HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION October 02, 2019

HDRC CASE NO:	2019-449
ADDRESS:	519 NOLAN
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 546 BLK 19 LOT 15 & E 5.58 FT OF 14
ZONING:	R-6 ,H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	2
DISTRICT:	Dignowity Hill Historic District
APPLICANT:	Aaron Peterson/PETERSON AARON
OWNER:	Aaron Peterson/PETERSON AARON
TYPE OF WORK:	New construction
APPLICATION RECEIVED:	August 21, 2019
60-DAY REVIEW:	October 20, 2019
CASE MANAGER:	Edward Hall

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Construct an accessory structure at the rear of the property at 519 Nolan. The applicant has proposed for the rear accessory structure to feature a footprint of approximately 900 square feet.
- 2. Receive Historic Tax Certification.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

i. Massing and form—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.

ii. Building size – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.

iii. Character—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.

iv. Windows and doors—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions. *v. Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. Orientation—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley loaded garages were historically used. *ii. Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

FINDINGS:

a. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct an accessory structure at the rear of the property at 519 Nolan. The applicant has proposed for the rear accessory structure to feature a footprint of approximately 900 square feet, and to be located to the right (east) of an existing accessory structure. The historic structure at 519 Nolan was constructed circa 1900 and is found on the 1904 Sanborn Map. The historic structure features a masonry façade, a metal roof and a traditional L-plan. The structure was constructed in the

Folk Victorian style.

- b. DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE This request was reviewed by the Historic and Design Review Commission on August 21, 2019, and was subsequently referred to the Design Review Committee. At that meeting, committee members discussed the appropriateness of metal siding and noted that metal siding should be profiled similarly to wood siding.
- c. SETBACKS & ORIENTATION The Guidelines for New Construction 5.B. state that the predominant garage orientation found along the block should be matched. Additionally, historic setback patterns of similar structures should be followed. The applicant has proposed to locate the accessory structure at the rear of the property, where accessory structures are historically located within the district. Generally the proposed setbacks and orientation are appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.
- d. MASSING The Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.i. notes that new garages and outbuildings should be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing and form. The applicant has proposed an overall height of approximately eighteen (18) feet in height. Generally, the proposed height is consistent with the Guidelines.
- e. FOOTPRINT As noted in finding a, the applicant has proposed a footprint to feature approximately 900 square feet. The Guidelines for New Construction 5.a.ii. notes that new accessory structures should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the primary historic structure's footprint. The existing historic structure features a footprint of approximately 1,660 square feet. The total lot size is approximately 11,200 square feet. The proposed footprint is not consistent with the Guidelines as it is more than 40 percent of the primary historic structure's footprint; however, given the overall size of the lot, staff finds that an accessory structure of additional size may be appropriate.
- f. CHARACTER The Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.iii. notes that new garages and outbuildings should relate to the period of construction of the primary historic structure on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details. The applicant has proposed for the structure to feature metal panel walls. The applicant has noted the ability to profile the proposed metal panels to feature a profile comparable to horizontally oriented wood siding.
- g. MATERIALS As noted in finding e, the applicant has proposed for the structure to primarily consist of metal panels. This is inconsistent with the Guidelines. Staff finds that accessory structures located within historic districts should feature materials that are consistent with those found on historic accessory structures; typically, wood framing, wood siding and a standing seam metal roof. Staff finds that the applicant should produce appropriate metal profiles that relate to wood.
- h. WINDOWS The applicant has noted the installation of three windows, but has not specified window materials at this time. Staff finds that windows should feature an overall profile that is complementary of the windows found on other accessory structures within the district. Additionally, staff finds that a double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- i. GARAGE DOORS The applicant has proposed metal, overhead rolling garage doors. Generally, staff finds that wood doors would be most appropriate for the Dignowity Hill Historic District; however, staff finds that a metal door may be appropriate provided that it features appropriate profiling and detailing.
- j. HISTORIC TAX CERTIFICATION The applicant has submitted an itemized list of costs that meets the threshold to be eligible for Historic Tax Certification. Additionally, applicant has met all requirements of the City's tax verification process as described in Section 35-618 of the UDC and has furnished evidence to that effect to the Historic Preservation Officer. Previously approved scopes of work include painting, roof repairs, porch repairs, and various interior improvements.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff finds that given the existing size of the lot, the adjacent industrial context and the limited visibility of the proposed structure from the right of way, that the construction of an accessory structure as proposed may be appropriate. Staff recommends the following:

- i. That the applicant submit a detailed profile of the proposed metal siding to staff. The proposed metal siding should feature a horizontal orientation and should only feature a distance between ridges of 4 to 6 inches. The proposed siding should not feature a glossy or shiny finish, and should be painted to match the historic structure. An industrial, or agricultural material should not be used.
- ii. That the applicant submit garage window and door specifications to staff for review and approval prior to purchase and installation.
- 2. Staff recommends approval of item #2, Historic Tax Certification as submitted.

