HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

July 15, 2015 Agenda Item No: 6

HDRC CASE NO: 2015-279

ADDRESS: 903 N OLIVE ST

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 530 BLK 14 LOT 19

ZONING: R5 H CITY COUNCIL DIST.: 2

DISTRICT: Dignowity Hill Historic District

APPLICANT: Lawrence Watts
OWNER: Lawrence Watts
TYPE OF WORK: Roof replacement

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to remove the existing cedar shingle roof and replace with a standing seam metal roof to match the roofing material presently installed on the dormers.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

3. Materials: Roofs

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. Regular maintenance and cleaning—Avoid the build-up of accumulated dirt and retained moisture. This can lead to the growth of moss and other vegetation, which can lead to roof damage. Check roof surface for breaks or holes and flashing for open seams and repair as needed.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- *i. Roof replacement*—Consider roof replacement when more than 25-30 percent of the roof area is damaged or 25-30 percent of the roof tiles (slate, clay tile, or cement) or shingles are missing or damaged.
- ii. Roof form—Preserve the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs when replacement is necessary. iii. Roof features—Preserve and repair distinctive roof features such as cornices, parapets, dormers, open eaves with exposed rafters and decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, and brackets with shaped ends. iv. Materials: sloped roofs—Replace roofing materials in-kind whenever possible when the roof must be replaced. Retain and re-use historic materials when large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required (e.g., slate or clay tiles). Salvaged materials should be re-used on roof forms that are most visible from the public right-of-way. Match new roofing materials to the original materials in terms of their scale, color, texture, profile, and style, or select materials consistent with the building style, when in-kind replacement is not possible.
- v. *Materials:* flat roofs—Allow use of contemporary roofing materials on flat or gently sloping roofs not visible from the public right-of-way.
- vi. Materials: metal roofs—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof. vii. Roof vents—Maintain existing historic roof vents. When deteriorated beyond repair, replace roof vents in-kind or with one similar in design and material to those historically used when in-kind replacement is not possible.

FINDINGS:

- a. The house at 903 N Olive was constructed circa 1900 and is of the Italianate style featuring a simple hipped roof, tall narrow windows, dormers with arched or hooded window moldings and a brick façade that is painted white.
- b. Houses constructed in the Italianate style feature various roofing forms and variations, however, most commonly feature a standing seam metal. In this instance, the structure features cedar shingles which are the original cedar

- shingles. The applicant has stated that the proposed change from cedar shingles to a standing seam metal roof is in relationship to insurance coverage.
- c. While the removing of an original feature of a contributing historic feature or material is generally not recommended, the applicant has proposed a replacement material that is consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 3.B.iv. The applicant should use panels that are 18 to 21 inches in width, ensure that seams are an appropriate height (1 to 2 inches), use a crimped ridge seam that is consistent with the historic application, use a low profile ridge cap and use a galvalume finish.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings a through c.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Jul 08, 2015

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.



