HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION December 20, 2017

HDRC CASE NO:	2017-654
ADDRESS:	130 WICKES
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 931 BLK 1 LOT 29
ZONING:	RM-4,H,HL
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	1
DISTRICT:	King William Historic District
LANDMARK:	McDonald Rent House
APPLICANT:	Manuel Vogt
OWNER:	Manuel Vogt
TYPE OF WORK:	Front yard landscaping, gutter and railing installation

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Install white rain gutters to the front and rear of the historic structure.
- 2. Wrought iron porch railings on the front porch.
- 3. Replace the existing mulch beds that surround the foundation skirting with river rock.
- 4. Replace the existing front lawn area with carex Leavenworthii.
- 5. Replace the existing lawn area to the left of the driveway with river rock.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

i. Historic Gardens- Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.

ii. Historic Lawns—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.

iii. Native xeric plant materials—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.

iv. Plant palettes—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.

v. Maintenance—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

i. Impervious surfaces —Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.

ii. Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. Rock mulch and gravel - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings

FINDINGS:

- a. The structure at 130 Wickes was constructed circa 1905 and features Folk Victorian architectural elements. The structure was rehabilitated in the summer of 2016. At this time, the applicant has proposed to install porch railings, perform site work and install rain gutters.
- b. GUTTER INSTALLATION The applicant has proposed to install rain gutters on the front and rear of the historic structure. The applicant has noted that the gutters will match the color of the historic structure's trim. The applicant has also noted that the gutter will feature a k style profile. Staff finds the proposed gutters appropriate.
- c. RAILINGS The applicant has proposed to install wrought iron railings to the front porch steps. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 7.B.iv. replacement or new porch elements should be simple in design as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Staff finds the installation of porch railings to be appropriate; however, the installation of wood railings would be historically appropriate.
- d. RIVER ROCK The applicant has proposed to remove the existing mulch from the planting beds adjacent to the foundation skirting and to install river rock. Staff find this installation appropriate given that it is limited to the area surrounding the foundation skirting.
- e. RIVER ROCK The applicant has proposed remove the existing lawn area to the left of the driveway and install river rock and trees. Per the Guidelines for Site Elements 3.B.iii. rocks should not be a wholesale replacement for lawn area. Staff finds that a low growing, ground cover would be a more appropriate replacement.
- f. LAWN REMOVAL The applicant has proposed to remove the existing, remaining lawn area and install a low growing plant material, a Carex species. Staff finds that this low growing plant will present itself similar to natural turf.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of items #1 through #5 with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant submit a final gutter detail to staff for review.
- ii. That the proposed front porch railings be wood and that a detail be submitted to staff for review.
- iii. That an evergreen ground cover be installed along the driveway instead of river rock.

CASE MANAGER:

Edward Hall

Proposal

- 1. Mulch removal in following places and replace with river rock (see photograph)
 - a. Front Left Bed
 - b. Front Right Bed
 - c. Bed Surrounding Palm Tree
- 2. Grass Removal and replacement with river rock (see photograph) along left border of driveway (area surrounding baby gem boxwoods)
- Removal of Grass at the following areas and replacement with Carex species (Leavenworthii, see photograph) as done at Monte Vista location which obtained historic approval (http://www.gardenstylesanantonio.com/going-irrigation-free-in-monte-vista.html). Consultation for our project received from Scott Ogden (see email) and work to be carried out by Rhinamic Workforce LLC (landscaping)
 - a. Front Right yard next to palm tree (see photograph)
 - b. Front Right and Left grass pods in front of driveway (see photograph)
- 4. Installation of Dwarf Esperanza in two front pods (see photograph)
- 5. Installation of wrought iron handrail on front steps
- 6. Installation of Rain Gutters in white color on Front and back (same color as white trim), see estimate from company







