



September 20, 2016

Mr. Dean Bayer, PE
Construction Group Project Manager
City of San Antonio – TCI Department
114 W. Commerce, 9th Floor
San Antonio, TX 78205

Re: 2017 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 4 – Award Recommendation Letter

Dear Mr. Bayer:

On September 13, 2016, contractor bid proposals for the referenced project were opened and read aloud. Five bid proposals were submitted with the bid by Lone Star Paving deemed non-responsive by the City of San Antonio.

The lowest responsive bidder for this contract is J&P Paving, Inc. with a total base bid of \$3,769,450.25. J&P Paving is headquartered in San Antonio, TX and has done a significant amount of asphalt overlay related projects for the City of San Antonio and others in the surrounding area. J&P Paving has been awarded similar contracts in recent years and the City of San Antonio has been pleased with their work. Due to no knowledge of poor performance which would exclude J&P Paving from being recommended for award, LAN recommends the award of this contract to J&P Paving, Inc. Below is a listing of the contractors who bid on this contract and their total base bids:

- | | |
|--|---------------------------------|
| 1. J&P Paving, Inc. | \$3,769,450.25 |
| 2. Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. | \$3,911,982.00 |
| 3. San Antonio Constructors, Ltd. | \$3,977,900.00 |
| 4. Austin Materials, LLC. | \$4,387,255.00 |
| 5. Asphalt Inc., D.B.A. Lone Star Paving | \$3,739,037.00 (NON-RESPONSIVE) |

Attached herewith are the following:

- 1) One (1) pdf copy of the bid tabulations
- 2) One (1) pdf copy of the summary of the low bidder's prices, which is 6.0% below the responsive contractor's bid proposal average and 5.8% below the Engineers Estimate.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 210-499-5082, or by email at sjaniol@lan-inc.com.

