



**City of San Antonio
Council Job Evaluation Report**

January 10, 2020

Completed by:

Stephen E. Werling, DBA, SPHR

Werling Associates, Inc.
11845 IH-10 West, Suite 407
San Antonio, TX 78230
Telephone: 210-697-8232
steve@werling.com

Copyright ©2020 by Werling Associates, Inc.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
ASSUMPTIONS AND OBSERVATIONS	1
ORGANIZATION INFORMATION	1
PAY STRUCTURE	2
JOB EVALUATION PROCESS	2
MARKET DATA	2
CITY OF SAN ANTONIO PAY PLAN	2
JOB EVALUATIONS	3
Chief of Staff	3
Zoning/Planning Director	5
Special Assistant to Council	8
Policy Director.....	9
Event Services Director	10
Communications Director.....	11
Constituent Services Director	14
Constituent Services Representative II.....	15
Constituent Services Representative I.....	17
RECOMMENDATIONS SUMMARY	19
PAY GRADES AND INDIVIDUAL PAY	19
Pay Grade Assignments.....	21
Annual Increases.....	21
EXHIBITS	
Exhibit 1 – Pay Structure.....	22
Exhibit 2 – Survey Results	23

INTRODUCTION

Werling Associates, Inc. provides this report in response to the Contract for Services dated November 14, 2019. The contract scope includes three items.

- Conduct a compensation review for up to 15 jobs within the City to determine the appropriate pay range for each job.
- Validate job descriptions to market data and provide pay recommendation guidelines with flexibility and consideration for uniqueness of each City Council District.
- Present final results of the compensation review to the City including a recommendation of a pay structure consistent with the City structure for similar duties and responsibilities.

ASSUMPTIONS AND OBSERVATIONS

There are several assumptions and observations that influence the job evaluation process.

- The job descriptions are complete, accurate, and up-to-date.
- The job evaluation process considered the lowest level of education and experience listed on the job description when making survey comparisons.
- Jobs with a Director title do not match the duties and education/experience requirements of the typical definition of Director used in most organizations.
- The market survey averages represent the best estimate for the pay of a fully qualified individual. The market estimates provide the primary foundation for estimating a logical range of base pay for the position.
- The Council jobs focus on responses to constituent inquiries and liaison activities between the Council member and the City departments. The jobs have very similar education and experience requirements.

ORGANIZATION INFORMATION

The job evaluation used a broad set of information provided by the City Staff.

- Job description for each job under review
- Resumes from twelve employees
- Job Analysis Questionnaires from 46 employees
- Work samples from 15 employees
- Survey data from a small set of cities
- City 2020 pay plans and pay grade assignment for each City job
- Job descriptions for all City jobs
- Wage data and job title for each employee
- Cost of living pay adjustment history FY 1999 to FY 2019
- CCR Eligible Council Aide Compensation, dated August 8, 2019

The City Compensation Manager also provided answers to several questions concerning the City's minimum wage and clarification of specific job titles.

PAY STRUCTURE

The project uses the City's Pay Plan structure for the analysis to maintain a 50% range for each job, except the Constituent Services Representative I and the Constituent Services Representative II. The two levels result in a 30.6% pay range. Exhibit 1 provides the pay structures.

JOB EVALUATION PROCESS

The project uses a market based job evaluation process to evaluate the jobs and determine the appropriate pay grade assignments. The market based job evaluation process uses elements from traditional market pricing and job evaluation methods to establish the appropriate pay grade for each job. The market pricing provides the benchmark information, while the job evaluation process considers internal factors such as the job responsibilities, internal labor markets, and unique jobs.

The market pricing process establishes the foundation for the pay system on the most critical element of wage determination, the external market rate for the job. The market rate and the organization's response to the market rate have a direct impact on the organization's ability to attract and retain skilled employees. The market pricing process assigns the job to the pay grade that most closely matches the survey average.

The job evaluation portion of the process uses the similarity between jobs and internal relationships to establish the pay grade where there is no available market data, not a direct match to a City job, or where the job contains unique activities or combination of activities from other jobs. The similarity between jobs provides the most direct information to establish an appropriate pay grade. The differences between jobs provide a basis for establishing the pay grade assignment by using established patterns of compensation decision making.

MARKET DATA

The project includes data from two salary surveys: a custom salary survey of seven comparable cities; and the 2019 San Antonio Area Wage and Benefit Survey.

Comparable City Survey

The City staff conducted a salary survey of eight comparable cities. The results, shown in Exhibit 2, do not provide any useful information for the study. The survey results do not show any job titles similar to the City of San Antonio Council jobs.

