



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION COMMISSION ACTION

This is not a Certificate of Appropriateness and cannot be used to acquire permits

September 5, 2018

HDRC CASE NO: 2018-420

ADDRESS: 723 BROOKLYN AVE
1718 N NAVIDAD

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 821 BLK 6 LOT A9
NCB 2075 BLK 1 LOT S, 78.83 FT OF 14

LANDMARK: Nesbitt House

APPLICANT: Patrick Christensen - 310 S St Mary's St

OWNER: Junior League of San Antonio - 723 Brooklyn Ave

TYPE OF WORK: Relocation of Historic Structure

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to relocate the historic structure at 723 Brooklyn Ave to a vacant lot addressed 1718 N Navidad St.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 723 Brooklyn Ave originally served as a 1-story single family home constructed in approximately 1890. The house was originally located at 700 S. McCullough, formerly 500 S. McCullough, and relocated to its present spot in the 1980s. According to survey records, the structure was heavily modified over the years, and previously featured a stucco façade and storefront entryway as indicated in a 1981-1982 survey. The survey noted that the structure was deteriorated at that time and detracted from its surrounding context. The home was restored to its present condition in the late 1980s, during which the non-original stucco storefront façade was removed and the original configuration and woodlap siding was rehabilitated. The historic structure was designed in the Folk Victorian style and features a cross gable configuration, an asymmetrical front porch with spindlework detailing, two over two wood windows, and a standing seam metal roof. The structure was locally designated on October 27, 1988, as part of a comprehensive initiative that landmarked over 1,100 individual structures in San Antonio.
- b. The applicant received conceptual approval from the Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) on December 6, 2017. At the time, the applicant was proposing to relocate the structure to a vacant lot in the Nathan Historic District. Staff noted that the Nathan Historic District is primarily residential and features single family homes constructed of similar styles. The era of significance of the district is more recent than the construction of the home, but is still compatible with its age and aesthetic qualities. The move would restore the home to a residential setting that respects the historic context of the landmark structure. Furthermore, developing the vacant lot with a historic structure will improve the integrity of the block and contribute to the Nathan Historic District. However, since that time, the ability to relocate the structure to this district is no longer feasible.
- c. **RELOCATION** – The applicant has proposed to relocate the structure to a vacant lot addressed 1718 N Navidad St. The lot is located within the Woodlawn Lake neighborhood, which is neither a historic district nor a Neighborhood Conservation District (NCD). The proposed lot is located at the intersection of N Navidad and Cornell Ave and is flanked on all sides by 1-story single family homes. Similar to the Nathan Historic District, the development era of this neighborhood is more recent than the age of the historic structure to be relocated, having

been platted and largely developed in the 1920s and 1930s. Homes nearby feature primarily Craftsman and Tudor Revival styles. The lot is located approximately two miles from 723 Brooklyn.

d. According to UDC Sec. 35-613, the following considerations should guide the recommendation to relocate the building:

1. The historic character and aesthetic interest the building, structure or object contributes to its present setting; the original context of the structure was a residential neighborhood. This context has largely been lost over the years, especially on the immediate block. Additionally, the structure itself has been both relocated and modified significantly over the years prior to being restored.
2. Whether there are definite plans for the area to be vacated and what the effect of those plans on the character of the surrounding area will be; the applicant has provided future plans to develop the property and its surrounding lots. The lots have been re-platted into one large parcel, which primarily contains surface parking with scattered trees. The proposed development is to be a large five-story multifamily project. Despite changes in its context over the years, including the 1976 noncontributing addition and increase in surrounding surface parking, the structure retained a high degree of significance when surveyed in 1987. There are also many examples, several within the city, of projects that have incorporated an existing structure into a large-scale development.
3. Whether the building, structure, or object can be moved without significant damage to its physical integrity; the proposed structure has the site since the 1980s after being relocated from its original site. The structure has been modified significantly over the years. The construction method and materiality of the structure also lends itself to a feasible move as demonstrated by its previous relocation.
4. Whether the proposed relocation area is compatible with the historical and archaeological character of the building, object, or structure; the applicant has proposed to relocate the historic structure to a vacant lot at 1718 N Navidad St. As noted in finding c, the neighborhood features primarily 1-story single family homes constructed in the 1920s and 1930s in predominantly Craftsman and Tudor Revival styles. The era of significance of the district is more recent than the construction of the home, but is still compatible with its age and aesthetic qualities. The move would restore the home to a residential setting that respects the historic context of the landmark structure. Furthermore, developing the vacant lot with a historic structure will improve the integrity of the block and contribute to the surrounding area.

RECOMMENDATION:

The historic context of the structure has generally been lost and the house may be a good candidate for relocation within an appropriate context in accordance with the UDC. The applicant has provided documentation that illustrates a plan for the final treatment of the structure in its new location, including orientation and hardscaping.

Staff recommends final approval of the relocation based on findings a through d with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant provides a final site plan indicating all hardscaping, landscaping, and final setbacks to staff prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant provides elevation drawings and detailed architectural detail drawings that indicate the final relocation condition of the structure, including the front porch and foundation treatment.
- iii. That the new property be designated through a historic zoning overlay.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Approved with staff stipulations.



Shanon Shea Miller
Historic Preservation Officer

A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) serves as a record of design approval and is valid for 180 days. Work that is not completed in accordance with this certificate may be subject to correction orders and other penalties.

A COA does not take the place of any required building permits nor does it authorize the use of a property beyond what is allowed by the Unified Development Code. Prior to beginning your construction project, please contact the Development Services Department at (210) 207-1111 to ensure that all requirements have been met.

This Certificate must remain posted on the job site for the duration of your project. Modifications to an approved design or an expired approval will require a re-issue of your Certificate of Appropriateness by OHP staff. Please contact OHP Staff at (210) 207-0035 with any questions.