HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

October 21, 2015 Agenda Item No: 3

HDRC CASE NO: 2015-402

ADDRESS: 510 ADAMS ST

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 2914 BLK 3 LOT 3

ZONING: RM4 H CITY COUNCIL DIST.:

DISTRICT: King William Historic District

APPLICANT: Juan Barrera **OWNER:** Juan Barrera

TYPE OF WORK: Final approval of porch demolition and reconstruction

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to demolish the existing concrete front porch and construct a new, wood front porch.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- *i. Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- *ii. Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- *iii. Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- *i. Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- *ii. Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- *iii.* Replacement—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
- *iv. Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
- v. Reconstruction—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

FINDINGS:

- a. The house at 510 Adams is of the Craftsman style and was constructed circa 1930. Craftsman style homes commonly feature both concrete and wood front porches as well as a combination of the two. The applicant has proposed to remove the existing, damaged concrete porch and construct a new, wood porch to feature dimensions to match the existing.
- b. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 7.B.iv., the design of porch reconstruction should be compatible in scale, massing and detail as the original. The applicant has proposed to retain the existing

- porch height and width to be consistent with the Guidelines. While the applicant has proposed a material change, staff finds this material change architecturally appropriate.
- c. The applicant has proposed to construct front porch railing on both the south and east porch facades. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 7.B.iv., added elements should be added as to not distract from the historic character of the building. The proposed railing is simple in design featuring square railings and post caps and will be painted to match the other porch wood. This is consistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings a through c.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Oct 13, 2015

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.

510 Adams - Porch Design

Here's a quick summary of why we want/need to consider replacement:

1. Structure: There is a large crack in the middle of the existing concrete block, resulting in a three-inch rise on the right side of the porch

2. Safety: With no railing to support the climb up the stairs, nor on the sides, I am afraid that my 85-year-old father-in-law will fall

Historical significance:

- * In a conversation in late May/early June with the Executive Director of the KWA, I discovered that these homes did not originally have concrete used anywhere in their material designs
- * Sometime in the 40's, though, the use of concrete was utilized more frequently (no one is sure why, but the assumption is based on the limited supply of wood and perhaps the innovation of concrete into the market)
 * In a conversation on July 15th (HDRC Meeting) to disclose this historical
- evidence, the Vice-Chair (Michael Guarino), agreed with this timeline re: wood v concrete

Materials:

- * Treated wood will be utilized with wood posts, railings and front steps.
- * Post caps will consist of same material
- * All wood will be painted to match trim (pure white)

Timing:

* Work can/will be completed in December/January

Construction:

* All work will be completed by a licensed/bonded General Contractor (contact information can be supplied, if necessary)









