# Z2018295



September 4, 2018

## APPLICATION FOR CHANGE OF ZONING

## Request:

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting a change in zoning to add "HL" Historic Landmark designation to 230 Cactus and to waive all related fees. *OHP Staff recommends approval*.

## **Case Comments:**

On July 6, 2018, the HDRC approved a Finding of Historic Significance requested by the owner and recommends approval to the Zoning Commission and City Council for the historic landmark designation of 230 Cactus.

## **Case History:**

September 4, 2018

Zoning Commission hearing

July 6, 2018

Historic & Design Review Commission (HDRC) hearing (Approved)

May 18, 2018

Property owner submitted application

## **Applicable Citations:**

<u>Note:</u> In accordance with the process for designation of a historic landmark, as outlined in Section 35-607 of the UDC, properties must meet three of sixteen criteria. This property meets three of the Criteria for Evaluation.

*UDC Section 35-607 – Designation Criteria for Historic Districts and Landmarks:* 

a. Process for Considering Designation of Historic Districts and Landmarks. Historic districts and landmarks shall be evaluated for designation using the criteria listed in subsection (b) and the criteria applied to evaluate properties for inclusion in the National Register. In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the criteria listed. Historic districts shall consist of at least two (2) or more structures within a legally defined boundary that meet at least three (3) of the criteria. Additionally, all designated landmarks and districts shall demonstrate clear delineation of the legal boundaries of such designated resources.

### b. Criteria for Evaluation.

- (5) Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;
- (7) Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature;
- (11) It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States;

## **Findings of Fact:**

- a. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner.
- b. HISTORIC CONTEXT The property at 230 Cactus is a Spanish Eclectic residence built c. 1917, an attached structure in the rear of the home, facing Martin Luther King Dr., was built c. 1910. 230 Cactus is located at the northwest corner of Cactus and Martin Luther King Dr. San Antonio's east side neighborhoods were the earliest to welcome African-American property owners and residents. The residential blocks east of South Hackberry (including the 200 block of Cactus Street, developed over the first decades of the 20th century. Many of the original structures have been lost in the surrounding area. Willie Silar Lee purchased the corner lot at Cactus and Nebraska (now Martin Luther King Dr) from P.H. & Catherine Wolf in 1913. According to the San Antonio Light & Gazette, Lee pulled a building permit



September 4, 2018

for a three room house on this lot in August of 1910. The 1912 City Directory lists Willie and Erastus Lee as residents at 230 Cactus. Based on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, it appears the Lees lived in the wood frame structure facing Nebraska at that time. The store seems to have been an important community gathering space according to the current property owner and newspaper articles which list it as a polling location in the 1930s and 1940s. It remained in business from 1922 through 1967.

- c. SITE CONTEXT The single family house is located on the corner of Cactus Street and Martin Luther King Drive. The home faces Cactus Street, which is a residential street with single family homes, varying in styles, all with a similar 10-15 foot front setback. The home aligns with the historic development pattern of the block, though it is the only Spanish Eclectic style on this block. On the northwest corner of the intersection is a single family minimal traditional home, and on the other two corners are vacant lots. A block to the west runs South Hackberry, a commercial corridor; a block to the west continues the residential neighborhood.
- d. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION The house is a single story Spanish Eclectic structure with a flat roof and parapet wall, and a stucco exterior. A concrete carriage step with the initials "F.M.A." is placed at the sidewalk curb; this is the only carriage step that remains along the block. Two narrow, red, blue. and yellow barrel tile covered shed roofs hang above the covered front porch. The front porch metal shed roof was likely added at a later time; the porch has non-original wood lattice that obstructs the front porch from view. The porch has a wrought iron balustrade and tiled steps that lead from the front walk to the original inset porch with a front and side archway. Small blue diamond tiles accent the top of each elevation. A prominent exterior stucco chimney is attached to the south elevation, tapering at the top. Double hung wood windows are installed throughout the house, some covered by multi-light screens. At the rear of the main structure is an attached yellow stucco garage with an overhead wood garage door. The Spanish Eclectic features include the stucco exterior, flat roof and parapet, clay barrel tiles, arched inset porch, tiled porch floor and wood, one-over-one windows. Located at the eastern side of the property is a small commercial structure with a wood storefront with a flat roof and parapet. It has a rectangular footprint, wood siding, two wood windows and two non-original wooden double doors that face Martin Luther King Drive. The front façade fenestration has been altered and the doors and windows are asymmetrical to the front façade. The store appears to have been originally a residence. After converting to a store, a porch was added but has since been removed based on the 1951 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map.
- e. EVALUATION As referenced in the applicable citations, 230 Cactus meets UDC criterion [35-607 (b)5], [35-607 (b)7], [35-607 (b)11], for a finding of historic significance in the process of seeking designation as a local historic landmark. In order to be eligible for landmark designation, a property must meet at least three of the criteria; 230 Cactus meets three.
  - 5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials; as a fine example of Spanish Eclectic architecture and an early twentieth century commercial storefront.
  - 7. Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature; for its prominent location at the corner of Cactus and Martin Luther King Blvd.
  - 11. It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States; for the role of Abernathy Grocery role as a modified residence serving as an important community space operated by Frank Abernathy.
- f. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner. If the HDRC approves the Finding of Historic Significance, then the recommendation for designation is submitted to the zoning



