# HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION 

December 19, 2018

## HDRC CASE NO: <br> ADDRESS:

## LEGAL DESCRIPTION: ZONING: <br> CITY COUNCIL DIST.: <br> APPLICANT: <br> OWNER: <br> TYPE OF WORK:

## APPLICATION RECEIVED:

 60-DAY REVIEW:
## REQUEST:

2018-612
126 VILLITA ST
112 VILLITA ST
NCB 986 BLK LOT 24A \& NW TRI PT \& NE TRI 24.68 FT OF 25
D, RIO-3
1
Miguel Saldana/B\&A Architects
Tim Barton/Villita Towers LLC
Construction of a twenty-four story residential structure with a detached parking structure
November 30, 2018
January 29, 2018

The applic ant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Construct a twenty-four (24) story, multi-family residential structure with mixed-use at the street level on the vacant lot at 112 Villita Street.
2. Construct a parking structure on the lot at 126 Villita Street. This would require the demolition of an existing building on the site that has been determined eligible for historic designation by OHP staff.

## APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

## UDC Section 35-670. Criteria for Certificate of Appropriateness-Generally

(b)(4)C. Design Characteristics of "RIO-3" River Improvement Overlay District - 3.
i. The historic work of Robert Hugman, CCC and WPA construction work, Ethel Harris tile work, and work of the National Youth Administration shall be respected and preserved in all construction efforts. Adherence to the intent and spirit of those plans is essential in all construction.
ii. Traditional, formal street level design precedents shall be respected, but at the river level, the more informal, handcrafted style shall be maintained.
iii. The integrity of historic properties shall be preserved as provided for in section 35-610. Historic differences between street level designs and river level designs shall be respected.
iv. The traditional design context of the area shall be respected at two (2) levels: the broader downtown context and the immediate block as it faces the river.
v. In new buildings that have more than one (1) facade, such as those that face the street and the river, the commission shall consider visual compatibility with respect to each important facade.
vi. The microclimate of the River Walk level shall be maintained and, during construction, shall be given extra protection. Downtown operations staff will be consulted to provide specific instructions for construction procedures. vii. Over-crowding of plant life or altering levels of light and water along the river shall not be permitted.
viii. Enhance the pedestrian experience with high-quality building designs that include balconies facing the river and the primary entrance facing the street.
ix. Ensure adequate solar access on the River Walk.

## Section 35-672. Neighborhood Wide Design Standards

(a) Pedestrian Circulation. Pedestrian access shall be provided among properties to integrate neighborhoods.
(2) Link the various functions and spaces on a site with sidewalks in a coordinated system.

Provide pedestrian sidewalks between buildings, parking areas and built features such as outdoor plazas and courtyards.
(5) Pedestrian Access Along the River Walk Pathway Shall Not Be Blocked.
A. Queuing is prohibited on the River Walk pathway.
B. Hostess stations shall be located away from the River Walk pathway so as to not inhibit pedestrian flow on the River Walk pathway. That is, the hostess station shall not be located in such a manner to cause a patron who has
stopped at the hostess stand to be standing on the River Walk pathway. Pedestrian flow shall be considered "inhibited" if a pedestrian walking along the pathway has to swerve, dodge, change direction or come to a complete stop to avoid a patron engaged at the hostess stand.
C. Tables and chairs shall be located a sufficient distance from the River Walk pathway so that normal dining and service shall not inhibit the flow of pedestrian traffic. See inhibited definition in subsection B. above.
(c) Views. The river's course (both natural and manmade), and San Antonio's street pattern, creates unique views of certain properties from the public ROW. These properties often occur at prominent curves in the river or where a street changes direction and a property appears to be a terminus at the end of a street.
(1) Architectural Focal Point. When a property is situated in such a manner as to appear to be the terminus at the end of the street or at a prominent curve in the river, the building shall incorporate into its design an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. (see Figure 672-3) An architectural feature will be considered to be a focal point through any of the following methods, but not limited to:
A. Additional height.
B. Creation of a tower.
C. Variation in roof shape.
D. Change of color or materials.
E. Addition of a design enhancement feature such as:
i. Embellished entrance areas.
ii. Articulated corners, especially when entrance is at corner, rounded or chamfered corners ease the transitions from one street facade to the adjoining facade.
iii. Recessed or projecting balconies and entrances.

