

## APPLICATION FOR CHANGE OF ZONING

## **Request:**

The Office of Historic Preservation requests a change of zoning to add "HL" Historic Landmark designation to 1322 McKinley and to waive all related fees. *OHP staff recommends approval*.

## **Case Comments:**

On November 7, 2018, the HDRC approved a Finding of Historic Significance requested by the owner and recommends approval to the Zoning Commission and City Council for the historic landmark designation of 1322 McKinley.

#### **Case History:**

December 18, 2018 Zoning Commission hearing

November 7, 2018 Historic & Design Review Commission (HDRC) hearing

October 1, 2018 Property owner submitted application

# **Applicable Citations:**

Note: In accordance with the process for designation of a historic landmark, as outlined in Section 35-607 of the UDC, properties must meet three of sixteen criteria. This property meets three of the Criteria for Evaluation.

*Unified Development Code Sec.* 35-607. – Designation Criteria for Historic Districts and Landmarks.

- a. Process for Considering Designation of Historic Districts and Landmarks. Historic districts and landmarks shall be evaluated for designation using the criteria listed in subsection (b) and the criteria applied to evaluate properties for inclusion in the National Register. In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the criteria listed. Historic districts shall consist of at least two (2) or more structures within a legally defined boundary that meet at least three (3) of the criteria. Additionally, all designated landmarks and districts shall demonstrate clear delineation of the legal boundaries of such designated resources.
- **b.** Criteria for Evaluation.
  - 5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;
  - 7. Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature;
  - 13. It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States.

# **Findings of Fact:**

- a. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner.
- b. HISTORIC CONTEXT: Prolific San Antonio developer B.G. Irish subdivided the neighborhood called The Highlands in 1923. He purchased the land from L.P. Peck and Ben Hammond, two members of the Highland Park Improvement Company which was developing the subdivision immediately north of The Highlands. Prior to its purchase for development, Albert Steves, Jr. ran

1901 S. ALAMO ST, SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78204

cattle on this property, leading to its early nickname of "the old Steve pasture." Key to the development of what was then the largest suburb in San Antonio was the new trolley line to facilitate commuting to downtown. The No. 10 Line passed through Highland Park via Rigsby Avenue ending at Adele Street (now S Walters) until 1933, when the trolley was replaced by bus service. The current population density of this neighborhood was reached between WW I and WW II. 1322 McKinley Avenue was built c. 1928, one of the first in the neighborhood (no addresses were listed on the block in the 1927 City Directory), and was advertised in the San Antonio Light as a fullyfurnished home in Cedar Crest "Designed—Built and Decorated by Miss Marie Pitts" (12 November 1928, p 6-B) and later in the same paper as "The Home of Harmony" (25 November 1928, p 10). (A woman-built home in this time was unique, but no other mentions of Miss Pitts were found when researching this property. Further research may uncover more about this Highland Park pioneer.) Cedarcrest (alternately "Cedar Crest") was a neighborhood in San Antonio nestled within Highland Park. An ad in the October 21, 1928 issue of the San Antonio Express lists Cedarcrast as the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Hicks Avenue between New Braunfels and Palmetto, just a block south of 1322 McKinley. 1322 McKinley first appears in the 1929-30 San Antonio city directory as vacant; in the 1931 directory, William E. Calvert is listed as its resident. William and wife Martha bought the home in 1930, after selling their 1928 home in The Highlands. William worked at a local department store, and Martha taught school in the neighborhood. Martha lived at 1322 McKinley until her death in 1963.

