



September 12, 2016

Mr. Dean Bayer, PE
Construction Group Project Manager
City of San Antonio – TCI Department
114 W. Commerce, 9th Floor
San Antonio, TX 78205

Re: 2017 Asphalt Overlay Contract Package 3 – Award Recommendation Letter

Dear Mr. Bayer:

On September 6, 2016, contractor bid proposals for the referenced project were opened and read aloud. Five bid proposals were submitted with the bid submitted by Lone Star Paving containing mathematical errors. This error did not impact the outcome of the low bid.

The low bidder for this contract is Clark Construction of Texas Inc. with a total base bid of \$8,347,433.50. Clark Construction is headquartered in San Antonio, TX and has done a significant amount of asphalt overlay related projects for the City of San Antonio and others in the surrounding area. Clark Construction has been awarded similar contracts in recent years and the City of San Antonio has been pleased with their work. Due to no knowledge of poor performance which would exclude Clark Construction from being recommended for award, LAN recommends the award of this contract to Clark Construction of Texas Inc. Below is a listing of the contractors who bid on the contract and their total base bids:

1. Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.	\$8,347,433.50
2. Asphalt Inc., dba Lone Star Paving	\$8,843,561.00
3. J&P Paving Co., Inc.	\$8,927,047.50
4. Angel Brothers Enterprises, LTD.	\$9,891,835.00
5. Austin Materials, LLC.	\$10,066,780.00

Attached herewith are the following:

- 1) One (1) pdf copy of the bid tabulations
- 2) One (1) pdf copy of the summary of the low bidder's prices, which is 9.4% below the responsive contractor's bid proposal average and 15.7% below the Engineers Estimate.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 210-499-5082, or by email at sjaniol@lan-inc.com.

