HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

March 07, 2018

HDRC CASE NO: ADDRESS: LEGAL DESCRIPTION: ZONING: CITY COUNCIL DIST.: DISTRICT: APPLICANT: OWNER: TYPE OF WORK: APPLICATION RECEIVED:	2018-099 1418 FULTON AVE NCB 2752 BLK 58 LOT 8 R-4 H 1 Fulton Historic District Tony Sanchez Tony Sanchez Window replacement February 19, 2018
APPLICATION RECEIVED:60-DAY REVIEW:	April 20, 2018

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Replace two first story wood windows featuring 8 divided lites each with wood windows featuring 4 divided lites each.
- 2. Replace two second story wood windows featuring 8 divided lites with new wood windows featuring 2 divided lites.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

12. Increasing Energy Efficiency

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Historic elements*—Preserve elements of historic buildings that are energy efficient including awnings, porches, recessed entryways, overhangs, operable windows, and shutters.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Weatherization*—Apply caulking and weather stripping to historic windows and doors to make them weather tight. ii. *Thermal performance*—Improve thermal performance of windows, fanlights, and sidelights by applying UV film or new glazing that reduces heat gain from sunlight on south and west facing facades only if the historic character can be maintained. Do not use reflective or tinted films.

iii. *Windows*— Restore original windows to working order. Install compatible and energy-efficient replacement windows when existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Replacement windows must match the appearance, materials,

size, design, proportion, and profile of the original historic windows.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 1418 Fulton is a 2-story single family home constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The home features a non-original second story addition, as well as wood windows with true divided lites, a stucco façade finish on the first story, and clay barrel tile roofing. The home is a contributing structure in the Fulton Avenue Historic District.
- b. WINDOW REPLACEMENT: FIRST FLOOR The applicant is proposing to replace two existing first floor wood windows featuring 8 divided lites with new wood windows featuring 4 divided lites. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, existing wood windows should be preserved and restored. If the window is deteriorated beyond repair, the replacement window must match the appearance, materials, size, design, proportion, and profile of the original window. The existing window is highly deteriorated and eligible for replacement. However, the proposed replacement window, while matching in material, does not match the divided lite configuration of the existing. The style of the window is characteristic of Spanish Eclectic homes in the district and in neighboring historic residential districts, such as Monticello Park. The window is also prominent and located in the center of the original front façade. Staff does not find the proposed replacement window consistent with the Guidelines.
- c. WINDOW REPLACEMENT: SECOND FLOOR The applicant is proposing to replace two second story wood windows featuring 8 divided lites with new wood windows featuring 2 divided lites. The second story of this structure is not original and non-contributing. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, existing wood windows should be preserved and restored. If the window is deteriorated beyond repair, the replacement window must match the appearance, materials, size, design, proportion, and profile of the original window. The existing windows are significantly deteriorated and eligible for replacement. However, the proposed replacement window, while matching in material, does not match the divided lite configuration of the existing. While the second story addition itself is not original, the design and configuration of the windows matches those on the first floor and those commonly found in historic Spanish Eclectic homes on Fulton Ave and in the nearby historic district Monticello Park. These windows may have been relocated from the first floor when the second story was added; alternatively, they were built to match the existing windows in all respects. Staff does not find the proposed replacement windows consistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through c. Staff recommends that the applicant installs new wood windows that match the dimensions, profile, materiality, and divided lite configuration as the existing. The applicant must submit updated drawings to staff that clearly indicate all dimensions, including overall size and individual muntins, for each opening.

CASE MANAGER:

Stephanie Phillips





Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed:Feb 22, 2018

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.

















. . . .

2nd Floor, Front

