HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

July 06, 2016 Agenda Item No: 21

HDRC CASE NO: ADDRESS: LEGAL DESCRIPTION: ZONING: CITY COUNCIL DIST.: DISTRICT: APPLICANT: OWNER: TYPE OF WORK: 2016-154 211 DEVINE ST NCB 724 BLK 6 LOT 11 RM4 H 1 Lavaca Historic District Emily & David Tucker Emily & David Tucker Final approval of a rear addition

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a rear addition at 211 Devine to feature approximately 420 square feet. The applicant has proposed materials to include a standing seam metal roof, wood siding and Hardi Board skirting.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

i. Minimize visual impact—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate. *ii. Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate. *iii. Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions. *iv. Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

i. Subordinate to principal facade—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.

ii. Rooftop additions—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

iii. Dormers—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.

iv. Footprint—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.

v. Height—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

i. Complementary materials—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

ii. Metal roofs—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and M aintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

iii. Other roofing materials—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

i. Imitation or synthetic materials—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. Salvage—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. Historic context—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider characterdefining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. Architectural details—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. Contemporary interpretations—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

FINDINGS:

- a. This case was heard by the Historic and Design Review Commission on May 18, 2016, where it received conceptual approval with the stipulations that the applicant include a transition piece between the proposed new addition and the existing structure, that the applicant provide specifications for the proposed windows and trim and that the applicant salvage any removed windows into the new addition.
- b. Staff performed a site visit on June 22, 2016, and found that while they are relatively screened, the proposed skylights are viewable from the public right of way.
- c. ADDITION The applicant has proposed to construct an addition of approximately 420 square feet at the rear of the property at 211 Devine. The Guidelines for Additions 1.A. states that additions should be sited to minimize visual impact from the public right of way, should be designed to be in keeping with the historic context of the block, should utilize a similar roof form and should feature a transition between the old and the new. The applicant has proposed for the rear addition to feature a gabled roof, setbacks from the historic structure's façade on one elevation and a transition detail. This is consistent with the Guidelines.
- d. SCALE MASSING & FORM Regarding scale, massing and form, the applicant has proposed for the addition to feature matching foundation heights and comparable floor to ceiling heights as the primary historic structure. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 1.A.
- e. MATERIALS The applicant has noted that materials for the proposed addition will include a standing seam metal roof, wood siding, Hardi Board skirting, wood windows to match the existing and window trim to match the existing. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Additions. The applicant should ensure that the new roof feature panels that are eighteen to twenty-one inches in width, crimped seams that are one to two inches in height, a low profile ridge cap and a galvalume finish.
- f. SKYLIGHTS The applicant has proposed to create four skylights in the original structure's roof. Two skylights

are to be located on the north (rear) roof slope while one side light is to be located on each the east and west roof slopes. Staff finds that the installation of skylights on the north (rear) roof slope to be appropriate, however, staff finds that the addition of skylights on the east and west roof slopes are not in keeping with the historic character of the original structure as it is viewed from the public right of way. Staff recommends the applicant eliminate the east and west skylights.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through e with the stipulation that the proposed skylights be flush or recessed within the original roof on the east and west roof slopes.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Jun 16, 2016

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.







Current Street View



Current Front of House



Current West Side of House



Current East Side of House



Current Back/Rear of House

June 7, 2016

Dear HRDC,

My husband and I are seeking final approval to begin the renovation of our new home. We have addressed the three recommendations that you all provided in our conceptual approval in the new drawing set submitted here.

We look forward to getting started on this project and are thrilled to be joining such a vibrant and caring neighborhood. Thank you for your guidance.