## Section 35-673. Site Design Standards

(a) Solar Access. The intent of providing and maintaining solar access to the San Antonio River is to protect the river's specific ecoclimate. The river has a special microc limate of natural and planted vegetation that requires certain levels and balanced amounts of sunlight, space and water. Development must be designed to respect and protect those natural requirements, keeping them in balance and not crowding or altering them so that vegetation does not receive more or less space and water, but particularly sunlight, than is required for normal expected growth.
(1) Building Massing to Provide Solar Access to the River. Building massing shall be so designed as to provide direct sunlight to vegetation in the river channel as defined:
A. The area to be measured for solar access shall be a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge or from the river's edge to the building face, whichever is lesser, parallel to the river for the length of the property.
B. The solar calculations shall be measured exclusive to the applicant's property; that is, shades and shadows of other buildings shall not be included in the calculations. The solar calculations shall only measure the impact of new construction and additions. The shading impact of historic buildings on the site may be excluded from the calculations.
C. The defined area shall receive a minimum of 5.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the winter solstice, and 7.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the summer solstice.
D. Those properties located on the south side of the river (whose north face is adjacent to the river) shall only be required to measure the sunlight in the 30 -foot setback on the opposite bank of the river.
E. Those properties within the river improvement overlay district not directly adjacent to the river are still subject to the provisions of this section. To determine the solar access effect of these buildings on the river the applicant must measure the nearest point to the river of an area defined by a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge, parallel to the river for the length of their property that would be affected by their building. For those buildings on the south side of the river, the 30 -foot setback shall be measured only on the opposite bank. F. However, in those cases where the above conditions cannot be met due to the natural configuration of the river, existing street patterns, or existing buildings, the HDRC may approve a buildings mass and height as allowed by table 674-2.
G. If there is a conflict with this section and another section of this chapter this section shall prevail.
(b) Building Orientation. Buildings should be sited to help define active spaces for area users, provide pedestrian connections between sites, help animate the street scene and define street edges. Consideration to both the street and riverside should be given. The placement of a building on a site should therefore be considered within the context of the block, as well as how the structure will support the broader design goals for the area.
(2) Primary and Secondary Entrances.
A. Orient a building's primary entrance toward the street with subordinate entrances located on the riverside
and/or the interior of the property. On a major thoroughfare street it is acceptable to provide the primary entrance through a common courtyard and then to a street.
B. The primary entrance shall be distinguished by architectural features such as, but not limited to: an entry portal; change in material or color; change in scale of other openings; addition of columns, lintels or canopies. C. Secondary entrances shall have architec tural features that are subordinate to the primary entrance in scale and detail. For purposes of this division subordinate means that the entrance is smaller in height and width, and has fewer or simpler architectural elements.
(f) Plant Materials. A number of soil conditions converge in the San Antonio area to create unique vegetation ecosystems. Along the route of the San Antonio River, the soil conditions vary greatly from the northern boundary near Hildebrand to the city limits near Mission San Francisco de la Espada (Mission Espada) and therefore native and indigenous plants will vary accordingly. Landsc aping should reflect the unique soil characteristics of the specific site.
(3) Install Trees to Provide Shade and to Separate Pedestrians From Automobile Traffic. Install street trees along the property line or in the ROW abutting all streets according to minimum requirement standards established in subsection 35-512(b), except where this conflicts with existing downtown Tri-Party improvements in "RIO-3." In "RIO-3" the owner has the option of placing trees at the property line, or along the street edge.
(g) Paving Materials. An important San Antonio landscape tradition is the use of decorative surfaces for paving and other landsc ape structures. Paving materials and patterns should be carefully chosen to preserve and enhance the pedestrian experience.
(1) Vary Walkway, Patio and Courtyard Paving to Add Visual Interest on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River. Pervious paving is encouraged where feasible and appropriate to the site.
(i) Street Furnishings. Street furnishings are exterior amenities, including but not limited to, tables, chairs, umbrellas, landscape pots, wait stations, valet stations, bicycle racks, planters, benches, bus shelters, kiosks, waste receptacles and similar items that help to define pedestrian use areas. Handcrafted street furnishings are particularly important in San Antonio, and therefore this tradition of craftsmanship and of providing street furniture is encouraged.
(2) Street Furnishing Materials.
A. Street furnishings shall be made of wood, metal, stone, terra cotta, cast stone, hand-sculpted concrete, or solid surfacing material, such as Corian or Surell.
(4) Street furnishings, such as tables and chairs may not be stored (other than overnight storage) in such a way as to be visible from the river pathway.
(j) Lighting. Site lighting should be considered an integral element of the landscape design of a property. It should help define activity areas and provide interest at night. At the same time, lighting should facilitate safe and convenient circulation for pedestrians, bic yclists and motorists. Overspill of light and light pollution should be avoided.
(1) Site Lighting. Site lighting shall be shielded by permanent attachments to light fixtures so that the light sources are not visible from a public way and any offsite glare is prevented.
A. Site lighting shall include illumination of parking areas, buildings, pedestrian routes, dining areas, design features and public ways.
B. Outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall have average ambient light levels of between one (1) and three (3) foot-candles with a minimum of 0.5 -foot candles and a maximum of six (6) footcandles
at any point measured on the ground plane. Interior spaces visible from the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level shall use light sources with no more than the equivalent lumens of a one hundred-watt inc andescent bulb. Exterior balconies, porches and canopies adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall use light sources with the equivalent lumens of a sixty-watt incandescent bulb with average ambient light levels no greater than the lumen out put of a one hundred-watt inc andescent light bulb as long as average foot candle standards are not exceeded. Accent lighting of landscape or building features including specimen plants, gates, entries, water features, art work, stairs, and ramps may exceed these standards by a multiple of 2.5. Recreational fields and activity areas that require higher light levels shall be screened from the river hike and bike pathways with a landsc ape buffer.
C. Exterior light fixtures that use the equivalent of more than one hundred-watt incandescent bulbs shall not emit a significant amount of the fixture's total output above a vertical cut-off angle of ninety (90) degrees. Any structural part of the fixture providing this cut-off angle must be permanently affixed.
D. Lighting spillover to the publicly owned areas of the river or across property lines shall not exceed one-half $(1 / 2)$ of one (1) foot-candle measured at any point ten (10) feet beyond the property line.
(2) Provide Lighting for Pedestrian Ways That is Low Sc aled for Walking. The position of a lamp in a pedestrianway light shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height above the ground.
(3) Light Temperature and Color.
A. Light temperature and color shall be between $2500^{\circ} \mathrm{K}$ and $3500^{\circ} \mathrm{K}$ with a color rendition index (CRI) of eighty (80) or higher, respectively. This restriction is limited to all outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way and from the interior spaces adjoining the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level. Levels shall be determined by product specifications.
(4) Minimize the Visual Impacts of Exterior Building Lighting.
A. All security lighting shall be shielded so that the light sources are not visible from a public way.
B. Lighting (uplighting and downlighting) that is positioned to highlight a building or outdoor artwork shall be aimed at the object to be illuminated, not pointed into the sky.
C. Fixtures shall not distract from, or obsc ure important architectural features of the building. Lighting fixtures shall be a subordinate feature on the building unless they are incorporated into the over-all design scheme of the building.
(5) Prohibited Lighting on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River.
A. Flashing lights.
B. Rotating lights.
C. Chaser lights.
D. Exposed neon.
E. Seasonal decorating lights such as festoon, string or rope lights, except between November 20 and January 10.
F. Flood lamps.
(6) Minimize the visual impacts of lighting in parking areas in order to enhance the perception of the nighttime sky and to prevent glare onto adjacent properties. Parking lot light poles are limited to thirty (30) feet in height, shall have a $90^{\circ}$ cutoff angle so as to not emit light above the horizontal plane.
(1) Access to Public Pathway Along the River. These requirements are specifically for those properties adjacent to the river to provide a connection to the publicly owned pathway along the river. The connections are to stimulate and enhance urban activity, provide path connections in an urban context, enliven street activity, and protect the ambiance and character of the river area.
(3) Clearly define a key pedestrian gateway into the site from the publicly owned pathway at the river with distinctive architectural or landsc ape elements.
A. The primary gatew ay from a development to the publicly owned pathway at the river shall be defined by an architectural or landscape element made of stone, brick, tile, metal, rough hewn cedar or hand-formed concrete or through the use of distinctive plantings or planting beds.
(n) Service Areas and Mechanic al Equipment. Service areas and mechanical equipment should be visually unobtrusive and should be integrated with the design of the site and building. Noise generated from mechanical equipment shall not exceed city noise regulations.
(1) Locate service entrances, waste disposal areas and other similar uses adjacent to service lanes and away from major streets and the river..
C. Air intake and exhaust systems, or other mechanical equipment that generates noise, smoke or odors, shall not be located at the pedestrian level.

Sec. 35-674. Building Design Principles
(a) Architectural Character. A basic objective for architectural design in the river improvement overlay districts is to encourage the reuse of existing buildings and construction of new, innovative designs that enhance the area, and help to establish distinct identities for each of the zone districts. At the same time, these new buildings should reinforce established building traditions and respect the contexts of neighborhoods.
When a new building is constructed, it shall be designed in a manner that reinforces the basic character-defining features of the area. Such features include the way in which a building is located on its site, the manner in which it faces the street and its orientation to the river. When these design variables are arranged in a new building to be similar to those seen traditionally, visual compatibility results.
(b) Mass and Scale. A building shall appear to have a "human scale." In general, this scale can be accomplished by using familiar forms and elements interpreted in human dimensions. Exterior wall designs shall help pedestrians establish a sense of scale with relation to each building. Articulating the number of floors in a building can help to establish a building's scale, for example, and prevent larger buildings from dwarfing the pedestrian.
(1) Express facade components in ways that will help to establish building scale.
A. Treatment of architectural facades shall contain a discernible pattern of mass to void, or windows and doors to solid mass. Openings shall appear in a regular pattern, or be clustered to form a cohesive design. Architectural elements such as columns, lintels, sills, canopies, windows and doors should align with
other architec tural features on the adjacent facades.
(2) Align horizontal building elements with others in the blockface to establish building scale.
A. Align at least one (1) horizontal building element with another horizontal building element on the same block face. It will be considered to be within alignment if it is within three (3) feet, measured vertically, of the existing architectural element.
(3) Express the distinction between upper and lower floors.
A. Develop the first floor as primarily transparent. The building fac ade facing a major street shall have at least fifty (50) percent of the street level facade area devoted to display windows and/or windows affording some view into the interior areas. Multi-family residential buildings with no retail or office space are exempt from this requirement.
(4) Where a building facade faces the street or river and exceeds the maximum facade length allowed in Table 674-1 divide the facade of building into modules that express traditional dimensions.
A. The maximum length of an individual wall plane that faces a street or the river shall be as shown in Table 674-1.

