HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

July 06, 2016

Agenda Item No: 33

HDRC CASE NO:	2016-254
ADDRESS:	327 W CRAIG PLACE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 1858 BLK 1 LOT 16, E 10 FT OF 15 & W 10 FT OF 17
ZONING:	O2 H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	1
DISTRICT:	Monte Vista Historic District
APPLICANT:	William Triplett/H.E.B.
OWNER:	Respite Care of San Antonio
TYPE OF WORK:	Addition, exterior modifications

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to do the following work on the Carriage house located in the rear of 327 W Craig Place:

- 1. Replace 2 existing wood windows on exiting dormers with wood windows
- 2. Alter 4 existing window openings
- 3. Install a triple wood window on the east façade
- 4. Install a wood one over one window on the south facade
- 5. Replace existing non-historic door on south facade
- 6. Demolish existing addition
- 7. Install a concrete slope to be ADA compliant and concrete walkway
- 8. Replace existing siding with board and batten fiber cement board
- 9. Repair woodwork with wood composite or fiber cement board

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alteration

1. Materials: Woodwork

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.

iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. Doors-Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. Muntins—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. Replacement glass—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

vii. Non-historic windows—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

viii. Security bars-Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.

ix. Screens—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

1. Topography

A. TOPOGRAPHIC FEATURES

i. *Historic topography*—Avoid significantly altering the topography of a property (i.e., extensive grading). Do not alter character-defining features such as berms or sloped front lawns that help define the character of the public right-of-way. Maintain the established lawn to help prevent erosion. If turf is replaced over time, new plant materials in these areas should be low-growing and suitable for the prevention of erosion.

ii. New construction—Match the historic topography of adjacent lots prevalent along the block face for new construction.
Do not excavate raised lots to accommodate additional building height or an additional story for new construction.
iii. New elements—Minimize changes in topography resulting from new elements, like driveways and walkways, through appropriate siting and design. New site elements should work with, rather than change, character-defining topography when possible.

8. Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Compliance

A. HISTORIC FEATURES

i. *Avoid damage*—Minimize the damage to the historic character and materials of the building and sidewalk while complying with all aspects of accessibility requirements.

ii. *Doors and door openings*—Avoid modifying historic doors or door openings that do not conform to the building and/or accessibility codes, particularly on the front façade. Consider using a discretely located addition as a means of providing accessibility.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Grade changes*—Incorporate minor changes in grade to modify sidewalk or walkway elevation to provide an accessible entry when possible.

ii. *Residential entrances*—The preferred location of new ramps is at the side or rear of the building when convenient for the user.

iii. *Non-residential and mixed use entrances*—Provide an accessible entrance located as close to the primary entrance as possible when access to the front door is not feasible.

C. DESIGN

i. *Materials*—Design ramps and lifts to compliment the historic character of the building and be visually unobtrusive as to minimize the visual impact, especially when visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Screening*—Screen ramps, lifts, or other elements related to ADA compliance using appropriate landscape materials. Refer to Guidelines for Site Elements for additional guidance.

iii. *Curb cuts*—Install new ADA curb cuts on historic sidewalks to be consistent with the existing sidewalk color and texture while minimizing damage to the historical sidewalk.

FINDINGS:

a. The property at 327 W Craig Place is a one-story Folk Victorian built circa 1902 in the Monte Vista Historic

District. The applicant is proposing to work on the Carriage House at this address. No work is being requested on the main structure. The Carriage House is a one-story structure, with a hipped roof, a standing seam metal roof, two gables and board and batten siding. The structure appears on the August 1935 Sanborn map without the shed addition. The Carriage House is identified in the 1998 Survey as contributing, built circa 1920.