Respectfully,

Stephen Aniol, P.E.
Project Manager

Cc: Juan Romero

BID TABULATION			Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.		Engineer's Estimate		Unit Price Comparison		
Project: 2017 Asphalt Overlay Package 3			5140 Gibb Sprawls Rd. San Antonio, TX 78219 210-661-6785						
Bid Opening: Tuesday, September 6, 2016									
Owner: City of San Antonio Department of Transportation & Capital Improvements									
Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.									
10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082									
LAN Project No.: 120-11729-020			LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER						
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	DELTA	% DELTA
BASE BID									
103.1	REMOVE CONCRETE CURB	2,500	LF	\$1.25	\$3,125.00	\$1.60	\$4,000.00	(\$0.35)	-21.9%
103.3	REMOVE SIDEWALKS AND DRIVEWAYS	11,500	SF	\$1.00	\$11,500.00	\$1.50	\$17,250.00	(\$0.50)	-33.3%
203	TACK COAT	3,500	GAL	\$3.00	\$10,500.00	\$3.50	\$12,250.00	(\$0.50)	-14.3%
205.4A	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22)	5,500	TON	\$76.23	\$419,265.00	\$83.60	\$459,800.00	(\$7.37)	-8.8%
205.4B	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP)	2,300	TON	\$66.89	\$153,847.00	\$89.60	\$206,080.00	(\$22.71)	-25.3%
208.1	SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPH. PVMT (2")	340,000	SY	\$0.75	\$255,000.00	\$2.85	\$969,000.00	(\$2.10)	-73.7%
209.1	BUS STOP CONCRETE PAVEMENT (10" DEPTH)	5,350	SY	\$71.50	\$382,525.00	\$85.00	\$454,750.00	(\$13.50)	-15.9%
230.3	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (6" COMPACTED DEPTH)	22,500	TON	\$100.94	\$2,271,150.00	\$98.30	\$2,211,750.00	\$2.64	2.7%
230.3	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (12" COMPACTED DEPTH)	1,200	TON	\$63.17	\$75,804.00	\$103.20	\$123,840.00	(\$40.03)	-38.8%
250	SEAL COAT	420,250	SY	\$1.05	\$441,262.50	\$1.60	\$672,400.00	(\$0.55)	-34.4%
340	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT, TYPE C (2" THICK) (PG 76-22) (CLASS "A" TRAP ROCK)	40,000	TON	\$79.90	\$3,196,000.00	\$88.20	\$3,528,000.00	(\$8.30)	-9.4%
438	CLEANING EXISTING JOINTS	350	LF	\$15.00	\$5,250.00	\$14.20	\$4,970.00	\$0.80	5.6%
454	HEADER TYPE EXPANSION JOINT SEALANT	350	LF	\$52.00	\$18,200.00	\$33.60	\$11,760.00	\$18.40	54.8%
500	CONCRETE CURB, GUTTER, AND CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER	2,500	LF	\$14.00	\$35,000.00	\$13.60	\$34,000.00	\$0.40	2.9%
502.1	CONCRETE SIDEWALKS	1,250	SY	\$42.00	\$52,500.00	\$40.60	\$50,750.00	\$1.40	3.4%
502.1A	CURB RAMPS	280	EA	\$1,100.00	\$308,000.00	\$1,150.00	\$322,000.00	(\$50.00)	-4.3%
503.1	PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE DRIVEWAYS	450	SY	\$54.00	\$24,300.00	\$44.50	\$20,025.00	\$9.50	21.3%
512.1	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (STORM SEWER)	15	EA	\$425.00	\$6,375.00	\$400.00	\$6,000.00	\$25.00	6.3%
512.1B	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (AT&T)	15	EA	\$600.00	\$9,000.00	\$465.00	\$6,975.00	\$135.00	29.0%
515.1	TOPSOIL	450	CY	\$30.00	\$13,500.00	\$21.00	\$9,450.00	\$9.00	42.9%
516.1	SODDING	1,800	SY	\$9.00	\$16,200.00	\$6.00	\$10,800.00	\$3.00	50.0%
533-A	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4")	500	LF	\$1.00	\$500.00	\$0.85	\$425.00	\$0.15	17.6%
533-B	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8")	250	LF	\$2.00	\$500.00	\$1.30	\$325.00	\$0.70	53.8%
533-C	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12")	250	LF	\$3.00	\$750.00	\$1.90	\$475.00	\$1.10	57.9%
533-D	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24")	250	LF	\$4.00	\$1,000.00	\$3.20	\$800.00	\$0.80	25.0%
533-E	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL)	10	EA	\$85.00	\$850.00	\$92.00	\$920.00	(\$7.00)	-7.6%
533-G	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	10	EA	\$85.00	\$850.00	\$92.00	\$920.00	(\$7.00)	-7.6%
533-H	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (RR-XING)	10	EA	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$215.00	\$2,150.00	(\$15.00)	-7.0%
535.1	4" WIDE YELLOW LINE	130,000	LF	\$0.30	\$39,000.00	\$0.50	\$65,000.00	(\$0.20)	-40.0%
535.2	4" WIDE WHITE LINE	30,000	LF	\$0.30	\$9,000.00	\$0.50	\$15,000.00	(\$0.20)	-40.0%
