HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

April 20, 2016

Agenda Item No: 27

HDRC CASE NO:	2016-036
ADDRESS:	931 HAYS ST
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 1654 BLK B LOT S 140 FT OF 16
ZONING:	R5 H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	2
DISTRICT:	Dignowity Hill Historic District
APPLICANT:	Ruben Carrillo
OWNER:	2627 Enterprise
TYPE OF WORK:	Final Approval for new construction

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single family residence on the vacant lot at 931 Hays, at the corner of Hays and Muncey.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements. ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

C. RELATIONSHIP OF SOLIDS TO VOIDS

i. *Window and door openings*—Incorporate window and door openings with a similar proportion of wall to window space as typical with nearby historic facades. Windows, doors, porches, entryways, dormers, bays, and pediments shall be considered similar if they are no larger than 25% in size and vary no more than 10% in height to width ratio from adjacent historic facades.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*— New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. Roof materials—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

B. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. *Salvaged materials*—Incorporate salvaged historic materials where possible within the context of the overall design of the new structure.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. Service Areas—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. Roof-mounted equipment—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure. ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced. The host historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

FINDINGS:

- a. This request received conceptual approval on February 3, 2016, with the stipulations that wood windows be used and that the foundation heights and setbacks be consistent with the Guidelines.
- b. The applicant has increased the front setback to be consistent with the adjacent properties on the block, consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 1.A.i.
- c. The orientation of the structure features the primary entrance facing Hays Street. The proposed primary entrance

orientation is consistent with those found on the block, in a north-south orientation.

- d. According to the Guidelines for New Construction 2.A.iii foundation and floor to floor heights should be aligned within one foot of floor to floor heights on adjacent structures. The historic example common throughout the Dignowity Hill Historic District is a prominent foundation height of at least 12 inches, often times with the exposed concrete foundation or an architectural foundation skirting. The applicant has increased the foundation height in response to this recommendation.
- e. New construction should be designed so that its overall scale and height are consistent with nearby historic structures. 931 Hays is a corner lot that is surrounded by single family residences. The front gabled roof and single story height of the structure are consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 2.B.i. and the existing examples of historic single family residences in Dignowity Hill.
- f. According to the Guidelines for New Construction 2.C. window and door openings should be similar in proportion to those on nearby historic facades. The applicant has proposed window and door openings along the front, rear and side façades that are consistent with those found throughout the neighborhood. This is consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 2.C.i.
- g. New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic structures in terms of building to lot ratio. The proposed building footprint should not cover more than 50% of the total lot area. The applicant's proposed building footprint is consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 2.D.
- h. The applicant has proposed materials that consist of Dutch lap wood siding, an asphalt shingle roof, Craftsman style wood doors and single hung vinyl windows. Although many of the materials are consistent with the Guidelines, staff recommends that the applicant install wood windows per the Guidelines.
- i. The applicant has included a side yard wooden fence in the site plan. Side yard fences are a typical site element found in the Dignowity Hill Historic District, and this request is consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B.i and ii.
- j. The applicant has included a decomposed granite front driveway and a new approach in the site plan. Many driveways on this block of Hays are unpaved, paved or feature a ribbon driveway. According to the Guidelines for Site Elements, 5.B.i. it is important to retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration. Currently there is no existing driveway or approach. Adding these elements is appropriate according to the Guidelines.
- k. Staff finds that the applicant has proposed architectural details that are appropriate to the architectural housing stock found along Hays Street as well as throughout this section of Dignowity Hill.
- 1. At this time, the applicant has not provided landscaping information. Staff recommends the applicant follow the Guidelines for Site Elements while developing a landscaping plan.
- m. Consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, windows used in new construction must maintain traditional dimensions and profiles and should be recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are not recommended. The corresponding page from the adopted windows policy document has been added to the exhibits for this request. A window detail or wall section which illustrates conformance with the guidelines for windows has not been submitted.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that wood windows or a window that is consistent with the guidelines be installed versus the proposed vinyl windows based on finding m. The applicant must submit a window detail or section that specifies the use of a block frame window that has a minimum recess of 2", and which eliminates a faux-divided light configuration in favor of a traditional one-over-one configuration.

CASE MANAGER:

Cory Edwards



N

931 Hays

Dignowity Hill

Printed:Jan 19, 2016

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.







931 Hays St. San Antonio, Texas 7820

FOCAL DESIGN BUILDERS

February 1, 2016



931 Hays St.

San Antonio, TX 78202 Dignowity Hill S. 140' of Lot 16, Block B, N.C.B. 1654

Scope of Work

New construction residence of around 1630 s.f. conditioned space plus 300 s.f. of outdoor porches. Residence to have three bedrooms, two baths and open social areas. Design was accomplished by following the ratios and architectural components that other historic residences have along the block of Hays street.