San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey

The San Antonio Area Wage and Benefit Survey provides comprehensive market data, collected from 78 organizations in the San Antonio Area. The data used from the San Antonio Area Wage and Benefit Survey was current as of January 1, 2019, and is adjusted for wage inflation at 3% to January 1, 2020.

CITY OF SAN ANTONIO PAY PLAN

The project also compared the education, experience, job duties, reporting relationships, and other job related factors to identify similar job within the 2020 City of San Antonio pay plan. The similarity

between jobs provides the most direct information to establish an appropriate pay grade. The differences between jobs provide a basis for establishing the pay grade assignment by using established patterns of compensation decision making.

Level II jobs in a career path tend to be one pay grade, or approximately 8% to 10% above the Level I job. Supervisors tend to be two to three pay grades or 25% to 30% above the jobs reporting to the supervisor. Pay grades for support jobs tend to be related to the level the supported job. An assistant to an executive are in a higher pay grade than a similar assistant to a manager. Pay grades also differ based on the scope of responsibility. Jobs at the department level tend to be two to three pay grades or 25% to 30% below than the same job that supports the entire organization, depending on size of the department compared to the size of the organization.

2020 City of San Antonio Pay Plan

The project uses information from the 2020 City Pay Plan to assist in determining the appropriate pay grade for each job. The City Pay Plan and job descriptions provided the most useful information for the project.

JOB EVALUATIONS

Chief of Staff

The Chief of Staff performs a wide variety of professional duties involved in the coordination of the activities of the Elected Official with City Departments and external organizations; provides information and assistance to constituents; and plans, organizes and coordinates complex research, analytical and administrative functions for the Elected Official. The Chief of Staff coordinates the daily operations of the District office and exercises supervision over the District staff.

The Chief of Staff job requires a Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Political Science, Public Administration, Business Administration or related field; Five years of increasingly responsible administrative, customer service, problem solving; or a combination of education and experience.

San Antonio General Market

The San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey does not provide a match for the Chief of Staff.

City of San Antonio Job Match

There are three City of San Antonio jobs that provide assistance in establishing the appropriate pay grade for the Chief of Staff. Table 1 provides the job title, job summary, and education/experience requirements for each job.

The Assistant to the Mayor provides the closest match to the duties, experience, and education requirements for the Chief of Staff. The Assistant to the City Council job description also includes many of the duties of the Chief of Staff. Both positions have education and experience requirements that match the requirements for the Chief of Staff.

The primary difference between the Assistant to the Mayor and the Assistant to the City Council jobs compared to the Chief of Staff is the scope of responsibility. The City jobs cover the entire City Council

and Mayor, rather than a smaller Council level operation. In addition, the City considers the jobs to be Executive positions.

The City of San Antonio Special Projects Manager job provides information for a department level job that covers project management duties in a broad range of departments. The Special Projects Manager provides the potential match to the Chief of Staff at the department level. The Special Project Manager contains some duties and responsibilities that are not found in the Chief of Staff position that requires a high degree of specialized knowledge and involves the implementation of solutions. The Chief of Staff does not require specialized knowledge of any operational area and does not oversee the implementation of projects, but does require knowledge across multiple departments.

Table 1

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Assistant to the Mayor	Under direction, is responsible for maintaining communication between the Mayor, the City Council, the City staff, citizens and the media; responds to and answers, on behalf of the Mayor, inquiries and complaints from the public and provides highly responsible and complex administrative support to the Mayor. Exercises direct supervision over staff.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Business Administration, Public Administration, Communication, or a related field. Five (5) years of increasingly responsible professional and administrative research and analytical experience, or equivalent combination of education and experience.
Assistant to City Council	Responsible for maintaining communication between the City Council, the Mayor, City staff, citizens and the media; responds to inquiries and complaints from the public on behalf of the Council; and provides highly responsible and complex administrative support to members of the City Council. Exercises direct supervision over staff.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Business Administration, Public Administration, Communications or a related field. Five (5) years of increasingly responsible professional and administrative research and analytical experience in a municipal government; or equivalent combination of education and experience.

Table 1 (cont.)

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Special Projects Manager	Responsible for managing and coordinating complex administrative projects or activities that require a high degree of specialized knowledge. Conducts research, provides data, makes recommendations, and implements solutions to achieve project goals and objectives. Exercises direct supervision over assigned staff.	Bachelor’s Degree from an accredited college or university. Three (3) years of increasingly responsible experience in planning, business, finance, or a related field. Two (2) years of supervisory experience

Table 2 provides the City’s pay grade and pay range for each job.