535.4	8" SOLID WHITE LINE	4,500	LF	\$0.85	\$3,825.00	\$1.00	\$4,500.00	(\$0.15)	-15.0%
535.5	12" WIDE WHITE LINE	1,000	LF	\$3.00	\$3,000.00	\$3.60	\$3,600.00	(\$0.60)	-16.7%
535.7	24" WIDE WHITE LINE	3,000	LF	\$5.00	\$15,000.00	\$5.50	\$16,500.00	(\$0.50)	-9.1%
535.12	WORD "ONLY"	50	EA	\$110.00	\$5,500.00	\$120.00	\$6,000.00	(\$10.00)	-8.3%
535.14	RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL	5	EA	\$550.00	\$2,750.00	\$515.00	\$2,575.00	\$35.00	6.8%
535.16	STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY	55	EA	\$75.00	\$4,125.00	\$125.00	\$6,875.00	(\$50.00)	-40.0%
535.17	BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL	40	EA	\$110.00	\$4,400.00	\$220.00	\$8,800.00	(\$110.00)	-50.0%
535.22	WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE)	30	EA	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$160.00	\$4,800.00	(\$10.00)	-6.3%
535.23	WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT)	130	EA	\$95.00	\$12,350.00	\$105.00	\$13,650.00	(\$10.00)	-9.5%
537.1	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W)	160	EA	\$1.50	\$240.00	\$4.20	\$672.00	(\$2.70)	-64.3%
537.2	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y)	160	EA	\$1.50	\$240.00	\$4.20	\$672.00	(\$2.70)	-64.3%
537.6	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C)	3,000	EA	\$4.00	\$12,000.00	\$3.40	\$10,200.00	\$0.60	17.6%
537.8	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A)	3,000	EA	\$4.00	\$12,000.00	\$3.40	\$10,200.00	\$0.60	17.6%
537.9	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R)	500	EA	\$4.00	\$2,000.00	\$3.60	\$1,800.00	\$0.40	11.1%
556.1	CAST IN PLACE DETECTABLE WARNING SURFACE TILES	50	EA	\$100.00	\$5,000.00	\$130.00	\$6,500.00	(\$30.00)	-23.1%
624.2	GROUND BOXES TYPE B (12x22)	10	EA	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$210.00	\$2,100.00	(\$10.00)	-4.8%
712	JOINT AND CRACK SEALING	6,000	LB	\$3.00	\$18,000.00	\$3.60	\$21,600.00	(\$0.60)	-16.7%
798	ASPHALT CONCRETE CUSHION SPEED HUMPS, TYPE 3	40	EA	\$1,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$2,400.00	\$96,000.00	(\$1,400.00)	-58.3%
SUP 1	DOOR HANGERS	1	LS	\$750.00	\$750.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	(\$250.00)	-25.0%
SUP 2	POLICE OFFICER	1,250	HR	\$40.00	\$50,000.00	\$47.00	\$58,750.00	(\$7.00)	-14.9%
SUP 3	RAILROAD INSURANCE AND PERMIT	1	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$0.00	0.0%
SUP 4	LAPTOP AND INTERNET ACCESS	1	LS	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$0.00	0.0%
SUP 5	TCI AT WORK PROJECT SIGN	30	EA	\$200.00	\$6,000.00	\$250.00	\$7,500.00	(\$50.00)	-20.0%
SUP 6	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD)	20	MO	\$2,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$2,100.00	\$42,000.00	(\$100.00)	-4.8%
SUP 7	ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION	10	EA	\$1,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$2,600.00	\$26,000.00	(\$1,600.00)	-61.5%
TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS:					\$8,022,933.50		\$9,580,659.00		
826	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT	550	EA	\$200.00	\$110,000.00	\$205.00	\$112,750.00	(\$5.00)	-2.4%
826A	VALVE BOX LOCATE AND ADJUSTMENT (SAWS)	15	EA	\$50.00	\$750.00	\$105.00	\$1,575.00	(\$55.00)	-52.4%
TOTAL SAWS WATER BID ITEMS:					\$110,750.00		\$114,325.00		
851	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	400	EA	\$425.00	\$170,000.00	\$400.00	\$160,000.00	\$25.00	6.3%
851A	LOCATING AND ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	15	EA	\$50.00	\$750.00	\$200.00	\$3,000.00	(\$150.00)	-75.0%
TOTAL SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:					\$170,750.00		\$163,000.00		
TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:					\$281,500.00		\$277,325.00		
512.1A	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLE (CPS ENERGY)	5	EA	\$600.00	\$3,000.00	\$205.00	\$1,025.00	\$395.00	192.7%
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	200	EA	\$200.00	\$40,000.00	\$205.00	\$41,000.00	(\$5.00)	-2.4%
TOTAL CPS ENERGY BIT ITEMS:					\$43,000.00		\$42,025.00		
TOTAL BASE BID:					\$8,347,433.50		\$9,900,009.00		