

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

December 20, 2017

HDRC CASE NO: 2017-577 **214 ARMY ADDRESS: 218 ARMY 220 ARMY 221 ARMY 226 ARMY 230 ARMY 235 ARMY 237 ARMY 238 ARMY 239 ARMY 240 ARMY 242 ARMY 247 ARMY 262 ARMY 302 ARMY 305 ARMY 306 ARMY 309 ARMY 315 ARMY 316 ARMY 319 ARMY 320 ARMY 327 ARMY 330 ARMY 331 ARMY 335 ARMY 336 ARMY 337 ARMY 338 ARMY 339 ARMY 341 ARMY 343 ARMY** 223 BRAHAN BLVD 225 BRAHAN BLVD 227 BRAHAN BLVD 231 BRAHAN BLVD 239 BRAHAN BLVD 251 BRAHAN BLVD 255 BRAHAN BLVD

> 259 BRAHAN BLVD 301 BRAHAN BLVD 302 BRAHAN BLVD

Page 1 of 5 HDRC Case: 2017-577

```
305 BRAHAN BLVD
                    326 BRAHAN BLVD
306 BRAHAN BLVD
                    330 BRAHAN BLVD
310 BRAHAN BLVD
                    333 BRAHAN BLVD
311 BRAHAN BLVD
                    337 BRAHAN BLVD
312 BRAHAN BLVD
                    345 BRAHAN BLVD
315 BRAHAN BLVD
                    353 BRAHAN BLVD
316 BRAHAN BLVD
                    359 BRAHAN BLVD
318 BRAHAN BLVD
                    363 BRAHAN BLVD
320 BRAHAN BLVD
                    367 BRAHAN BLVD
321 BRAHAN BLVD
                    210 HAYWOOD AVE
322 BRAHAN BLVD
                    214 HAYWOOD AVE
324 BRAHAN BLVD
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 4 & 5
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 6&7 8
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 9
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 17
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 10
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 16 AND 17
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 18
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 19
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 20, 21 & 22
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 23
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 24 & 25
NCB 3856 (255 BRAHAN {AMENDING}), BLOCK 2 LOT 26 & 27
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 9
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 8
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 7
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 6
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 4 EXCEPT SE 1 FT X 66.97 FT
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 3 & SE 1 FT X 66.97 FT OF 4
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 5
NCB 3856 BLK 2 LOT 1&2
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 17 & W 20 FT OF 16
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT W 40 FT OF 15 & E 30 FT OF 16
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 14, W 25 FT OF 13 & E 10 FT OF 15
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 18
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 19
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 20
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 21
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 22 AND 23
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 12 & E 25 FT OF 13
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 9, 10, 11, 24, 25, W 45 FT OF 8 & W 2 FT OF 26
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT E 48 FT OF 26 & W 25 FT OF 27
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 7 AND E 5 FT OF 8
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 6 & W 25 FT OF 5
NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 28,29, & E.25 FT OF 27
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 18 19
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 15 & 16
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 20 & W 25 FT OF 21
NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT E 25 FT OF 21 & W 25 FT OF 22
```

NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 23,EXC SE 2 FT & E 1/2 OF 22

NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 24 & SE 2 FT OF 23

LEGAL DESCRIPTION:

NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 25

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 16 & W 25 FT OF 15

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 14 & E 25 FT OF 15

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 12, 13 & W 25 FT OF 11

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 10 & E 25 FT OF 11

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 9

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 8 & W 25 FT OF 7

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 5, 6 & E 25 FT OF 7

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 4

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 3

NCB 3858 BLK 4 LOT 2

NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 31

NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 32 & W 45FT OF 33

NCB 3855 BLK 1 LOT 34 & E 5 FT OF 33

NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 10 11

NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 12 W 10 FT OF 13

NCB 3593 BLK 1 LOT 14 E 40 FT OF 13

PUBLIC PROPERTY: No

LANDMARK: Commercial Building

APPLICANT: Mary Radicke on behalf of the Westfort Alliance Neighborhood Association

OWNER: Various

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval for a historic designation of the Westfort Historic District and a recommendation for approval to the Zoning Commission and to the City Council. The proposed district includes the 200 and 300 block of Army between Broadway and Pine, and the 200 block Brahan on the north between Broadway and Pine, and the 300 block of Brahan between Haywood and Pine. It contains 60 parcels total, all are found to be contributing to the character of the proposed district.

FINDINGS:

- a. The request for historic district designation was submitted by a property owner within the proposed boundary on March 23, 2017, on behalf of the Westfort Alliance Neighborhood Association.
- b. The proposed district was platted in 1909 by E.H. Cunningham and J.Kirkpatrick. The area includes an eclectic mix of styles, including Tudor, craftsman, prairie, Spanish eclectic, folk Victorian, post-war mid-century apartments and neoclassical homes. The development pattern and neighborhood location reflect the proliferation of housing stock after WWII abutting Fort Sam Houston to the east. UDC Section 35-607 (a) states that historic districts must meet at least three of the designation criteria. The proposed Westfort Historic District meets criteria 3, 8, 10 and 11. All structures included in the proposed boundary are contributing.
- c. BACKGROUND -- The applicant is requesting approval for historic district designation for the Westfort Historic District and a recommendation for approval to the Zoning Commission and to the City Council for Historic zoning designation.
- The proposed district will include the 200 and 300 block of Army between Broadway and Pine, and the 200 block Brahan on the north between Broadway and Pine, and the 300 block of Brahan between Haywood and Pine. It contains 60 non-municipal parcels total. All 60 properties are contributing to the proposed district.
- Prior to receiving the request for district designation, OHP staff was invited by residents to attend five neighborhood meetings held on 7/18/2016, 8/7/2016, 8/14/2016, 8/23/2016, and 9/14/2016, to provide information regarding historic designation and the design review processes.
- A public informational meeting for proposed historic district as held on April 11, 2017, for property owners within the boundary. 17 property owners were present at this meeting.
- On October 17, 2017, OHP gave an additional presentation describing the designation and design review process at the Westfort Neighborhood Alliance Association (WANA) quarterly meeting. Over 20 residents of WANA where in attendance
- On October 19, 2017, the staff of the Office of Historic Preservation received and verified 31 return notices of 51% of the property owners within the proposed boundary that are in support of the designation. In accordance with the UDC, staff has forwarded the application to the HDRC for review.