Table 2

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Special Projects Manager	534	61,626.50	83,195.71	104,764.92
Assistant to the City Council	600	92,718.08	120,533.40	148,348.72
Assistant to the Mayor	600	92,718.08	120,533.40	148,348.72

Recommended Pay Grade

The Chief of Staff has very similar job responsibility compared to the Assistant to the City Council and to the Assistant to the Mayor. The primary difference is the scope of oversight at the City level versus the Council level.

The primary differences between the Chief of Staff and the City jobs is the scope of the Council level duties versus the City-wide duties. The difference in scope suggests that the Chief of Staff pay grade should be two to three pay grades below the Assistant to the City Council and Assistant to the Mayor pay grade, or a 25% to 30%. The job evaluation assigns the Chief of Staff to pay grade 528 to establish a 25% to 30% differential with the City-wide jobs and a starting pay above the Special Projects Manager. Pay grade 528 also establishes 50% range used for the other Council jobs. Table 3 provides the recommended pay grade and pay range.

Table 3

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Chief of Staff	528	70,120.96	87,651.20	105,181.44

Zoning/Planning Director

The Zoning/Planning Director performs a wide variety of professional duties involved in the coordination of the activities of the assigned Council Member with City Departments and external organizations in reference to Planning and Zoning; provides information and assistance to the Council Member concerning policy issues; and plans, organizes and coordinates complex research, analytical and administrative functions for the City Council Member.

The job requires a Bachelor’s Degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Political Science, Public Administration, Business Administration or related field; two years of increasingly responsible administrative, customer service, and problem solving; or a combination of education and experience.

The Zoning/Planning Director job does not include any duties typically assigned to a Director level job. The Zoning/Planning Director is not directly involved in zoning or planning activities in some Districts where the Zoning/Planning Director is a liaison between the City departments and the constituents. In addition, the Zoning/Planning Director requires two years of administrative, customer service, and problem solving but does not require any background in zoning or planning.

San Antonio General Market

The San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey does not contain any data for the Zoning/Planning Director.

Related City of San Antonio Jobs

The City of San Antonio has several jobs that are related to the Zoning/Planning Director. Table 4 provides the job title, job summary, and education/experience requirements for each job.

Table 4

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Planning Manager	Performs administrative and supervisory work requiring extensive knowledge and ability in the field of Urban Planning. Assists with the administration of planning studies and programs. Work involves responsibility for maintaining existing programs and developing new, innovative planning programs in support of the general plan for the comprehensive development of the City. Responsible for the formulation, coordination, and research of specialized planning activities. Exercises direct supervision over assigned staff.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university. Five (5) years of increasingly responsible urban planning experience to include two (2) years supervisory or management experience.
Principal Planner	Performs highly complex professional planning activities involving advanced planning and special projects. Work involves assisting in directing, coordinating, and overseeing the activities and operations of assigned section. Exercises direct supervision over assigned staff.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university. Four (4) years of increasingly responsible urban planning experience to include one (1) year of supervisory or lead work experience. Preferred: An advanced degree in Urban Planning, Urban Design, Architecture or closely related field.

Table 4 (Cont.)

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Planning Coordinator	Responsible for performing a variety of complex level planning work including directing and coordinating municipal planning programs and projects, researching, analyzing and interpreting data. Exercises functional supervision over assigned staff.	<p>Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university.</p> <p>Three (3) years increasingly responsible urban planning experience.</p> <p>Preferred: An advanced degree in Urban Planning or closely related field.</p>
Senior Planner	Responsible for performing complex planning and supervisory work, responsible for the supervision of a section within the City's Planning & Development Services Department. Responsibilities include the development of recommendations on planning and zoning issues, staffing of boards and committees and the review of work performed by subordinate planners. May exercise direct supervision over assigned staff.	<p>Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university.</p> <p>Two (2) years increasingly responsible urban planning experience to include one (1) year of supervisory or lead work experience.</p>
Planner	Performs professional planning work with both administrative and technical responsibilities in comprehensive short and long range planning. May exercise functional supervision over assigned staff.	<p>Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university.</p> <p>One (1) year of planning experience.</p>
Sr. Development Services Specialist	Responsible for providing consultation related services and reviewing residential and commercial development projects. Processes various development requests and applications. May exercise functional supervision over assigned staff.	<p>Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university.</p> <p>Two (2) years of experience processing development related projects or supervising customer service activity.</p> <p>Must obtain an International Code Council (ICC) Certification as a Permit Technician within one (1) year of employment.</p>

Table 5 provides the City's pay grade and pay range for each job.

Table 5

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Planning Manager	534	61,626.50	83,195.71	104,764.92
Principal Planner	526	57,950.88	72,438.47	86,926.06
Planning Coordinator	525	52,682.50	65,853.32	79,024.14
Senior Planner	524	47,893.56	59,866.95	71,840.34
Planner	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78
Sr. Development Services Specialist	511	42,485.30	47,361.08	52,236.86

Recommended Pay Grade

The Zoning/Planning Director duties, education, and experience most closely matches the Planner in pay grade 522. The job evaluation assigns the job to pay grade 523 to match the other Council position with similar responsibilities and education/experience requirements. Table 6 provides the recommended pay grade and pay range.

Table 6

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Zoning/Planning Director	523	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66

Special Assistant to Council

The Special Assistant to Council provides responsive and confidential work assisting the Council Member. Work involves coordinating public appearances, media requests, and escalated issues. Works closely with individuals, advocacy groups and other associations to address concerns, provide information, and develop responses. Works on complex programs or projects as directed by the Council Member or Chief of Staff. May exercise supervision over assigned staff.

The Special Assistant to Council requires a Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university; two (2) years of related professional experience; or an equivalent combination of education and experience.

The Special Assistant to Council job description includes work on complex projects, job duties that are comparable to the duties listed in other Council jobs, response to constituent questions, liaison between Council Member and community, and provides policy explanations to community leaders. Many of the duties match the duties of the Director jobs in the Council.

San Antonio General Market

The San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey does not contain any data for the Special Assistant to Council.

Related City of San Antonio Jobs

The Special Assistant to Council job description includes work on complex projects, job duties that are comparable to the duties listed in other Council jobs, response to constituent questions, liaison between Council Member and the community, provide policy explanations to community leaders. Many of the duties match the duties of the other Council Director jobs. The broad nature of the job does not allow for a comparison to a single City job.

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the Special Assistant to Council to the same pay grade as the Zoning/Planning Director and the Policy Director. Table 7 provides the recommended pay grade and pay range.

Table 7

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Special Assistant to Council	523	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66

Policy Director

The Policy Director serves as the Council Member's primary point of contact for policy research, writing and policy development, and in some Districts writing CCRs. Conducts surveys and polls to determine primary public opinion and contrary viewpoints. There appears to be a range of activities in the policy related job in each District. May exercise direct supervision over assigned staff.

The Policy Director requires a Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university; two (2) years of related professional experience; or an equivalent combination of education and experience.

The Policy Director job does not include any duties typically assigned to a Director level job.

San Antonio General Market

The San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey does not contain any data for the Policy Director.

City of San Antonio Job Match

The general nature of the job duties does not allow for a direct match to the City jobs. The policy activities typically apply to a specific department with specific knowledge requirements.

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the Policy Director to the same pay grade as the Zoning/Planning Director and the Special Assistant to Council. Table 8 provides the recommended pay grade and pay range.

There appears to be a range of activities in the policy related jobs in each District. The Council Members should take the reduced duties compared to the full policy activities of the specific employees into consideration when setting the pay rates.

Table 8

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Policy Director	523	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66

Event Services Director

The Event Services Director plans, coordinates, implements, and facilitates events for the Council district office. The job requires a Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university or equivalent combination of education and experience. The Event Services Director job does not include any duties typically assigned to a Director level job.

San Antonio General Market

The Event Services Director duties, education, and experience align closely with the San Antonio Wage Survey Event Coordinator duties, education, and experience.

Table 9 provides the job title, job summary, and education/experience requirements for the job.

Table 9

Survey Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Event Coordinator	Oversees all logistics of an event such as; food and beverage, venue negotiations, scheduling, entertainment, equipment setup, and exhibits. Manages all aspects of event, promotion, materials, and inventory. Calculates a budget for proposed events, negotiates contracts, and maintains relationships with vendors.	High School Diploma 0 - 1 year of experience

Table 10 provides the survey data and corresponding pay grade.

Table 10

Survey Job Title	25th	Average	75th	Pay Grade
Event Coordinator	40,600.96	44,171.63	50,993.39	521

City of San Antonio Job Match

The Event Services Director duties, education, and experience align closely with the City of San Antonio Events Coordinator duties, education, and experience.

Table 11 provides the job title, job summary, and education/experience requirements for the job.

Table 11

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Events Services Coordinator	Responsible for planning and coordinating events with customers, organizing set-up requirements, and contract services for City facilities. Working conditions are primarily in an office environment. May exercise functional supervision over assigned staff.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university.

Table 12 provides the City's pay grade and pay range for the job.

Table 12

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Events Services Coordinator	510	40,467.96	45,108.83	49,749.70

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the Event Services Director to pay grade 522 to match the starting pay of the job and survey data, and to maintain a 50% pay range. Table 13 provides the pay grade and pay range.

Table 13

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Event Services Director	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78

Communications Director

The Communications Director performs journalistic and public communications work for the development of informational materials, news releases, and other actions necessary to prepare materials for release. The job does not supervise any employees or perform any duties typically assigned to a Director. The job requires a Bachelor's degree and two years of experience in public relations or a High School diploma plus additional experience. The job duties match the duties and requirements of a Communications and Public Relations Representative.

San Antonio General Market

The Communications Director job duties are similar to the San Antonio Survey Communications Specialist and Public Relations Representative. The Public Relations Representative requires a Bachelor's Degree while the Communications Director requires either a Bachelor's degree or High School diploma with additional education.

Table 14 provides the survey job title, summary, and minimum experience/education for each job.

Table 14

Survey Job Title	Job Summary	Education and Experience
Communications Specialist	Creates, writes, edits and updates manuals, brochures and marketing materials for the organization, customers and employees. Develops format, artwork, and general design of information. Ability to translate large volume of material to user-oriented language.	Bachelor's degree 0 -3 years of experience
Public Relations Representative	Plans and conducts public relations program designed to create and maintain a favorable image for employer or client. Develops and communicates information designed to keep the public informed of employer's programs, accomplishments, or point of view.	Bachelor's degree 3 - 5 years of experience

Table 15 provides the survey data and the corresponding pay grade.

Table 15

Survey Job Title	25th	Average	75th	Pay Grade
Communications Specialist	45,079.95	57,944.42	71,678.06	524
Public Relations Representative	41,946.16	49,445.31	55,306.06	522

City of San Antonio Job Match

The City of San Antonio has several jobs that are related to the Communications Director. Table 16 provides the job title, job summary, and education/experience requirements for each job.

Table 16

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Public Engagement Officer	Plans, develops, and implements strategies and programs to help facilitate community involvement with City departments, programs and initiatives. Develops and implements City policies, procedures, and protocol designed to engage community input on various City programs and initiatives. Conducts neighborhood need assessments, meets with neighborhood residents, leaders, and community groups to identify needs and available resources. Prepares or edits scripts to be presented over communications media; outlines of material for newspaper photographers; and display advertising for newspapers, posters, handbills, exhibits or programs.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Journalism, Public Relations, Communications, or a related field. Three (3) years professional experience in Public Relations.

Table 16 (Cont.)

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Public Information Officer	Responsible for performing journalistic and public contact work for the development of informational materials, news releases, and other actions necessary to prepare materials for release. Provides public relations support for a City department to improve the timely and accurate distribution of information.	<p>Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Journalism, Public Relations, Communications, or a related field.</p> <p>Three (3) years professional experience in Public Relations.</p> <p>Or Equivalent combination of education and experience.</p>
Mayor's Communications Strategist	Under administrative direction, is responsible for strategic communications planning and implementation of projects and initiatives for the Office of the Mayor. Works with City officials and staff at all levels in the coordination of media and community relations programs and activities. Exercises direct supervision over assigned staff.	<p>Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university. Master's degree highly preferred.</p> <p>Five (5) years of experience in Communications, Marketing, Public Information or a related field, including two (2) years of direct supervisory experience.</p>

The Communications Director duties, education and experience most closely matches the Public Information Officer duties, education and experience. The Mayor's Communications Strategist includes supervisory responsibilities, education requirements, experience, and a scope of responsibility not included in the Communications Director job.

Table 17 provides the City's pay grade and pay range for each job.

Table 17

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Public Engagement Officer	525	52,682.50	65,853.32	79,024.14
Public Information Officer	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78
Mayor's Communications Strategist	536	81,500.12	110,025.10	138,550.10

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the Communications Director to pay grade 522 which is two pay grades below the San Antonio general survey data and matches the City Public Information Officer. Table 18 provides the pay grade and pay range for the job.

Table 18

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Communications Director	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78

Constituent Services Director

The Constituent Services Director manages the Constituent Service office to include but not limited to overseeing all concerns that are received, providing information and assistance to the public. Works closely with individuals, advocacy groups and other associations to provide information or referrals for City services. Exercises direct supervision over assigned staff. The Constituent Services Director requires a Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university; two (2) years of administrative or customer service experience; or equivalent combination of education and experience.

The Constituent Services Director duties change slightly depending on the District. Most Constituent Services Directors supervise up to four Constituent Service Representatives, other Directors do not supervise any employees. The Constituent Services Director job does not include any duties typically assigned to a Director level job.

San Antonio General Market

The San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey provides data for a general Customer Service Supervisor. Table 19 provides the survey job title, summary, and minimum experience/education for the job.

