



September 21, 2017

Mr. Dean Bayer, PE
Construction Group Project Manager
City of San Antonio – TCI Department
114 W. Commerce, 9th Floor
San Antonio, TX 78205

Re: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 2 – Contract Award

Dear Mr. Bayer:

On September 19, 2017 contractor bid proposals for the referenced project were opened and read aloud. Ten bid proposals were submitted with one bid containing errors.

The low bidder for this contract is Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. with a total base bid of \$4,870,914.30. Clark Construction is headquartered in San Antonio, TX and has done a significant amount of asphalt overlay related projects for the City of San Antonio and others in the surrounding area. Clark Construction has been awarded similar contracts of size and scope in recent years and the City of San Antonio has been pleased with their work. Due to no knowledge of poor performance which would exclude Clark Construction from being recommended for award, LAN recommends the award of this contract to Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. Below is a listing of the contractors who bid on the contract and their total base bids:

1. Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.	\$4,870,914.30
2. San Antonio Constructors, Ltd	\$5,226,649.50
3. J&P Paving Co., Inc.	\$5,348,278.40
4. Oldcastle Materials Texas, Inc.	\$5,440,560.24
5. Asphalt Inc. LLC, DBA Lone Star Paving	\$5,500,617.81
6. H.L. Zumwalt Construction, Inc.	\$5,677,550.89
7. Curran Contracting Company	\$5,905,406.15
8. Fuquay, Inc.	\$6,194,777.30
9. Austin Materials, LLC	\$8,093,224.72
10. Heritage Asphalt Company, LLC	\$10,679,700.00

Attached herewith are the following:

- 1) One (1) pdf copy of the bid tabulations
- 2) One (1) pdf copy of the summary of the low bidder's prices, which is 11.8% below the responsive contractor's bid proposal average and 18.8% below the Engineers Estimate. Bids submitted by Austin Materials and Heritage Asphalt Company were removed from the Contractor Average, as these bids are significantly higher than the remaining Contractor's bids and the Engineer's estimate.



**Lockwood, Andrews
& Newnam, Inc.**
A LEO A DALY COMPANY

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (210) 499-5082, or by email at sjaniol@lan-inc.com.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Stephen Aniol, P.E." The signature is fluid and cursive.

Stephen Aniol, P.E.
Senior Project Manager

Cc: Juan Romero
David Rios
Margaret Toscano

BID TABULATION															
Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 2 Bid Opening: Tuesday, September 19, 2017 Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc. 10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082 LAN Project No.: 120-12032-002			Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. 5140 Gibbs Sprawl Rd. San Antonio, TX 78219 210-661-6785		San Antonio Constructors, Ltd PO Box 682008 San Antonio, TX 78268 210-681-0211		J&P Paving Co. Inc. 5002 Sinclair Rd. San Antonio, TX 78222 210-648-4708		Oldcastle Materials Texas, Inc. 5723 University Heights Blvd, Ste 115 San Antonio, TX 78249 210-654-5576		Asphalt Inc. LLC, DBA Lone Star Paving 4310 Jung San Antonio, TX 78247 210-325-9973		H.L. Zumwalt Construction, Inc. 17511 FM 1283 Mico, TX 78056 210-695-3541		
			LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER												
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL
		TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:			\$74,000.00		\$58,750.00		\$63,010.00		\$94,450.00		\$48,000.00		\$66,790.00
		TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:			\$122,625.00		\$114,750.00		\$118,020.00		\$139,525.00		\$88,625.00		\$125,100.00
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	40	200	\$200.00	\$8,000.00	\$200.00	\$8,000.00	\$200.00	\$8,000.00	\$160.00	\$6,400.00	\$200.00	\$8,000.00	\$212.00	\$8,480.00
		TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS:			\$8,000.00		\$8,000.00		\$8,000.00		\$6,400.00		\$8,000.00		\$8,480.00
		TOTAL BASE BID (COSA + SAWS + CPS):			\$4,870,914.30		\$5,226,649.50		\$5,348,278.40		\$5,440,560.24		\$5,500,617.81		\$5,677,550.89

