

**State of Texas
County of Bexar
City of San Antonio**



**Meeting Minutes
City Council B Session
City Hall Complex
105 Main Plaza
San Antonio, Texas 78205**

Wednesday, October 30, 2019

2:00 PM

Municipal Plaza Building

The City Council of San Antonio convened in the City Council Chambers of the Municipal Plaza Building.

ROLL CALL

City Clerk Leticia Vacek took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Councilmembers present:

PRESENT: Mayor Nirenberg, Treviño, Andrews-Sullivan, Viagran, Rocha Garcia, Gonzales, Cabello Havrda, Sandoval, Pelaez, Courage, and Perry.

1. Briefing on the Domestic Violence Comprehensive Plan and the Commission on Collaborative Strategies to Prevent, Combat, and Respond to Domestic Violence presented by the City of San Antonio [Colleen M. Bridger, MPH, PhD, Assistant City Manager; Jennifer Herriott, MPH, Interim Director, Health]

Colleen Bridger noted that the number of homicides as the result of domestic violence had increased and Child Protective Services (CPS) estimated that at least 25% of their cases were directly involved with domestic violence. She added that the San Antonio Police Department (SAPD) had experienced an increase in family violence related reports. She stated that Family Violence Prevention Services reported the highest average monthly census count May 2019. She noted that the number and rate of homicides due to domestic violence was increasing but other indicators were not as clear. She stated that family violence calls to SAPD have been stable and felony family violence arrests have increased

6% per year from 2014 to 2018. She noted that a gap analysis utilizing a framework based on a public health approach was performed and included increasing protective factors and decreasing risk factors. She reviewed the life course theory of prevention and noted that the ecosystem of violence included:

- Child abuse
- Suicide
- Gun violence
- Elder abuse
- Domestic violence

Dr. Bridger stated that many indicators vary widely from year to year and there were concerns with the quality and definitions of data. She noted that most of the available data was from law enforcement. She stated that the following data sources were utilized in the gap analysis:

- Survey of congressional town hall attendees
- Two surveys of community-based service providers
- Interviews with community stakeholders
- Interviews with State and Federal experts

She noted that the Town hall survey recommendations included:

- Removing weapons from the home of domestic violence abusers
- Teen and youth dating violence prevention programs
- Training for Police Officers on domestic violence response
- Increasing the number of legal advocates to support survivors through the court process
- Parent education programs which prevent child abuse
- Communication campaigns about where to seek help for domestic violence
- Training for healthcare providers to identify and support survivors of domestic violence

She stated that the following themes were identified as the result of community interviews:

- Community norms (acceptance of the status quo)
- Perceived importance
- Complexity of work
- Specialized populations
- Lack of coordination
- Transparency of process and outcomes

Dr. Bridger stated that a violence prevention framework was created and included the categories of primary prevention, secondary prevention, acute response, and tertiary prevention. She noted that the Commission on Collaborative Strategies to Prevent, Combat, and Respond to Domestic Violence was formed by Judge Peter Sakai who appointed Dr. Bridger and Judge Monique Diaz as co-chairs of the Commission. She stated that the stakeholder subcommittees included: 1) Non-profit coordination; 2)

Law enforcement; 3) Healthcare; 4) Prosecution; and 5) Judiciary. She noted that an additional stakeholder subcommittee would be added for higher education. She stated that the Healthcare Subcommittee would focus on a communication campaign and a referral and training system; the Judicial Subcommittee would focus on pro bono representation and firearm surrender enforcement; the Law Enforcement Subcommittee would create a Domestic Violence High Risk Team; the Non-Profit Subcommittee would focus on school-based education and pro bono access; and the Prosecution Subcommittee would perform the Praxis International Blueprint Analysis. She noted that the City and the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services allocated \$1 million to address domestic violence in the following manner:

- Triple P Parenting Program (\$250,000)
- Domestic violence communications campaign (\$170,000)
- School-based violence prevention (\$80,000)
- Competitive Request for Proposal (RFP) to support initiatives (\$500,000)

Dr. Bridger stated that additional sources of support included: 1) San Antonio Area Foundation (\$600,000); 2) UT Health (\$100,000); 3) Texas Council on Family Violence (funding for coordinator); and 4) The Kronkosky Foundation (Triple P and ISD work). She noted that the remaining \$500,000 was set aside to respond to priorities identified by the Commission by non-profit organizations. She reviewed the multiple initiatives underway to address domestic violence by SAPD.

