HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

June 03, 2015

Agenda Item No: 09

HDRC CASE NO:	2015-192
ADDRESS:	3903 N ST MARYS
ZONING:	R6 HS RIO-1
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	2
LANDMARK:	Brackenridge Park
APPLICANT:	Tim Morrow
OWNER:	City of San Antonio / Parks Department
TYPE OF WORK:	San Antonio Zoo Giraffe Exhibit
REQUEST:	

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Revise the existing hoofstock exhibit into a mixed hoofstock and giraffe exhibit, including regrading the site to be giraffe friendly. To achieve the giraffe friendly grades, the pond and some landscape islands are to be removed as well as the existing, non historic barn. Existing landscape islands that remain will be encased in a smooth coat of rockwork for animal welfare. A new pond will be constructed as well as a wood screen fence that will be constructed at a taller height.

The applicant has noted that the historic stone walls on the east side of the exhibit will not be impacted by the proposed work. All grading work will tie into the existing grades at the wall and slope away.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. Complementary materials—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

UDC Section 35-670. Criteria for Certificate of Appropriateness-Generally

(b) Design Objectives for River Improvement Overlay Districts.

(1)Enhance the pedestrian experience with high quality streetscape designs.

(2)Design buildings to relate to the pedestrian scale.

(3)Low impact development (LID) features such as engineered swales, engineered infiltration

storm sewer systems, bio-retention, and engineered wetlands are encouraged in all RIO districts.

These features may be considered on-site detention features to the extent that they reduce the

storm water runoff expected downstream as a result of such developments.

(4)Encourage neighborhood and cultural tourism uses as well as infill housing and rehabilitation of existing structures.

UDC Section. 35-642. New Construction of Buildings and Facilities.

In considering whether to recommend approval or disapproval of a certificate, the historic and design review commission shall be guided by the following design considerations. These are not intended to restrict imagination, innovation or variety, but rather to assist in focusing on design principles, which can result in creative solutions that will enhance the city and its neighborhoods. Good and original design solutions that meet the individual requirements of a specific site or neighborhood are encouraged and welcomed.

(a)Site and Setting.

(1) Building sites should be planned to take into consideration existing natural climatic and topographical features. The intrusive leveling of the site should be avoided. Climatic factors such as sun, wind, and temperature should become an integral part of the design to encourage design of site-specific facilities which reinforces the individual identity of a neighborhood and promotes energy efficient facilities.

(2) Special consideration should be given to maintain existing urban design characteristics, such as setbacks, building heights, streetscapes, pedestrian movement, and traffic flow. Building placement should enhance or create focal points and views. Continuity of scale and orientation shall be emphasized.

(3) Accessibility from streets should be designed to accommodate safe pedestrian movement as well as vehicular traffic. Where possible, parking areas should be screened from view from the public right-of-way by attractive fences, beams, plantings or other means.

(4) Historically significant aspects of the site shall be identified and if possible incorporated into the site design. Historic relationships between buildings, such as plazas or open spaces, boulevards or axial relationships should be maintained.

(b)Building Design.

(1)Buildings for the public should maintain the highest quality standards of design integrity. They should elicit a pride of ownership for all citizens. Public buildings should reflect the unique and diverse character of San Antonio and should be responsive to the time and place in which they were constructed.

(2)Buildings shall be in scale with their adjoining surroundings and shall be in harmonious conformance to the identifying quality and characteristics of the neighborhood. They shall be compatible in design, style and materials. Reproductions of styles and designs from a different time period are not encouraged, consistent with the secretary of

the interior's standards. Major horizontal and vertical elements in adjoining sites should be respected.

(3)Materials shall be suitable to the type of building and design in which they are used. They shall be durable and easily maintained. Materials and designs at pedestrian level shall be at human scale, that is they shall be designed to be understood and appreciated by someone on foot. Materials should be selected that respect the historic character of the surrounding area in texture, size and color.

(4)Building components such as doors, windows, overhangs, awnings, roof shapes and decorative elements shall all be designed to contribute to the proportions and scale of their surrounding context. Established mass/void relationships shall be maintained. Patterns and rhythms in the streetscape shall be continued.

(5)Colors shall be harmonious with the surrounding environment, but should not be dull. Choice of color should reflect the local and regional character. Nearby historic colors shall be respected. (6)Mechanical equipment or other utility hardware should be screened from public view with materials compatible with the building design. Where possible, rooftop mechanical equipment should be screened, even from above. Where feasible, overhead utilities should also be underground or attractively screened. Exterior lighting shall be an integral part of the design. Interior lighting shall be controlled so that the spillover lighting onto public walkways is not annoying to pedestrians.

(7)Signs which are out of keeping with the character of the environment in question should not be used. Excessive size and inappropriate placement on buildings results in visual clutter. Signs should be designed to relate harmoniously to exterior building materials and colors. Signs should

express a simple clear message with wording kept to a minimum.