- c. SITE CONTEXT: 1322 McKinley Avenue is located in the Highland Park neighborhood of San Antonio, east of the I-37 and I-10 interchange. The block on which it sits distinguishes itself from others in the neighborhood due to its lack of cohesive style. Neighbors include Craftsman and Tudor homes as well as more recently built minimal tradition infill. In comparison to blocks such as those in what was historically the Cedarcrest subdivision (the aforementioned 1300 and 1400 blocks of Hicks), homes on McKinley were not built by a single contractor. There are both ribbon and solid concrete driveways, both one-story and two-story homes. Disparate styles and eras are united, however, by continuity in lot size as well as average setback. 1322 McKinley Avenue is situated mid-block on the south side of McKinley Avenue between S Palmetto Avenue to the west and St Anthony Avenue to the east. The house sits along the west edge of the parcel with a ribbon drive along the east side of the lot and house. The house is set back from the street in line with its direct neighbors and other homes on the block. The house originally featured a rear one-story, side gable, wood-frame garage, since demolished; such garages can be found on Sanborn Maps from this block across much of the neighborhood, including the six houses directly east of 1322 McKinley Avenue and all houses that share an informal alley with 1322 McKinley Avenue.
- d. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION: 1322 McKinley Avenue is a one-story, single-family house built in the French Eclectic style with two discernable phases: the original structure and a rear addition. The original structure's wood frame and chimney are clad in stucco. The dominant roof form is a steep hipped roof with a turret on the primary façade; the hipped roof meets a rear side-gabled roof. All are clad in asphalt shingle. The chimney, which is taller than the dominant roof ridge, is tethered to the east hip of the roof with what is presumably an iron rod. The turret has a

1901 S. ALAMO ST, SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78204

small windowless dormer with a design that appears to be three clay roof tiles set into the stucco. The house has a slab front porch with mosaic tile and a metal balustrade; the balustrade is not present on Google Streetview prior to 2016 and does not appear to be an original feature of the home. The primary entrance to the home is arched and appears on the east side of the porch as opposed to the front; side-facing doors are a characteristic typical of French and Tudor revivals. The rear addition has an asphalt-shingled low-slope shed roof with wood siding. Original windows have been replaced by vinyl-sash windows, also included on the addition. Historically, the ribbon drive led to a rear garage at the southeast corner of the lot, as evidenced by Sanborn Maps as late as 1951. Aerial imagery indicates the garage was demolished in 2015, and a new structure was built with a similar footprint in 2016.

- e. EVALUATION: As referenced in the applicable citations, 1322 McKinley meets UDC criteria [35-607 (b)7], [35-607 (b)11], and [35-607 (b)13], for a finding of historic significance in the process of seeking designation as a local historic landmark. In order to be eligible for landmark designation, a property must meet at least three of the criterial; 1322 McKinley meets three.
  - 5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials; 1322 McKinley is a French Eclectic residence with character-defining features such as its varied roof forms, tower, tall chimney, and overall asymmetry—notably, the main entrance is not located on the tower, which is unusual for this style;
  - 7. Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature; 1322 McKinley is one of the first homes built on the block and the only home on the block with a tower; its French Eclectic style that distinguishes it from the other Craftsman, Tudor, and post-war structures on its block; and it contributes to neighborhood continuity due to minimal and largely reversible interventions to its primary façade;
  - 13. It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States; prominent and long-time southside residents William and Martha Calvert were the first owners.
- f. The City offers a tax incentive for the substantial rehabilitation of historic properties because historic landmarks possess cultural and historical value and contribute to the overall quality and character of the City and its neighborhoods. If historic designation is approved, rehabilitation and restoration work may be eligible for this incentive. State and Federal tax incentives are also available for properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places and provide substantial relief for rehabilitation projects.
- g. If the HDRC approves the Finding of Historic Significance, then the recommendation for designation is submitted to the zoning commission. The zoning commission will schedule a hearing and then forward its recommendation to the City Council. City Council has the ultimate authority to approve the historic designation zoning overlay.
- h. Per UDC Sec. 35-453, once the commission makes a recommendation for designation, property owners must receive a written approval (a Certificate of Appropriateness) for any exterior work until the City Council makes their final decision.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**:



HDRC recommendation HDRC published exhibits