

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

July 06, 2018

HDRC CASE NO: 2018-325
ADDRESS: 538 QUITMAN ST
LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 993 BLK 3 LOT E 35.3 FT OF N 100FT OF 2 & W 14.7 FT OF N 100 OF 3
ZONING: R-6 H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.: 2
DISTRICT: Government Hill Historic District
APPLICANT: Justin Abt
OWNER: Justin Abt
TYPE OF WORK: Exterior modifications
APPLICATION RECEIVED: June 28, 2018
60-DAY REVIEW: August 27, 2018
REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to wrap four existing stucco front porch columns with cedar. The wrapping will feature simple paneled detailing.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
- iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
- v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 538 Quitman St is a 1-story single family home constructed in approximately 1935 in the Craftsman style. The home has been heavily modified over the years, and features non-original metal windows, non-original stucco siding, and columns clad with stucco. Despite these changes, the structure retains several original elements that are characteristic of the Craftsman style, including a primary front gable configuration, gable vent, and gable bracketing. The home is contributing to the Government Hill Historic

District.

- b. PORCH COLUMNS – The applicant has proposed to wrap the existing stucco-clad porch columns with thin sheets of wood coated with a cedar stain. The wrapping will feature a simple paneled detailing. The existing stucco-clad columns will be retained beneath. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, added or reconstructed porch elements should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish. If no architectural evidence of added elements exist, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns. While staff finds that panel detailing generally appropriate for the Craftsman architecture of the structure, staff finds that the material, color, thickness, and detailing inconsistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval of the porch column modifications based on findings a through b. Staff recommends that the applicant consider alternatives that are more consistent with the original design and materials and of the house. Appropriate changes may be eligible for administrative approval.

CASE MANAGER:

Stephanie Phillips

CASE COMMENTS:

The work was completed prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness. Post-work application fees have not been paid.



Flex Viewer

Powered by ArcGIS Server

Printed: Jul 02, 2018

The City of San Antonio does not guarantee the accuracy, adequacy, completeness or usefulness of any information. The City does not warrant the completeness, timeliness, or positional, thematic, and attribute accuracy of the GIS data. The GIS data, cartographic products, and associated applications are not legal representations of the depicted data. Information shown on these maps is derived from public records that are constantly undergoing revision. Under no circumstances should GIS-derived products be used for final design purposes. The City provides this information on an "as is" basis without warranty of any kind, express or implied, including but not limited to warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose, and assumes no responsibility for anyone's use of the information.

June 29, 2018 at 2:06 PM
523-599 Quitman St
San Antonio TX 78208
United States