BID TABULATION													Contractor Average		
Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 2				Curran Contracting Company		Fuquay, Inc.		Austin Materials, LLC		Heritage Asphalt Company, LLC		Engineer's Estimate			
Bid Opening: Tuesday, September 19, 2017 Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc. 10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082 LAN Project No.: 120-12032-002				11230 IH 10 East Converse, TX 78109 210-448-3973		4861 Old Hwy. 81 New Braunfels, TX 78132 830-606-1882		2115 Stephens Place, Suite 730 New Braunfels, TX 78130 210-727-7503		608 Henrietta Creek Road Roanoke, TX 76262 817-293-4263					
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	AVG UNIT PRICE	TOTAL
			TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:		\$552,207.00		\$82,500.00		\$151,901.70		\$220,000.00		\$77,000.00		\$129,963.38
			TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:		\$565,184.50		\$153,750.00		\$200,091.70		\$293,750.00		\$134,000.00		\$178,447.44
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	40	200	\$216.05	\$8,642.00	\$375.00	\$15,000.00	\$187.00	\$7,480.00	\$500.00	\$20,000.00	\$225.00	\$9,000.00	\$220.38	\$8,815.25
			TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS:		\$8,642.00		\$15,000.00		\$7,480.00		\$20,000.00		\$9,000.00		\$8,815.25
			TOTAL BASE BID (COSA + SAWS + CPS):		\$5,905,406.15		\$6,194,777.30		\$8,093,224.72		\$10,679,700.00		\$6,000,056.00		\$5,520,594.32

BID TABULATION

Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 2

Bid Opening: Tuesday, September 19, 2017

Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department

Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.

10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082

LAN Project No.: 120-12032-002

Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.
5140 Gibbs Sprawl Rd.
San Antonio, TX 78219
210-661-6785