Melody Woosley stated that the Department of Human Services would issue an RFP on November 1, 2019 for \$500,000 to support community-wide domestic violence efforts to prevent and eliminate domestic violence. She noted that the solicitation would target non-profits entities which provide services related to the Domestic Violence Plan. She stated that the proposed contract term would begin upon contract award and end September 30, 2021 with a one-year renewal. She noted that the RFP scope of work priorities included:

- Referral system
- Pro Bono representation
- Domestic Violence High Risk Teams
- School-based education
- Blueprint for safety
- Forensic Nurse Examiners
- Lethality assessments

Ms. Woosley reviewed the outreach that would be performed; the evaluation criteria; the evaluation voting members; and additional requirements. She stated that the application due date for the RFP was December 16, 2019 and the RFP would be brought before City Council in February 2020 for consideration with a contract start date in March 2020.

Dr. Bridger presented the following five-year goals:

1. Disrupt developmental pathways toward partner violence
2. Teach safe and healthy relationship skills
3. Increase cross-sector partnerships and transparency
4. Coordinate and streamline access to services and Trauma-Informed Response Systems

5. Support survivors to increase safety and lessen harms
6. Reduce access to weapons and increase availability of rehabilitative programs

Dr. Bridger stated that by the end of the first year baseline indicators for each objective would have been established and each year staff would report on the progress of the previous year. She noted that a final report would be issued at the end of year five.

Mayor Nirenberg questioned this year's statistics on domestic violence. Dr. Bridger stated additional time was needed to assess trends and updated data would be provided. Mayor Nirenberg confirmed that domestic violence was not limited to one socioeconomic bracket or zip code and affected all populations. He recommended that updates be provided to the Community Health and Equity Council Committee.

Councilmember Gonzales asked of the process for removing weapons from those arrested for family violence or as a condition of their bond. Chief McManus stated that the current process was based on the honor system and the Judiciary Subcommittee was reviewing how this process was addressed by other communities. He noted that the process developed would be dependent on resources available. Councilmember Gonzales expressed support for additional funding for delegate agencies.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan asked how survivors would be included in stakeholder committees or policy work groups. Dr. Bridger replied that quarterly town halls would be held where survivors would be encouraged to provide feedback. She stated that monthly Facebook Live Sessions would be held where individuals could provide feedback and a document on the Facebook site was available for individuals to fill out.

Councilmember Viagran requested that a report be made to the Public Safety Council Committee on the process for the removal of firearms from individuals. She asked of the definition of family violence. Lieutenant Salame stated that family violence related to individuals which reside in the same household.

Councilmember Cabello Havrda asked of the experts guiding this work. Dr. Bridger stated that Jenny Hixon from Metro Health has reached out to experts in other areas as our expert liaison. Councilmember Cabello Havrda asked of the role of the faith and business community. Dr. Bridger noted that the faith community was part of the Task Force and staff were partnering with the Chambers of Commerce regarding a model policy and training on domestic violence.

Councilmember Treviño asked if Joint Base San Antonio (JBSA) had been engaged in the process. Dr. Bridger replied that General Lenderman would participate on the Commission. Councilmember Treviño requested representation by the LGBTQ community on the Evaluation Committee.

Councilmember Perry asked how a misdemeanor was defined. Lieutenant Salame replied that misdemeanors were Class A, B and C Assaults. Councilmember Perry asked if the RFP had been brought before the Audit and Accountability Committee. Dr. Bridger replied that the RFP went straight to City Council in order to release the RFP as soon as possible.

Councilmember Peláez stated that in 2018, the Battered Women and Children's Shelter housed 4,063 women and children and in 2019 to date, the Battered Women and Children's Shelter housed 3,777 women and children.

Councilmember Courage asked if there was a registry at the Local, State, or National level for domestic violence offenders. Dr. Bridger replied that there was not.

2. Briefing by the San Antonio Metropolitan Health District on the mandatory posting of letter grade placards in food establishments. [Colleen M. Bridger, MPH, PhD, Assistant City Manager; Jennifer Herriott, Interim Director, Health]

Mario Martinez stated that in 2014, the Office of Innovation conducted a study in which recommended outcomes indicating the need for an updated scoring system for food establishments. He noted that with input from the Restaurant Association and other stakeholders, Metro Health implemented a voluntary letter grade placard in 2016. He added that per State Law and City Ordinance food establishments must display the latest food inspection score in a conspicuous place for public viewing.