Quote

Bob Address: SATX 78210 Invoice Address: -same as above- City/State/Zip:	Date: Name:	5/3/2017 Manuel Vogt				1		
City/State/Zip: New Branding, TX 2830 Mobile Phone: 270.779.6602 Home Phone: State Style: Email: manuelsvoat@gmail.com Sutter Style: 5" K-Style 40ft Ladder: No Downspout Style: 243 Wedges: No Downspout Color: 30 White Itea Fortection: Has Flashing: State Style:: 0 Story Height: 1 Story ***repossible for pathing Lessers in in ***repossible for state spons #** State spons Story Height: 1 Story **tended gutters Mone Story Height: 1 Story **tended gutters #*** State spons Story Height: 1 Story **tended gutters #************************************					LESSA RAIN GU	RDS TTERS		
Mobile Phone: 270.779.6602 www.lessardsautters.com Home Phone: randv@lessardsautters.com randv@lessardsautters.com Email: manuelsvoat@gmail.com randv@lessardsautters.com Gutter Style: S" K-Style 40ft Ladder: No Gutter Color: 30 White Downsport Style: 2x3 Wedges: No Downsport Color: 30 White Leaf Protection: None Remove Existing: No Romove Shingles No Flashing: Has Flashing Splash Blocks: 0 Story Height: 1 Story ""megnolid proteine protection: None \$710.00 Total \$0.00 Balance \$0.00 Story Height: 1 Story Stor-Down \$286.00 \$286.00 \$286.00 \$577.00 Gutter Cost \$1,144.00 \$0.00 Store-Down \$0.00 \$30.00 <th></th> <th colspan="7">New Braunfels, TX 78130</th>		New Braunfels, TX 78130						
Sutter Style: S' K-Style 40ft Ladder: No Sutter Color: 30 White Leaf Protection: No No Remove Existing: No Roof Type: 30 White **reporting for there going No Remove Existing: No Roof Type: 30 White **reporting for there going Balance Story Height: 1 Story Sutter Cost \$710.00 Total \$0.00 Suter Cost \$1.14.00 \$0.00 \$572.00 \$0.00 Suter Clove (UPTIME WARKNET) \$1.144.00 \$0.00 \$1.144.00 \$0.00 \$1.144.00 \$0.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.144.00 \$1.14	Home Phone:		com		www.lessardsgut	tters.com		
Downspout Style: 2x3 Wedges: No Downspout Color: 30 White Leaf Protection: None Remove Existing: No Roof Type: Shingles Flashing: Has Flashing Splash Blocks: No Story Height: 1 Story **for dynamic Lesser's is or response for water going behind gutters # Splash Blocks: 0 Story Height: 1 Story @ Gutter Cost \$710.00 Total \$0.00 Balance \$0.00 Balance \$0.00 <th>Linall.</th> <td>unueisvogt@gmall.</td> <td><u></u></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	Linall.	unueisvogt@gmall.	<u></u>					
Balance \$0.00 Optional Gutter Guards (In addition to gutter coss)	Downspout Style: Leaf Protection: Flashing: **if no flashing, Lessards is not responsible for water going	2x3 None	Wedges: Remove Existing: Splash Blocks:	No No No	Downspout Colo Roof Typ	or: 30 White be: Shingles		
Optional Gutter Guards (in addition to gutter cost) Roll-Lock \$286.00 Step-Down \$0.00 Smart-Flow \$572.00 Leaf Blaster (15-YEAR WARRANTY) Gutter Glove (UFETIME WARRANTY) NOTES:		Gutter Cost	\$710.00	•	Total \$0.(00		
Roll-Lock \$286.00 Step-Down \$0.00 Smart-Flow \$572.00 Leaf Blaster (15-YEAR WARRANTY) Gutter Glove (LIFETIME WARRANTY) NOTES: NOTES:					Balance \$0.0	00		
		Roll-Lock Step-Down Smart-Flow Leaf Blaster	(15-YEAR WARRANTY)	\$286.00 \$0.00 \$572.00 \$1,144.00				
		NOTES:						
SEE PAGE 2 FOR PICTURES *Warranty Information* All work comes with our 10-year installation warranty. However,		*Warrantv Inform			stallation warranty. However			

Warranty Information All work comes with our 10-year installation warranty. However, gutters must be cleaned regularly. If warranty is requested and the gutters are found to be full of leaves, a \$75 fee will be charged. Please note: there may be minimal damage to grass, shrubs, and small trees around perimeter of home/business. We will obviously do our best to minimize this, but installation of gutters requires heavy foot traffic. Quote

<image/>	<image/>

Placement & color of material: Purchaser has been advised of exact location & color of gutters and downspouts as seen in pictures/drawing. Any changes in the scope of work agreed to above will be at an additional charge to the purchaser. Jobs can be cancelled 2 weeks ahead of install date. Less than 2 weeks customer is required to pay %30 of cost for restocking fee.

Going Irrigation Free in Monte Vista



view slideshow

Many conservation-minded homeowners are surprised to learn that in San Antonio's historic districts the city's review guidelines specify the preservation of 50 percent or more of the existing historic lawn at a given home.

This might seem like a complication to homeowners hoping to reduce their outdoor water through landscape redesign — especially when the existing design features a sweeping lawn, the chief target of much current watersaver design. But a recent Scott Ogden landscape in Monte Vista found a novel way to comply with this requirement through a simple design solution and managed to do away with the sprinkler system in the process.

Re: Historical Guidelines Landscaping Question

1 message

Scott Ogden <scot1111@flash.net> Reply-To: Scott Ogden <scot1111@flash.net> To: Manuel Vogt <manuelsvogt@gmail.com> Cc: "Lauren S. Ogden" <plantmom@aol.com> Sun, Oct 1, 2017 at 10:35 PM

Manuel and Patricia-

Yes, Brad did a nice write up on our project, but he did it quickly in advance of a SAWS promotion event , so unfortunately muddled a few of the details.

The sedge we used at the Fisher garden in Monte Vista is actually a regional Texas form of *Carex leavenworthii*. It is sometimes sold by Native Texas Nursery (along with a couple other mixed native sedge species they collect on site) as "Webberville *Sedge"*;Other Austin area nurseries market *C. leavenworthii* as "Scott's turf". Texas sedge (*Carex texensis*) is a different species ; the form in horticulture is actually not native to Texas (it came via a California Bonsai pot from a cemetary in Maryland); such are are the bedeviling details of horticulture) Texas sedge is not well suited for mass planting as a lawn in our region.

C. leavenworthii idoes very well, and is adaptable to both sunny and shaded situations; we have grown it in our own moderately sunny garden in Austin for over 15 years, where it functions as a casual lawn and groundcover combined with rainlilies. We also use it frequently for client gardens. Our main chores are raking leaves and debris from the adjacent live oaks and pulling occaisional weeds. Monte Vista has good deep soils that should be fine for *C. leavenworthii*. During extended hot spells targeted irrigation with a hose-end sprinkler will keep foliage from browning. If there are native clumping sedges growing in neglected lots in King William they are likely *C. leavenworthii*. While not really a lawn in the usuall sense, this sedge is fine with light occasional foot traffic, and from, that standpoint is a better choice than most other groundcover options.

Best,

Scott Ogden (512) 9179134

Quote

Date: Name:	5/3/2017 Manuel Vogt			L			
Job Address: City/State/Zip:	130 Wickes St. SATX 78210			LESSARI RAIN GUTH	DS ERS		
Invoice Address: City/State/Zip:	-same as above			2281 Normandy Grace New Braunfels, TX 7813			
Mobile Phone: Home Phone:	270.779.6602		Tel: 210-480-0009 www.lessardsgutters.com randy@lessardsgutters.com				
Email:	<u>manuelsvogt@gmail.</u>	<u>.com</u>					
Gutter Style:	5" K-Style	40ft Ladder:	No	Gutter Color:	30 White		
Downspout Style:	2x3	Wedges:	No	Downspout Color:	30 White		
Leaf Protection:	None	Remove Existing:	No	Roof Type:	Shingles		
Flashing: •*if no flashing, Lessards is not responsible for water going behind gutters	Has Flashing	Splash Blocks: # Splash Blocks:	No O	Story Height:	1 Story		
	2						
	Gutter Cost	\$710.00		Total \$0.00			
			Ba	afance \$0.00			
	Optional Gutte	r Guards (in addition to gu	tter cost)				
	Roll-Lock		\$286.00				
	Step-Down		\$0.00				
	Smart-Flow		\$572.00				
	<u>Leaf Blaster</u> Gutter Glove	(15-YEAR WARRANTY) (LIFETIME WARRANTY)	\$1,144.00 \$0.00				
	NOTES:						
		SEE PAGE	2 FOR PICTURES				
Warranty Information All work comes with our 10-year installation warranty. However,							
				gutters are found to be full of			

gutters must be cleaned regularly. If warranty is requested and the gutters are found to be full of leaves, a \$75 fee will be charged. Please note: there may be minimal damage to grass, shrubs, and small trees around perimeter of home/business. We will obviously do our best to minimize this, but installation of gutters requires heavy foot traffic.