

January 10, 2018

Mr. Dean Bayer, PE SMP Project Manager City of San Antonio – TCI Department 114 W. Commerce, 9th Floor San Antonio, TX 78205

Re: 2018-2019 Base Repair Task Order Contract Package 11 – Contract Award

Dear Mr. Bayer:

On January 9, 2018 contractor bid proposals for the referenced project were opened and read aloud. Two bid proposals were submitted with none containing errors.

The lowest responsive bidder for this contract is Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. with a total base bid of \$2,139,567.48. Clark Construction is headquartered in San Antonio, TX and has done a significant amount of base repair related projects for the City of San Antonio and others in the surrounding area. Clark Construction has been awarded similar contracts of size and scope in recent years and the City of San Antonio has been pleased with their work. Due to no knowledge of poor performance which would exclude Clark Construction from being recommended for award, LAN recommends the award of this contract to Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. Below is a listing of the contractors who bid on the contract and their total base bids:

1.	Clark Construction of Texas, Inc.	\$2,139,567.48
2.	Curran Contracting Company	\$3,421,502.35

Attached herewith are the following:

1) One (1) pdf copy of the bid tabulations

2) One (1) pdf copy of the summary of the low bidder's prices, which is 23.1% below the responsive contractor's bid proposal average and 20.8% below the Engineers Estimate.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (210) 499-5082, or by email at <u>sjaniol@lan-inc.com</u>.

