

**AUDIT & ACCOUNTABILITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE  
MEETING MINUTES  
JANUARY 29, 2019 at 9:30 AM  
MUNICIPAL PLAZA, B ROOM**

Committee Present:	Councilmember John Courage, <i>District 9, Chair</i> Councilmember Roberto C. Treviño, <i>District 1</i> Councilmember Clayton Perry, <i>District 10</i> Citizen Member Judy Treviño
Committee Absent:	Citizen Member Priscilla Soto
Staff Present:	Kevin Barthold, <i>City Auditor</i> ; Ben Gorzell, Jr., <i>Chief Financial Officer</i> ; Troy Elliott, <i>Deputy Chief Financial Officer &amp; Director of Finance</i> ; Carlos Contreras, <i>Assistant City Manager</i> ; William McManus, <i>Chief of Police</i> ; Razi Hosseini, <i>Interim Director of Transportation &amp; Capital Improvements</i> ; Dr. Colleen Bridger, <i>Director of Metropolitan Health</i> ; Russ Handy, <i>Director of Aviation</i> ; Patricia Muzquiz Cantor, <i>Director of Convention &amp; Sports Facilities</i> ; Leticia Saenz, <i>Deputy City Clerk</i> ; Robert Blanton, <i>Deputy Police Chief</i> ; Vance Meade, <i>Deputy Fire Chief</i> ; Kevin Goodwin, <i>Chief Technology Officer</i> ; Christie Chapman, <i>Assistant Director of Transportation &amp; Capital Improvements</i> ; Michael Sindon, <i>Assistant Director of Economic Development</i> ; Homer Garcia III, <i>Assistant Director of Parks &amp; Recreation</i> ; Mark Bigler, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Buddy Vargas, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Gabriel Treviño, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Holly Williams, <i>IT Auditor</i> ; Denise Trejo, <i>Auditor</i> ; Rebecca Moulder, <i>Auditor</i> ; Lorenzo Garza, <i>Auditor</i> ; Daniel Kuntzelman, <i>Auditor</i> ; Sheryl Wardashki, <i>Auditor</i> ; Eryanne Taft, <i>Interim Executive Management Assistant</i> ; Cecily Hope Pretty, <i>Office of the City Clerk</i>

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Courage called the meeting to order.

**1. Approval of the Minutes from the Audit & Accountability Committee Meeting on December 11, 2018**

Councilmember Perry moved to approve the minutes of the December 11, 2018 Audit and Accountability Council Committee meeting. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

### **Post-Solicitation High Profile Items**

- 2. 2019 Job Order Contracting for Capital Improvement Projects [Transportation & Capital Improvements]**
- 3. Construction Services for Terminal A Security Checkpoint Expansion at San Antonio International Airport (SAIA) [Transportation & Capital Improvements]**

### **Final Internal Audit Reports**

- 4. AU18-C02 Audit of Convention & Sports Facilities Visit San Antonio Contract**
- 5. AU18-C03 Audit of Convention & Sports Facilities Catering & Concessions Contracts**

Councilmember Treviño moved to accept Items 2 through 5. Councilmember Perry seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

## **ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION**

### **Select Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings**

#### **6. Records Management System for SAPD [Police]**

Deputy Police Chief Robert Blanton stated that SAPD was soliciting a single, web-based records management platform inclusive of field-based reporting and case management that was compliant with the National Incident-Based Reporting System (NIBRS). He noted that the Request for Proposals (RFP) was valued at \$5.4 million for a term of one year with 4, one-year renewal options. He provided an overview of project and solicitation criteria and noted that reporting systems were federally required to be NIBRS-compliant by January 2021. He reviewed the differences between current Uniform Crime Reporting (UCR) data and NIBRS data and stated that NIBRS was more comprehensive. He provided an overview of outreach efforts and the Evaluation Committee. He stated that all Uniform and Civilian Employees of the Police Department were contacted regarding product functionality and over 600 requirements were identified. He reviewed solicitation requirements including points for Veteran-Owned Small Businesses (VOSB) and noted that SBEDA requirements were waived. He provided an overview of the timeline with City Council consideration in June 2019 in order to meet compliance requirements by 2021.

Councilmember Perry asked if staff considered a turnkey solution for records management. Deputy Chief Blanton replied that turnkey solutions were preferred and the RFP specified same. Councilmember Perry asked how the new system would simplify

existing processes. Kevin Goodwin replied that the new system did not require synchronization between different components and information updates would be available to all users immediately. Councilmember Perry expressed concern that the solicitation timeline did not allow sufficient time for companies to generate competitive proposals and requested an extension based on industry feedback. Councilmember Treviño and Ben Gorzell stated that they had not received similar feedback.

Chairman Courage asked if 16 weeks was enough time to implement and test the new system if the solicitation was extended by two weeks. Mr. Goodwin replied that staff anticipated implementation and testing to last 16 to 18 weeks.

Mr. Gorzell stated that staff would extend the solicitation period to 45 days and would review necessary adjustments to other components of the process. Councilmember Perry asked that staff consider longer solicitation periods for all future contracts.

No action was required for Item 6.

## **Select Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings**

### **7. EMS Billing & Collection Services [Fire]**

Deputy Fire Chief Vance Meade stated that the current vendor had a net collection rate of 56.07% for Fiscal Year 2018 and 59.27% for FY2017. He noted that medical incidents comprised over 80% of total incident volume for the Fire Department. He stated that the Fire Department responded to 160,000 medical incidents in FY2018 with 104,000 resulting in Emergency Medical Services (EMS) and billable fees. He noted that the selected firm would be responsible for providing billing and collection services for fees charged to individuals for EMS and related transports. He stated that the vendor would bill Medicare, Medicaid, private insurance firms, and individuals with a required minimum collection rate of 56% for any given month after 12 months of collection efforts. He noted that the RFP was valued at \$25 million annually over a proposed term of five years with 2, one-year renewal options. He stated that City Council consideration was planned for March 2019 with a contract start date of April 1<sup>st</sup>. He reviewed the scoring matrix and provided an overview of outreach efforts.