Engineer's Estimate

Unit Price Comparison

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	DELTA	% DELTA
BASE BID									
103.1	REMOVE CONCRETE CURB	3,600	LF	\$1.25	\$4,500.00	\$2.25	\$8,100.00	(\$1.00)	-44.4%
103.3	REMOVE SIDEWALKS AND DRIVEWAYS	22,400	SF	\$1.00	\$22,400.00	\$2.00	\$44,800.00	(\$1.00)	-50.0%
203	TACK COAT	4,700	GAL	\$3.00	\$14,100.00	\$3.10	\$14,570.00	(\$0.10)	-3.2%
205.4A	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22)	31,260	TON	\$58.08	\$1,815,580.80	\$65.30	\$2,041,278.00	(\$7.22)	-11.1%
205.4B	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP)	1,450	TON	\$58.08	\$84,216.00	\$71.00	\$102,950.00	(\$12.92)	-18.2%
208.1	SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPH. PVM'T (2")	213,150	SY	\$0.50	\$106,575.00	\$2.10	\$447,615.00	(\$1.60)	-76.2%
230.3A	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (6" COMPACTED DEPTH)	19,500	TON	\$74.96	\$1,461,720.00	\$77.00	\$1,501,500.00	(\$2.04)	-2.6%
230.3B	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (12" COMPACTED DEPTH)	1,150	TON	\$63.69	\$73,243.50	\$79.00	\$90,850.00	(\$15.31)	-19.4%
250	SEAL COAT	284,200	SY	\$0.81	\$230,202.00	\$1.70	\$483,140.00	(\$0.89)	-52.4%
438	CLEANING EXISTING JOINTS	500	LF	\$1.00	\$500.00	\$9.10	\$4,550.00	(\$8.10)	-89.0%
454	HEADER TYPE EXPANSION JOINT SEALANT	475	LF	\$1.00	\$475.00	\$50.00	\$23,750.00	(\$49.00)	-98.0%
500	CONCRETE CURB, GUTTER, AND CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER	3,600	LF	\$14.00	\$50,400.00	\$15.00	\$54,000.00	(\$1.00)	-6.7%
502.1	CONCRETE SIDEWALKS	1,650	SY	\$43.00	\$70,950.00	\$44.50	\$73,425.00	(\$1.50)	-3.4%
502.1A	CURB RAMPS	450	EA	\$1,110.00	\$499,500.00	\$1,125.00	\$506,250.00	(\$15.00)	-1.3%
503.1	PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE DRIVEWAYS	1,300	SY	\$46.00	\$59,800.00	\$50.00	\$65,000.00	(\$4.00)	-8.0%
512.1	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (STORM SEWER)	20	EA	\$350.00	\$7,000.00	\$365.00	\$7,300.00	(\$15.00)	-4.1%
512.1B	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (AT&T)	10	EA	\$600.00	\$6,000.00	\$405.00	\$4,050.00	\$195.00	48.1%
515.1	TOPSOIL	350	CY	\$20.00	\$7,000.00	\$30.00	\$10,500.00	(\$10.00)	-33.3%
516.1	SODDING	1,800	SY	\$7.25	\$13,050.00	\$7.00	\$12,600.00	\$0.25	3.6%
533-A	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4")	600	LF	\$0.50	\$300.00	\$1.00	\$600.00	(\$0.50)	-50.0%
533-B	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8")	250	LF	\$1.00	\$250.00	\$1.40	\$350.00	(\$0.40)	-28.6%
533-C	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12")	250	LF	\$1.00	\$250.00	\$2.40	\$600.00	(\$1.40)	-58.3%
533-D	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24")	350	LF	\$2.00	\$700.00	\$4.30	\$1,505.00	(\$2.30)	-53.5%
533-E	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL)	10	EA	\$75.00	\$750.00	\$75.00	\$750.00	\$0.00	0.0%
533-F	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	10	EA	\$75.00	\$750.00	\$91.00	\$910.00	(\$16.00)	-17.6%
533-G	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (RR-XING)	10	EA	\$75.00	\$750.00	\$420.00	\$4,200.00	(\$345.00)	-82.1%
535.1	4" WIDE YELLOW LINE	47,300	LF	\$0.40	\$18,920.00	\$0.40	\$18,920.00	\$0.00	0.0%
535.2	4" WIDE WHITE LINE	53,000	LF	\$0.40	\$21,200.00	\$0.40	\$21,200.00	\$0.00	0.0%
535.4	8" SOLID WHITE LINE	6,000	LF	\$0.75	\$4,500.00	\$1.20	\$7,200.00	(\$0.45)	-37.5%
535.5	12" WIDE WHITE LINE	1,200	LF	\$3.00	\$3,600.00	\$2.60	\$3,120.00	\$0.40	15.4%
535.7	24" WIDE WHITE LINE	4,500	LF	\$6.00	\$27,000.00	\$5.50	\$24,750.00	\$0.50	9.1%
535.12	WORD "ONLY"	18	EA	\$125.00	\$2,250.00	\$115.00	\$2,070.00	\$10.00	8.7%
535.14	RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL	12	EA	\$450.00	\$5,400.00	\$535.00	\$6,420.00	(\$85.00)	-15.9%
535.16	STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY	24	EA	\$75.00	\$1,800.00	\$140.00	\$3,360.00	(\$65.00)	-46.4%
535.17	BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL	24	EA	\$75.00	\$1,800.00	\$230.00	\$5,520.00	(\$155.00)	-67.4%
535.22	WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE)	24	EA	\$125.00	\$3,000.00	\$152.00	\$3,648.00	(\$27.00)	-17.8%
535.23	WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT)	60	EA	\$110.00	\$6,600.00	\$97.00	\$5,820.00	\$13.00	13.4%
537.1	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W)	250	EA	\$0.50	\$125.00	\$4.50	\$1,125.00	(\$4.00)	-88.9%
537.2	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y)	250	EA	\$0.50	\$125.00	\$4.50	\$1,125.00	(\$4.00)	-88.9%
537.6	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C)	2,500	EA	\$5.00	\$12,500.00	\$3.70	\$9,250.00	\$1.30	35.1%
537.8	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A)	2,500	EA	\$5.00	\$12,500.00	\$3.70	\$9,250.00	\$1.30	35.1%
537.9	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R)	600	EA	\$5.00	\$3,000.00	\$3.70	\$2,220.00	\$1.30	35.1%
556.1	CAST IN PLACE DETECTABLE WARNING SURFACE TILES	50	EA	\$50.00	\$2,500.00	\$270.00	\$13,500.00	(\$220.00)	-81.5%
624.2	GROUND BOXES TYPE B (122322)	7	EA	\$200.00	\$1,400.00	\$445.00	\$3,115.00	(\$245.00)	-55.1%
712	JOINT AND CRACK SEALING	6,500	LB	\$2.90	\$18,850.00	\$4.50	\$29,250.00	(\$1.60)	-35.6%
798	ASPHALT CONCRETE CUSHION SPEED HUMPS, TYPE 3	400	LF	\$43.33	\$17,332.00	\$300.00	\$120,000.00	(\$256.67)	-85.6%
SUP 1	DOOR HANGERS	1	LS	\$1,025.00	\$1,025.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	(\$475.00)	-31.7%