Respectfully,

Stephen Aniol, P.E. Senior Project Manager

Cc: Juan Romero Margaret Toscano

BID TABULATION Project: 2018-2019 Base Repair Task Order Contract Package 11 Bid Opening: Tuesday, January 9, 2018 Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc. 10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082				Clark Construction of Texas, Inc. 5140 Gibbs Sprawl Rd. San Antonio, TX 78219 210-661-6785		Curran Contracting Company 11230 IH-10 East Converse, TX 78109 210-819-6128		Engineer's Estimate		Contractor Average	
	.: 120-12032-008 DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT		NSIVE BIDDER TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	AVG UNIT PRICE	TOTAL
ITEM	BASE BID	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TUTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	AVG UNIT PRICE	TOTAL
205.4A	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22)	6,580	TON	\$69.03	\$454,217.40	\$67.85	\$446,453.00	\$85.00	\$559,300.00	\$68.44	\$450,335.20
205.4B	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP)	1,560	TON	\$20.00	\$31,200.00	\$77.85	\$121,446.00	\$75.00	\$117,000.00	\$48.93	\$76,323.00
208.1	SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPHALTIC MATERIAL (2" DEPTH)	59,500	SY	\$2.00	\$119,000.00	\$1.55	\$92,225.00	\$3.00	\$178,500.00	\$1.78	\$105,612.50
230.3A	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (6" COMPACTED DEPTH)	17,000	TON	\$76.63	\$1,302,710.00	\$125.50	\$2,133,500.00	\$85.00	\$1,445,000.00	\$101.07	\$1,718,105.00
230.3B	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (12" COMPACTED DEPTH)	1,700	TON	\$20.00	\$34,000.00	\$114.45	\$194,565.00	\$85.00	\$144,500.00	\$67.23	\$114,282.50
533-A	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4")	2,000	LF	\$0.45	\$900.00	\$0.60	\$1,200.00	\$0.55	\$1,100.00	\$0.53	\$1,050.00
533-B	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8")	1,000	LF	\$0.90	\$900.00	\$1.40	\$1,400.00	\$1.20	\$1,200.00	\$1.15	\$1,150.00
533-C	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12")	1,000	LF	\$1.90	\$1,900.00	\$2.60	\$2,600.00	\$2.00	\$2,000.00	\$2.25	\$2,250.00
533-D	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24")	1,000	LF EA	\$3.25	\$3,250.00	\$4.00	\$4,000.00	\$3.00	\$3,000.00	\$3.63	\$3,625.00
533-E 533-F	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL) ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	40 40	EA	\$50.00	\$2,000.00	\$75.25 \$75.25	\$3,010.00	\$70.00	\$2,800.00	\$62.63	\$2,505.00
	ELIM EXIST PVMT MIK AND KAISED MARKERS (WORD)	12	EA	\$50.00 \$70.00	\$2,000.00 \$840.00	\$75.25	\$3,010.00 \$4,000.80	\$70.00 \$250.00	\$2,800.00 \$3,000.00	\$62.63 \$201.70	\$2,505.00
535.1	4" WIDE YELLOW LINE	50,000	LF	\$70.00	\$840.00	\$333.40	\$4,000.80	\$250.00	\$20,000.00	\$201.70	\$2,420.40 \$20,750.00
535.2	4" WIDE WHITE LINE	30,000	LF	\$0.38	\$19,000.00	\$0.45	\$22,500.00	\$0.40	\$20,000.00	\$0.42	\$20,750.00 \$12,450.00
535.4	8" SOLID WHITE LINE	1,500	LF	\$0.80	\$1,200.00	\$0.45	\$1,425.00	\$0.40	\$1,275.00	\$0.42	\$1,312.50
535.5	12" WIDE WHITE LINE	1,500	LF	\$0.80	\$3,000.00	\$0.95	\$4,050.00	\$0.85	\$3,900.00	\$0.88	\$3,525.00
535.7	24" WIDE WHITE LINE	700	LF	\$2.00	\$3,325.00	\$2.70	\$3,885.00	\$2.00	\$3,850.00	\$2.35	\$3,605.00
535.7A	24" WIDE WHITE LINE (HIGH CONTRAST)	1,300	LF	\$4.73	\$27,300.00	\$3.55	\$31,980.00	\$3.50	\$30,550.00	\$22.80	\$3,605.00
