HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

August 17, 2016 Agenda Item No: 29

HDRC CASE NO:	2016-312
ADDRESS:	321 E DEWEY PLACE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 2999 BLK 1 LOT 4 W 44.4 FT OF 5
ZONING:	MF33 H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	1
DISTRICT:	Tobin Hill Historic District
APPLICANT:	Linda Ricks
OWNER:	Reconstruction Design LLC
TYPE OF WORK:	Window replacement, construct new front balcony

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Remove two original one over one wood windows and install two new wood one over one windows
- 2. Construct the front 3rd floor roof balustrade

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. Muntins—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. Replacement glass—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

vii. Non-historic windows—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.

iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.

v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

FINDINGS:

- a. There are two existing front wood, one over one windows on the first floor. The applicant is proposing to remove the windows and replace with two new wood one over one windows. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.vii., historic windows should be repaired or, if beyond 50% deteriorated, should be replaced with a window to match the original in terms of size, type, configuration, material and details, feature clear glass, and recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are not recommended. The corresponding pages from the adopted windows policy document have been added to the exhibits for this request. Staff made a site visit August 8, 2016, and found the windows in need of repair but repairable. Staff finds the removal of these two windows not consistent with the Guidelines. Windows are an important character defining feature, therefore, staff recommends that they are retained and repaired.
- b. The main structure is a two story classical revival home with a first floor porch, a second floor balcony, and a third floor dormer with one existing wood door and three windows. Both the first floor porch and second floor balcony have simple square railings. The porches are covered with a flat roof that the 3rd floor dormer accesses. The applicant is proposing to install a roof balustrade around the existing front dormer to match the existing railings. The proposed railing is 3' tall and would create a balcony 7' deep and 10.5' wide. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations7.B.iv., added elements should be simple and not distract from the historic character. Staff finds that though there is no photographic evidence of a roof balustrade, there are historic examples of railings when there is roof top access.
- c. HISTORIC TAX CERTIFICATION At this time, the applicant has not applied for Historic Tax Certification. Staff recommends the applicant apply for the historic tax incentive which lasts a total of ten (10) years.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of item #2 as submitted based on finding b. If the applicant is considering the rehabilitation of the primary historic structure, staff recommends the applicant apply for Historic Tax Certification.

Staff recommends denial of item #1 based on finding a. Staff recommends that the windows be retained and repaired.

CASE MANAGER:

Lauren Sage





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Aug 10, 2016

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.







7/27/2016

Letter to Historiel

Please see the detail description of the property Q 321 E. Dewey Pl. Sau antonio, dey. 78212.

We have provided you with a rendering for the 3rd floor railing to misroe image the original railing on the 157+ 2° floors. Demensions provided.

Pictures of the 3rd floor door from the interior of house.

Pictures of the 2 front windows, Pella architect series - Werboard have arrived waiting for porch Completion to install, Contact Sylvia Sendejo @ Pella if you have any prestins 210-735-2030.

Pictures enclosed of house renovated at 402 E. astly San antonis Dey. 78212 - Cassita had been condemned,

5/9/2016

ALL Materials being used are the some as original -Photo of building - prior to construction Facade of front had to be rebuilt, hore engineer reports. new wood windows by Pella to be installed on 2 large front windows Paints attached 3rd floor trooping - will have Aprindles + rails to duplicate the 15I + 3rd floor spindler All will be identical to original

Anda Recks ASID



Pella ProLine 450

UNIT SECTIONS











Scale 3" = 1 0.

Aldmensions are approximate





CLAD / WOOD



Third Floor Door - Exterior



Paints

Anowy pine PPUIO-13 Main Body of house Behr = Trim on windows PPU7-16 Vistage Linen Behr =

Behr =

Facea boards -MQ2-61 magnet

Behr =

Porcher floors

Behr =

Behr =

Cielings Beoded Board

Nail + spirdle

Celestial Light MQ3-24

PPU10-13

Snowy pine

PPU10-13

Showy pine

Airda Richs ASID





Downstairs Front Window



Downstairs Front Window







Downstairs Front Window

Downstairs Front Window









3rd Floor Door - Interior View



402 E. Ashby



SELECTING AN APPROPRIATE REPLACEMENT

6.B.iv. Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.



Recommended stipulations for replacement:

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

Details to avoid:



- Vinyl product changes the material
- Window is not recessed within frame
- Sash components do not feature traditional dimensions



- Track insert alters profile
- Meeting rails thicker than original
- Low-e coating alters hue and reflectivity



• Window trim and sill detail not consistent with original

SELECTING WINDOWS FOR NEW BUILDINGS

3.A.i. Complementary materials—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district...

Windows used in new construction should:

- Maintain traditional dimensions and profiles;
- Be recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are <u>not</u> recommended;
- Feature traditional materials or appearance. Wood windows are most appropriate. Double-hung, block frame windows that feature alternative materials may be considered on a case-by-case basis;
- Feature traditional trim and sill details. Paired windows should be separated by a wood mullion.

The use of low-e glass is appropriate in new construction provided that hue and reflectivity are not drastically different from regular glass.

Examples in New Construction:





