HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION March 15, 2017

| HDRC CASE NO: | 2017-099 |
|---------------------|--|
| ADDRESS: | 614 N PALMETTO |
| LEGAL DESCRIPTION: | NCB 6004 BLK 5 LOT S 45 FT OF 16 |
| ZONING: | R-4,HL |
| CITY COUNCIL DIST.: | 2 |
| LANDMARK: | Null |
| APPLICANT: | Blue Sea Enterprises, LLC & Sea and Sea LLC |
| OWNER: | Blue Sea Enterprises, LLC & Sea and Sea LLC |
| TYPE OF WORK: | Installation of metal foundation skirting, window modifications, walkway |
| | installation and front porch modifications |

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Install metal foundation skirting.
- 2. Install a gravel front walkway leading from the front porch to the public right of way.
- 3. Perform modifications to the existing front porch.
- 4. Modify the profile of the front window beneath the front facing gable.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.

ii. Balusters—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.

iii. Floors—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

8. Architectural Features: Foundations

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Replacement features*—Ensure that features such as decorative vents and grilles and lattice panels are replaced in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not possible, use features matching in size, material, and design. Replacement skirting should consist of durable, proven materials, and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. Maintenance—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. Replacement materials—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. Width and alignment— Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. Stamped concrete—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. ADA compliance—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

FINDINGS:

- a. The structure at 614 N Palmetto was constructed circa 1920 and is found on the 1951 Sanborn map. The structure features architectural elements that include a concrete wrap around porch, hipped and gabled roofs and wrought iron columns. The applicant previously received Administrative Approval for the construction of a rear deck, the repair of the existing wood windows, fencing, painting and the installation of a standing seam metal roof.
- b. FOUNDATION SKIRTING Prior to the start of work at 614 N Palmetto, the structure featured a foundation skirting that had been heavily damaged and removed. The applicant installed a metal foundation skirting without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 8.B.i., replacement foundation skirting should consist of durable, proven materials and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact. The installed metal skirting neither matches the existing siding nor is installed in a manner that has a minimal visual impact. Staff finds the metal skirting inconsistent with the Guidelines.
- c. FRONT PORCH The existing front porch is constructed of concrete. The applicant has covered the existing front porch and front porch steps with cedar decking and finish boards. The Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations note that front porches should not be covered with unless they are covered with materials that were used historically. Staff finds the installed cedar porch decking and finish boards inconsistent with the Guidelines.
- d. GRAVEL WALKWAY The Guidelines for Site Elements 5.A. states that front walkways should be repaired to match the existing walkway material and color. Additionally, the historic width and alignment of front yard walkways should be maintained. The historic walkway material, concrete, has been removed and replaced with gravel and wood borders. This is not consistent with the Guidelines.
- e. FRONT WINDOW The front window beneath the projecting window bay originally featured ornamental panes which have been removed in the repair of the existing windows. Staff finds that a salvaged window should be installed that matches the profile of the original.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through e. Staff recommends the following:

- i. That the applicant remove the metal foundation skirting and install a skirting that is architecturally appropriate.
- ii. That the applicant remove the materials covering the concrete porch.
- iii. That the applicant remove the gravel front yard walkway and install a concrete walkway that is consistent with those found historically in the Dignowity Hill Historic District in terms of alignment, width and material.
- iv. That the applicant install a salvaged wood window that matches the profile of the original window that was modified.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall

CASE COMMENT:

All post work application fees have been paid by the applicant.





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Mar 06, 2017

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.



Used Cars San Antonio

St Charles

614 North Palmetto

N Palmetto

N Palmer

House of Prayer Christian Ministry **1951 SANBORN MAP**





ADDRESS: 614 N. PALMETTO