	WORD "ONLY"	40	EA	\$95.00	\$3,800.00	\$112.30	\$4,492.00	\$110.00	\$4,400.00	\$103.65	\$4,146.00
	RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL	12	EA	\$425.00	\$5,100.00	\$520.95	\$6,251.40	\$500.00	\$6,000.00	\$472.98	\$5,675.70
535.16	STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY	30	EA	\$100.00	\$3,000.00	\$115.75	\$3,472.50	\$300.00	\$3,000.00	\$107.88	\$3,236.25
	BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL	30	EA	\$250.00	\$7,500.00	\$289.40	\$8,682.00	\$235.00	\$7,050.00	\$269.70	\$8,091.00
	WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE)	30	EA	\$110.00	\$3,300.00	\$129.65	\$3,889.50	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	\$119.83	\$3,594.75
	WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT)	50	EA	\$80.00	\$4,000.00	\$96.10	\$4,805.00	\$95.00	\$4,750.00	\$88.05	\$4,402.50
537.1	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W)	600	EA	\$0.50	\$300.00	\$5.80	\$3,480.00	\$4.00	\$2,400.00	\$3.15	\$1,890.00
537.2	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y)	600	EA	\$0.50	\$300.00	\$5.80	\$3,480.00	\$4.00	\$2,400.00	\$3.15	\$1,890.00
537.6	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C)	3,500	EA	\$3.25	\$11,375.00	\$3.85	\$13,475.00	\$3.50	\$12,250.00	\$3.55	\$12,425.00
	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A)	3,500	EA	\$3.25	\$11,375.00	\$3.85	\$13,475.00	\$3.50	\$12,250.00		\$12,425.00
537.9	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R)	2,000	EA	\$3.25	\$6,500.00	\$3.85	\$7,700.00	\$3.50	\$7,000.00	\$3.55	\$7,100.00
SUP 1	DOOR HANGERS	1	LS	\$375.00	\$375.00	\$5,402.35	\$5,402.35	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,888.68	\$2,888.68
	POLICE OFFICER	400	HR	\$40.00	\$16,000.00	\$84.90	\$33,960.00	\$42.00	\$16,800.00	\$62.45	\$24,980.00
SUP 3	TCI PROJECT SIGN	10	EA	\$150.00	\$1,500.00	\$308.00	\$3,080.00	\$175.00	\$1,750.00	\$229.00	\$2,290.00
SUP 4	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD)	16	МО	\$500.00	\$8,000.00	\$1,002.55	\$16,040.80	\$1,800.00	\$28,800.00	\$751.28	\$12,020.40
SUP 5	ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION	8	EA	\$0.01	\$0.08	\$3,149.75	\$25,198.00	\$1,200.00	\$9,600.00	\$1,574.88	\$12,599.04
			TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS:		\$2,100,567.48		\$3,241,633.35		\$2,655,725.00		\$2,671,100.42
826	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT	75	EA	\$200.00	\$15,000.00	\$235.00	\$17,625.00	\$225.00	\$16,875.00	\$217.50	\$16,312.50
		SUBTOTAL	SAWS WATER BID ITEMS:		\$15,000.00		\$17,625.00		\$16,875.00		\$16,312.50
851	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	40	EA	\$350.00	\$14,000.00	\$3,762.35	\$150,494.00	\$400.00	\$16,000.00	\$2,056.18	\$82,247.00
			SAWS SEWER BID ITEMS:		\$14,000.00	+ 5,1 02.00	\$150,494.00	÷	\$16,000.00	,	\$82,247.00
			TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:		\$29,000.00		\$168,119.00		\$32,875.00		\$98,559.50
F40.0		50		# 222.25	A 40.000.00	* 005.00	A44 750 00	¢005.00	M44 050 00	017.50	¢40.075.00
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	50		\$200.00	\$10,000.00	\$235.00	\$11,750.00	\$225.00	\$11,250.00	\$217.50	\$10,875.00
			TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS:		\$10,000.00		\$11,750.00		\$11,250.00		\$10,875.00
								1			\$2,780,534.92

