

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

April 20, 2016

Agenda Item No: 25

HDRC CASE NO: 2016-150
ADDRESS: 334 W ELSMERE PLACE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 3967 BLK 2 LOT E 25 FT OF 3 & W 25FT OF 4
ZONING: R5 H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.: 1
DISTRICT: Monte Vista Historic District
APPLICANT: David McKay/Painting N More
OWNER: Peter Krulevitch
TYPE OF WORK: Reroofing and roof form change
REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Remove larger gable roof line and leave existing rounded gable over porch.
2. Replace an asbestos shingle roof with a 24 gauge galvalume standing seam metal roof with 18 inch panels.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

3. Materials: Roofs

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Roof replacement*—Consider roof replacement when more than 25-30 percent of the roof area is damaged or 25-30 percent of the roof tiles (slate, clay tile, or cement) or shingles are missing or damaged.
- ii. *Roof form*—Preserve the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs when replacement is necessary.
- iii. *Roof features*—Preserve and repair distinctive roof features such as cornices, parapets, dormers, open eaves with exposed rafters and decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, and brackets with shaped ends.
- iv. *Materials: sloped roofs*—Replace roofing materials in-kind whenever possible when the roof must be replaced. Retain and re-use historic materials when large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required (e.g., slate or clay tiles). Salvaged materials should be re-used on roof forms that are most visible from the public right-of-way. Match new roofing materials to the original materials in terms of their scale, color, texture, profile, and style, or select materials consistent with the building style, when in-kind replacement is not possible.
- vi. *Materials: metal roofs*—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof.

FINDINGS:

- a. The structure at 334 W Elsmere Place is craftsman style one story home, with an asphalt shingle roof. The configuration at the entrance includes a gable over a brow arch supported by columns.
- b. The applicant is proposing to remove the gable and continue existing roof slope to meet the bow. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 3.B.ii., historic roof forms should be preserved. Staff made a site visit on April 12, 2016, and found that roof form change would be appropriate for the craftsman architecture style of the home, and that there are other homes on the block with similar roof forms. Staff finds the applicant's proposal appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.
- c. The home at 334 W Elsmere was identified in the Monte Vista National Register Nomination in 1990. The photo from the nomination indicates the existing top gable.
- d. The applicant is proposing to install a standing seam metal roof on the main structure at 334 W Elsmere Place to feature the standard galvalume color and 18 inch panels. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance

and Alterations, metal roofs are to be used on structures that historically had metal roofs or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. During the site visit, staff found standing seam metal roofs on craftsman style homes, but did not find the combination of this architectural style and a standing seam metal roof. The proposal is not consistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of item #1 based on findings a and b. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2 based on finding c. If the HDRC approves the request to install a standing seam metal roof, staff recommends that it's approved with stipulations that the applicant ensure seams are one to two inches, use a a crimped ridge seam, and use a low-profile ridge cap with no ridge cap vent or end cap.

CASE MANAGER:

Lauren Sage



The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.

334 W Elsmere Pl - existing



CITY of SAN ANTONIO
NOTICE of HEARING
HISTORIC & DESIGN
REVIEW COMMISSION

ADDRESS: 1001 S. ALAMO ST.
REQUEST: HISTORIC & DESIGN REVIEW - 1001 S. ALAMO ST.
HEARING DATE: 10/10/11 2011

TIME: 3:00 P.M.

FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT
(210) 215-9274

ALL HDRC MEETINGS TAKE PLACE AT 1001 S. ALAMO



334 W Elsmere - proposed



example submitted by applicant



examples submitted by applicant









302

EDISON
SECURITY

