LF | \$0.38 | \$15,200.00 | \$0.38 | \$15,200.00 | \$0.00 | 0.0% |
| 535.4 | 8" SOLID WHITE LINE | 5,600 | LF | \$0.83 | \$4,648.00 | \$0.85 | \$4,760.00 | (\$0.02) | -2.4% |
| 535.5 | 12" WIDE WHITE LINE | 1,700 | LF | \$2.33 | \$3,961.00 | \$2.55 | \$4,335.00 | (\$0.22) | -8.6% |
| 535.7 | 24" WIDE WHITE LINE | 1,000 | LF | \$4.80 | \$4,800.00 | \$5.35 | \$5,350.00 | (\$0.55) | -10.3% |
| 535.7A | 24" WIDE WHITE LINE (CROSSWALK - HIGH CONTRAST) | 3,200 | LF | \$21.25 | \$68,000.00 | \$23.50 | \$75,200.00 | (\$2.25) | -9.6% |
| 535.12 | WORD "ONLY" | 70 | EA | \$97.00 | \$6,790.00 | \$117.00 | \$8,190.00 | (\$20.00) | -17.1% |
| 535.14 | RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL | 20 | EA | \$450.00 | \$9,000.00 | \$475.00 | \$9,500.00 | (\$25.00) | -5.3% |
| 535.16 | STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY | 70 | EA | \$100.00 | \$7,000.00 | \$95.00 | \$6,650.00 | \$5.00 | 5.3% |
| 535.17 | BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL | 60 | EA | \$250.00 | \$15,000.00 | \$200.00 | \$12,000.00 | \$50.00 | 25.0% |
| 535.22 | WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE) | 50 | EA | \$112.00 | \$5,600.00 | \$125.00 | \$6,250.00 | (\$13.00) | -10.4% |
| 535.23 | WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT) | 170 | EA | \$83.00 | \$14,110.00 | \$100.00 | \$17,000.00 | (\$17.00) | -17.0% |
| 537.1 | TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W) | 300 | EA | \$5.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$4.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$1.00 | 25.0% |
| 537.2 | TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y) | 300 | EA | \$5.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$4.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$1.00 | 25.0% |
| 537.6 | PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C) | 5,600 | EA | \$3.33 | \$18,648.00 | \$3.50 | \$19,600.00 | (\$0.17) | -4.9% |
| 537.8 | PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A) | 5,600 | EA | \$3.33 | \$18,648.00 | \$3.30 | \$18,480.00 | \$0.03 | 0.9% |
| 537.9 | PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R) | 1,150 | EA | \$3.33 | \$3,829.50 | \$3.30 | \$3,795.00 | \$0.03 | 0.9% |
| 556.1 | CAST IN PLACE DETECTABLE WARNING SURFACE TILES | 85 | EA | \$99.00 | \$8,415.00 | \$250.00 | \$21,250.00 | (\$151.00) | -60.4% |
| 624.2 | GROUND BOXES TYPE B (122322) | 15 | EA | \$10.00 | \$150.00 | \$315.00 | \$4,725.00 | (\$305.00) | -96.8% |
| 712 | JOINT AND CRACK SEALING | 9,000 | LB | \$2.50 | \$22,500.00 | \$4.50 | \$40,500.00 | (\$2.00) | -44.4% |

BID TABULATION

Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 9

Bid Opening: Friday, January 5, 2018

Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department

Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.

10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082

LAN Project No.: 120-12032-008

J&P Paving Co Inc
5002 Sinclair Rd.
San Antonio, TX 78222
210-648-4708

Engineer's Estimate

Unit Price Comparison

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER

| ITEM | DESCRIPTION | QUANTITY | UNIT | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL | DELTA | % DELTA |
|------------------------------------|---|----------|------|------------|-----------------------|------------|-----------------------|--------------|---------|
| 798 | ASPHALT CONCRETE CUSHION SPEED HUMPS, TYPE 3 | 600 | LF | \$74.95 | \$44,970.00 | \$100.00 | \$60,000.00 | | |
| SUP 1 | DOOR HANGERS | 1 | LS | \$800.00 | \$800.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | | |
| SUP 2 | POLICE OFFICER | 1,650 | HR | \$40.00 | \$66,000.00 | \$40.00 | \$66,000.00 | \$0.00 | 0.0% |
| SUP 3 | RAILROAD INSURANCE AND PERMIT | 1 | LS | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$0.00 | 0.0% |
| SUP 4 | LAPTOP AND INTERNET ACCESS | 1 | LS | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$1,500.00 | (\$500.00) | -33.3% |
| SUP 5 | TCI PROJECT SIGN | 30 | EA | \$100.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$140.00 | \$4,200.00 | (\$40.00) | -28.6% |
| SUP 6 | PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD) | 24 | MO | \$900.00 | \$21,600.00 | \$1,250.00 | \$30,000.00 | (\$350.00) | -28.0% |
| SUP 7 | ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION | 10 | EA | \$500.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$15,000.00 | (\$1,000.00) | -66.7% |
| TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$8,094,605.90 | | \$8,855,511.00 | | |
| 826 | SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT | 300 | EA | \$200.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$185.00 | \$55,500.00 | \$15.00 | 8.1% |
| 826A | VALVE BOX LOCATE AND ADJUSTMENT (SAWS) | 20 | EA | \$1.00 | \$20.00 | \$100.00 | \$2,000.00 | (\$99.00) | -99.0% |
| TOTAL SAWS WATER BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$60,020.00 | | \$57,500.00 | | |
| 851 | ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS) | 200 | EA | \$300.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$315.00 | \$63,000.00 | (\$15.00) | -4.8% |
| 851A | LOCATING AND ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS) | 20 | EA | \$1.00 | \$20.00 | \$150.00 | \$3,000.00 | (\$149.00) | -99.3% |
| TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$60,020.00 | | \$66,000.00 | | |
| TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$120,040.00 | | \$123,500.00 | | |
| 512.3A | ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY) | 100 | EA | \$200.00 | \$20,000.00 | \$210.00 | \$21,000.00 | (\$10.00) | -4.8% |
| TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS: | | | | | \$20,000.00 | | \$21,000.00 | | |
| TOTAL BASE BID: | | | | | \$8,234,645.90 | | \$9,000,011.00 | | |