Materials

Wood Siding: Dutch Lap

Exterior Paint : Siding : Loft Space N500-2

Details (window trim, columns, Fascia, etc.): Behr White

Roofing : (similar to photo)

New fence/ Gate: Wood (similar to photo)

Drive Way: Decomposed Granite











Materials

Front Door : Crafstman 6 Lite Staned Mahogany Wood Prehung

Windows:

JELD-WEN, V-4500 Series Single Hung Vinyl Window with Grids : (similar to photo)









931 Have St	First Floor	Plan		1.0
501 Hays Ol.	Date	2.01.2016	Scale	1/8" = 1'-0"







2 North 1/8" = 1'-0"

931 Have St	Ext. Elevations	2.0
301 Hays Ol.	Date 2.01.2016	Scale 1/8" = 1'-0"









031 Have St	Ext. Ele	evations	2.1		
551 Hays OL	Date	2.01.2016	Scale	3/32" = 1'-0"	



				Room Finish	Schedule					
		Finish								
key	Room Name	Floor	Base	Wall	Ceiling	Heigth	Comments			
1	Living	WOOD	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
2	Dining	WOOD	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
3	Kitchen	TILE	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
4	Master Bedroom	CARPET	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
5	Master Closet	CARPET	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
6	Master Bath	TILE	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
7	Toilet Rm.	TILE		GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
8	Shower	TILE		TILE	TILE	8" - 0"				
9	Bedroom 1	CARPET	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
10	Closet	CARPET	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
11	Hall	WOOD	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
12	Laundry	TILE		GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
13	Bathroom	TILE		GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
14	Shower	TILE		TILE	TILE	8" - 0"				
15	Bedroom	CARPET	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	12' - 0"				
16	Closet	CARPET	1 X 4	GYPSUM BOARD	GYPSUM BOARD	8" - 0"				
17	HVAC	TILE								
18	W/H									

						Door Schedule		
Door								Finish
Number	To Room: Name	Door Size	Width	Height	Manufacturer	Model	Finish	Comments
D1	Living	36" x 84"	3' - 0"	7' - 0"	STEVES & SONS	M3306-6-CT-MJ-6IRH	STAINED	
D3	Kitchen	36" x 84"	3' - 0"	7' - 0"	STEVES & SONS	M3306-6-CT-MJ-6IRH	STAINED	
D4a	Master Bedroom	32" x 84"	2' - 8"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D4b	Master Bedroom	32" x 84"	2' - 8"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D5	Master Closet	48" x 84"	4' - 0"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D6	Master Bath	48" x 84"	4' - 0"	7" - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D7	Toilet Rm.	24" x 84"	2' - 0"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D9	Hall	32" x 84"	2' - 8"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D10	Closet	30" x 84"	2' - 6"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D12	Laundry	48" x 84"	4' - 0"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D13	Hall	36" x 84"	3' - 0"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D15	Hall	32" x 84"	2' - 8"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D16	Closet	48" x 84"	4' - 0"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D17	HVAC	30" x 84"	2' - 6"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	
D18	W/H	30" x 84"	2' - 6"	7' - 0"	VERANDA	J626WWADAELH	PAINT	

Window Schedule								
	Rough	Opening	Manufacture					
Type Mark	Width	Height	r	Model	Material	Comments		
A	2' - 6"	5' - 0"	JELD-WEN	V-2500	VINYL			
В	2' - 8"	5' - 0"	JELD-WEN	V-2500	VINYL			
С	2' - 6"	6' - 6"	JELD-WEN	V-2500	VINYL			
D	2' - 6"	3" - 6"	JELD-WEN	V-2500	VINYL			
E	3' - 0"	6" - 0"	JELD-WEN	V-2500	VINYL			
F	1' - 4"	2' - 0"	JELD-WEN	V-2500	VINYL			



2.0







1 First Floor Electrical

4.0



























SELECTING WINDOWS FOR NEW BUILDINGS

3.A.i. Complementary materials—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district...

Windows used in new construction should:

- Maintain traditional dimensions and profiles;
- Be recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are <u>not</u> recommended;
- Feature traditional materials or appearance. Wood windows are most appropriate. Double-hung, block frame windows that feature alternative materials may be considered on a case-by-case basis;
- Feature traditional trim and sill details. Paired windows should be separated by a wood mullion.

The use of low-e glass is appropriate in new construction provided that hue and reflectivity are not drastically different from regular glass.

Examples in New Construction:





