# HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION 

September 21, 2016
Agenda Item No: 10

## HDRC CASE NO: <br> ADDRESS: <br> LEGAL DESCRIPTION: <br> ZONING: <br> CITY COUNCIL DIST.: <br> DISTRICT: <br> APPLICANT: <br> OWNER: <br> TYPE OF WORK:

## REOUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Repair the existing wood porch decking and wood siding.
2. Install new craftsman style columns and column brackets.
3. Install new craftsman style porch railing.
4. Remove the existing security bars and repair the original wood windows.
5. Paint the exterior of the structure.
6. Enclose a non-original rear porch.
7. Remove the existing chain link fence and install a new wood picket fence.
8. Landscape the front and rear yard.
9. Receive Historic Tax Certification.

## APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

## Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

## 1. Materials: Woodwork

## A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. Inspections-Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.
ii. Cleaning-Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or striping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing. iii. Paint preparation-Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.
iv. Repainting - Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See General Paint Type Recommendations in Preservation Brief \#10 listed under Additional Resources for more information. $v$. Repair-Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

## B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. Façade materials-Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.
ii. Materials-Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.
iii. Replacement elements-Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

## 6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

## A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. Openings-Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
ii. Doors-Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
iii. Windows-Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
iv. Screens and shutters-Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
v. Storm windows-Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

## B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. Doors-Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
ii. New entrances-Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
iii. Glazed area-Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. iv. Window design-Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
$v$. Muntins-Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
vi. Replacement glass-Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
vii. Non-historic windows-Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
viii. Security bars-Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
$i x$. Screens-Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
x. Shutters-Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

## 7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

## A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres-Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
ii. Balusters-Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
iii. Floors-Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

## B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. Front porches-Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
ii. Side and rear porches-Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
iii. Replacement-Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and
columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
$i v$. Adding elements-Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
v. Reconstruction-Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

## Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

## 2. Fences and Walls

## A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

i. Preserve-Retain historic fences and walls.
ii. Repair and replacement-Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.
iii. Application of paint and cementitious coatings-Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

## B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. Design-New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure. ii. Location-Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. iii. Height-Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
iv. Prohibited materials-Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
$v$. Appropriate materials-Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses-Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

## UDC Section 35-618. Tax Exemption Qualifications:

(a) Assessed Valuation. In accordance with the provisions of this article, a building, site, or structure which meets the definition of a historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation and which is substantially rehabilitated and/or restored as certified by the historic and design review commission and approved by the city tax assessor-collector, shall have an assessed value for ad valorem taxation as follows regardless of ownership during the granted time period:
(1) A residential property shall have the assessed value for ad valorem taxation for a period of ten (10) tax years equal to the assessed value prior to preservation.
(b) Applicability. This exemption shall begin on the first day of the first tax year after verification of completion of the preservation required for certification; provided the building shall comply with the applicable zoning regulations for its use and location.
(c) Application. Application for a historic structure preservation tax exemption pursuant to this division is to be filed with the office of historic preservation. The historic preservation officer shall be the agent of the city for the purposes of administering this division provided that the historic preservation officer request a recommendation from the
historic and design review commission. Each application shall be signed and sworn to by the owner of the property and shall:
(1) State the legal description of the property proposed for certification;
(2) Include an affidavit by the owner describing the historic significance of the structure in need of tax relief;
(3) Include a final complete set of plans for the historic structure's restoration or rehabilitation;
(4) Include a statement of costs for the restoration or rehabilitation work;
(5) Include a projection of the estimated construction, time and predicted completion date of the historic restoration or rehabilitation;
(6) Authorize the members of the historic and design review commission, the city tax assessor-collector and city officials to visit and inspect the property proposed for certification and the records and books of the owners as necessary to certify that the property in question is in substantial need of restoration or rehabilitation;
(7) Include a detailed statement of the proposed use for the property; and
(8) Provide any additional information to the historic and design review commission which the owner deems relevant or useful such as the history of the structure or access to the structure by the public.
Each application shall contain sufficient documentation confirming or supporting the information submitted therein.
(d) Certification.
(1) Historic and Design Review Commission Certification. Upon receipt of the owner's sworn application the historic and design review commission shall make an investigation of the property and shall certify the facts to the city tax assessor-collector within thirty (30) days along with the historic and design review commission's documentation for recommendation of either approval or disapproval of the application for exemption.
(2) Tax Assessor-Collector Approval. Upon receipt of the certified application for tax exemption as well as the recommendation of the historic and design review commission, the city's tax assessor-collector shall within thirty (30) days approve or disapprove eligibility of the property for tax relief pursuant to this division. In determining eligibility, the tax assessor-collector shall first determine that all the requirements of this division have been complied with and that only the historic structure and the land reasonably necessary for access and use thereof is to be provided favorable tax relief.
(g) Eligibility.
(1) The tax exemption options outlined in subsection (f), above, will remain in effect unless terminated by designation status being removed pursuant to subsection $35-606(\mathrm{~g})$ of this article.

## FINDINGS:

a. The structure at 521 N Palmetto was constructed circa 1930 and features craftsman style elements. Since its construction, modifications have occurred including the partial enclosure of the front porch, column modifications and the construction of a covered rear porch.
b. WOOD ELEMENTS - The applicant has proposed to repair the damaged wood porch decking as well as all wood siding and skirting elements. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, 1.A. and B. deteriorated elements are to be repaired. If elements are beyond repair, they should be replaced with in kind materials. The applicant's proposal is consistent with the Guidelines.
c. PORCH COLUMNS - The historic structure currently features 4 " $\times 4$ " wood columns that are not architecturally appropriate. The applicant has proposed to install columns that are architecturally appropriate which are to include either 6 " x 6 " or 8 " x 8 " columns with craftsman detailing. Staff finds the proposal to install architecturally appropriate columns appropriate; however, staff recommends the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed columns.
d. COLUMN BRACKETS - In addition to the installation of new columns, the applicant has proposed to remove the architecturally inappropriate column brackets and install new brackets. Architecturally, craftsman style houses do not feature column brackets. Staff finds the applicant's removal of the inappropriate brackets appropriate; however, staff finds that the applicant should not install new column brackets.
e. PORCH RAILING - The structure currently features non-original porch railing. The applicant has proposed to
remove the existing porch railing and install craftsman style railing. Craftsman style houses that feature porch railing typically feature porch railing that features both a top and bottom rail with space between the bottom rail and the porch decking. Staff recommends the applicant provide a detail of the proposed railing that is architecturally appropriate.
f. WOOD WINDOWS - The applicant has proposed to remove all metal security bars, consistent with the Guidelines to Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.viii. Additionally, the applicant has proposed to repair all original wood windows. Where non-original windows are located, the applicant has proposed to install new sashes that match the original in profile and material. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.vii.
g. EXTERIOR PAINTING - The applicant has noted that the historic structure will be repainted with either a gray, blue, green or pale yellow color or other neutral tones. Staff finds that neutral colors that are consistent with those found throughout the Dignowity Hill Historic District are appropriate. The applicant can receive administrative approval for paint colors. Additionally, the applicant has proposed to paint existing yellow bollards in the front yard white. The bollards are currently in place to protect the historic structure from vehicles.
h. REAR PORCH ENCLOSURE - The rear of the historic structure currently features a non-original porch. The applicant has proposed to enclose this porch for additional interior space. The applicant has proposed to use existing wood siding from the rear of the historic structure that is currently covered by the shed porch roof and install three wood windows and a wood door. Additionally, the applicant has proposed to utilize the height and pitch of the existing rear addition's roof which is to the south of the proposed new enclosure. Staff finds the applicant's proposal appropriate.
i. FENCING - The lot currently features a chain link fence that runs adjacent to the public right of way along N Palmetto. The applicant has proposed to replace this fence with a new wood picket fence to be a total of four (4) feet in height. Staff finds the proposed replacement appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B.ii; however, staff finds that the applicant should provide a detail of the final fence design.
j. LANDSCAPING - The applicant has submitted a landscaping plan noting the installation of decomposed granite in the rear yard that is to maintain the width of the existing driveway for the purposes of connecting the concrete ribbon strip driveway to the rear alley, the installation of a small stone, ground level patio, the installation of grass in the rear yard and the installation of a small flagstone pathway to connect the ribbon strip driveway to the front concrete sidewalk. Staff finds the applicant's proposed landscaping consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements.
k. HISTORIC TAX CERTIFICATION - The requirements for Tax Certification outlined in UDC Section 35-618 have been met and the applicant has provided evidence to that effect to the Historic Preservation Officer including photographs and an itemized list of costs.

## RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of items \#1 through \#9 with the following stipulations to be submitted for staff approval:
i. That the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed columns that includes dimensions as noted in finding c .
ii. That the applicant remove the proposed installation of column brackets from the proposed column modification as noted in finding d .
iii. That the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed porch railing that includes dimensions as noted in finding e.
iv. That the applicant provide a detailed drawing of the proposed wood picket fence as noted in finding i.

## CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall

## CASE COMMENT:

The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.


Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server
Printed:Sep 08, 2016




521 N Palmetto
Front Elevation Design


This side existing: No changes except repairs

521 N. Palmetto

Site Plan for 521 N. Palmetto, San Antonio Tx


(remove existing and replace
Add crushed granite driveway
(D)

- Stone patio

$$
\text { 1, app } \operatorname{anc}^{3} 3^{1} \times 16^{6}
$$

(A) - see attached interior plan for interior charges
(B)-Remare 4 Here in Front and along driveway
to front corner to house
(C) - Add shrubs in mulch beds. Add flags tone path from existing sidewalk to existing drive way $\square I=2^{\prime} \times 2^{\prime}$ square (approx inmate)


## (LEFT)



| Current Characteristics | Planned Work |
| :---: | :---: |
| Exterior Material: wood siding | Retain the majority which is in good condition, and replace with same style wood siding where repairs needed. |
| Porch Style: wood plank platform | Repair/replace wood planks due to wood rot. |
| Porch Style: $4 \times 4$ " columns/support posts | Encase in wood to more closely match the Craftsman Bungalow style - either $6 \times 6$ " or $8 \times 8$ " size - general style below. Many similar examples seen in Dignowity Hill area. |
| Porch Style: $2 \times 4$ " corner braces at the top | Replace with $4 \times 4$ " corbel style brackets, similar to what is already existing along the roof-line. |
| Porch Style: concrete curved front steps | Retain concrete steps, and paint or stain to complement exterior colors. |


|  |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Porch Style: wood porch railing | Replace with wood railing to complement other Craftsman porch features. |
| Windows: historic sash windows (all except a few) | Repair to functioning existing sash windows \& replace with sash windows those which are of newer design. Objective is to have all windows on the property be of historic design/materials. |
| Windows: metal security grates/bars on exterior of all windows | Remove metal grates to display original historic windows (and Craftsman detailing on upper half of window behind front porch, which can be seen, below right, from the interior of the house). Below left is an example of the style. |
| Exterior Paint: primary yellow/cream, trim - hunter green | Repaint with gray/blue/green/pale yellow or neutral tones with white trim, appropriate to the Craftsman style, and with the approval of the Dignowity Hill ARC. |



|  |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Exterior Style: wooden plank gable | Replace with Craftsman style wood gable with more appealing design. |
| Front Landscaping: misc weeds/grass | Plant small shrubs along fence and create planting beds for curb appeal. Plant grass in yard. |
| Driveway: cement strips (with weeds between) adjacent to the house, ending at rear edge of house | Add crushed rock between cement strips to reduce weed growth. Extend driveway with gravel path (from gate at rear of house, below left) to rear gated exit onto alley (below right) connecting Dawson \& Houston. |



Current Rear of House:


| Current Characteristics | Planned Work |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Back Porch: wood, deteriorating, within roofline | 未*Enclose back porch as study <br> \& powder room resulting in <br> approximately 120sf <br> addition. |
| Foundation - cedar posts, same <br> as the rest of the property. <br> Raise floor to level of the rest <br> of the house. Use existing <br> wood siding to match current <br> exterior. Add 3 historic sash <br> windows (two on the rear, one <br> on the side). Add back door <br> with glass panels. |  |
| Back Yard: no current lawn or landscaping | The addition will enclose one <br> existing window (aluminum <br> style, not currently a historic <br> sash window) betwen the <br> kitchen and back porch. <br> Replace with historic window <br> to maintain light from rear of <br> the house into the kitchen. |



Additional Notes:

1. Estimated total $\$ 59,000$ of rehab/improvements
2. Estimated 10-12 weeks for work to be completed
3. Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness submitted on 9/1/16 for:
a. Roof Replacement - currently 3-tab asphalt shingles; replacing with similar style 3-tab asphalt shingles
b. Foundation Leveling - currently cedar posts with wood siding skirt; replacing or repairing cedar posts as necessary, then reinstalling, repairing, or replacing wood siding skirt with like materials to maintain current style

Attachments:

1. HDRC Application Form
2. Site Plan \& Floorplan
3. Planned Front \& Rear Elevations
4. Contractor's Cost Estimate and Scope of Work
5. Tax Certification Form

521 N Palmetto
Existing walls' removed to improve How and usability

- Exterior porch to be enclosed and airconditioned/heated. Adding $1 / 2$ bath, Exterior siding to be original material, reused.

(A) - Renovated existing master bath
(B) - Renovated existing kitchen
(C) - Revised utility closet for coset tor
washer/dryer
combo. combo.
(D) - Renovated $2^{\text {nd }}$ Bathroom
(E) Front porch to be repaired
(F) Miscellaneous upgrades to toning and light fixtures, windows repaired. (all original historic) windolis repaired), Addition of new AVAC system incl. newduting.


## QUOTATION

## HR <br> RESTORATION INC

Date: August 23, 2016
INVOICE \# 98735
Ralph Hinojoso
4 I3 E. Glenview
San Antonio Texas
78201
(210) 383-5410


Expiration Date: September 15, 2016

To

Denise Mayon
521 N. Palmetto
San Antonio Texas
151-296-83186


EACH | All plumbing from floor up to new |
| :--- |
| fixtures are to be new with supply |
| lines and cut ofts. Homeowner to |
| buy fixtures. Water heater to bring |
| up to code. |