- b. The applicant recently received administrative approval to remove existing privacy fence around accessory structure, paint carriage house, repair foundation of carriage house, replace existing standing seam metal with new standing seam metal, replace existing skirting and repair and replace the gutters.
- c. Currently, there are 9 wood windows, 2 on the two existing dormers and 7 one over ones. Two of the seven are on the addition that the applicant is proposing to demolish. The applicant is proposing to replace 2 windows with the wood fixed windows on the dormers.
- d. The applicant is also proposing to create and alter four openings, one on the south elevation, and infill all three windows on the west elevation. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.i, window and door openings should be preserved. The proposal to alter window openings is not consistent with the Guidelines. Staff recommends that the existing window openings be preserved.
- e. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.vii., historic windows should be repaired or, if beyond repair, should be replaced with a window to match the original in terms of size, type, configuration, material and details, feature clear glass, and recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are not recommended. The corresponding pages from the adopted windows policy document have been added to the exhibits for this request. Staff made a site visit June 22, 2016, and found that though the windows are in poor shape, they are repairable. Staff recommends that the applicant repair the existing wood windows and salvage the windows from the addition to be demolished.
- f. The applicant is proposing to install a triple wood window, consisting of three one over one windows on the new east elevation where the addition was removed. The applicant is also proposing to install one wood one over one window in the south elevation. The new windows match the proportions of the existing one over one windows.
- g. Staff finds the new windows consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.iv., which states to install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, form and detail. However, staff recommends that the applicant attempt to salvage the wood windows from the addition that is proposed to be demolished.
- h. The applicant is proposing to replace existing non-historic door on south façade with another door. The applicant is proposing to replicate the front door of the main structure and install it on the Carriage House. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.A., historic doors should be repaired, or replaced when necessary with a style of door that is historically appropriate. Staff finds the proposed door consistent with the Guidelines.
- i. The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing rectangular addition on the east side of the carriage house. The structure appears on the August 1935 Sanborn map without the shed addition. Staff finds the removal of the non-historic addition appropriate.
- j. Currently, there is no walkway to the Carriage House. The applicant is proposing to install a concrete slope to be ADA compliant to access the front door of the Carriage house. The concrete walk way will not exceed a 1:12 slope up to the entrance. The entrance will have a landing the meets the 60" length minimum. Staff finds the proposal appropriate as the walkway is minimal, meets ADA standards, and will not be seen from the public right-of-way.
- k. The applicant is proposing to replace the existing wood siding and repair woodwork with board and batten fiber cement board. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 2, repair should be considered before replacement, hardiboard is not recommended and in-kind materials are preferred when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Staff recommends the applicant repair the siding with in-kind materials and dimensions, and only repair when necessary. Repairs in-kind can be approved administratively.
- 1. Staff visited the site June 22, 2016, and found the windows in tact with broken glass, and the board and batten had various profiles.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends denial of items #1, 2, 8 and #9 based on findings a through e and finding j. Staff recommends that the applicant repair those windows that are repairable and replace when necessary with wood windows of the same dimension and profile, feature clear glass, and recessed within the window frame. Staff recommends the applicant repair the existing siding, where repair is not possible replace with in-kind materials with the same dimensions.

Staff recommends approval of items #3 through #7 based on findings f through i with the following stipulations:

1. That the applicant used salvaged windows from the addition when creating new window openings.

CASE MANAGER:

Lauren Sage





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Jun 20, 2016

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.



HDRC Application Respite Care of San Antonio 327 W. Craig Place (Carriage House), Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, TX



Contents:

- 4. Photos of the existing structure and site
- 8. Narrative explaining scope of the proposed renovation
- 9. Site Plan
- 12. Explanation of Proposed Modifications plan and elevations
- 20. Details, Materials, & Colors

The applicant recently received administrative approval to remove existing privacy fence around accessory structure, paint carriage house, repair foundation of carriage house, replace existing standing seam metal with new standing seam metal, replace existing skirting and repair and replace the gutters. Front Elevation South Elevation



Site Details: 327 W. Craig Place (Carriage House) San Antonio, TX - Monte Vista Historic District Owner: Respite Care of San Antonio, Inc. Zoning: O2 H Block 1 Lot: 16 [East 10ft of 15 & West 10ft of 17]



Right Elevation



Site Details: 327 W. Craig Place (Carriage House) San Antonio, TX - Monte Vista Historic District Owner: Respite Care of San Antonio, Inc. Zoning: O2 H Block 1 Lot: 16 [East 10ft of 15 & West 10ft of 17]



5

Rear Elevation

North Eevation



Site Details: 327 W. Craig Place (Carriage House) San Antonio, TX - Monte Vista Historic District Owner: Respite Care of San Antonio, Inc. Zoning: O2 H Block 1 Lot: 16 [East 10ft of 15 & West 10ft of 17]



Left Elevation West Elevation



Site Details: 327 W. Craig Place (Carriage House) San Antonio, TX - Monte Vista Historic District Owner: Respite Care of San Antonio, Inc. Zoning: O2 H Block 1 Lot: 16 [East 10ft of 15 & West 10ft of 17]



7

Narrative of Proposed Work

327 W. Craig Place (Carriage House)
San Antonio, Texas
Monte Vista Historic District
Block 1 Lot 16 [East 10' of 15, West 10' of 17]
Zoning: O2 H
Owner: Respite Care of San Antonio, Inc.

