HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

July 6, 2016 Agenda Item No: 10

2016-203 431 ADAMS ST NCB 2880 BLK 5 LOT 9 RM4 H 1 King William Historic District Jorge Araujo Scott & Hoda Cummings, Scott & Hoda Cummings Demolition of accessory structure and new construction
Demolition of accessory structure and new construction

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a new, two story accessory structure. The demolition of the existing, non-contributing accessory structure as well as the replacement of the existing roof of the primary historic structure were approved at the June 15, 2016, HDRC Hearing.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

i. Massing and form—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.

ii. Building size – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.

iii. Character—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.

iv. Windows and doors—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions. *v. Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. Orientation—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used. *ii. Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

FINDINGS:

- a. The applicant has proposed to construct a new, two story accessory structure. The demolition of the existing, noncontributing accessory structure as well as the replacement of the existing roof of the primary historic structure were approved at the June 15, 2016, HDRC Hearing.
- b. MASSING & FORM According to the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.i, new accessory structures should be designed to be visually subordinate to the primary historic structure in terms of their height, massing and form. The primary historic structure at 431 Adams features a single story with a foundation height of approximately two feet and an overall height of 21' – 0". The applicant has proposed to construct an accessory structure to include two levels and an overall height of 23' – 1 ½". In terms of height, while the proposed structure is slightly taller

than the primary historic structure, staff finds its height is generally appropriate in context with other accessory structures along both Adams and Barbe.

- c. BUILDING SIZE The applicant has proposed an overall building size of approximately 1,000 square feet. The primary historic structure features a footprint of approximately 1,500 square feet. While the applicant has proposed a footprint that is larger than half of that of the primary historic structure, staff finds that this proposal is appropriate given that the overall massing of the proposed structure is subordinate to that of the primary historic structure.
- d. CHARACTER New accessory structures should relate to the period or construction of the primary historic structure on the lot through the use of contemporary materials and simplified architectural details. Elements that should relate are façade materials, roofing materials, window and door openings and materials and overall architectural form.
- e. CHARACTER At this time, the applicant has proposed façade materials to include Hardi Board siding and brick consistent with the brick of the primary historic structure. The applicant has proposed vertically oriented siding, comparable in dimension as other structures in the immediate vicinity. This is consistent with the Guidelines and appropriate for the King William.
- f. WINDOWS & DOORS The applicant has noted that the accessory structure is to feature aluminum windows that feature the proportions of the windows found in the primary historic structure. Additionally, the applicant has noted that each window will be inset at least 2 inches within each wall. Staff finds this proposal appropriate.
- g. GARAGE DOORS In regards to the proposed garage doors, the applicant has not noted a specific material, however, staff finds that the applicant should study existing garage door found throughout the district that are architecturally contributing.
- h. ORIENTATION According to the Guidelines, the predominant garage orientation found along the block should be matched. Corner lots found along Barbe Street feature a primary structure orientation toward the intersecting streets while the accessory structure's orientation is toward Barbe. The applicant's proposed orientation is consistent with the Guidelines.
- i. SETBACKS Per the Guidelines, the historic setback pattern of similar accessory structures along the streetscape should be followed. The applicant has noted compliance with setback requirements while using a similar setback found throughout the district. This is consistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through i with the stipulation that each window is inset at least two inches within solid walls.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Jun 07, 2016

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.







431 ADAMS ST - FRONT OF EXISTING HOME FROM ADAMS ST.

431 ADAMS ST. - FRONT LEFT VIEW OF EXISTING HOME AT CORNER OF ADAMS AND BARBE

431 ADAMS ST - LEFT SIDE ELEVATION OF EXISTING HOME ALONG BARBE

431 ADAMS ST - LEFT LOT LINE ALONG BARBE. SHOWING FENCE FROM REAR OF EXISTING HOME TO EXISTING TWO CAR GARAGE

431 ADAMS ST - FRONT OF EXISTING GARAGE VIEW FROM BARBE, AT CORNER OF BARBE AND WICKES.



DATE Haven JOB # 1516 U I L D E R S 5/13/16 6/14/16 HD HNG ROUND CS. 6. ROUND CS. 6. ROUND CS. 6. ROUND CS. CONTRACT STRATE 6/20/16 Щ [́]́щ _о RA APK , 50. 12. 17. F 0 ⁿ 4 ſ∕/ ()Ш Ш Ŕ ((\mathbf{r} NORTH \cap * Ц \langle РM WINTER SOLSTIC ----(n)TOP TON PREVAILING SUMMER BREEZE 4 SHEET $\frac{\text{SITE}}{\text{SCALE:}} \xrightarrow{\text{PLAN}}$













427 WICKES ST. - VIEW ALONG BARBE ST. OF LEFT ELEV OF ACCESSORY BLDG

.......

427 WICKES ST. - VIEW ALONG BARBE ST. OF LEFT SIDE OF ELEV OF ACCESSORY BLDG. LEFT SIDE NEIGHBOR GARAGE (BLUE) ALSO IN VIEW. 427 WICKES ST - CORNER OF WICKES AND BARBE FACING THE REAR OF THE SUBJECT PROPERTY'S LOT.

ONE STORY HOME 1208 SQ. FT.

REAR ACCESSORY BLDG: 360 SQFT GARAGE 400 SQFT ON FLOOR 1 360 SQFT ON FLOOR 2

8

427 WICKES ST - LEFT ELEVATION ALONG BARBE ST. OF MAIN HOME AND ELEV OF DETACHED GARAGE / 2 STORY STRUCTURE FACING REAR OF HOME

HARDI MASSING SIMILAR TO PROPOSED IS BEING APPLIED AT AN ONGOING PROJECT ON ADAMS ST. NE OF THE SUBJECT PROPERTY

7100000000



