

November 20, 2018

### **APPLICATION FOR CHANGE OF ZONING**

### **Request:**

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting a change in zoning to add "HL" Historic Landmark designation to 314 E Ashby Place and to waive all related fees. *OHP Staff recommends approval*.

### **Case Comments:**

On October 3, 2018, the HDRC approved a Finding of Historic Significance requested by the owner and recommends approval to the Zoning Commission and City Council for the historic landmark designation of 314 E Ashby Place.

# **Case History:**

November 20, 2018 Zoning Commission hearing

October 3, 2018 Historic & Design Review Commission (HDRC) hearing (Approved)

September 19, 2018 Property owner submitted application

## **Applicable Citations:**

<u>Note:</u> In accordance with the process for designation of a historic landmark, as outlined in Section 35-607 of the UDC, properties must meet three of sixteen criteria. This property meets three of the Criteria for Evaluation.

*UDC Section 35-607 – Designation Criteria for Historic Districts and Landmarks:* 

a. Process for Considering Designation of Historic Districts and Landmarks. Historic districts and landmarks shall be evaluated for designation using the criteria listed in subsection (b) and the criteria applied to evaluate properties for inclusion in the National Register. In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the criteria listed. Historic districts shall consist of at least two (2) or more structures within a legally defined boundary that meet at least three (3) of the criteria. Additionally, all designated landmarks and districts shall demonstrate clear delineation of the legal boundaries of such designated resources.

#### b. Criteria for Evaluation.

- (5) Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;
- (11) It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States;
- (13) It bears an important and significant relationship to other distinctive structures, sites, or areas, either as an important collection of properties or architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to the plan based on architectural, historic or cultural motif:

#### **Findings of Fact:**

- a. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner.
- b. HISTORIC CONTEXT -

Built c. 1922, the house at 314 E Ashby Place represents the economic growth San Antonio experienced in the 1920s, and development occurred in the established northern neighborhoods.

c. HISTORIC CONTEXT -

According the building records, the north side of East Ashby Place was in the Schomann Tract and the south side was in the Dalkowitz Subdivision. 314 E Ashby Pl is located within the Dalkowitz

November 20, 2018

Subdivision. Platted in 1922, this plat is located on the south side of E Ashby Place and consisted of 44 lots. Comparing today's BCAD map with the historic plat it appears twelve lots have been combined for the campus of Hawthorne Elementary School, an individual local landmark. Noted in a review of the New Encyclopedia of Texas, Sol Dalkowitz was a clothing dealer, the President of Dalkowitz Bros General Department Store on W Commerce Street and he lived at 619 San Pedro. Due to his uncommon last name and San Antonio's tremendous growth in the 1920s, it is plausible that Dalkowitz invested in real estate and was the owner of this land. Based on the architectural styles of moderate Craftsman bungalows and Tudors it appears that development predominately occurred in the 1930s. According to City Directories, 314 E Ashby Place was first occupied in 1922 by Joseph P and Pearl Marr. Deed research could not determine if they were the original owners or if the property was built for them. Throughout the home's life, it was used as an apartment, furnished duplex and a single family home, according to San Antonio Light newspaper classifieds from 1920s through 1950s.

#### d. SITE CONTEXT -

The residential structure is along a block with other residential structures, including mostly Craftsman one and two stories. It has a lot size and a front set back similar to its residential neighbors. It is the western most residence, and sits 3 lots from the corner of East Ashby Place and McCullough Avenue. The front entrance of the house faces East Ashby and has a front concrete walkway, which is consistent with the historic development pattern of the block. There are three steps at the public sidewalk, in line with concrete retaining wall around the front yard, which is consistent with the development in that time. There is an added 3' tall hogwire fence atop the retaining wall that is not characteristic of fences built in the 1920s. According to Google Street Views, the fence was added in 2014-2016. There is a concrete 10' wide driveway to the east, accessing the rear yard, which is consistent to the pattern along the block.

