

# HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

June 19, 2019

**HDRC CASE NO:** 2019-311  
**ADDRESS:** 1704 SAN FERNANDO ST  
**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 6016 BLK A LOT 3 & W 15 FT OF 2  
**ZONING:** R-4,HL  
**CITY COUNCIL DIST.:** 5  
**LANDMARK:** House  
**APPLICANT:** Thomas Casias  
**OWNER:** Thomas Casias  
**TYPE OF WORK:** Installation of a front yard fence  
**APPLICATION RECEIVED:** May 15, 2019  
**60-DAY REVIEW:** July 16, 2019  
**CASE MANAGER:** Stephanie Phillips

## REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a cattle panel fence in the front yard. The fence height is requested to be four feet.

## APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

*Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements*

### 2. Fences and Walls

#### A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.
- ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.
- iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

#### B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
- v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

#### C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.
- ii. *Location*—Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

## FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 1704 San Fernando St was constructed circa 1912-1915 in the Craftsman style and first appears on the 1954 Sanborn Map. The structure features a standing seam metal hipped roof with a front porch with wood columns. The structure is an individually listed local landmark and was designated on August 16, 2015. The applicant is requesting approval to install a cattle panel style 4-foot tall fence with wooden posts in the front yard. The fence has already been installed prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness or permit.
- b. FENCE DESIGN AND HEIGHT – Around April 2016, the applicant installed a solid, horizontal wood plank fence in the front yard. Sometime around June 11, 2019, the applicant changed the design to the requested cattle panel style fence prior to obtaining approval. The requested height is four feet. Historically, a front yard fence did not exist in this location, but they are prevalent in the vicinity. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, new front yard fences should appear similar to those used historically in the vicinity in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. New fences are also required to meet development standards as outlined in UDC Section 35-514. Based on similarly placed fences in the vicinity, staff finds the proposed design to be appropriate.
- c. FENCE LOCATION – According to the Historic Design Guidelines, new front yard fences should follow historic fence placements in the vicinity. Based on the existing context and area fences, staff finds the location to be generally appropriate.

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends approval of the front yard fence based on findings a through c with the following stipulations:

- i. The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.
- ii. That the applicant pulls all required permits for the front yard fence. Failure to comply with the permitting procedures outlined in the UDC may result in violations or other compliance measures from the applicable City departments.

### **CASE COMMENTS:**

**VIOLATION** – The requested fence was installed prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness or permit. The installation occurred sometime after April 2016. The applicant modified the fence to feature the requested cattle panel design prior to obtaining a permit around June 11, 2019.



June 13, 2019 at 1:11 PM  
1700 El Paso St  
San Antonio TX 78207  
United States







**PREVIOUS CONDITION**





PREVIOUS CONDITION



This image shows a single sheet of white paper with ten horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.

Drive way

House

12 ft

32 ft  
fence

2 ft  
fence

18 ft

1 ft

sidewalk

7 ft

Approach

curb

street