Table 674-1
Description RIO-1 RIO-2 RIO-3 RIO-4 RIO-5 RIO-6
Maximum Facade Length 50 ft .50 ft .30 ft .75 ft .75 ft .50 ft .
B. If a building wall plane facing the street or river and exceeds the length allowed in Table 674-1, employ at least two (2) of the following techniques to reduce the perceived mass:

- Change materials with each building module to reduce its perceived mass; or
- Change the height with each building module of a wall plane. The change in height shall be at least ten (10) percent of the vertic al height; or
- Change the roof form of each building module to help express the different modules of the building mass; or
- Change the arrangement of windows and other facade articulation features, such as, columns, pilasters or strap work, which divides large planes into smaller components.
(5) Organize the Mass of a Building to Provide Solar Access to the River.
A. One (1) method of doing so is to step the building down toward the river to meet the solar access requirements of subsection 35-673(a).
B. Another method is to set the building back from the river a distance sufficient to meet the solar access requirements of subsection 35-673(a).
(c) Height. Building heights vary along the river corridor, from one-story houses to high-rise hotels and apartments. This diversity of building heights is expected to continue. However, within each zone, a general similarity in building heights should be encouraged in order to help establish a sense of visual continuity. In addition, building heights shall be configured such that a comfortable human scale is established along the edges of properties and views to the river and other significant landmarks are provided while allowing the appropriate density for an area.
(1) The maximum building height shall be as defined in Table 674-2.
A. Solar access standards subsection 35-673(a), and massing standards subsection 35-674(b) also will affect building heights.

Table 674-2
Description
RIO-1 RIO-2 RIO-3 RIO-4 RIO-5 RIO-6
$\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { Maximum \# of Stories } & 5 & 10 & \text { None } & 7 & 5 & 4\end{array}$
Maximum Height in Feet 60 ft . 120 ft . None 84 ft . 60 ft .50 ft .
(3)On the street-side, the building facade shall appear similar in height to those of other buildings found traditionally in the area.
If fifty (50) percent of the building facades within a block face are predominantly lower than the maximum height allowed, the new building facade on the street-side shall align with the average height of those lower buildings within the block face, or with a particular building that falls within the fifty (50) percent range. However, the remainder of the building may obtain its maximum height by stepping back fifteen (15) feet from the building face.
(4) Designation of a development node provides for the ability to increase the building height by fifty (50) percent from the requirements set out in article VI.
(d) Materials and Finishes. Masonry materials are well established as primary features along the river corridor and their
use should be continued. Stucco that is detailed to provide a texture and pattern, which conveys a human scale, is also part of the tradition. In general, materials and finishes that provide a sense of human scale, reduce the perceived mass of a building and appear to blend with the natural setting of the river shall be used, especially on major structures.
(1) Use indigenous materials and traditional building materials for primary wall surfaces. A minimum of seventy-five
(75) percent of walls (excluding window fenestrations) shall be composed of the following:
A. Modular masonry materials including brick, stone, and rusticated masonry block, tile, terra-cotta, struc tural clay tile and cast stone. Concrete masonry units (CMU) are not allowed.
B. Other new materials that convey the texture, scale, and finish similar to traditional building materials.
C. Stucco and painted concrete when detailed to express visual interest and convey a sense of scale.
D. Painted or stained wood in a lap or shingle pattern.
(2) The following materials are not permitted as primary building materials and may be used as a secondary material only:
A. Large expanses of high gloss or shiny metal panels.
B. Mirror glass panels. Glass curtain wall buildings are allowed in RIO-3 as long as the river and street levels comply with 35-674(d)(1) above.
(3) Paint or Finish Colors.
A. Use natural colors of indigenous building materials for properties that abut the River Walk area.
B. Use matte finishes instead of high glossy finishes on wall surfaces. Wood trim and metal trim may be painted with gloss enamel.
C. Bright colors may highlight entrances or architectural features.
(e) Facade Composition. Traditionally, many commercial and multi-family buildings in the core of San Antonio have had facade designs that are organized into three (3) distinct segments: First, a "base" exists, which establishes a scale at the street level; second a "mid-section," or shaft is used, which may include several floors. Finally a "cap" finishes the composition. The cap may take the form of an ornamental roof form or decorative molding and may also include the top floors of the building. This organization helps to give a sense of scale to a building and its use should be encouraged. In order to maintain the sense of scale, buildings should have the same setback as surrounding buildings so as to maintain the street-w all pattern, if clearly established.
In contrast, the traditional treatment of facades along the riverside has been more modest. This treatment is largely a res ult of the fact that the riverside was a utilitarian edge and was not oriented to the public. Today, even though orienting buildings to the river is a high priority objective, it is appropriate that these river-oriented facades be simpler in character than those facing the street.
(1) Street Facade. Buildings that are taller than the street-wall (sixty (60) feet) shall be artic ulated at the stop of the street wall or stepped back in order to maintain the rhythm of the street wall. Buildings should be composed to include a base, a middle and a cap.
A. High rise buildings, more than one hundred (100) feet tall, shall terminate with a distinctive top or cap. This can be accomplished by:
i. Reducing the bulk of the top twenty (20) percent of the building by ten (10) percent.
ii. By stepping back the top twenty (20) percent of the building.
iii. Changing the material of the cap.
B. Roof forms shall be used to conceal all mechanical equipment and to add architectural interest to the structure.
C. Roof surfaces should include strategies to reduce heat island effects such as use of green roofs, photo voltaic panels, and/or the use of roof materials with high solar reflectivity.
(2) Fenestration. Windows help provide a human scale and so shall be proportioned accordingly.
D. Curtain wall systems shall be designed with modulating features such as projecting horizontal and/or vertic al mullions.
(3) Entrances. Entrances shall be easy to find, be a special feature of the building, and be appropriately scaled.
A. Entrances shall be the most prominent on the street side and less prominent on the river side.
B. Entrances shall be placed so as to be highly visible.
C. The scale of the entrance is determined by the prominence of the function and or the amount of use.
D. Entrances shall have a change in material and/or wall plane.
E. Entrances should not use excessive storefront systems.
(4) Riverside facade. The riverside facade of a building shall have simpler detailing and composition than the street facade.
A. Architectural details such as cornices, sills, lintels, door surrounds, water tables and other similar details should use simple curves and handcrafted detailing.
B. Stone detailing shall be rough hewn, and chiseled faced. Smooth faced stone is not permitted as the primary
building material, but can be used as accent pieces.
C. Facades on the riverside shall be asymmetrical, pedestrian scale, and give the appearance of the back of a building. That is, in traditional building along the river, the backs of building were designed with simpler details, and appear less formal than the street facades.
(g) Awnings, Canopies and Arcades. (See Figure 674-2) The tradition of sheltering sidewalks with awnings, canopies and arcades on commercial and multi-family buildings is well established in San Antonio and is a practice that should be continued. They offer shade from the hot summer sun and shelter from rainstorms, thereby facilitating pedestrian activity. They also establish a sense of scale for a building, especially at the ground level. Awnings and canopies are appropriate locations for signage. Awnings with signage shall comply with any master signage plan on file with the historic preservation officer for the property. Awnings and canopies installed at street level within the public right-of-way require licensing with the city's capital improvements management services (CIMS) department. Canopies, balconies and awnings installed at river level within the public right-of-way require licensing with the city's downtown operations department.
(1) If awnings, arcades and canopies are to be used they should accentuate the character-defining features of a building.
A. The awning, arcade or canopy shall be located in relationship to the openings of a building. That is, if there are a series of awnings or canopies, they shall be located at the window or door openings. However awnings, canopies and arcades may extend the length of building to provide shade at the first floor for the pedestrian. B. Awnings, arcades and canopies shall be mounted to highlight architectural features such as moldings that may be found above the storefront.
C. They should match the shape of the opening.
D. Simple shed shapes are appropriate for rectangular openings.
E. Odd shapes and bubble awnings are prohibited except where the shape of an opening requires a bubble awning, or historic precedent shows they have been previously used on the building.
F. Canopies, awnings and arcades shall not conflict with the building's proportions or with the shape of the openings that the awning or canopy covers.
G. Historic canopies shall be repaired or replaced with in-kind materials.
(2) Materials and Color.
A. Awnings and canopies may be constructed of metal, wood or fabric. Certain vinyl is allowed if it has the appearance of natural fiber as approved by the HDRC.
B. Awning color shall coordinate with the building. Natural and earth tone colors are encouraged. Fluorescent colors are not allowed. When used for signage it is appropriate to choose a dark color for the canopy and use light lettering for signage.
(3) Incorporating lighting into the design of a canopy is appropriate.
A. Lights that illuminate the pedestrian way beneath the awning are appropriate.
B. Lights that illuminate the storefront are appropriate.
C. Internally illuminated awnings that glow are prohibited.

## UDC Section. 35-675. Archaeology.

When an HDRC application is submitted for commercial development projects within a river improvement overlay district the city archeologist shall review the project application to determine if there is potential of containing intact archaeological deposits utilizing the following documents/methods:
(1)The Texas Sites Atlas for known/recorded sites, site data in the files of the Texas Archeological Research Laboratory and the Texas Historical Commission;
(2)USGS maps;
(3)Soil Survey maps;
(4)Distance to water;
(5)Topographic al data;
(6)Predictive settlement patterns;
(7)Archival research and historic maps;
(8)Data on file at the office of historic preservation.

If after review the city archeologist determines there is potential of containing intact archaeological deposits, an archaeological survey report shall be prepared and submitted. If, after review by the city archeologist, a determination is made that the site has little to no potential of containing intact archaeological deposits, the requirement for an archaeological survey report may be waived.

Upon completion of a survey, owners of property containing inventoried archaeological sites are encouraged to educate the public regarding archaeological components of the site and shall coordinate any efforts with the office of historic preservation.

## DOWNTOWN DESIGN GUIDE - TOWER MASSING

Towers in downtown San Antonio greatly affect the appearance of the overall skyline. Evaluations in other cities suggest that towers are most attractive when they have a ratio of height to width of about 3.5:1, for example, 100 feet wide and 350 feet tall. Reducing the bulk of the top of a tower ("sculpting" the tower) can make it more attractive. Towers ought to have slender massing and sound proportions.

1. Towers should have their massing designed to reduce overall bulk and to appear slender as they asc end higher.
2. Towers may extend directly up from the property line at the street and are not required to be setback.
3. Tower siting and massing should maintain key views toward important natural or man-made features.
4. Design the middle segment or tower of the building to break up the overall bulk into smaller segments and address impacts such as shadowing and views. Reduce the perception of mass through architectural detailing such as changes of materials and color.
5. Design the top of buildings to be a 'fifth façade' that may be distinctive against the skyline when looked up to or viewed from above. A well-designed roofline creates opportunities for sky views and views to distinctive landmarks; creates opportunities for sunlight to reach the ground, and orients the public when way finding.
6. Design the top of the building and/or the top of its podium to include opportunity for communal outdoor amenity space and/or a place for environmental innovation such as green roofs, rainw ater recovery and solar panels. Tower Form Tower forms ought to appear simple yet elegant, and add a sculptural form to the Downtown San Antonio's skyline.
7. Towers should be designed to achieve a simple faceted geometry and large vertic al plane movement. They should not appear overw rought or to have over-manipulated elements.
8. Towers that emulate a more streamline modern style should provide variety through subtle details in the curtain wall, and the articulation of a human-scaled base at the street level.
9. If a project has more than one tower, they should be complementary to each other and employ the same architectural design approach.

## FINDINGS:

a. The applic ant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a twenty-four (24) story, multi-family residential structure on the vacant lot at 112 Villita Street as well as construct a detached parking structure on the lot at 126 Villita Street, which would require the demolition of the existing building on the site.
b. CONCEPTUAL APPROVAL -Conceptual approval is the review of general design ideas and principles (such as scale and setback). Specific design details reviewed at this stage are not binding and may only be approved through a Certific ate of Appropriateness for final approval.
c. DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE - This request was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on September 11, 2019, where committee members commented on the massing and street elements of the tower. The proposed parking structure and associated demolition have not been formally reviewed by the Design Review Committee.
d. ARCHAEOLOGY -The project area is within the River Improvement Overlay District and is adjacent to the San Antonio River, an area known to contain significant historic and prehistoric archaeologic al deposits. In addition, a review of historic archival maps shows structures within the property as early as 1873. Furthermore, human remains were reportedly found within, or in close proximity to, the project area. Therefore, an archaeological investigation is required. The development project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology.