#### e. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION -

The structure is one-and-a-half stories with a gable on hip roof form with composition shingles, wood lap siding, and a rear gable addition. The gable addition was added after 1951, according to the Sanborn map; Bexar County Appraisal District indicated the addition was added in 2014. The roofing shingles and siding are typical for many styles in San Antonio, including Folk Victorian and Craftsman styles; however, the roofing shingles appear to be replacements while the siding is original. The style of the home has Folk Victorian influences seen by the original painted wood shingles in the gable's pediment, the front gable, and the original square wood porch supports and pilasters. The structure also has Craftsman influences with the gable on hip roof form and simple wood brackets seen on the porch and gable that appear to be original. There are original wood one over one windows and an original four piece ribbon window, each with three by five divided lights; these double hung wood windows are commonly seen on both Folk Victorian and Craftsman style homes built during this time. Ribbon windows are more typical for the Craftsman style. There are non-original aluminum screen son some of the double-hung windows. The front wood door appears to be a replacement with craftsman wood details and three by two divided lights; above it is an original transom window commonly found in many styles. There are three other entrances; one is a left side entrance with a half-lite door, transom and shed awning that appears non-original according to the 1951 Sanborn map. On the rear addition there are two rear entrances including a double door with full-lights, and a craftsman influenced single door. The attached front porch is a hipped roof with four square porch columns, and two similar pilasters; even number of porch supports is typical for Folk Victorian homes. Up to the front entrance is a wooden porch stoop a food wider than the front door on each side, which is not common construction during this period; the home probably had a wood porch landing the same width has the porch covering.



November 20, 2018

- f. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION, REAR BUILDING -
  - There is a rear accessory dwelling with a front gable roof and wood lap siding; this building is seen on the January 1951 Sanborn map used as a garage. As a garage to a Craftsman home, it would have wood lap siding and a front gable as it does today. The garage's front doors have been removed and enclosed with a non-original horizontal sliding window. Though the structure has been modified, it is still has the same form, massing and location as the original and is a contributing structure to the site.
- g. EVALUATION As referenced in the applicable citations, 314 E Ashby Place meets UDC criterion [35-607 (b)5], [35-607 (b)11], [35-607 (b)13], for a finding of historic significance in the process of seeking designation as a local historic landmark. In order to be eligible for landmark designation, a property must meet at least three of the criteria; 314 E Ashby Place meets three.
  - (5) Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials; as a single family home with influences from both Folk Victorian and Craftsman styles, styles integral to the homes found in the neighborhood.
  - (11) It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States; as part of an important and diverse historic neighborhood in San Antonio, established as San Antonio grew with the establishing of the railroad and the economic boom in the 1920s.
  - (13) It bears an important and significant relationship to other distinctive structures, sites, or areas, either as an important collection of properties or architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to the plan based on architectural, historic or cultural motif; as part of the original plat in the Dalkowitz Subdivision with few intrusions.
- h. The City offers a tax incentive for the substantial rehabilitation of historic properties because historic landmarks possess cultural and historical value and contribute to the overall quality and character of the City and its neighborhoods. If historic designation is approved, rehabilitation and restoration work may be eligible for this incentive. State and Federal tax incentives are also available for properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places and provide substantial relief for rehabilitation projects.
- i. If the HDRC approves the Finding of Historic Significance, then the recommendation for designation is submitted to the zoning commission. The zoning commission will schedule a hearing and then forward its recommendation to the City Council. City Council has the ultimate authority to approve the historic designation zoning overlay.
- j. Per UDC Sec. 35-453, once the commission concurs eligibility of the property and makes a recommendation of approval for designation, interim design review requirements will be in place and the property owners must receive a written approval (a Certificate of Appropriateness) for any exterior work. Theses interim requirements will remain in place until the City Council makes their final decision on the proposed zoning change or not longer than six months.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

HDRC Recommendation HDRC published Exhibits Letter of Support from the SA Conservation Society