September 4, 2018

- commission. The zoning commission will schedule a hearing and then forward its recommendation to the City Council. City Council has the ultimate authority to approve the historic designation zoning overlay.
- g. Per UDC Sec. 35-453, once the commission concurs with the eligibility of the property and makes a recommendation of approval for designation, interim design review requirements will be in place and the property owners must receive a written approval (a Certificate of Appropriateness) for any exterior work. Theses interim requirements will remain in place until the City Council makes their final decision on the proposed zoning change or not longer than six months.
- h. The City offers a tax incentive for the substantial rehabilitation of historic properties because historic landmarks possess cultural and historical value and contribute to the overall quality and character of the City and its neighborhoods. If historic designation is approved, rehabilitation and restoration work may be eligible for this incentive. State and Federal tax incentives are also available for properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places and provide substantial relief for rehabilitation projects.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

HDRC Recommendation HDRC published Exhibits

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION COMMISSION ACTION

July 6, 2018

**HDRC CASE NO:** 

2018-288

**ADDRESS:** 

230 CACTUS ST

**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** 

NCB 632 BLK B LOT 9 & 18

**APPLICANT:** 

Eugenio & Alma Chavarria - 230 Cactus

**OWNER:** 

Eugenio & Alma Chavarria - 230 Cactus

### **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Finding of Historic Significance for the property located at 230 Cactus Street.

#### FINDINGS:

a. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner. b. HISTORIC CONTEXT - The property at 230 Cactus is a Spanish Eclectic residence built c. 1917, an attached structure in the rear of the home, facing Martin Luther King Dr., was built c. 1910. 230 Cactus is located at the northwest corner of Cactus and Martin Luther King Dr. San Antonio's east side neighborhoods were the earliest to welcome African-American property owners and residents. The residential blocks east of South Hackberry (including the 200 block of Cactus Street, developed over the first decades of the 20th century. Many of the original structures have been lost in the surrounding area. Willie Silar Lee purchased the corner lot at Cactus and Nebraska (now Martin Luther King Dr) from P.H. & Catherine Wolf in 1913. According to the San Antonio Light & Gazette, Lee pulled a building permit for a three room house on this lot in August of 1910. The 1912 City Directory lists Willie and Erastus Lee as residents at 230 Cactus. Based on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, it appears the Lees lived in the wood frame structure facing Nebraska at that time. The store seems to have been an important community gathering space according to the current property owner and newspaper articles which list it as a polling location in the 1930s and 1940s. It remained in business from 1922 through 1967. c. SITE CONTEXT - The single family house is located on the corner of Cactus Street and Martin Luther King Drive. The home faces Cactus Street, which is a residential street with single family homes, varying in styles, all with a similar 10-15 foot front setback. The home aligns with the historic development pattern of the block, though it is the only Spanish Eclectic style on this block. On the northwest corner of the intersection is a single family minimal traditional home, and on the other two corners are vacant lots. A block to the west runs South Hackberry, a commercial corridor; a block to the west continues the residential neighborhood. d. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION – The house is a single story Spanish Eclectic structure with a flat roof and parapet wall, and a stucco exterior. A concrete carriage step with the initials "F.M.A." is placed at the sidewalk curb; this is the only carriage step that remains along the block. Two narrow, red, blue, and yellow barrel tile covered shed roofs hang above the covered front porch. The front porch metal shed roof was likely added at a later time; the porch has non-original wood lattice that obstructs the front porch from view. The porch has a wrought iron balustrade and tiled steps that lead from the front walk to the original inset porch with a front and side archway. Small blue diamond tiles accent the top of each elevation. A prominent exterior stucco chimney is attached to the south elevation, tapering at the top. Double hung wood windows are installed throughout the house, some covered by multi-light screens. At the rear of the main structure is an attached yellow stucco garage with an overhead wood garage door. The Spanish Eclectic features include the stucco exterior, flat roof and parapet, clay barrel tiles, arched inset porch, tiled porch floor and wood, one-over-one windows. Located at the eastern side of the property is a small commercial structure with a wood storefront with a flat roof and parapet. It has a rectangular footprint, wood siding, two wood windows and two non-original wooden double doors that face Martin Luther King Drive. The front façade fenestration has been altered and the doors and windows are asymmetrical to the front façade. The store appears to have been originally a residence. After converting to a store,