Table 19

Survey Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Customer Service Supervisor	Oversees the day-to-day activities of a customer service team, processing service requests or handling problem resolution by phone. Hires, schedules, supervises, and evaluates customer service representatives. Ensures all personnel are fully trained on products, services, problem solving, judgment, and customer satisfaction techniques. Provides management with reports on customer service and satisfaction.	High School Diploma 2 - 3 years of experience

Table 20 provides the survey value and corresponding pay grade.

Table 20

Survey Job Title	25th	Average	75th	Pay Grade
Customer Services Supervisor	32,203.86	48,903.82	60,772.66	522

City of San Antonio Job Match

The City of San Antonio Customer Services Rep. Supervisor job duties are similar to the Constituent Services Director that supervises a small group of employees. Table 21 provides the job title, job summary, and required experience/education.

Table 21

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Customer Services Rep. Supervisor	Responsible for overseeing the customer service function for a particular department or for 311 related issues if assigned to Customer Service/311 Department. Oversees responses to telephone and written inquiries for all internal and external customers. Assists in resolving customer issues. Exercises direct supervision over assigned staff.	Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university. Four (4) years of increasingly responsible experience in public information or providing customer assistance.

Table 22 provides the City’s pay grade and pay range for the job.

Table 22

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Customer Services Rep. Supervisor	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the job to pay grade 522 to match the San Antonio survey and City pay grade. Table 23 provides the pay grade and pay range.

Table 23

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Constituent Services Director	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78

Constituent Services Representative II

Constituent Service Representative II performs a variety of duties involved in the coordination of activities for the Council district office with City departments and external organizations. Provides information and assistance to the public. Works closely with individuals, advocacy groups and other

associations to provide information or referrals for City services. May exercise functional supervision over Constituent Services Representative I's. The Level II job requires a Bachelor's Degree from an accredited college or university or equivalent combination of education and experience.

San Antonio General Market

The San Antonio Survey Customer Services Specialist duties matches the general duties of the Constituent Service Representative II. The jobs differ slightly in experience and education requirements. The Constituent Service Representative II requires a Bachelor's Degree or High School Diploma with additional experience. The Customer Services Specialist requires an Associate's degree and one to two years of experience. Table 24 provides the job title, job summary, and required experience/education.

Table 24

Survey Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Customer Services Specialist	Handles incoming calls from customers making requests, inquiring, or expressing concern about products, services, or order status. Supports customer service representatives by handling calls of a complex nature requiring additional knowledge of products or services, a higher level of decision-making authority, or specific problem solving skills. Collects and enters data accurately and responsively to promote customer satisfaction. Assists supervisor with team activities and service level goals.	Associate's Degree 1 - 2 years of experience

Table 25 provides the survey values and corresponding pay grade.

Table 25

Survey Job Title	25th	Average	75th	Pay Grade
Customer Services Specialist	38,991.68	44,947.55	48,021.90	522

City of San Antonio Job Match

The City of San Antonio Customer Services Specialist job duties are similar to the Constituent Services Representative II. Table 26 provides the job title, job summary, and required experience/education.

Table 26

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Customer Services Specialist	Responsible for recording and following-up on citizens' complaints, questions, and requests regarding City services. Working conditions are primarily inside an office environment with occasional visits to outdoor sites. Exercises functional supervision over assigned staff.	Two (2) years of college from an accredited college or university. Two (2) years of increasingly responsible experience in public information and customer assistance and use of computer data in the analysis of service delivery.

Table 27 provides the City’s pay grade and pay range for the job.

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Customer Services Specialist	508	36,715.37	40,919.19	45,123.00

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the Constituent Services Representative II to pay grade 508 to match the City pay grade. Table 28 provides the pay grade and pay range.

Table 28

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Constituent Service Representative II	508	36,715.37	40,919.19	45,123.00

Constituent Services Representative I

Constituent Services Representative I job duties match the level II job duties with the exception of the education requirements. The Constituent Services Representative I requires a High School Diploma with no required experience.

San Antonio General Market

The analysis matches the City’s Constituent Services Representative I to the Customer Service Representative II in the San Antonio Wage and Benefit Survey. The level II position matches the complexity of dealing with a broader range of constituent concerns. Table 29 provides the job title, job summary, and required experience/education.

Table 29

Survey Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Customer Service Representative II	Handles incoming calls from customers making requests, inquiring or expressing concern about products, services or order status. Collects and enters data accurately and responsively. Makes decisions to promote customer satisfaction and resolving the issue.	High School Diploma 1 - 2 years of experience.