Respite Care of San Antonio proposes to renovate the Carriage House at 327 W. Craig Place in order to make it a habitable and suitable space for the caretakers and children of Respite Care. The one-story structure will be converted into a learning and activity center.

The Carriage House requires extensive work in order to make it a habitable space. There is an addition that was added onto the original structure that will be removed. The supporting foundation of the structure will require reinforcing and leveling. Due to inconsistencies in patterning, damage, rot, lead, and maintainability, the existing siding will be removed and replaced with a "board and batten" fiber cement board material. The pattern will be consistent with the original character of the board and batten siding. Abating and re-siding will also allow for the installation of a vapor barrier and proper insulation of the house. All other damaged, rotted and compromised exterior woodwork and trim will be replaced as needed with a fiber cement board type product or wood composite trim such a MiraTEC. The shape, scale, and form of the original woodwork patterns will be maintained or replicated as needed. The existing windows will be replaced with wood windows which are consistent shape, form, and operation of the original windows (as we did in the Main House). The new windows will also have insulated glass.

The existing roof has suffered a significant amount damage and will have to be replaced. The original roof line will remain the same. The existing 7-12 slope will be maintained and structural reinforcement to the framing will be completed prior to installing a new metal, standing seam roof. The design/installation of the new roof panels will be consistent with current practices and construction with a hidden fastener type installation. The appearance of the roof (21" spacing) is consistent with the existing roof.

As the carriage house is repaired, the project will restore/replace architectural elements in accordance with the original design. The vernacular style of the carriage house is a composition of various styles which has evolved over time. Since its original construction in 1902, the structure has had numerous additions, which vary in cladding material and detailing. The proposed renovation will remove the most recent addition (approximately 97 sqft - non-historic) from the east side and restore the façade as accurately as possible to the original design. This will include a set of three windows. The windows design will be consistant with those of the original design.

The underpinning along the foundation will be replaced and styled in a manner consistent with the existing. The gutters will be repaired/replaced as necessary and all downspouts will be directed away from the foundation. The surrounding sitework will be regraded to allow for proper drainage. There will also be a new entry ramp aded to allow for ADA access.



)

9



Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas



Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas

Explanation of Proposed Modifications

diagrammatic overview

- Remove Existing Addition
- Remove Surrounding Wood Fence
- Restore / Replace Facades, Roof, Windows, Doors and Trim
- Regrade Sorrounding Sitework for Drainage
- Add new entry ramp to allow for ADA access.





Proposed Plan

*Net change to building footprint is approx 97sf reduction

Existing Plan





³²⁷ West Craig Place Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas



327 West Craig Place Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas

Z

Keyed Notes

- 2. 3.
- Double locked 26 GA. Galvalume standing seam metal roof. Board & Batten Siding (match style to original) fiber cement board. Window trim per detail (repair/replace as necessary) typical all conditions. Painted wood windows w-insulated glass (dimensions & sash profile match to existing) typical all conditions Galvanized sheet metal flashing above heads of windows and doors typical all conditions. Typical corner trim 5/4 x 4 Miratec (replace, match existing). Typical fascia 2 x 6 cedar (repair/replace as necessary). Replace door (to match Main House). Add concrete Walkway.
- 4. 5. 6. 7. 8.

- 9.
- 10.
- Level house and re-grade surrounding site as needed. Wall trim $-5/4 \times 6$ Miratec (replace, match existing)... Wall trim $-5/4 \times 2$ Miratec (replace, match existing). 11.
- 12.
- 13. Galvanized sheet metal flashing



Keyed Notes

- Double locked 26 GA. Galvalume standing seam metal roof.
- Double locked 2b GA. Galvalume standing seam metal root. Board & Batten Siding (match style to original) fiber cement board. Window trim per detail (repair/replace as necessary) typical all conditions. Painted wood windows w-insulated glass (dimensions & sash profile match to existing) typical all conditions Galvanized sheet metal flashing above heads of windows and doors typical all conditions. Typical corner trim 5/4 x 4 Miratec (replace, match existing). Typical fascia 2 x 6 cedar (repair/replace as necessary). Replace door (to match Main House). Add concrete Walkway. Level house and re-grade surrounding site as needed 2.3.4.5.6.7.8.