Findings related to request item \#1:
1a. PEDESTRIAN CIRCULATION - Per the UDC Section 35-672(a) in regards to pedestrian circulation, an applicant shall provide pedestrian access among properties to integrate neighborhoods. The applicant has proposed connections to the right of way along Villita Street as well as on Jack White Way; however, the applicant has proposed a vehic ular arrival court which would disrupt the flow of traffic for pedestrians on Jack White Way. At the River Walk level, the applicant has proposed an elevator and a stair connection into the proposed new construction, but has not proposed a connection from the River Walk level to the right of way at the Villita or Jack White Way. The UDC Section 35-672(a)(1)(B) notes that a connection should be provided from
the street level sidewalk to the River Walk at cross streets and bridges. Per the construction documents, the applicant has not provided this connection. Additionally, staff finds that the proposed sidew alk configuration on Jack White Way is inconsistent with the UDC as the proposed sidewalk is broken across the property.
1b. ARCHITECTURAL FOCAL POINT - According to the UDC Section 35-672(c)(1), properties that appear to be the terminus at the end of the street or at a prominent curve in the river shall incorporate into their design an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. Given the location of this property's location near the terminus of both Jack White Way and Villita Street, staff finds that an architectural focal point is needed. Architectural focal points, per the UDC are noted as additional height, creation of a tower elements, variation in roof shape, change of color or material, or addition of a design enhancement feature, such as articulated corners. The applicant is responsible for incorporating this into the design.
1c. SOLAR ACCESS - The UDC Section 35-673(a)(1) provides guidelines for solar access to the San Antonio River in regards to new construction. At this time, the applicant has not provided a solar access study to staff noting that a minimum of five and one half (5.5) hours of direct sunlight, measured at the winter solstice and seven and one half (7.5) hours of direct sunlight, measured at the summer solstice are provided to the river, measured from the river's edge or from the river's edge to the building face, whichever is lesser, parallel to the river for the length of the property.
1d. CURB CUTS - The applicant has proposed two curb cuts on Jack White Way that interrupt the sidewalk at the public right of way for approximately ninety (90) feet. The UDC Section 35-672(b)(1)(A) notes that curb cuts should be limited to two on parking areas or structure facing only one street and one for each additional street face. Additionally, the UDC notes that curb cuts should not be wider than twenty-five (25) feet. While the applicant has only proposed two curb cuts on Jack White Way, staff finds the width, profile and removal of sidewalk to be inappropriate and inconsistent with the UDC.
1e. SITE DESIGN - According to the UDC Section 35-673, buildings should be sited to help define active spaces for area users, provide pedestrian connections between sites, help animate the street scene and define street edges. Primary entrances should be oriented toward the street and shall be distinguishable by an architectural feature. The proposed new construction features a primary elevation that fronts Villita Street, one that fronts Jack White Way and one that front the river. Per the submitted construction documents, the applicant has proposed for a vehicular arrival court to act as the primary entrance on Jack White Way. This is not consistent with the UDC.
1f. LANDSCAPE DESIGN - Per the UDC Section 35-673(e) regarding landsc ape design, a variety in landscape design must be provided with no more than seventy-five (75) percent of the landscape materials, including plants being the same as those on adjacent properties. Additionally, according to the UDC Section 35-674(f), indigenous, non-invasive plant species and tropical plant species are permitted. The applicant has not provided information regarding landscape design as this time.
1g. MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT - The UDC Section 35-673(n) addresses service areas and mechanic al equipment and their impact on the public. Service areas and mechanical equipment should be visually unobtrusive and should be integrated with the design of the site and building. Noise generated from mechanical equipment shall not exceed city noise regulations. The applicant is responsible for complying with this requirement.
1h. BUILDING SCALE (Street Level)- According to the UDC Section 35-674(b) a building shall appear to have a "human scale". To comply with this, a building must (1) express façade components in ways that will help to establish building scale, (2) align horizontal building elements with others in the block face to establish building scale, (3) express the distinction between upper and lower levels, (4) in this instance, divide the façade of the building into modules that express traditional and (5) organize the mass of a building to provide solar access to the river. The applicant has proposed massing that at the street level caters to automobile access and features a double height storefront system. While the applicant has proposed human scaled elements such as projecting and recessed balconies on each floor and has provided variations in façade separation, staff finds that human scaled architectural elements are lacking at the street level. For instance, the proposed storefront system at the street level features an uninterrupted height of approximately 20 feet. Staff finds that storefront and canopy elements with traditional dimensions should be introduced into the street-level design.
1i. BUILDING SCALE (River Level) - The applicant has proposed two entry points within the existing river wall on the river façade. The mezzanine level on the river façade feature profiling and massing comparable to those found on Villita and Jack White Way. Additional design consideration should be given to the river elevation of the proposed new construction to incorporate human scaled features, landscaping, architectural elements that respond to the River Walk.
1j. TOWER MASSING - The applic ant has proposed building massing and a tower shape that features a width of approximately 140 feet parallel to the river. With a general height of 268 feet, this results in a building height to width ratio of approximately $2: 1$. According to the Downtown Design Guide, height to width ratios of new towers
should be $3.5: 1$. Furthermore, towers should have their massing designed to reduce overall bulk and to appear slender as they ascend higher. The proposed height to width ratio and lack of tapering is inconsistent with the Downtown Design Guide. Staff finds that exploring opportunities for tapering the tower to reduce overall width as the tower ascends higher would be more consist with the Downtown Design Guide.
1k. BUILDING HEIGHT - According to the UDC Section 35-674(c) in regards to the height of new construction in RIO districts, there are no height restrictions for new construction in RIO 3 other than the solar access standards in which this proposal complies. Section 35-674(c)(3) states that building facades shall appear similar in height to those of other buildings found traditionally in the area. This section also states that if fifty (50) percent of the building facades within a block face are predominantly lower than the maximum height allowed, the new building façade on the street-side shall align with the average height of those lower buildings within the block face, or with a particular building that falls within the fifty (50) percent range. At this time, the applicant has not provided a solar study to determine the appropriateness of the proposed height.
11. MATERIALS - In regards to materials and finishes, the UDC Section 35-674(d)(1) states that indigenous materials and traditional building materials should be used for primary wall surfaces. A minimum of seventy-five (75) percent of walls (excluding window fenestrations) shall be composed of the flowing: Modular masonry materials including brick, stone, and rustic ated masonry block, tile, terra-cotta, structural clay tile and cast stone. Concrete masonry units (CMU) are not allowed. However according to 35-674(d)(2)(B), glass curtain wall panels are allowed in RIO-3 as long as the river and street levels comply with 35-674(d)(1). The applic ant has proposed materials that include custom steel railing, exposed concrete, metal louvers to screen various mechanical elements, glazing, storefront systems and concrete wall panels. Generally, the proposed materials are consistent with the UDC.
1m.FAÇADE COMPOSITION - According to the UDC Section 35-674 in regards to façade composition, high rise buildings, more than one hundred (100) feet in height shall terminate with a distinctive top or cap. In addition to this, curtain wall systems shall be designed with modulating features such as projecting horizontal and/or vertical mullions, entrances shall be easy to find, be a special feature of the building and be appropriately scaled and the riverside façade of a building shall have simpler detailing and composition than the street façades. The applic ant has proposed three distinct masses that are separated by horizontal breaks in building massing.
1n. FAÇADE COMPOSITION - The applicant has proposed for the south elevation to feature relatively no separation, fenestration or detailing. A panel system will compose the majority of this elevation. The UDC Section 35-672(b)(4) notes that where building facades face a street or river, the maximum length of a wall plane cannot exceed thirty (30) feet. Where this occurs, a change in material, change in height, change in roof form or a change in fenestration must occur. The proposed south elevation is not consistent with the UDC.

## Findings related to request item \#2:

2a. The applicant has proposed to construct a parking structure on the lot at 126 Villita Street through the demolition of the existing structure. The applic ant has proposed for the new garage structure to feature five levels.
2b. EXISTING STRUCTURE - The proposed parking structure necessitates the demolition of a circa 1916 building that has been remodeled over the years. Staff performed an in-depth historic assessment of the building and finds that it is a candidate for historic designation. While the currently visible architectural elements of the existing building date to the 1970's, the design is associated with architect Norcell Haywood who was the first Afric an Americ an licensed architect to practice in San Antonio. The detailed Historic Assessment is provided in the exhibits for this request.
2c. DEMOLITION ALTERNATIVES - Staff expressed concern regarding the proposed demolition to the applicant as early as September 2018 and provided a finalized historic assessment for the property on December 10. Staff has also requested that the applicant provide alternatives to full demolition of the building such as incorporating a portion of the building façade into the proposed garage design. Staff does not find that the current proposal addresses these concerns. The applic ant is able to present alternatives for consideration by the HDRC. In accordance with the UDC, staff or the HDRC may request a Finding of Historic Signific ance for the property provided that viable solution for preserving portions of the building cannot be agreed upon.
2d. GARAGE DESIGN - The UDC Section 35-672(b)(4) notes that parking garages should have retail space or office space on the ground floor, which should feature at least fifty (50) percent of its linear street frontage as windows or display windows. Additionally, the UDC notes that parking garages will be determined compatible if they do not vary in height by more than thirty (30) percent from another building on the same block face and use materials that can be found on other building within the block face. The applicant has proposed brick cladding for the first level, but has not proposed to incorporate ground level retail or office space. The proposed garage design is not consistent with the UDC.

2e. LIGHTING - Lighting from parking structure should not produce light pollution or glares that spill over onto other properties, or the San Antonio River Walk. The applicant is responsible for submitting a lighting plan to OHP staff for review to ensure that light pollution does not occur.
2f. GARAGE CURB CUT - The UDC Section 35-672(b)(1)(A) notes that curb cuts should be limited to two on parking areas or structure facing only one street and one for each additional street face. Additionally, the UDC notes that curb cuts should not be wider than twenty-five (25) feet. The applicant's proposed curb cut width is inconsistent with the UDC.

## RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval of item \#1, the construction of a twenty-four story tower based on findings 1a through 1 n . Staff recommends the applicant address the following items prior to returning to the HDRC:
i. That the applic ant revise the curb cuts and automobile entry court proposed on Jack White Way and install a continuous sidewalk and pedestrian amenities across the site as noted in finding 1a.
ii. That the applicant revise the proposed tower massing to include a greater height to width ratio and inc lude tapering as the tower ascends based on finding 1 j .
iii. That the applic ant introduce an architectural focal point as noted in finding 1 b .
iv. That the applic ant submit a solar access study for consideration of overall height and impacts to the River Walk as noted in finding 1 c .
v. That the applic ant eliminate the continuous curb cut proposed on Jack White Way as noted in finding 1d and 1e.
vi. That the applic ant submit a conceptual landscaping plan as noted in finding 1 f .
vii. That the applic ant propose fenestration and façade separating elements to the south façade as noted in finding 1 n .

Staff does not recommend approval of item \#2, the construction of a five level parking structure based on findings 2 a through 2e. Staff recommends the applic ant address the following items prior to returning to the HDRC.
i. That alternatives to full demolition of the existing building be further evaluated and presented for HDRC consideration.
ii. That the garage features ground-level uses and incorporate windows or display space along at least fifty (50) percent of the linear street frontage.
iii. That any proposed curb cuts be modified to not exceed twenty-five (25) feet in width.
iv. That a lighting plan be submitted for review to ensure than no light pollution results from the proposed new construction.

ARCHAEOLOGY - An archaeological investigation is required. The archaeological scope of work should be submitted to the OHP archaeologists for review and approval prior to beginning the archaeologic al investigation. The development project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology.

## CASE MANAGER:

Edw ard Hall

Historic Assessment<br>Property Address: 126 Villita Street

1. APPLICATION DETAILS

Applicant: Frank Burney, Martin \& Drought, P.C.
Type: Historic Assessment
Date: $\quad 16$ November 2018
2. FINDINGS: The structure at 126 Villita, built c. 1916, is a one-story commercial style brick building constructed for the Maverick-Clarke Litho Company. While it is not currently designated as a local landmark or part of a local historic district, it is listed as a contributing property in the San Antonio Downtown and River Walk Historic District. Additionally, 126 Villita is under the purview of the Downtown Design guide and located in a River Improvement Overlay (3). The building was remodeled in 1929, 1938, 1974, and 1999. The current exterior design dates to the 1974 alterations completed by Haywood-Jordan-McCowan, Inc. Principal Norcell Haywood was the first licensed African-American architect in San Antonio.
a. HISTORIC CONTEXT:

## Downtown San Antonio

Downtown San Antonio is generally defined by the Interstate Highways that loop around the central core ( $\mathrm{IH}-10$ to the west and south, $\mathrm{IH}-35$ to the west and north, and $\mathrm{IH}-37$ to the east). Commerce and Market Streets serve as the main east-west passages through the core, with Flores, S. St. Mary's, and Navarro Streets serving as the main north-south passages. The majority (roughly 65\%) of buildings in Downtown San Antonio are simple, two-part commercial blocks ranging from one to three stories in height. Taller buildings include both two- and three-part vertical blocks. About $15 \%$ of buildings are midrise, ranging from four to seven stories. These are more common along major corridors such as Broadway, Houston Street, and S. St. Mary's Street. High rise buildings of eight stories or more (roughly 20\%) are distributed evenly across the district with the Tower Life building marking the southernmost, high-density resource at thirty stories.
Contributing properties retain the essential physical features that made up their character or appearance during the period of its association with the district. A contributing property need not be unaltered, as it is common for commercial buildings to have received some alterations to accommodate changes in marketing and use of the buildings over the years. Common changes to historic downtown buildings include replacement of the original storefronts with larger glass and metal storefronts, recladding of some or all the exterior façade materials including painting of brick, replacement of original windows, parapet or roof alterations, removal of architectural details or more extreme changes such as additions that do not complement the original building. ${ }^{1}$
Prior to the 1920s, the San Antonio River took several sharps turns through this part of downtown. The bends created a small peninsula, called Bowen’s Island, purchased from Maria Josefa Yturri by James Bowen in 1845 and owned by the family until 1910. Lafayette

[^0]
## CITY OF SAN ANTONIO

 OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATIONWard later purchased the property and worked with the city to excavate a new river channel, eliminating the curve along the south side of the peninsula. St. Mary's Street was extended south to Nueva at that time. ${ }^{2}$ The first of many buildings constructed on the old Bowen's Island, the Maverick-Clarke Litho Co. facility boasted "the largest first-floor area in San Antonio" in 1917. ${ }^{3}$ Construction took off in the 1920s, and the AB Frank building, SmithYoung Tower, Plaza Hotel, and Montgomery Ward were all constructed on Bowen's Island by 1929. Maverick-Clarke remained at this location until 1929, when the building was remodeled for Texas Furniture Store Co. ${ }^{4}$ By 1931, Western Auto occupied the western portion of the building. ${ }^{5}$

## Maverick-Clarke Litho Company

Founded in 1874 by Robert Clarke and Samuel Maverick, the Maverick-Clarke Litho Company offered printing services as well as office supplies and stationery. After moving from Soledad Street to a large, new plant at Bowen’s Island in 1916, the firm expanded to include locations in Corpus Christi, Houston, and Brownsville. The company later moved to 215 E Travis. ${ }^{6}$ On the occasion of the opening of their new facility at Nogalitos and Zarzamora, the San Antonio Express listed many publications that were under their production including The Gulf Coast Lumberman, Southwestern Baker, the Shriner’s publication Alzabar-Achbar, and Spanish language magazines that were unnamed. ${ }^{7}$ After several mergers, the company continues to operate today as Harland Clarke, with its headquarters still located in San Antonio.

## Western Auto

Western Auto Supply Company was founded in 1909 by George Pepperdine as a mail-order supplier of auto parts and accessories. The first retail store opened in 1921, and at its peak, it had approximately 1,200 stores in the United States.
The chain came to San Antonio in 1924 with its first location at 112-114 Broadway, which quickly grew and moved to 300-302 Broadway (northeast corner of Broadway and Third) in 1929. The second location opened in 1931 at 128 Villita, at the corner of Villita and Jack White Way, followed by a third at 504 Main Avenue established by 1935.
Beginning March 1, 1938, the three existing Western Auto locations in San Antonio were expanded. The primary entrance to store No. 2 was "moved over to the corner of S. St. Mary's and Villita Street," and its footprint "increased more than 25 per cent, with new display windows extending along S. St. Mary's Street for about 75 feet, as well as on Villita Street" (San Antonio Express, 5 June 1938, page 25). The Express article covering the expansion notes, "The original space occupied by the No. 2 Store has been converted into the drive-in parking and service for customers, affording parking space on the inside for more than 20 automobiles" (5 June 1938, page 25). General contractor for the project was

[^1]
## CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

the W.R. Davidson Construction Company of San Antonio-the Express article states that "all materials were purchased from local concerns and nothing but union labor was used" (5 June 1938, page 25).
Western Auto was sold first to the Beneficial Corporation in 1961, and then to Sears, Roebuck and Co. in 1987, "in a deal valued at $\$ 402$ million" ("Sears Agrees to Buy Western Auto," Los Angeles Times, 17 March 1988). The brand truly started to decline in 1998, when Advance Auto Parts acquired the Western Auto's operations from Sears for $\$ 175$ million; at that time, it had decreased its presence to 630 stores in 19 states and Puerto Rico. By 2003, the Sears-Advanced Auto Parts merger resulted in the end of the Western Auto brand name.