Respectfully,

Stephen Aniol, P.E.
Project Manager

Cc: Juan Romero

BID TABULATION Project: 2017 Asphalt Overlay Package 4 Bid Opening: Tuesday, September 13, 2016 Owner: City of San Antonio Department of Transportation & Capital Improvements Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc. 10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082 LAN Project No.: 120-11729-020				J&P Paving Co., Inc. 5002 Sinclair Rd. San Antonio, TX 78222 210-648-4708		Engineer's Estimate		Unit Price Comparison	
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER									
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	DELTA	% DELTA
BASE BID									
103.1	REMOVE CONCRETE CURB	2,000	LF	\$1.50	\$3,000.00	\$1.60	\$3,200.00	(\$0.10)	-6.3%
103.3	REMOVE SIDEWALKS AND DRIVEWAYS	12,500	SF	\$1.45	\$18,125.00	\$1.50	\$18,750.00	(\$0.05)	-3.3%
203	TACK COAT	2,500	GAL	\$3.00	\$7,500.00	\$3.60	\$9,000.00	(\$0.60)	-16.7%
205.4A	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22)	20,850	TON	\$68.08	\$1,419,468.00	\$74.00	\$1,542,900.00	(\$5.92)	-8.0%
205.4B	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP)	750	TON	\$67.96	\$50,970.00	\$76.00	\$57,000.00	(\$8.04)	-10.6%
208.1	SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPH. PVMT (2")	138,200	SY	\$2.95	\$407,690.00	\$2.50	\$345,500.00	\$0.45	18.0%
230.3A	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (6" COMPACTED DEPTH)	10,000	TON	\$82.19	\$821,900.00	\$92.00	\$920,000.00	(\$9.81)	-10.7%
230.3B	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (12" COMPACTED DEPTH)	400	TON	\$83.94	\$33,576.00	\$78.00	\$31,200.00	\$5.94	7.6%
250	SEAL COAT	190,000	SY	\$1.57	\$298,300.00	\$1.60	\$304,000.00	(\$0.03)	-1.9%
438	CLEANING EXISTING JOINTS	250	LF	\$1.00	\$250.00	\$12.00	\$3,000.00	(\$11.00)	-91.7%
454	HEADER TYPE EXPANSION JOINT SEALANT	250	LF	\$1.00	\$250.00	\$37.00	\$9,250.00	(\$36.00)	-97.3%
500	CONCRETE CURB, GUTTER, AND CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER	2,000	LF	\$12.00	\$24,000.00	\$13.00	\$26,000.00	(\$1.00)	-7.7%
502.1	CONCRETE SIDEWALKS	900	SY	\$38.00	\$34,200.00	\$40.00	\$36,000.00	(\$2.00)	-5.0%
502.1A	CURB RAMPS	240	EA	\$1,200.00	\$288,000.00	\$1,150.00	\$276,000.00	\$50.00	4.3%
503.1	PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE DRIVEWAYS	700	SY	\$43.39	\$30,373.00	\$43.00	\$30,100.00	\$0.39	0.9%
512.1	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (STORM SEWER)	20	EA	\$300.00	\$6,000.00	\$365.00	\$7,300.00	(\$65.00)	-17.8%
512.1B	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (AT&T)	10	EA	\$300.00	\$3,000.00	\$400.00	\$4,000.00	(\$100.00)	-25.0%
515.1	TOPSOIL	400	CY	\$20.00	\$8,000.00	\$22.00	\$8,800.00	(\$2.00)	-9.1%
516.1	SODDING	1,500	SY	\$5.00	\$7,500.00	\$6.00	\$9,000.00	(\$1.00)	-16.7%
533-A	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4")	300	LF	\$0.30	\$90.00	\$1.00	\$300.00	(\$0.70)	-70.0%
533-B	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8")	200	LF	\$0.30	\$60.00	\$2.20	\$440.00	(\$1.90)	-86.4%
533-C	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12")	200	LF	\$0.50	\$100.00	\$2.60	\$520.00	(\$2.10)	-80.8%
533-D	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24")	200	LF	\$0.50	\$100.00	\$3.70	\$740.00	(\$3.20)	-86.5%
533-E	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL)	5	EA	\$2.00	\$10.00	\$75.00	\$375.00	(\$73.00)	-97.3%
533-F	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	5	EA	\$2.00	\$10.00	\$75.00	\$375.00	(\$73.00)	-97.3%
533-G	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (RR-XING)	5	EA	\$80.00	\$400.00	\$160.00	\$800.00	(\$80.00)	-50.0%
535.1	4" WIDE YELLOW LINE	25,000	LF	\$0.35	\$8,750.00	\$0.50	\$12,500.00	(\$0.15)	-30.0%
535.2	4" WIDE WHITE LINE	35,000	LF	\$0.35	\$12,250.00	\$0.50	\$17,500.00	(\$0.15)	-30.0%
535.4	8" SOLID WHITE LINE	4,000	LF	\$0.78	\$3,120.00	\$1.20	\$4,800.00	(\$0.42)	-35.0%
535.5	12" WIDE WHITE LINE	750	LF	\$2.45	\$1,837.50	\$3.70	\$2,775.00	(\$1.25)	-33.8%
535.7	24" WIDE WHITE LINE	2,250	LF	\$5.25	\$11,812.50	\$6.20	\$13,950.00	(\$0.95)	-15.3%
535.12	WORD "ONLY"	10	EA	\$101.85	\$1,018.50	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	(\$23.15)	-18.5%
535.14	RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL	5	EA	\$460.00	\$2,300.00	\$535.00	\$2,675.00	(\$75.00)	-14.0%
535.16	STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY	10	EA	\$105.00	\$1,050.00	\$105.00	\$1,050.00	\$0.00	0.0%
535.17	BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL	15	EA	\$250.00	\$3,750.00	\$270.00	\$4,050.00	(\$20.00)	-7.4%
535.22	WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE)	15	EA	\$113.00	\$1,695.00	\$220.00	\$3,300.00	(\$107.00)	-48.6%
535.23	WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT)	35	EA	\$87.15	\$3,050.25	\$115.00	\$4,025.00	(\$27.85)	-24.2%
537.1	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W)	150	EA	\$5.00	\$750.00	\$4.00	\$600.00	\$1.00	25.0%
537.2	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y)	150	EA	\$5.00	\$750.00	\$4.00	\$600.00	\$1.00	25.0%
537.6	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C)	1,500	EA	\$3.50	\$5,250.00	\$4.50	\$6,750.00	(\$1.00)	-22.2%
537.8	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A)	1,250	EA	\$3.33	\$4,162.50	\$4.50	\$5,625.00	(\$1.17)	-26.0%
537.9	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R)	400	EA	\$3.33	\$1,332.00	\$4.50	\$1,800.00	(\$1.17)	-26.0%
556.1	CAST IN PLACE DETECTABLE WARNING SURFACE TILES	30	EA	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$175.00	\$5,250.00	(\$25.00)	-14.3%
624.2	GROUND BOXES TYPE B (122322)	5	EA	\$100.00	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$1,000.00	(\$100.00)	-50.0%
712	JOINT AND CRACK SEALING	4,000	LB	\$2.90	\$11,600.00	\$3.50	\$14,000.00	(\$0.60)	-17.1%
798	ASPHALT CONCRETE CUSHION SPEED HUMPS, TYPE 3	30	EA	\$2,500.00	\$75,000.00	\$2,400.00	\$72,000.00	\$100.00	4.2%
SUP 1	DOOR HANGERS	1	LS	\$800.00	\$800.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	(\$200.00)	-20.0%
SUP 2	POLICE OFFICER	400	HR	\$40.00	\$16,000.00	\$45.00	\$18,000.00	(\$5.00)	-11.1%
SUP 3	RAILROAD INSURANCE AND PERMIT	1	LS	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	(\$2,500.00)	-50.0%
SUP 4	LAPTOP AND INTERNET ACCESS	1	LS	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	(\$500.00)	-33.3%
SUP 5	TCI AT WORK PROJECT SIGN	20	EA	\$10.00	\$200.00	\$150.00	\$3,000.00	(\$140.00)	-93.3%
SUP 6	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD)	10	MO	\$1,800.00	\$18,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$20,000.00	(\$200.00)	-10.0%
SUP 7	ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION	5	EA	\$1,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$1,700.00	\$8,500.00	(\$200.00)	-11.8%
TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS:					\$3,663,350.25		\$3,877,050.00		
826	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT	225	EA	\$200.00	\$45,000.00	\$185.00	\$41,625.00	\$15.00	8.1%
826A	VALVE BOX LOCATE AND ADJUSTMENT (SAWS)	10	EA	\$50.00	\$500.00	\$100.00	\$1,000.00	(\$50.00)	-50.0%
TOTAL SAWS WATER BID ITEMS:					\$45,500.00		\$42,625.00		
851	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	175	EA	\$300.00	\$52,500.00	\$400.00	\$70,000.00	(\$100.00)	-25.0%
851A	LOCATING AND ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	10	EA	\$50.00	\$500.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	(\$150.00)	-75.0%
TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:					\$53,000.00		\$72,000.00		
TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:					\$98,500.00		\$114,625.00		
512.1A	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLE (CPS ENERGY)	2	EA	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$700.00	\$1,400.00	(\$400.00)	-57.1%
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	35	EA	\$200.00	\$7,000.00	\$200.00	\$7,000.00	\$0.00	0.0%
TOTAL CPS ENERGY BID ITEMS:					\$7,600.00		\$8,400.00		
TOTAL BASE BID:					\$3,769,450.25		\$4,000,075.00		