- 9.
- Level house and re-grade surrounding site as needed. Wall trim $-5/4 \times 6$ Miratec (replace, match existing)... Wall trim $-5/4 \times 2$ Miratec (replace, match existing). 10.
- 11.
- 12. 13.



Existing Carriage House



<u>Existing & Proposed Rear (North) Elevation - HEB Respite Care Carriage House</u> Scale: 3/16" = 1'-0" Respite Care of San Antonio 327 West Craig Place Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas



Existing & Proposed Right (East) Elevation - HEB Respite Care Carriage House Scale: 3/16" = 1'-0" Respite Care of San Antonio 327 West Craig Place

Keyed Notes

- Double locked 26 GA. Galvalume standing seam metal roof. Board & Batten Siding (match style to original) fiber cement board. Window trim per detail (repair/replace as necessary) typical all conditions. Painted wood windows w-insulated glass (dimensions & sash profile match to existing) typical all conditions Galvanized sheet metal flashing above heads of windows and doors typical all conditions. Typical corner trim 5/4 x 4 Miratec (replace, match existing). Typical fascia 2 x 6 cedar (repair/replace as necessary). Replace door (to match Main House). Add concrete Walkway.

- 2.3.4.5.6.7.8.
- 9.
- Level house and re-grade surrounding site as needed. Wall trim $-5/4 \times 6$ Miratec (replace, match existing)... Wall trim $-5/4 \times 2$ Miratec (replace, match existing). 10.
- 11.
- 12.
- 13. Galvanized sheet metal flashing







Existing & Proposed Left (West) Elevation - HEB Respite Care Carriage House Scale: 3/16" = 1'-0" Respite Care of San Antonio 327 West Craig Place Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas



Existing Floor Plan (Window Placement) - HEB Respite Care Carriage House Scale: 3/16" = 1'-0" Respite Care of San Antonio

pite Care of San Antonio 327 West Craig Place Monte Vista Neighborhood San Antonio, Texas

Ν



1 - Carriage House Door

-Door appears to not be original. Plan to replace with door similar the front door of the Main House.











2 - Carriage House Window (South Facade)

- Window is in very poor shape. Plan to replace with window similar to the Main House (all main house windows were replaced with new wood windows).
- Window and Framing do not appear to be original.



3 - Carriage House Window (South Facade)

-Window appears to not be original (part of the addition). Plan to eliminate the Window along with the addition.



4 - Carriage House Door (East Facade)

-Door appears to not be original (part of the addition). Plan to eliminate the door along with the addition.





5 - Carriage House Window (East Facade)

-Window appears to not be original (part of the addition). Plan to eliminate the Window along with the addition.



6 - Carriage House Window (East Facade)

-Window appears to not be original (part of the addition). Plan to eliminate the Window along with the addition.



7 - Carriage House Window (West Facade)

- Window is in very poor shape.
- Window and Framing do not appear to be original.
- Due to the window having a direct view into the adjacent backyard, we plan to eliminate the window for the privacy and saftey of the Respite Care Children. 32



7 - Carriage House Window (West Facade)

- Window is in very poor shape.
- Window and Framing do not appear to be original.
- Due to the window having a direct view into the adjacent backyard, we plan to eliminate the window for the privacy and saftey of the Respite Care Children.pite Care Children.







Board & Batten Siding Due to the fact that there are 3 styles of Board & Batten Siding we are proposing to use the following:

Siding: -Board & Batten Siding - fiber cement board with 2"composite trim pieces every 12" on center .

Details, Materials, & Colors:

Restore features wherever possible and replicate on renovated portions to preserve the look and historic characteristics of the home

Siding:

-Board & Batten Siding (match style to original) - fiber cement board with 2"composite tim pieces every 12" on center .

Smooth

Thickness: 5/16"	-			
Weight: 2.40lbs./sq. ft				
Length: 10.00'				
WIDTHS	4'X8'	4'X9'	4'X10'	
	48.00"	48.00"	48.00"	
EXPOSURE	40.00			
EXPOSURE COLORPLUS®	•	000e014:00407		





