# HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION April 19, 2017

**HDRC CASE NO:** 2017-162 **ADDRESS:** 1203 E CROCKETT ST **LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 1373 BLK 1 LOT E 49 FT OF 9 & 10 **ZONING: RM-4** H **CITY COUNCIL DIST.:** 2 **Dignowity Hill Historic District DISTRICT:** Aurora Morales-Lopez **APPLICANT:** Aurora Morales-Lopez **OWNER:** 

### **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a 4 foot tall black wrought iron fence in the front and side yard. The front yard fencing would be installed atop an existing retaining wall approximately 40" in height.

## **APPLICABLE CITATIONS:**

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

1. Topography

A. TOPOGRAPHIC FEATURES

i. *Historic topography*—Avoid significantly altering the topography of a property (i.e., extensive grading). Do not alter character-defining features such as berms or sloped front lawns that help define the character of the public right-of-way. Maintain the established lawn to help prevent erosion. If turf is replaced over time, new plant materials in these areas should be low-growing and suitable for the prevention of erosion.

ii. *New construction*—Match the historic topography of adjacent lots prevalent along the block face for new construction. Do not excavate raised lots to accommodate additional building height or an additional story for new construction. iii. *New elements*—Minimize changes in topography resulting from new elements, like driveways and walkways, through appropriate siting and design. New site elements should work with, rather than change, character-defining topography when possible.

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

i. Preserve—Retain historic fences and walls.

ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.

iii. Application of paint and cementitious coatings—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure. ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fence or wall existed historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for

appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses. C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.

ii. Location – Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

## FINDINGS:

- a. The structure located at 1203 E Crockett St is a single-family home designed in the Craftsman style. The home features a double front gable and contains traditional Craftsman elements, including exposed roof rafter ends and decorative porch brackets. The house is a contributing property in the Dignowity Hill Historic District.
- b. The applicant has proposed to install a wrought iron fence on the sides and front yard of the lot. The side fencing will be a continuation of existing wrought iron fencing on the side yard fronting Wheeler Alley. The proposed fence will begin at five feet on the sides of the house and gradually taper to hit four feet at the front of the lot. The front yard fence will be four feet with a gate at the front steps atop a retaining wall fronting the sidewalk. Though four feet is the maximum height stipulated in guideline 2.A.iii, the retaining wall is approximately 40 inches in height. A four foot fence would result in a nearly six foot height relative to the public right-of-way. Retaining walls are also a common front yard element along E Crockett St due to slope and drainage conditions, and there is no precedent for fences installed on retaining walls in this area. Staff does not find the proposal consistent with the guidelines.

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends approval of the fence installation based on findings a and b with the following stipulation:

i. That the height of the fence is no taller than four feet including the height of the retaining wall. The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.

## **CASE MANAGER:**

**Stephanie Phillips** 

## **CASE COMMENTS:**

The applicant has received both administrative and HDRC approval for the following items:

- October 21, 2016: Repair existing retaining wall (Administrative COA)
- August 29, 2016: Install a wrought iron fence in the side yard facing Wheeler Alley not to exceed 6 feet in height and to be set back 4-5 feet from the front façade (Administrative COA)
- April 20, 2016: Historic Tax Verification (HDRC COA)
- March 11, 2016: Install a screen door at the front of the structure, painted red to match the porch color (Administrative COA)
- June 19, 2015: Replace existing chain link fence in side of the yard facing neighbors with a new wood privacy fence with front and rear gate, not to exceed 6 feet in height (Administrative COA)
- April 15, 2015: Build a 30x6 foot porch across the front elevation of the house, install an extra window on the front façade, install a front door (HDRC COA)
- April 2, 2015: Paint skirting (Administrative COA)

## HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION April 19, 2017

HDRC CASE NO:

2017-161





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Apr 14, 2017

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.



#### PLOT PLAN FOR BUILDING PERMITS



I certify that the above plot plan shows all improvements on this property and that there will be no construction over easements. I also certify that I will build in compliance with the UDC and the 2015 IRC.

Date: <u>3/31/17</u>\_\_\_\_

Signature of Applicant: \_\_\_\_\_\_Muran Mnals Kope