Sincerely,

Emily and David Tucker

TUCKER HOUSE

211 DEVINE STREET SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS

GENERAL NOTES

1. ALL MEASUREMENTS TO BE VERIFIED IN FIELD BY CONTRACTOR.

2. ALL MEP SYSTEMS TO BE UPGRADED TO MEET CURRENT MUNICIPAL CODE.

INTERIOR FINISH NOTES

1. ORIGINAL WOOD FLOORS TO BE REPAIRED AND REFINISHED, SEE DEMO PLAN FOR LOCATION.

2. PLYWOOD FLOORS TO BE REMOVED, SEE DEMO PLAN FOR LOCATION.

3. ADDITION BEDROOM TO HAVE NEW WOOD FLOORS, SEE FLOORPLAN FOR LOCATION.

4. ALL BATHROOMS TO BE FINISHED WITH TILE FLOORING TBD. ALL FIXTURES TBD.

5. ALL DOOR TRIM, WINDOW TRIM, AND MOULDING TO BE REMOVED BY HOMEOWNER AND REUSED BY CONTRACTOR WHERE POSSIBLE.

6. EXISTING WALLS TO REMAIN TO BE STRIPPED DOWN TO SHIPLAP LAYER. SHIPLAP TO REMAIN OR TO BE REMOVED AND REUSED, TBD. DEMO WALLS TO BE STRIPPED DOWN TO SHIPLAP LAYER, SHIPLAP TO BE REMOVED AND REUSED WHERE POSSIBLE.

EXTERIOR FINISH NOTES

1. EXISTING ROOF SHEATHING AND METAL TO BE REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH NEW INSULATED METAL ROOF. ROOF ON ADDITION TO MATCH.

2. ALL ORIGINAL WINDOWS TO BE REMOVED, RESTORED, AND REPLACED WHERE POSSIBLE.

3. ALL EXTERIOR WALLS TO BE STRIPPED, PRIMED, AND REPAINTED, COLOR TBD.

4. FRONT AND REAR CONCRETE STEPS TO BE DEMOLISHED AND REPLACED, DESIGN TBD.

5. FRONT PORCH DECKING TO BE REPLACED.

6. ALL NEW WINDOWS TO BE WOOD FRAME AND MATCH EXISTING WINDOWS IN APPEARANCE AND TRIM DETAIL



TUCKER HOUSE 211 DEVINE ST SAN ANTONIO, TX 78210 DEVINE ST. ANTONIO, $(\cap$ \geq **REVISIONS:** DATE 6.7.16 DRAWN BY: DTT & EET TITLE & GENERAL NOTES T100

| | ۴I | NEW METAL ROOF OF SIMILAR TYPE AND STYLE |
|--------|----|--|
| | F2 | ADDITION SIDING TO MATCH EXISTING HISTORIC SIDING |
| | F3 | NEW HARDIE PLANK SKIRT |
| U U | F4 | DECORATIVE LAP SIDING TO REMAIN |
| | F5 | ALL NEW WINDOWS TO MATCH EXISTING IN STYLE AND TRIM DETAIL |



02 LEFT SIDE ELEVATION

1/8"=1'





SIDING TRANSITION

2'

01

]"=]'







| \Box | F١ | NEW METAL ROOF OF SIMILAR TYPE AND STYLE |
|--------|----|---|
| | F2 | ADDITION SIDING TO MATCH EXISTING HISTORIC SIDING |
| Ū | F3 | NEW HARDIE PLANK SKIRT |
| | F4 | DECORATIVE LAP SIDING TO REMAIN |





FRONT ELEVATION

0' 2' 4'

01









| | (F5) | |
|------------|------|----------|
| £3) | | |
| (5) (5) | | |
| ¢ | | |
| ¢} | | |
| A | | |
| F 4 | | (F4) |
| | | <u> </u> |

| | F١ | EXISTING WALLS TO REMAIN |
|------------|----|---|
| \bigcirc | F2 | DEMO WALL |
| Z | F3 | DEMO FLOOR |
| Ū | F4 | WINDOWS TO BE REMOVED, REPAIRED, AND REUSED |
| Ш | F5 | WINDOWS TO BE REMOVED |
| | | |

01 DEMOLITION PLAN