BID TABULATION Project: 2018-2019 Base Repair Task Order Contract Package 11 Bid Opening: Tuesday, January 9, 2018 Owner: City of San Antonio Transportation & Capital Improvements Department Engineer: Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc. 10101 Reunion Place, Suite 200, San Antonio, Texas 78216-4165 (210) 499-5082				Clark Constructi 5140 Gibbs San Antonic 210-66	Sprawl Rd. , TX 78219	Engineer's Estimate		Unit Price Comparison	
	p.: 120-12032-008			LOWEST RESPO	ONSIVE BIDDER				
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	DELTA	% DELTA
	BASE BID								
205.4A	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (2" THICK) (PG 64-22)	6,580	TON	\$69.03	\$454,217.40	\$85.00	\$559,300.00	(\$15.97)	-18
205.4B	HOT MIX ASPHALTIC PAVEMENT TYPE D (LEVEL-UP)	1,560	TON	\$20.00	\$31,200.00	\$75.00	\$117,000.00	(\$55.00)	-73
208.1	SALVAGING, HAULING & STOCKPILING RECLAIMABLE ASPHALTIC MATERIAL (2" DEPTH)	59,500	SY	\$2.00	\$119,000.00	\$3.00	\$178,500.00	(\$1.00)	-33
230.3A	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (6" COMPACTED DEPTH)	17,000	TON	\$76.63	\$1,302,710.00	\$85.00	\$1,445,000.00	(\$8.37)	-9
230.3B	REPLACING BASE & PVMT WITH TYPE B PVMT (12" COMPACTED DEPTH)	1,700	TON	\$20.00	\$34,000.00	\$85.00	\$144,500.00	(\$65.00)	-76
533-A	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (4")	2,000	LF	\$0.45	\$900.00	\$0.55	\$1,100.00	(\$0.10)	-18
533-B	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (8")	1,000	LF	\$0.90	\$900.00	\$1.20	\$1,200.00	(\$0.30)	-25
533-C	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (12")	1,000	LF	\$1.90	\$1,900.00	\$2.00	\$2,000.00	(\$0.10)	-5
533-D	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (24")	1,000	LF	\$3.25	\$3,250.00	\$2.00	\$2,000.00	\$0.25	
533-E	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (SYMBOL)	40	EA	\$50.00	\$3,250.00	\$3.00	\$3,000.00	\$0.25 (\$20.00)	-28
533-E	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	40	EA					· · · /	
533-F	ELIM EXIST PVMT MRK AND RAISED MARKERS (WORD)	12	EA	\$50.00	\$2,000.00	\$70.00	\$2,800.00	(\$20.00)	-28
				\$70.00	\$840.00	\$250.00	\$3,000.00	(\$180.00)	-72
535.1	4" WIDE YELLOW LINE	50,000	LF	\$0.38	\$19,000.00	\$0.40	\$20,000.00	(\$0.02)	-5
535.2	4" WIDE WHITE LINE	30,000	LF	\$0.38	\$11,400.00	\$0.40	\$12,000.00	(\$0.02)	-5
535.4	8" SOLID WHITE LINE	1,500	LF	\$0.80	\$1,200.00	\$0.85	\$1,275.00	(\$0.05)	-5
535.5	12" WIDE WHITE LINE	1,500	LF	\$2.00	\$3,000.00	\$2.60	\$3,900.00	(\$0.60)	-23
535.7	24" WIDE WHITE LINE	700	LF	\$4.75	\$3,325.00	\$5.50	\$3,850.00	(\$0.75)	-13
535.7A	24" WIDE WHITE LINE (HIGH CONTRAST)	1,300	LF	\$21.00	\$27,300.00	\$23.50	\$30,550.00	(\$2.50)	-10
535.12	WORD "ONLY"	40	EA	\$95.00	\$3,800.00	\$110.00	\$4,400.00	(\$15.00)	-13
535.14	RAILROAD CROSSING SYMBOL	12	EA	\$425.00	\$5,100.00	\$500.00	\$6,000.00	(\$75.00)	-15
535.16	STRAIGHT WHITE ARROW BICYCLE FACILITY	30	EA	\$100.00	\$3,000.00	\$100.00	\$3,000.00	\$0.00	C
535.17	BICYCLE RIDER SYMBOL	30	EA	\$250.00	\$7,500.00	\$235.00	\$7,050.00	\$15.00	6
535.22	WHITE SHARROW (BIKE SHARED LANE)	30	EA	\$110.00	\$3,300.00	\$150.00	\$4,500.00	(\$40.00)	-26
535.23	WHITE ARROW (LEFT/RIGHT/STRAIGHT)	50	EA	\$80.00	\$4,000.00	\$95.00	\$4,750.00	(\$15.00)	-15
537.1	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE W)	600	EA	\$0.50	\$300.00	\$4.00	\$2,400.00	(\$3.50)	-87
537.2	TRAFFIC BUTTON (TYPE Y)	600	EA	\$0.50	\$300.00	\$4.00	\$2,400.00	(\$3.50)	-87
537.6	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE I-C)	3,500	EA	\$3.25	\$11,375.00	\$3.50	\$12,250.00	(\$0.25)	-7
537.8	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II A-A)	3,500	EA	\$3.25	\$11,375.00	\$3.50	\$12,250.00	(\$0.25)	-7
537.9	PAVEMENT MARKER (TYPE II C-R)	2,000	EA	\$3.25	\$6,500.00	\$3.50	\$7,000.00	(\$0.25)	-7
SUP 1	DOOR HANGERS	1	LS	\$375.00	\$375.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	(\$625.00)	-62
SUP 2	POLICE OFFICER	400	HR	\$40.00	\$16,000.00	\$42.00	\$16,800.00	(\$2.00)	-4
SUP 3	TCI PROJECT SIGN	10	EA	\$150.00	\$1,500.00	\$175.00	\$1,750.00	(\$25.00)	-14
SUP 4	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN (ELECTRONIC MESSAGE BOARD)	16	MO	\$500.00	\$8,000.00	\$1,800.00	\$28,800.00	(\$1,300.00)	-72
SUP 5	ADDITIONAL MOBILIZATION	8	EA	\$0.01	\$0.08	\$1,200.00	\$9,600.00	(\$1,199.99)	-100
001 0			TOTAL COSA BID ITEMS:		\$2,100,567.48	φ1,200.00	\$2,655,725.00	(\$1,199.99)	-100
			TOTAL COSA BID TIENIS.		φ2,100,307.40		φ2,033,723.00		
826	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTMENT	75	EA	¢000.00	¢45,000,00	¢005.00	¢40.075.00	(*05.00)	
020	SAWS VALVE BOX ADJUSTIVIENT			\$200.00	\$15,000.00	\$225.00	\$16,875.00	(\$25.00)	-11
		SUBIOTALS	AWS WATER BID ITEMS:		\$15,000.00		\$16,875.00		
		10							
851	ADJUSTING EXISTING MANHOLES (SAWS)	40	EA	\$350.00	\$14,000.00	\$400.00	\$16,000.00	(\$50.00)	-12
		SUBTOTAL S	AWS SEWER BID ITEMS:		\$14,000.00		\$16,000.00		
			TOTAL SAWS BID ITEMS:		\$29,000.00		\$32,875.00		
			1						
512.3A	ADJUSTING EXISTING VALVE BOX (CPS ENERGY)	50	EA	\$200.00	\$10,000.00	\$225.00	\$11,250.00	(\$25.00)	-11
			TOTAL CPS BID ITEMS:		\$10,000.00		\$11,250.00		
			TOTAL BASE BID:		\$2,139,567.48		\$2,699,850.00		

DELTA
-18.8%
-73.3%
-33.3%
-9.8%
-76.5%
-18.2%
-25.0%
-5.0%
8.3%
-28.6%
-28.6%
-72.0% -5.0%
-5.0%
-5.9%
-23.1%
-13.6%
-10.6%
-13.6%
-15.0%
0.0%
6.4%
-26.7%
-15.8%
<u>-87.5%</u> -87.5%
-87.5% -7.1%
-7.1%
-7.1%
-62.5%
1 90/-
-14.3%
-72.2%
-100.0%
-11.1%
-12.5%
-12.070
-11.1%