

## HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

August 19, 2015

Agenda Item No: 17

**HDRC CASE NO:** 2015-328  
**ADDRESS:** 1438 NAPIER AVE  
**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 7657 BLK LOT E 134.51 FT OF 26 2010) SPLIT PER PLAT 9601/23  
**ZONING:** C3R H RIO-5  
**CITY COUNCIL DIST.:** 3  
**DISTRICT:** Mission Historic District  
**APPLICANT:** Armando Santiago  
**OWNER:** Armando Santiago  
**TYPE OF WORK:** New Construction of a Carport  
**REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a metal frame carport. The proposed carport will measure 20' x 26' with a height of 8'.

### APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

*Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction*

#### 3. Materials and Textures

##### A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

#### 5. Garages and Outbuildings

##### A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.

ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.

iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.

##### B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used.

ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

### FINDINGS:

- a. The property at 1438 Napier Ave is part of the Mission Historic district. The subject property is located along a rural street with a mix of residential structures and open land. Within the context of the street, the subject property actively engages with the street and is not set back as far as some of its counterparts.
- b. According to the Guidelines for New Construction on Materials and Textures, 4.A.i., new materials should complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. The applicant proposes to construct a 20' x 26' carport to feature steel posts and a metal roof. The carport will have blue trim along the roof line to match the existing garage. Staff finds the carport's steel post details to be incongruent to the materials typically found in the district. This is not consistent with the guidelines.
- c. According to the Guidelines for New Construction on Garages and Outbuildings, 4.A.i., new garages and

outbuildings should be designed to be visually subordinate to the principle historic structure in terms of their height, massing and form. The applicant proposes to build a carport with an overall footprint of approximately 520 square feet. The overall height of the proposed carport is approximately 8 feet in height. The proposed ridge height, and scale is subordinate to the primary structure and is consistent with the Guidelines.

- c. According to the Guidelines for New Construction on Building Size, 4.A.ii., new outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principle historic structure footprint. The proposed carport's footprint of approximately 520 square feet is consistent with the Guidelines, however the dominating prominence of the structure on the lot would not be appropriate.
- d. New garages and outbuildings should relate to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details. The primary building features stucco walls and a metal roof. The applicant has proposed steel posts for the carport's beams, and a metal roof. The materials reflect an industrial aesthetic that does not complement the materials of the primary structure or the garage to which it should relate. The proposed carport appears to be a prefabricated product that does not have the quality or character of a site built structure. This is not consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.iii.
- e. According to the Guidelines for New Construction on Orientation, 4.B.i., the garage orientation should match the predominant orientation found along the block. The applicant's proposed carport orients towards the main street. This is consistent with the guidelines.
- f. According to the Guidelines for New Construction 4.B.ii., setbacks should follow historic patterns of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. The applicant has noted the proposed carport to be located at the northwest corner of the lot with a 6' side setback. This is consistent with the Guidelines.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff does not recommend approval of the carport based on findings a through f.

#### **CASE MANAGER:**

Alyson Smith



**1438 Napier**

Printed: Aug 13, 2015

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.







**TOTAL** ⓘ  
**\$ 1,415.00**

**SIZE**



20X26 \$ 1,295.00 ▼

ADD TO

CART

**TRIM  
COLOR**

Leave a message



**ROOF  
COLOR**