Table 30 provides the survey values and corresponding pay grade.

Table 30

Survey Job Title	25th	Average	75th	Pay Grade
Customer Service Representative II	35,028.24	37,903.13	40,075.95	506

City of San Antonio Job Match

The City of San Antonio has two jobs that are related to the Constituent Services Representative I. The analysis uses the two jobs that require experience that is greater than the Constituent Services Representative I to reflect the potential for calls with a higher level of difficulty or constituent frustrations. Table 31 provides the job title, job summary, and education/experience requirements for each job.

Table 31

City Job Title	Job Summary	Education/Experience
Customer Services Representative	Responsible for customer service activities in a particular department, involving the handling of requests and/or complaints regarding City services.	High School Diploma or GED equivalent. One (1) year experience dealing with the public servicing client/customer requests.
Service Representative	Responsible for direct customer service activities involving the handling and intake of multi-department requests and/or complaints regarding City services. Provides customers with as much information and direct service as possible without transferring the call to another person or department. Receives incoming non-emergency, public safety 311 calls.	High School Diploma or GED equivalent Two (2) years of experience dealing with the public servicing client/customer requests.

Table 32 provides the City’s pay grade and pay range for each job.

Table 32

City Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Customer Services Representative	501	31,616.00	32,254.69	32,893.38
Service Representative	506	34,528.00	38,082.20	41,636.40

Recommended Pay Grade

The job evaluation assigns the Constituent Services Representative I to pay grade 506 to match the City Service Representative pay grade. Table 33 provides the pay grade and pay range.

Table 33

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Constituent Services Representative I	506	34,528.00	38,082.20	41,636.40

RECOMMENDATIONS SUMMARY

Table 34 provides Werling Associates recommended pay grades for the positions under review.

Table 34

Job Title	Pay Grade	Min	Mid	Max
Chief of Staff	528	70,120.96	87,651.20	105,181.44
Zoning/Planning Director	523	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66
Special Assistant to Council	523	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66
Policy Director	523	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66
Event Services Director	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78
Communications Director	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78
Constituent Services Director	522	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78
Constituent Services Representative II	508	36,715.37	40,919.19	45,123.00
Constituent Services Representative I	506	34,528.00	38,082.20	41,636.40

PAY GRADES AND INDIVIDUAL PAY

The pay grade assignments and pay ranges provide a general guidance in establishing a competitive and equitable pay to each employee. Organizations use two general models to establish the appropriate pay for each employee.

Many organizations use a traditional model that can be traced back to the unionized organizations and the government entities in the 1940s. These organizations created a model to match the labor market characteristics at the time including limited skill differences between employees, a culture where employees stayed with an employer most of their careers, and limited differences in wage inflation across jobs due to the availability of workers to fill most positions. The traditional model provides a starting pay at the minimum of the pay grade to reflect an unskilled employee. The model then provides a constant percentage increase each year of employment. The model rewards time on the job.

The significant changes in the U.S. economy over the past 40 years have increased the complexity of pay decisions. Organizations must now address a broad range of pay related problems including a severe shortage of skilled employees in some fields, unequal wage inflation, large variances in employee performance, budgetary constraints, and increased scrutiny by individuals outside of the organization. This complexity requires adoption of a new model to determine the appropriate pay needed to attract and retain the best employees, while addressing budgetary and other constraints.

The contemporary model provides a negotiated starting pay based on the skill level, experience, and the labor market conditions. The contemporary model uses a more quantitative analysis of pay related factors, such as previous experience, time on the job, performance, additional job duties, criticality to the organization, additional education, and other job related factors.

The following tables provide a general template and decision guidelines to determine the appropriate pay for each employee. The easiest process involves a template to assist in establishing an appropriate pay rate. The template increases equity between employees without limiting managerial discretion. Table 35 provides a sample template to assist in determining employee pay within the pay grades.

Table 35

Factor	Sample Pay Adjustment
Experience	2% for each year of experience beyond the minimum job requirements.
Education	\$2,000 for Master’s degree
Additional job duties	5% - 10% for significant duties covered in other job titles
Management Discretion	Adjustment based on Council Member decision.

Table 36 provides general guidelines for establishing individual pay rates using pay grade 522 as an example.

Table 36

	Pay	Individual Pay
Grade Minimum	39,580.84	Pay for an employee who meets the minimum requirements for the job.
First Quartile	39,580.84 - 44,528.58	Pay range for a fully qualified employee with 4 years of previous experience and time on the job.
Second Quartile	44,528.58 - 49,476.31	Pay range for a fully qualified employee with 8 years of previous experience and time on the job.
Midpoint	49,476.31	Pay for a fully qualified employee with 8 years of previous experience and time on the job.
Third Quartile	49,476.31 - 54,424.05	Pay range for a fully qualified employee with 12 years of previous experience and time on the job.
Fourth Quartile	54,424.05 - 59,371.78	Pay range for a fully qualified employee with 16 years of previous experience and time on the job.
Maximum	59,371.78	Maximum pay for an employee in a given job.

Pay Grade Adjustments

The current tight labor market requires organizations to update the pay ranges on a regular basis. The City of San Antonio should include the Council jobs in any annual Pay Plan update.

Annual Increases

The annual increases for the City Council staff should mirror the increases provided to the City employees. In addition, the City Council should also provide additional increases to compensate for wage inflation that causes a pay grade change.

Exhibit 1: Pay Structure

Pay Range	Grade	Minimum	Midpoint	Maximum
501	A-2	31,616.00	32,254.69	32,893.38
502	A-3	32,032.00	33,012.33	33,992.66
503	A-4	32,552.00	34,066.37	35,580.74
504	A-5	33,072.00	35,152.78	37,233.56
505	A-6	33,800.00	36,687.82	39,575.64
506	A-7	34,528.00	38,082.20	41,636.40
507	A-8	35,360.00	39,420.16	43,480.32
508	A-9	36,715.38	40,919.19	45,123.00
509	A-10	38,549.68	42,965.13	47,380.58
510	A-11	40,467.96	45,108.83	49,749.70
511	A-12	42,485.30	47,361.08	52,236.86

Pay Range	Grade	Minimum	Midpoint	Maximum
520	C-1	32,711.64	40,889.68	49,067.72
521	C-2	35,982.96	44,978.70	53,974.44
522	C-3	39,580.84	49,476.31	59,371.78
523	C-4	43,539.86	54,424.76	65,309.66
524	C-5	47,893.56	59,866.95	71,840.34
525	C-6	52,682.50	65,853.32	79,024.14
526	C-7	57,950.88	72,438.47	86,926.06
527	C-8	63,746.28	79,682.85	95,619.42
528	C-9	70,120.96	87,651.20	105,181.44
529	C-10	77,132.64	96,415.93	115,699.22
530	C-11	84,845.28	106,056.47	127,267.66
531	C-12	93,331.16	116,663.95	139,996.74

Pay Range	Grade	Minimum	Midpoint	Maximum
532	D-1	46,598.50	62,907.91	79,217.32
533	D-2	53,587.30	72,342.92	91,098.54
534	D-3	61,626.50	83,195.71	104,764.92
535	D-4	70,869.76	95,674.15	120,478.54
536	D-5	81,500.12	110,025.11	138,550.10

Exhibit 2: Survey Results

Municipality	Employee Classification (PT, FT, Temp)	Adjusted Average Salaries***	Number of Incumbents	# of Council Districts	Benefits (Yes or No)
Austin	FT	City Council Sr. Exec Asst. - \$65,502 City Council Exec Asst. - \$48,757 Council Exec Secretary - \$45,338	12 29 4	10	Yes
Dallas	FT, PT, Temp	Sr Executive Assistant - \$76,585.56 Admin Specialist II - \$61,073.16 City Council Liaison - \$52,219.60 Council Secretary - \$42,727.06 Admin Specialist - \$39,841.26 Council Assistant* - \$38,200.60 Temporary Help - \$19,283.43	13 18 1 1 1 1 2	14	Yes
Corpus Christi		Council does not have paid staff			
Ft. Worth	Temp	Council Aide - \$47,440	10	8	No
Houston**	FT	Senior Council Aide - \$76,006 Council Aide - \$59,246 Council Research Asst. - \$51,758 Council Admin Asst. - \$45,989 Council Secretary - \$35,717 Council Intern - \$30,134	16 2 15 15 7 8	16 (5 of which are At Large)	Yes
Kansas City	FT	Assistant to Elected Official - \$42,703.98	22	6	Yes
Oklahoma City	FT	Chief of Staff to the City Council (Executive) - \$129,466.13 Chief of Staff to the Mayor - \$124,971.52 Special Assistant to the Council - \$78,388.11 Executive Assistant to the Mayor - \$75,616.54 Administrative Coordinator - \$66,755.64 Special Assistant to the Mayor - \$53,100.59	1 1 1 2 1 1	8	Yes
Phoenix	FT / Temp	Council Assistant - \$97,337 Council Research Analyst - \$60,655 Council Aide - \$51,460	7 7 9	8	Yes

*Includes one PT position

**Houston does not have a City Manager form of government

***Salaries have been adjusted based on ERI cost of living index