Troy Elliott noted no findings as a result of due diligence.

Councilmember Perry asked if services were provided at a loss to the City. Deputy Chief Meade replied that only 54% of services rendered were billable and services were not designed to generate revenues to the City. He added that San Antonio had the highest collection rate in Texas. Councilmember Perry expressed concern that taxpayers were billed for EMS. Mr. Gorzell stated that minimal collections came from individuals and the majority was billed to public and private insurance. He added that the City would have to identify other revenue streams to continue providing EMS if the City no longer billed for services.

Councilmember Perry moved to forward Item 7 to the full City Council for consideration. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

## **Final Internal Audit Reports to Be Discussed**

### **8. AU18-F10 Follow-Up Audit of Police & Fire Department 9-1-1 Operations & Response Reporting**

Kevin Barthold stated that the original audit was issued in November 2016 and the follow-up was conducted to review implementation of recommendations for the following: (1) SAPD, SAFD, and Bexar Metro 9-1-1; (2) SAPD; and (3) SAFD. He reviewed the recommendations for the first two sections and noted that all recommendations were currently implemented. He stated that the staff was again recommending that SAFD include the transfer time from SAPD in their call time reporting.

Chairman Courage asked how San Antonio's response times compared to other municipalities. Police Chief William McManus replied that San Antonio did not benchmark against other cities due to the number of potential influences but internal response times had improved year-to-year.

Mr. Barthold stated that staff was reissuing the recommendation to SAFD to include initial police response time in overall response time reporting. He noted that all other recommendations were currently implemented.

Councilmember Perry asked if SAFD intended to implement the final recommendation. Deputy Chief Meade replied that the information was included in reports but was noted separately from the fire response time due to the department's inability to influence police response times. Councilmember Perry requested a report on how other cities reported call response times.

Chairman Courage asked of the average fire response time including police response time. Mr. Barthold replied that it was 36 seconds. Chairman Courage asked of the number of call takers. Deputy Chief Blanton replied that SAPD had 170. Deputy Chief Meade replied that SAFD had 12. He noted that some of the call takers were temporarily reassigned from other areas and the department would likely request additional, dedicated positions in next year's budget. Chairman Courage asked how many SAFD calls resulted in dispatches. Deputy Chief Meade replied that there were 200,000 annually. Mr. Barthold added that the call ratio for SAPD was ten times that of SAFD.

Citizen Member Treviño moved to accept Item 8. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

### **9. AU18-015 Audit of Parks & Recreation Online Reservation Payment System**

Gabriel Treviño stated that the scope of the audit was to determine if controls and processes for the ActiveNet reservation and payment system were adequate and properly managed. He noted that ActiveNet was implemented on March 1, 2017 to streamline the reservation and payment process for park facilities and the scope of the audit was from implementation through March 31, 2018. He stated that staff reviewed reservation and payment records, user access, fees, and compliance with Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards (PCI DSS). He noted that ActiveNet was functioning as intended but there were opportunities to strengthen controls in terms of user access, refund approvals, and oversight of fee modifications and waivers.

Homer Garcia stated that overall reservations increased since ActiveNet's implementation and walk-ins decreased significantly. He noted that management agreed with all recommendations and implemented corrective action.

Chairman Courage asked of fee modifications and waivers. Mr. Garcia replied that only the Parks and Recreation Director or their designee could approve same per City Ordinance.

Councilmember Perry expressed concern that taxpayers were issued additional fees to utilize public park facilities. Mr. Garcia replied that fees were set by City Ordinance and gave citizens guaranteed use of select facilities. He added that the fees were utilized to offset maintenance costs. Councilmember Perry suggested that the City Council revisit the policy.

Councilmember Treviño asked if ActiveNet included Community Center reservations. Mr. Garcia replied that it did.

Citizen Member Treviño moved to accept Item 9. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

#### **10. AU18-006 Audit of SAMHD Air Monitoring Programs**

Buddy Vargas stated that the scope of the audit was to determine if the Public Center for Environmental Health (PCEH) Air Monitoring Programs were effective and adequately managed. He noted that a City Ordinance was established in 2015 to assist in the identification of local businesses that contribute to air pollution and required a \$200 registration fee for those emitting pollution. He stated that the audit scope was FY2017 through August 2018 and included review of regulations, policies, and procedures; grant management; air monitoring equipment; and station security. He noted that air monitoring programs were determined to be effective and adequately managed but there were opportunities to improve outreach and education efforts. He recommended increased outreach and identification of new pollution sources. He stated that staff agreed with the recommendations.

Dr. Colleen Bridger stated that the department was successful in obtaining additional funding for the Air Quality Unit and would dedicate additional funding and staff to outreach, education, and identification efforts.

Citizen Member Treviño moved to accept Item 10. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

#### **Consideration of Items for Future Meetings**

Mr. Barthold stated that the audit schedule was on track.

Mr. Gorzell asked if the Council Committee would like to review the proposed contract extension with Wells Fargo for P-Card administration. Chairman Courage requested same.

**ADJOURN**

There being no further discussion, Chairman Courage adjourned the meeting at 11:04 am.

**ATTEST:**

---

*John Courage, Chairman*

---

*Leticia Y. Saenz  
Deputy City Clerk*

DRAFT