#### HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

# September 21, 2016 Agenda Item No: 10

HDRC CASE NO:	2016-356
ADDRESS:	521 N PALMETTO
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 1371 BLK 3 LOT 32
ZONING:	RM4 H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	2
DISTRICT:	Dignowity Hill Historic District
APPLICANT:	Denise Mayen
OWNER:	James Dempsey/Jedidiah TX LLC
TYPE OF WORK:	Rehabilitation, addition, fencing, exterior modifications and Historic Tax
	Certification

#### **REOUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Repair the existing wood porch decking and wood siding.
- 2. Install new craftsman style columns and column brackets.
- 3. Install new craftsman style porch railing.
- 4. Remove the existing security bars and repair the original wood windows.
- 5. Paint the exterior of the structure.
- 6. Enclose a non-original rear porch.
- 7. Remove the existing chain link fence and install a new wood picket fence.
- 8. Landscape the front and rear yard.
- 9. Receive Historic Tax Certification.

## **APPLICABLE CITATIONS:**

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

## A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

*i. Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.

*ii. Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or striping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing. *iii. Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.

*iv. Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See General Paint Type Recommendations in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information. *v. Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

## B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

*i. Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.

*ii. Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.

*iii. Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

## A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

*i. Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

*ii. Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

*iii. Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

iv. Screens and shutters-Preserve historic window screens and shutters.

*v. Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

## B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

*i. Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

*ii. New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

*iii. Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. *iv. Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

*v. Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

*vi. Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

*vii. Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

viii. Security bars-Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.

*ix. Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

*x. Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

# A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

*i. Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.

*ii. Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.

*iii. Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

# B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

*i. Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.

*ii. Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.

iii. Replacement-Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and

columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish. *iv. Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance. *v. Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

#### 2. Fences and Walls

#### A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

*i. Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.

*ii. Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.

*iii. Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

#### **B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS**

*i. Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure. *ii. Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. *iii. Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fence or wall existed historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

*iv. Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

*v. Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

#### UDC Section 35-618. Tax Exemption Qualifications:

(a) Assessed Valuation. In accordance with the provisions of this article, a building, site, or structure which meets the definition of a historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation and which is substantially rehabilitated and/or restored as certified by the historic and design review commission and approved by the city tax assessor-collector, shall have an assessed value for ad valorem taxation as follows regardless of ownership during the granted time period:

- (1) A residential property shall have the assessed value for ad valorem taxation for a period of ten (10) tax years equal to the assessed value prior to preservation.
- (b) Applicability. This exemption shall begin on the first day of the first tax year after verification of completion of the preservation required for certification; provided the building shall comply with the applicable zoning regulations for its use and location.
- (c) Application. Application for a historic structure preservation tax exemption pursuant to this division is to be filed with the office of historic preservation. The historic preservation officer shall be the agent of the city for the purposes of administering this division provided that the historic preservation officer request a recommendation from the

historic and design review commission. Each application shall be signed and sworn to by the owner of the property and shall:

- (1) State the legal description of the property proposed for certification;
- (2) Include an affidavit by the owner describing the historic significance of the structure in need of tax relief;
- (3) Include a final complete set of plans for the historic structure's restoration or rehabilitation;
- (4) Include a statement of costs for the restoration or rehabilitation work;
- (5) Include a projection of the estimated construction, time and predicted completion date of the historic restoration or rehabilitation;
- (6) Authorize the members of the historic and design review commission, the city tax assessor-collector and city officials to visit and inspect the property proposed for certification and the records and books of the owners as necessary to certify that the property in question is in substantial need of restoration or rehabilitation;
- (7) Include a detailed statement of the proposed use for the property; and
- (8) Provide any additional information to the historic and design review commission which the owner deems relevant or useful such as the history of the structure or access to the structure by the public.

Each application shall contain sufficient documentation confirming or supporting the information submitted therein.