BID TABULATION

Project: 2018 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 2

Bid Opening: Tuesday, September 19, 2017

Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department

Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.

10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082

LAN Project No.: 120-12032-002

Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.
5140 Gibbs Sprawl Rd.
San Antonio, TX 78219
210-661-6785

Engineer's Estimate

Unit Price Comparison

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	DELTA	% DELTA
SUP 2	POLICE OFFICER	450	HR	\$40.00	\$18,000.00	\$45.00	\$20,250.00	(\$5.00)	-11.1%
SUP 3	RAILROAD INSURANCE AND PERMIT	1	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$0.00	0.0%
SUP 4	LAPTOP AND INTERNET ACCESS	1	LS	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	(\$500.00)	-33.3%
SUP 5	TCI PROJECT SIGN	20	EA	\$150.00	\$3,000.00	\$240.00	\$4,800.00	(\$90.00)	-37.5%
SUP 6	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD)	12	MO	\$1,200.00	\$14,400.00	\$1,500.00	\$18,000.00	(\$300.00)	-20.0%
SUP 7	ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION	5	EA	\$500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$10,000.00	(\$1,500.00)	-75.0%
TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS:					\$4,740,289.30		\$5,857,056.00		
826	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT	275	EA	\$175.00	\$48,125.00	\$200.00	\$55,000.00	(\$25.00)	-12.5%
826A	VALVE BOX LOCATE AND ADJUSTMENT (SAWS)	10	EA	\$50.00	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	(\$150.00)	-75.0%
TOTAL SAWS WATER BID ITEMS:					\$48,625.00		\$57,000.00		
851	SAWS ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLE	210	EA	\$350.00	\$73,500.00	\$350.00	\$73,500.00	\$0.00	0.0%
854A	ADJUST EXISTING SEWER CLEANOUT	10	EA	\$50.00	\$500.00	\$350.00	\$3,500.00	(\$300.00)	-85.7%
TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:					\$74,000.00		\$77,000.00		
TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:					\$122,625.00		\$134,000.00		
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	40	200	\$200.00	\$8,000.00	\$225.00	\$9,000.00	(\$25.00)	-11.1%
TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS:					\$8,000.00		\$9,000.00		
TOTAL BASE BID (COSA + SAWS + CPS):					\$4,870,914.30		\$6,000,056.00		