(8)Auxiliary design. The site should take into account the compatibility of landscaping, parking facilities, utility and service areas, walkways and appurtenances. These should be designed with the overall environment in mind and should be in visual keeping with related buildings, structures and places.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation numbers 9 and 10:

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

FINDINGS:

- a. In order to accommodate a giraffe exhibit at the San Antonio Zoo, the applicant has proposed to remove three existing landscaping islands. Within these existing landscaping islands are a variety of trees including Palm trees and Mesquite. The Palms range from 13" to 15" in diameter and the Mesquite range from 10" to 16" in diameter. These landscaping islands are each approximately 3' tall and are constructed of stone similar to the stone featured in the WPA walls, however the WPA era historic walls are not to be impacted by the removal of the landscaping islands. The remaining landscaping islands will be coated with a smooth rock surface to accommodate the giraffe. This is consistent with the UDC Section 35-642(a) regarding Site and Setting.
- b. Along with the removal of three non original landscaping islands, the applicant has proposed to re-grade the site to accommodate the giraffe and construct a new pond. The applicant has noted that the regrading activities will not damage the WPA era walls and will slope away from the walls. This is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation numbers 9 and 10.
- c. The applicant has proposed to remove the existing wood screen fence in the proposed giraffe exhibit and rebuilt a taller food fence at the pedestrian bridge for a giraffe barrier. The applicant has proposed to reconstruct the new wood screen fence to match the materials of the existing. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B.i.
- d. The applicant has proposed to demolish the existing, non historic barn due to wood rot. Within this demolition, the applicant has proposed to salvage the existing roof structure. Staff finds that the demolition of this non original element as well as the salvaging of the existing roof structure is appropriate.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings a through d.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall





The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.























Accessibility for Persons with Disabilities : This drawing contains layouts and elements critical to providing Access for Disabled Persons. Contractor shall provide verification and certification of Compliance with the applicable accessibility regulations.

Design Intent : Outlines, sketches, or references of possible Outlines, sketches, or references of possible theming, exhibits, and graphics on this drawing are for design intent; to show or describe the character, scope, relationships, forms, size and appearance of the Project, major materials and systems, in general, their quality levels, performance standards, requirements, or criteria. Engineered design, means, methods, manufacture, installation, code compliance, operation, safety, and warranties are to be provided by the Contractor; including engineering documentation signed and sealed by a qualified Engineer licensed to practice by the authority having jurisdiction. The Architect/Designer's review of submittals is for the purpose of checking for conformance with information given and the design concept expressed in the Contract Documents.





Keynote List SEE GENERAL DWG INFO. SHEET FOR COMPLETE LIST

024113 SITE CLEARING - REF CIVIL	
024113A	REMOVE - AS NOTED
024113D	EXISTING TO REMAIN
024119 SELECTIVE DEMOLITION	
024119A	REMOVE - AS NOTED
024119B	REMOVE AND TURN OVER TO OWNER
024119D	EXISTING TO REMAIN
055000 METAL FABRICATIONS	
055000C	ACCESSORY - AS NOTED
061000 ROUGH CARPENTRY	
061000A	DIMENSION LUMBER - SIZE NOTED
129353 EXHIBIT FURNISHINGS	
129353A	LYING DEADFALL TREE
129353B	NATURAL STONE BOULDERS / ROCKS
130002 ARTIFICIAL ROCKWORK	
130002A	ROCKWORK
	024113A 024113D 024119 SELECTIVE DEMO 024119A 024119B 024119D 055000 METAL FABRICATI 055000C 061000 ROUGH CARPENT 061000A 129353 EXHIBIT FURNISHI 129353A 129353B 130002 ARTIFICIAL ROCKV



Accessibility for Persons with Disabilities : This drawing contains layouts and elements critical to providing Access for Disabled Persons. Contractor shall provide verification and certification of Compliance with the applicable accessibility regulations.

Design Intent : Outlines, sketches, or references of possible theming, exhibits, and graphics on this drawing are for design intent; to show or describe the character, scope, relationships, forms, size and appearance of the Project, major materials and systems, in general, their quality levels, performance standards, requirements, or criteria. Engineered design, means, methods, manufacture, installation, code compliance, operation, safety, and warranties are to be provided by the Contractor; including engineering documentation signed and sealed by a qualified Engineer licensed to practice by the authority having jurisdiction. The Architect/Designer's review of submittals is for the purpose of checking for conformance with information given and the design concept expressed in the Contract Documents.



SAN ANTONIO ZOO – GIRAFFE EXHIBIT (PACKAGE 1) PROJECT NARRATIVE

Revise existing hoofstock exhibit into a mixed hoofstock and giraffe exhibit, including regading site to be giraffe friendly. To achieve the giraffe friendly grades, the pond and some landscape islands are to be removed. Existing landscape islands that remain will be encased in a smooth coat of rockwork for animal welfare. A new pond will be constructed.

Historic stone walls at the east side of the exhibit will not be impacted by this scope of work. Grading will tie in to the existing grades at the wall and slope away.

EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 1: Southeast corner - Grade to be revised, sloped away from base of existing wall



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 2: East Wall – Demolition of landscape island to allow giraffe friendly grades



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 3: East Wall - No scope at wall, demolish landscape island to allow for giraffe friendly grades

EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 4: East wall – No demolition scope



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 5: Pedestrian Bridge – No demolition scope



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 6: Pedestrian Bridge – Replace wood screen fence with taller wood fence for giraffe barrier



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 7: South Guest View – Demolish landscape island



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 8: South Guest View - Demolish landscape island to allow for giraffe friendly grades



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 9: East Guest Pathway – No scope



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 10: North Guest View – Encapsulate existing rockwork planters in smooth rockwork for giraffe protection



EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 11: North Giraffe Barn – Demolish barn and fence posts due to rot, salvage roof structure



PLANS – ELEVATIONS - MATERIALS



Site Demolition Plan

PLANS – ELEVATIONS - MATERIALS





PLANS – ELEVATIONS - MATERIALS



Pond Plan and Detail





PLANS – ELEVATIONS - MATERIALS





Smooth Rockwork Character





PLANS – ELEVATIONS - MATERIALS



Wood Screen Fence and Gate Character