- (d) Certification.
  - (1) Historic and Design Review Commission Certification. Upon receipt of the owner's sworn application the historic and design review commission shall make an investigation of the property and shall certify the facts to the city tax assessor-collector within thirty (30) days along with the historic and design review commission's documentation for recommendation of either approval or disapproval of the application for exemption.
  - (2) Tax Assessor-Collector Approval. Upon receipt of the certified application for tax exemption as well as the recommendation of the historic and design review commission, the city's tax assessor-collector shall within thirty (30) days approve or disapprove eligibility of the property for tax relief pursuant to this division. In determining eligibility, the tax assessor-collector shall first determine that all the requirements of this division have been complied with and that only the historic structure and the land reasonably necessary for access and use thereof is to be provided favorable tax relief.
- (g) Eligibility.

(1) The tax exemption options outlined in subsection (f), above, will remain in effect unless terminated by designation status being removed pursuant to subsection 35-606(g) of this article.

## FINDINGS:

- a. The structure at 521 N Palmetto was constructed circa 1930 and features craftsman style elements. Since its construction, modifications have occurred including the partial enclosure of the front porch, column modifications and the construction of a covered rear porch.
- b. WOOD ELEMENTS The applicant has proposed to repair the damaged wood porch decking as well as all wood siding and skirting elements. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, 1.A. and B. deteriorated elements are to be repaired. If elements are beyond repair, they should be replaced with in kind materials. The applicant's proposal is consistent with the Guidelines.
- c. PORCH COLUMNS The historic structure currently features 4" x 4" wood columns that are not architecturally appropriate. The applicant has proposed to install columns that are architecturally appropriate which are to include either 6" x 6" or 8" x 8" columns with craftsman detailing. Staff finds the proposal to install architecturally appropriate columns appropriate; however, staff recommends the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed columns.
- d. COLUMN BRACKETS In addition to the installation of new columns, the applicant has proposed to remove the architecturally inappropriate column brackets and install new brackets. Architecturally, craftsman style houses do not feature column brackets. Staff finds the applicant's removal of the inappropriate brackets appropriate; however, staff finds that the applicant should not install new column brackets.
- e. PORCH RAILING The structure currently features non-original porch railing. The applicant has proposed to

remove the existing porch railing and install craftsman style railing. Craftsman style houses that feature porch railing typically feature porch railing that features both a top and bottom rail with space between the bottom rail and the porch decking. Staff recommends the applicant provide a detail of the proposed railing that is architecturally appropriate.

- f. WOOD WINDOWS The applicant has proposed to remove all metal security bars, consistent with the Guidelines to Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.viii. Additionally, the applicant has proposed to repair all original wood windows. Where non-original windows are located, the applicant has proposed to install new sashes that match the original in profile and material. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.vii.
- g. EXTERIOR PAINTING The applicant has noted that the historic structure will be repainted with either a gray, blue, green or pale yellow color or other neutral tones. Staff finds that neutral colors that are consistent with those found throughout the Dignowity Hill Historic District are appropriate. The applicant can receive administrative approval for paint colors. Additionally, the applicant has proposed to paint existing yellow bollards in the front yard white. The bollards are currently in place to protect the historic structure from vehicles.
- h. REAR PORCH ENCLOSURE The rear of the historic structure currently features a non-original porch. The applicant has proposed to enclose this porch for additional interior space. The applicant has proposed to use existing wood siding from the rear of the historic structure that is currently covered by the shed porch roof and install three wood windows and a wood door. Additionally, the applicant has proposed to utilize the height and pitch of the existing rear addition's roof which is to the south of the proposed new enclosure. Staff finds the applicant's proposal appropriate.
- i. FENCING The lot currently features a chain link fence that runs adjacent to the public right of way along N Palmetto. The applicant has proposed to replace this fence with a new wood picket fence to be a total of four (4) feet in height. Staff finds the proposed replacement appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B.ii; however, staff finds that the applicant should provide a detail of the final fence design.
- j. LANDSCAPING The applicant has submitted a landscaping plan noting the installation of decomposed granite in the rear yard that is to maintain the width of the existing driveway for the purposes of connecting the concrete ribbon strip driveway to the rear alley, the installation of a small stone, ground level patio, the installation of grass in the rear yard and the installation of a small flagstone pathway to connect the ribbon strip driveway to the front concrete sidewalk. Staff finds the applicant's proposed landscaping consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements.
- k. HISTORIC TAX CERTIFICATION The requirements for Tax Certification outlined in UDC Section 35-618 have been met and the applicant has provided evidence to that effect to the Historic Preservation Officer including photographs and an itemized list of costs.

# **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends approval of items #1 through #9 with the following stipulations to be submitted for staff approval:

- i. That the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed columns that includes dimensions as noted in finding c.
- ii. That the applicant remove the proposed installation of column brackets from the proposed column modification as noted in finding d.
- iii. That the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed porch railing that includes dimensions as noted in finding e.
- iv. That the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed wood picket fence as noted in finding i.

# CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall

# CASE COMMENT:

The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.





The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.

521 North Palmetto

33

I Palmetto

NPEL

Pickett Academy

1

4-11-20-1

TV-

100

-

THE

Del

Mig

Downsoon Mary

N Pelmetto

TAN

House of Praye Christian Ministry

Densen St

521 North Palmetto

Gulf

N Pelmetto

13

Ed

IMA I L

Deuseon St.

N Palmetto

THE MAN







F Shingle root ) Existing Window This side existing: No changes except repairs K-7'3"-Nee existing original siding 521 N. Palmetto -+++ Use xisting riginal siding





Current Characteristics	Planned Work
Exterior Material: wood siding	Retain the majority which is in good condition, and replace with same style wood siding where repairs needed.
Porch Style: wood plank platform	Repair/replace wood planks due to wood rot.
Porch Style: 4x4" columns/support posts	Encase in wood to more closely match the Craftsman Bungalow style - either 6x6" or 8x8" size - general style below. Many similar examples seen in Dignowity Hill area.
Porch Style: 2x4" corner braces at the top	Replace with 4x4" corbel style brackets, similar to what is already existing along the roof-line.
Porch Style: concrete curved front steps	Retain concrete steps, and paint or stain to complement exterior colors.

•



Porch Style: wood porch railing



Windows: historic sash windows (all except a few)

Windows: metal security grates/bars on exterior of all windows



Exterior Paint: primary yellow/cream, trim - hunter green Replace with wood railing to complement other Craftsman porch features.



Repair to functioning existing sash windows & replace with sash windows those which are of newer design. Objective is to have all windows on the property be of historic design/materials.

Remove metal grates to display original historic windows (and Craftsman detailing on upper half of window behind front porch, which can be seen, below right, from the interior of the house). Below left is an example of the style.



Repaint with gray/blue/green/pale yellow or neutral tones with white trim, appropriate to the Craftsman style, and with the approval of the Dignowity Hill ARC.



Front Yard Fence: chain link



Front Door: plain metal door, no window(s), metal security grate in front Replace with wood white picket style fence (similar example just a few houses down the street).



Replace with Craftsman style wood exterior door with upper window, remove metal security grate to expose new door.



ending at rear edge of house

house, below left) to rear gated exit onto alley (below right) connecting Dawson & Houston.





Misc: protective yellow bollards



Repaint white to match planned white picket fence. These are needed to protect house from unsafe drivers (Gulf St dead ends into property.)

Current Rear of House:



Current Characteristics	Planned Work
Back Porch: wood, deteriorating, within roofline	**Enclose back porch as study & powder room resulting in approximately 120sf addition.
	Foundation - cedar posts, same as the rest of the property. Raise floor to level of the rest of the house. Use existing wood siding to match current exterior. Add 3 historic sash windows (two on the rear, one on the side). Add back door with glass panels.
	The addition will enclose one existing window (aluminum style, not currently a historic sash window) between the kitchen and back porch. Replace with historic window to maintain light from rear of the house into the kitchen.
Back Yard: no current lawn or landscaping	Add stone patio at base of new back stairs. Add grass and planting beds for appearance.