Norcell Haywood and Haywood-Jordan-McCowan, Inc.
The next major renovation came in 1974, when Southers, Goldberg \& Lyons, Inc. purchased 126 Villita from Western Auto and contracted Norcell Haywood's firm, Haywood-JordanMcCowan, Inc., to complete $\$ 10,500$ of work on 126 Villita.
Norcell Haywood (b. 1935, d. 2015) was the only licensed black architect in San Antonio at the time of this project, and one of only nine licensed black architects statewide, according to a profile of him in the San Antonio Express/News, published 17 September 1972 (page 10-G). According to his obituary, "he was one of the first four African-American students to be admitted to the University of Texas, and was the second African American to graduate from the UT School of Architecture in 1960." Haywood worked with O’Neil Ford from 1963 to 1968. His first firm, Norcell D. Haywood \& Associates was established in 1965. In 1971, he founded and served as president of Haywood-Jordan-McCowan, Inc., which had offices in San Antonio, Houston, and Dallas. He was the architect for Antioch Baptist Church at 1001 N Walters and Second Baptist Church at 3310 E Commerce, both local historic landmarks, and the Carver Library at 3350 E Commerce, just east of Second Baptist. Staff is able to connect Haywood-Jordan-McCowan to 126 Villita because of a lawsuit filed by Norcell Haywood 14 January 1976 against Southers, Goldberg \& Lyons. The lawsuit states the "Claimant [Norcell D. Haywood, president of Haywood-Jordan-McCowan, Inc.] performed labor as an Architect to improve such real property [126 Villita]. Such labor may be generally described as follows: Preparation of schematic design, design development and construction documents; assistance in preparation of information for bidders; and administration of construction phase of the design and erection of an office building, including repair, renovation and remodeling and/or original construction and superintending and supervising the erection and construction thereof." The contract in question is a Standard Form of Agreement Between Owner and Architect, a form provided by the American Institute of Architects, AIA Document 8141.

## Guido Companies Renovation

In 1999-2000, the interior of 126 Villita was demolished and remodeled by locally prominent contractor Guido Brothers Construction Company; the internal demo permit was issued 10/1/1999 to Tom Guido. Subcontractors included Mission Plumbing and Heating and Vollmer Electric. This is the last major renovation of record for the structure.

## 3. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION:

a. SITE CONTEXT: 126 Villita is situated on the northern third of a block bordered by Villita, S. St. Mary's, E Nueva, and Jack White Way in the San Antonio Downtown and River Walk Historic District. Aside from the Tower Life Building, located northeast of the subject structure, the surrounding parcels are comprised of low- to mid-rise commercial buildings and surface parking.
126 Villita is located one block south of the River Walk and directly southwest of the locally designated Smith-Young Tower, colloquially known as the Tower Life Building (310 S. St. Mary's); in fact, the tower is visible from a number of interior windows and skylights. The primary entrances of both buildings face each other diagonally across the intersection of Villita and S. St. Mary's. Northwest of the subject structure is the locally landmarked Plaza Hotel (311 S. St. Mary's/119 Villita). Directly east across S. St. Mary's from 126 Villita is a large surface parking lot, and on the northeast corner of that parcel is the locally landmarked Federal Reserve Building which now serves as the Mexican Consulate (127 Navarro). The parcel immediately south of the subject structure is the locally landmarked Montgomery Ward Building (419 S. St. Mary’s), which was converted to a parking garage while maintaining its historic façade. The Montgomery Ward Building and 126 Villita are separated by a pie-shaped patio accessible through several sliding glass doors from the subject structure but inaccessible to the Montgomery Ward Building. South of the Montgomery Ward building are two single-story commercial storefronts. Taken in whole, the storefronts along S. St. Mary's speak to a time when this area was prominently a shopping district, before Houston Street became San Antonio's primary shopping area.
b. MASSING AND VOLUME: 126 Villita is a six-sided, single-story brick commercial building 12-15 feet tall with a flat roof and parapet shorter than 1 '. The building is rather kite-shaped; its longest diameter runs from the northwest corner (at S. St. Mary’s and Villita) to the southeast (the south corner of the S. St. Mary's façade). Its long facades along S. St. Mary's and Villita make it appear much shorter than it is; the massing gives it an almost brutalist sense of scale while maintaining its warm early mid-century brick details and modified egg-and-dart cornice.
c. FORM: The primary entrance of 126 Villita is located at the corner of Villita and S. St. Mary's streets. While the roof extends over the entrance to create a recessed entrance, the doors are oriented toward the intersection. The brick façade along Villita runs west toward the 1935 entrance of the subject structure, which was located at the southeast corner of Villita and Jack White Way; this is the shortest side of the building as it once accommodated the corner-facing entrance. It was bricked up as part of the 1938 renovation and address shift; the brick wraps around the southeast corner of this façade for about two feet to meet stucco over brick. Walking south on Jack White Way along the stucco-over-brick façade, an approximately 20 -foot span of the building increases in height by about four feet returning to the lower height of the rest of the building before the entrance to a covered parking garage on this side of the subject structure. The building turns east southeast toward the rear of the Montgomery Ward Building; it turns again slightly north before meeting the northeast corner of its neighbor. This wall runs along the north side of the patio and meets the extended east façade along S. St. Mary's. This façade comprises the east side of the building, from the corner of Villita and S. St. Mary's, along the east edge of the patio, and meets the Montgomery Ward Building via an approximately eight foot brick wall with a steel door and steel teeth along the top to discourage fence jumping.

## CITY OF SAN ANTONIO

 OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATIONd. STYLE: 126 Villita is a single-story early midcentury commercial-style building.
e. MATERIALS: Exterior materials include brick, aluminum or steel-frame plate glass windows, wood doors, and stucco over brick.
f. ARCHITECTURAL DETAIL: There are five character-defining courses on the brick facades along Villita and S. St. Mary's (from top to bottom): a modified concrete egg-anddart cornice capped in metal flashing, a course of stacked headers three bricks tall, an inset panel of alternating dog tooth brick set on point 12 bricks tall, another course of stacked headers two bricks tall, and a tall course of running bond brick all the way to the ground except where plate glass windows are present. This pattern repeats between brick pilasters that are also running bond. Each bay is between approximately six and 15 feet long. Where there are plate glass windows, they run from below the second course of stacked headers to a Saltillo tile sill, with a bond brick course 12-15 inches high between the sill and the sidewalk. Windows are inoperable with steel or aluminum frames. They appear in pairs along the S. St. Mary's façade; there is a set of three windows on the Villita façade. The recessed front doors are two sets of swinging wood doors with six lites in each and vertical brass handles. The top three lites of each door stretch approximately $2 / 3$ the height, with the bottom three lites stretching the bottom third; the wood is equally wide around each door and between the lites. The underside of the overhang is lined with wood slats and has a round brown-gray punched ceramic lamp in the style of Beaumont Mood. There are 13 dark brown rectangular punched ceramic sconces also in the style of Beaumont Mood: four on the north façade, five on the west façade, and four on the east façade.
g. LANDSCAPE: Most of the area surrounding the building is concrete sidewalk, but there are four trees evenly spaces along the east side of 126 Villita. The patio between the subject structure and neighboring Montgomery Ward Building includes a variety of plants and three trees. Identifiable plants include beauty berry, split-leaf philodendron, and umbrella palm.
4. LANDMARK CRITERIA: 126 Villita is listed as a contributing property in the San Antonio Downtown and River Walk Historic District. It is eligible for individual local historic designation under UDC 35-607(b) based on the following criteria:
(4) Its identification as the work of a master builder, designer, architect, or landscape architect whose individual work has influenced the development of the community, county, state, or nation; Haywood-Jordan-McCowan, Inc., led by prominent black architect Norcell Haywood, the sole licensed black architect in San Antonio at the time, designed and implemented the 1974 alterations to 126 Villita;
(5) Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials; 126 Villita demonstrates characteristics typical of mid-century commercial architecture clearly influenced by the work of O'Neil Ford;
(7) Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature; 126 Villita is located on a prominent corner of the Downtown and River Walk National Register Historic District and has been at this location since 1916. Renovations over its 102 year history reflect the evolution of the property through a variety of uses over time.
(11) It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States; 126 Villita is the only building staff can connect to a black architect in downtown

## CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

San Antonio. It was also the first structure built on Bowen's Island after the San Antonio River had been diverted as part of flood control and land reclamation efforts in the early $20^{\text {th }}$ century.
(16) It is designated as a Recorded Texas Historic Landmark or State Archeological Landmark, or is included on the National Register of Historic Places; 126 Villita is listed as a contributing property in the San Antonio Downtown and River Walk Historic District, added to the National Register of Historic Places on 23 February 2018.
5. OUTCOME OF REVIEW: Based on this assessment, 126 Villita meets five of the sixteen criteria listed in UDC Section 35-607(b). In order to be eligible for landmark designation, a property must meet at least three of these criteria; thus, 126 Villita is eligible for designation as a local landmark. As noted above, some modifications have been made to the structure over time. For 126 Villita, both the original function and design of the space as a Western Auto as well as the 1974 Haywood alterations to the structure contribute to its eligibility.
Staff recommends that every effort be made to preserve and integrate this structure into any future plans for the site. The parking garage currently proposed for this site could incorporate some or all of the current structure, potentially as street level retail. Sensitive vertical additions might be appropriate and provide additional space. A garage entrance already exists on western façade along Jack White; this elevation has little architectural significance and could be altered to accommodate access to a parking garage on upper floors. Additionally, onsite interpretation related to Haywood-Jordan-McCowan, Inc. would be appropriate.


East end of north façade along Villita St.


West end of north façade along Villita St.


Façade on corner of Villita and Jack White Way; location of original Western Auto entrance c. 1935. (See historic photo below.)


South end of west façade along Jack White Way and south façade intersecting with rear of Montgomery Ward Building.


West façade along S. St. Mary’s.


Left: Photo of the transitions from 126 Villita (right), the extended brick façade across the patio (center), and the historic Montgomery Ward Building (left).

Below: details of the primary entrance at the corner of Villita and S. St. Mary's.



Image from staff's site visit on 8 June 2016 showing same façades at 126 Villita.


Biography of and interview with Norcell D. Haywood, San Antonio Express/News, 17
September 1972, page 10-G.


Historic and Design Review Commission

CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

Design Review Committee Report \& Recommendation

DATE:SEPTEMEER 11,2018
ADDRESS: VILLI AT SA RIVER

HDRC Case\# $\qquad$
Meeting Location:1901 S ALAMO
APPLICANT: LAEL MALAONAAO/FAB STUDIO, MIGUEL SALAANA/BEEENLER + ASSOCMTES DRC Members present:MKIAEL GUARINO, LÚETIS FISH ${ }^{-}$, JEFF FEELER
Staff present:ENSARA HKLL
Others present: $\qquad$
REQUEST: CONSTRUCTION OF A $290^{\circ}$ RESIdENTIAL TOWER ON THE SAN ANTONIO RIVER WALK AT VILLITA ANA JACK WHITE WAY COMMENTS/CONCERNS: LM: TONER GARAGE TO BE SEPARATE, ACROSS STREET, CONUESAATION ON LOCATION OF GARAGE. CF: QUESTIONS PRANG GARAGE LOCATION, CM: NO EETAIL/COMMERCLAL IN GARAGE, BUT GARAGE WILL FEATURE A FACADE, CM: APPCOXCMATELY $290^{\circ} \mathrm{IN}$ HEIGHT, 246 SIAENTIAL UNITS, RETAIL ANA LINING SPACE WILL BE NLLUAEA TO FRONT GOTH VILLITA ANA RIVER WALK, $50 \%$ OF FACADE WILL BE GLAZING, TEXAS LMESTONE ON GROUNA LEVELS: STEPBACKS ON INA ANA $18 T H$ LEVELS. COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE [ ] DISAPPROVE [ ] APPROVE WITH COMMENTS/STIPULATIONS:


Al上 - General conversation regaraing street facaae.
MS: - OVERMEN OF MASSING; COST FACTOES, SQUARE FOOTAGE ANA MAXIMIZING FGOTPEINT HAVE AEVEN SHAPE/MASGING.

MG: - THOUGHTS REGKRNNG OPEN COBNER - WHY? PEINCPPA FACALEES SHOULD BE ANCHOEEA AT CORNERS.

دF: - HOW IS RETAL SPNLE ACCESSIBLE? ENTRES FBOM VILLITA?
MG:- POTENTIAL ARINE ENTRANLE GLAY; PORTE-COCHERE BENG INTERNAL IS OLAY; SHOUL PE FRAMEA AT CORNER.

MGI - WTEFESAE IN EIVER ELEMENT ANA RIVER FACAAE. ENST ELEVATION IS SEAAPATEA BY BALCONIES; FOOTFEINT IS COMPACT; NO ISSUE W/ WIATH.

LF: - WHY AONTT BALCONIES WRAP ON ALL FACAAES?
MG: - COSIAER BETETING bALCONIES.
GF: - WIATH OF TOP THIRA NEE TO BE BEOKEN - CONSIAER NORTA OR SOUTH. PROVILE CONTEX: STREET, MASS TO RW






view of the west facade from the south along Jack White way
schematic
design
concept illustratives



schematic
design
materials
key







$$
\sqrt{5} \sqrt{S}]
$$

























```
A3.01
```



1 NORTH ELEVATION
2 SOUTH ELEVATION





[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Extracted from the San Antonio Downtown \& River Walk Historic District National Register Historic District registration form.

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ Bowen, Francis J. "Historic Bowen’s Island, Once City Garden Spot, Now Site for \$5,000,000 Worth of New Buildings," San Antonio Express, 23 January 1927.
    3 "St. Mary’s Street," The San Antonio Light, 23 July 1916. "St. Mary’s Street Already Has Sky-Scrapers, Big Business and Other Great Advantages," The San Antonio Light, 4 February 1917.
    ${ }^{4}$ San Antonio City Directory, 1929. Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps: Texas, V4, Sheet 445, c. 1912-1951.
    ${ }^{5}$ San Antonio City Directory, 1931.
    6 "Maverick-Clarke Opens New Plant at Southside Location," San Antonio Express, 1 October 1950.
    ${ }^{7}$ "Firm Grows from 60 to 300 Employes (sic) in 24 Years," San Antonio Express, 1 October 1950.