- The decision to seek historic district designation was in response to concerns from the residents regarding recent demolitions and increased development activities.
- The proposed boundary is located within the Westfort Neighborhood Conservation District-9 (NCD). The NCD was designated by the City Council October 2011. Per UDC 35-335, the City Council aims to preserve, protect, enhance, and perpetuate the value of these residential neighborhoods or commercial districts through the establishment of Neighborhood Conservation Districts. NCDs are established in areas that possess distinctive character-defining features.
- d. SITE CONTEXT The proposed historic district lies north of the west end of Fort Sam Houston and north of downtown San Antonio. There are curbed sidewalks, large lots with deep setbacks and a large landscaped median along Brahan Boulevard.
- e. HISTORIC CONTEXT The proposed historic district consists of portions of two subdivision plats, Army Terrace and Narcissa Place, both platted in 1909. John H Kirkpatrick Company was the owner and developer of Army Terrace Plat. Narcissa Place was platted by E.H. Cunningham. Both subdivisions attracted prominent residents in the 1910s including Sunken Gardens architect, C.T. Boelhauwe; Frack Scobey, director of the U.S. Mint and Gutzon Borglum, American artist and the sculptor of the Mount Rushmore National Monument.
- f. ARCHITECTURAL ASSESSMENT The housing stock is largely reflective of the early 20th century trend which promoted varied styles within neighborhoods. The architectural styles in Westfort range from Folk Victorian, Craftsman, Prairie, Colonial revival, Tudor revival, to Spanish eclectic with a couple of mid-century apartment buildings.
- g. EVALUATION As referenced in the applicable citations, Westfort Historic District meets UDC criterion [35-607 (b)3], [35-607 (b)8], [35-607 (b)10], [35-607 (b)11], for a finding of historic significance in the process of seeking designation as a local historic district. In order to be eligible for a historic district, at least two properties must meet at least three of the criteria; Westfort Historic District meets four.
- (3) Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state, or nation; for its association with key figures associated with local and national landmarks and key institutions.
- (8) Its historical, architectural, or cultural integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship; Westfort is an eclectic neighborhood architecturally speaking with a mix of styles and types. The eclectic styles reflect the chronology of the neighborhood's development. Houses and apartment buildings are located in this area with styles including Folk Victorian, New Formalism, Midcentury modern, Craftsman, Prairie, Colonial revival, Tudor revival, and Spanish eclectic. Primary materials found include stucco, wood, wood shingle, and brick. All structures within the proposed district are within the period of significance and contribute to the neighborhood. There are only two vacant lots, otherwise the neighborhood is intact.
- (10) Its character as an established and geographically definable neighborhood, united by culture, architectural style or physical plan and development; The Westfort Neighborhood was established adjacent and partially encircled by Fort Sam Houston. The proposed district boundary is part of 2 subdivisions both platted in 1909. The neighborhood includes similar setbacks, large lots, a wide landscaped median, and a grand streetscape on this rise overlooking the city.
- (11) It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States; The Westfort Neighborhood has been home to many prominent citizens, including C.T. Boelhauwe, architect of the State Bank and Trade building and the Sunken Gardens Theatre, Gutzon Borglum, sculptor of Mount Rushmore, and more. The Westfort Neighborhood was established with a need for multi-family homes and apartment buildings being adjacent to Fort Sam Houston.
- h. If the HDRC concurs that the proposed district meets criteria and is eligible for designation and recommends the historic district designation for the Westfort Historic District, then their recommendation shall be submitted to the zoning commission. Once the zoning commission makes their recommendation, it will be submitted to the city council. The city council shall review and shall approve or deny the proposed historic district.
- i. Per UDC Sec. 35-453, once the commission makes a recommendation for designation, property owners shall follow the historic and design review process before permits can be issued, until a final resolution from City Council. Written approval (a Certificate of Appropriateness) must be obtained for any exterior work.
- j. Historic districts possess cultural and historical value and contribute to the overall quality and character of the City. The City offers a tax incentive for all residential properties occupied by the property owner at the time of the designation. The incentive is a 20% tax exemption on City taxes for 10 years provided the owner remains in the property.
- k. The City also offers a Substantial Rehabilitation tax incentive. After substantial rehabilitation of a historic property, the property owners may choose one of two tax incentives, including having the city property taxes frozen for 10 years at the pre-rehabilitation value, or paying no city property taxes for the first five years, and for the next five years, city property taxes are assessed at the value that is 50% of the post-rehabilitation assessed value.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval for designation of the Westfort Historic District and a recommendation for approval to the Zoning Commission and to the City Council based on findings a through g.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The Historic and Design Review Commission approves historic designation of the Westfort Historic District and a recommendation for approval to the Zoning Commission and to the City Council for historic district designation.

Shanon Shea Miller

Historic Preservation Officer