## Additional Notes:

- 1. Estimated total \$59,000 of rehab/improvements
- 2. Estimated 10-12 weeks for work to be completed
- 3. Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness submitted on 9/1/16 for:
  - a. Roof Replacement currently 3-tab asphalt shingles; replacing with similar style 3-tab asphalt shingles
  - b. Foundation Leveling currently cedar posts with wood siding skirt; replacing or repairing cedar posts as necessary, then reinstalling, repairing, or replacing wood siding skirt with like materials to maintain current style

## Attachments:

- 1. HDRC Application Form
- 2. Site Plan & Floorplan
- 3. Planned Front & Rear Elevations
- 4. Contractor's Cost Estimate and Scope of Work
- 5. Tax Certification Form



# QUOTATION

## HLR RESTORATION INC

Ralph Hinojosa 413 E. Glenview San Antonio Texas 78201 (210) 383-5410



Date: August 23, 2016 INVOICE # 98735 Expiration Date: September 15, 2016

To

Denise Mayen 521 N. Palmetto San Antonio Texas 151-296-83186

Qty	Item #	Description	Unit Price	Lump Sum	Line Total
		REHAB COST ESTIMATE BASIC			
I EACH	#0001	40 YARD DUMPSTER	\$550.00		\$550.00
3 EACH	#0002	Demo front porch, Kitchen, Both Bathrooms, any damaged drywall.	\$750.00		\$1450.00
3 Each	#0003	New configuration of frame walls and bathrooms.	\$750.00		\$950.00
4 each #0004	#0004	Level foundation in place includes bathrooms and porches.	\$2500.00		\$3750.00
		Wood floors re-sand and finish out, bathroom floors and shower walls ceramic tile home owner choosing tiles. \$2.00 Tile allowance.			\$4250.00
	Install new kitchen cabinets and counter tops homeowner to pick counter top.			\$6268.00.00	
		Interior paint and dry wall repair and tape/ float/ texture complete house homeowner to pick color.			\$3850,00
		ELECTRICAL			
2 EACH	#0005	Remove all plugs and switches includes GFI and replace with white, to include setting of all fixtures and complete working order, includes fixtures labor to install new celling fixtures homeowner to buy fixtures.		\$1250.00	\$1850.00
		HVAC			
2 EACH	#0006	Install new 3 ton 14 seer unit complete package. Bring up to code.		\$5450.00	\$5450.00
	1	PLUMBING			

			Subtotal	\$54,068.00
l each		Remove rear parch and add new foundation for new room addition study with new ½ bath with new windows and rear door sheetrock tape float texture and paint ,electrical and plumbing included with lavatory and hard ware. Flooring to consist of		\$11250.00
3 each	#00010	Paint all house homeowner choice of colors, power wash and scrape only (NO SANDING.)		\$2875.00
BEACH	#0009	Install new front and rear doors, repair windows to work freely, any broken glass, rotted or missing siding and or trim to include front and rear porches. Include front yard privacy fence.		\$2850.00
		EXTERIOR REPAIRS & PAINT		
2 EACH	#0008	Remove and replace new roofing shingles. Replace all rotted wood on all eves and overhangs. To include gutters N. & S. only.		\$4875.00
		COMPLETE ROOF REPLACE		
EACH	#0007	All plumbing from floor up to new fixtures are to be new with supply lines and cut offs. Homeowner to buy fixtures. Water heater to bring up to code.		\$3850.00

Estimation prepared by:

This is a quotation on the goods named, subject to the conditions noted below: [Describe any conditions pertaining to these prices and any additional terms of the agreement. You may want to include contingencies that will affect the quotation.]

To accept this quotation, sign here and return:

- doesn't include \$1000 \$\$500 for shower glass -budget for any tile is #2/ft.

- does not include appliances - does include fixtures/finishes/ hardware