Mr. Martinez stated that the letter grade placard increased transparency, reduced foodborne illnesses, and assisted with long-term compliance. He noted that major cities across the nation and cities in Texas have adopted letter grade placards which were supported by the National Association of County and City Health Officials. He stated that a presentation on the status of the voluntary letter grade placard was made to the Community Health and Equity Committee in 2018 and the Committee approved a motion for City Council consideration on the mandatory display of letter grade placards.

Mr. Martinez presented a timeline which included reporting on the input received from the public and food establishments followed by consideration by the City Council later this year. He noted that if approved, an education period would occur in January – March 2020 followed by implementation and enforcement in April 2020.

Mr. Martinez stated that a public survey in English and Spanish was conducted which was promoted through Metro Health and SA Speak Up. He noted that there were 2,968 respondents to the public survey, and reviewed the survey results. He reported that 97% of respondents indicated that they would like to see letter grades posted in public view at restaurants. He stated that 2,833 surveys were collected for food establishments. He reported that an even distribution of respondents was observed from each Council District. He noted that food establishments were provided with three options to determine the letter grades and the opportunity to comment on the proposal to make display of letter grade placards mandatory.

He reviewed the three options available for selection on the food establishment survey and noted that 319 selected option 1; 854 selected option 2; and 1,444 selected option 3. He stated that option 3 allowed establishments to receive a new score based on an average of the past three inspections and the current inspection with the average of all four scores determining the letter grade with no fee. He reviewed the concerns and recommendations posed by business associations. He noted that Metro Health made the following recommendations:

- Mandatory letter grade placards implemented in January 2020
- Use average of last three and current scores
- Letter grade placard with score
- Post placard on front door or window
- Include three-month education period

- Establishments may request a re-grade inspection if 10 points lower than the average of the last three scores
- Golden A for four consecutive 90+ scores

Dr. Bridger added that she would meet with each Councilmember to discuss the options presented. She noted that Metro Health was requesting City Council approval to revise the annual customer license invoice billing to October 1st of each year. She stated that this initiative would assist in tracking past due accounts and keeping customer accounts up to date. She noted that there would be no change to invoice license fees associated with the proposed revision and Metro Health would pro-rate the annual fee for new establishments.

Andy Segovia clarified that Dr. Bridger would meet with each Councilmember and review the options regarding the letter grade placard and answer questions.

Mayor Nirenberg asked how old the oldest inspection would be if the last four inspection scores were averaged. Dr. Bridger replied that the oldest inspection would be from one year ago. Mayor Nirenberg suggested that re-inspection fees be scaled to the size of the business.

Councilmember Viagran asked where the placards were currently placed. Mr. Martinez replied that it was up to the food establishment. Councilmember Viagran asked how long the inspections were good. Mr. Martinez replied that food establishment with high risk were inspected every four months; and those with medium risk were inspected twice a year. Councilmember Viagran asked if the policy would apply to food trucks and similar food establishments. Mr. Martinez replied that the policy would not apply to food trucks or similar food establishments.

Councilmember Perry asked of the input received from the San Antonio Restaurant Association, the Tourism Council, and the Riverwalk Association. Dr. Bridger stated that they did not want the program to be mandatory. Councilmember Perry requested the number of restaurants which agreed or didn't agree to mandatory display of letter grade placards. Dr. Bridger would provide that data to the Councilmembers.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mayor Nirenberg recessed the meeting at 5:21 p.m. to discuss the following items:

- A. Economic development negotiations pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.087 (economic development).
- B. The purchase, exchange, lease or value of real property pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.072 (real property).

- C. Legal issues related to collective bargaining pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney).
- D. Settlement offer in litigation styled Maria Salazar, et al. v. City of San Antonio pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney).

Mayor Nirenberg reconvened the meeting at 6:02 pm and announced that no action was taken.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Nazarete Ruben Flores Perez stated that we take orders from the father and people crossing over from other countries bring their traditions with them.

ADJOURNED

There being no further discussion, Mayor Nirenberg adjourned the meeting at 6:15 pm.

APPROVED

**RON NIRENBERG
MAYOR**

Attest:

LETICIA M. VACEK TRMC/CMC/MMC
City Clerk