City of San Antonio One Stop



August 13, 2019



City of San Antonio GIS Copyright 8-13-2019







519 Nolan Detached Garage Project:

Items included:

- 1) Drawing of proposed building with elevations and footprint
- 2) 3D modeling pictures of all sides of the new proposed building
- 3) Measured site plan, including setbacks, on recent survey from 2018
- 4) Photos of the front of the house and backyard

Proposed materials:

Metal building consisting of steel structure.

- Roof Galvalume to match the original roof on the main house in color and style
- Siding will also be metal but will be painted to match the tan/limestone color of the main house.
- Trim, soffits, and garage doors will be white to also match main house
- 2ft eaves added on sides to mimic main house architecture

Side note:

I'm putting together an application for the tax incentive for substantial rehabilitation of the main house. I currently have an open administrative approval repairing the roof on the main house and porch, and to allow for the replacement of the gingerbread trim that was damaged by rot/water intrusion on the porch. My point in telling you this, is that my intention since my purchase of this property is to restore and fix the issues that have been majorly neglected by past owners.

I am the home owner, not a flipper. This 1890 Folk Victorian is my dream house and I plan to live in it for many, many years. The proposed detached garage provides more functionality to the property, while being respectful to the character of the main property and of the neighborhood, Dignowity Hill. Due to the placement of the garage, it will be blocked almost entirely by the main house. It starts 152 feet back from the street, and will be all but invisible to passersby. Regardless, I've taken care to make decisions on colors and the style of architecture (roof slope, eaves, etc..) to make it fit in well.

Please kindly approve my application, so that I can move towards permitting with the city.

Front of House



Backyard



Proposed location of garage (in yellow)





Building Sketch

Borrower/Client	Aaron R. Peterson				
Property Address	519 Nolan St				
City	San Antonio	County Bexar	State TX	Zip Code 78202	
Lender	Broadway National Bank				













519 Nolan Street Substantial Rehab						
Calculator						
2018 Improvement						
Value	\$124,042.00					
Required 30% pre-						
rehab value	\$37,212.60					
Cost of Rehab	Ş51,037.91					

Percentage of Value of	
Improvements spent	
on Rehab/Restoration	41.15%

519 Nolan Street Remodel/Restoration Summary

Completed Repairs (started 06/01/18-completed 09/01/19):

Kitchen (full remodel):

- Removed cracked plaster to expose brick
- Repaired long leaf pine floors
 - There was plywood subfloor put down by previous owners, but no tile had been laid
 - Removed all face nails from the original floors (previous owners used to secture felt and plywood subfloor)
 - Multiple holes from water damage to original floors- patched using antique long leaf pine to match time period and width
 - Basement access hatch was moved to allow for access (original was against the back wall and without access, due to cabinet placement)
 - o Sanded and refinished with stain and polyurethane to match original color and finish
- New cabinets
- New countertops
- New backsplash
- New appliances (vent hood, range, built in fridge, wine/beverage fridge, dishwasher)
- Metal work (blackened steel floating shelf, vent hood, and side shelving on the island)
- New recessed lighting in ceiling
- Undercabinet/under shelf lighting in coffee bar area and under floating shelf

Dining Room

- Removed the cracking plaster to expose brick
- Repaired original 10' long leaf pine pocket doors (they were not tracking and wouldn't pull out)
- Repaired cracking plaster/lath on interior walls
- Recessed lighting added
- Floor to ceiling bookshelves built using antique lumber trim, and stained to match
- Painted the other plaster wall

Living Room

- Repaired cracking plaster and properly reattached to the lath
- Painted the room
- The house was missing the original mantle, so research was done to find a similar matching one to the original. Located and installed a dark stained tiger oak mantle from a folk Victorian home that was torn down in the Fredericksburg area. It was an 1893 home, so very similar to the actual age of the original one.

Foyer

- 1970s hanging light fixture was replaced with an antique French empire chandelier that I found at an auction. Similar in size and dimension to one I saw in another historic home in this neighborhood
- Sanded and refinished long leaf pine floors
- Sealed the air leakage around the front double doors

Exterior

- Replaced the porch roof, reconstructing the framing with treated lumber and decking before using metal roofing to match the main house
- Went to alamo Hardwoods and found original dimension trim to replace the mismatched trim and the water damaged sections on the porch
- Primed and painted the Trim

- Main Roof- repaired flashing around chimneys, repaired gutter leaks, and top-coated entire standing seam metal roof
- Some of the soffits on the left side of the house had fallen due to water intrusion/rotted wood secondary to the roof leaks. Once roof was repaired, soffits were also repaired, replacing rafter sections with new treated lumber. Hardie-board was used to replace the soffits. Care was taken to ensure the trim and soffits matched the dimensions and exact look of the original construction
- Windows were over sprayed by a sloppy previous owner when he painted the house. Each window glass was cleaned
- External shutters were repaired and made functional again
- Porch light was replaced, as the old one was broken, of poor quality, and didn't match the home
- Stick on address letters were removed from porch post

Future Plans (starting 10/01/19):

Interior:

- Dining room
 - Add rolling library ladder for floor to ceiling bookshelves
- Redo parts of the addition
 - o Replacing mismatched engineered flooring with antique long leaf pine
 - o Re-tile bathrooms and paint
 - Walk in Shower and new vanity for the master
 - Repaint and restore clawfoot tub in the spare bathroom
- Spray foam insulation
 - o Open cell in attic to create conditioned attic space and improve efficiency
 - Closed cell for the basement ceiling (under floor of main level)
- Basement
 - o Finish basement, inclusive of weeping tile system and concrete or paver flooring system
 - o Re-do stairs to improve access
 - o Add wine storage and seating area, so it becomes a functional wine cellar

Exterior:

- Restore all 14 antique windows, inclusive of stripping flaking paint, redoing the window weights, caulking, and replacing broken panes (3 panes cracked)
- Stripping and re-priming/painting the exterior shutters

Landscaping:

- Re-do cement sidewalk, as it's cracked and not level
- Sprinkler system install, sod and landscape front yard
- 2 car detached garage in the back yard

Bexar CAD

Property Search Results > 105492 PETERSON AARON Tax Year: 2018 for Year 2018

Property

Property ID:	105492		Legal Descri	ption:	NCB 546 BLK 19 LOT 15 & E 5.58 FT OF 14
Geographic ID:	00546-019-0150)	Zoning:		R-6
Туре:	Real		Agent Code	:	
Property Use Code:	001				
Property Use Description:	Single Family				
Protest					
Protest Status:					
Informal Date:					
Formal Date:					
Location					
Address:	519 NOLAN ST SAN ANTONIO, 1	FX 78202	Mapsco:		617A4
Neighborhood:	DIGNOWITY HIL	L HIST DIST	Map ID:		
Neighborhood CD:	57069				
Owner					
Name:	PETERSON AARC	ON	Owner ID:		3125535
Mailing Address:	519 NOLAN ST	% Ownership:		p:	100.000000000%
	SAN ANTONIO, 1	IX /8202-2251			
			Exemptions	•	
			Exemptions	:	
lues			Exemptions	:	
lues (+) Improvement Homes	ite Value:	+	Exemptions \$124,110	:	
				:	
(+) Improvement Homes	omesite Value:		\$124,110	:	
(+) Improvement Homes (+) Improvement Non-He	omesite Value: :	+	\$124,110 \$0		¨imber Use Value
(+) Improvement Homes (+) Improvement Non-Ho (+) Land Homesite Value	omesite Value: : /alue:	+ +	\$124,110 \$0 \$100,890		īmber Use Value \$0
(+) Improvement Homes (+) Improvement Non-Ho (+) Land Homesite Value (+) Land Non-Homesite V	omesite Value: : /alue: ⁄aluation:	+ + +	\$124,110 \$0 \$100,890 \$0		
(+) Improvement Homes (+) Improvement Non-He (+) Land Homesite Value (+) Land Non-Homesite V (+) Agricultural Market V	omesite Value: : /alue: ⁄aluation:	+ + +	\$124,110 \$0 \$100,890 \$0 \$0 \$0		\$0
 (+) Improvement Homes (+) Improvement Non-He (+) Land Homesite Value (+) Land Non-Homesite V (+) Agricultural Market V (+) Timber Market Valua 	omesite Value: : /alue: /aluation: tion:	+ + + + +	\$124,110 \$0 \$100,890 \$0 \$0 \$0 \$0		\$0
 (+) Improvement Homes (+) Improvement Non-He (+) Land Homesite Value (+) Land Non-Homesite V (+) Agricultural Market V (+) Timber Market Valua (=) Market Value: 	omesite Value: : /alue: /aluation: tion:	+ + + + =	\$124,110 \$0 \$100,890 \$0 \$0 \$0 \$0 \$225,000		\$0

(=) Assessed Value: =

Taxing Jurisdiction

Owner:	PETERSON AARON
% Ownership:	100.00000000%
Total Value:	\$225,000

Entity	Description	Tax Rate	Appraised Value	Taxable Value	Estimated Tax
06	BEXAR CO RD & FLOOD	0.023668	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$53.25
08	SA RIVER AUTH	0.018580	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$41.81
09	ALAMO COM COLLEGE	0.149150	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$335.59
10	UNIV HEALTH SYSTEM	0.276235	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$621.53
11	BEXAR COUNTY	0.277429	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$624.21
21	CITY OF SAN ANTONIO	0.558270	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$1,256.11
57	SAN ANTONIO ISD	1.562600	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$3,515.85
CAD	BEXAR APPRAISAL DISTRICT	0.000000	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$0.00
	Total Tax Rate:	2.865932			
				Taxes w/Current Exemptions:	\$6,448.35
				Taxes w/o Exemptions:	\$6,448.35

\$225,000

Improvement / Building

Improvement #	1: Residential State Co	ode: A1	Living Area:	1951.0 sqft	Value:	\$124,042
Туре	Description	Class CD	Exterior Wall	Year Built	SQFT	
LA	Living Area	G - SB		1890	1658.0	
LA1	Additional Living Area	G - SB		1890	293.0	
OP	Attached Open Porch	G - NO		1890	161.0	
UTL	Attached Utility	G - SB		1890	64.0	
PAC	Terrace with cover	G - NO		1890	440.0	
Improvement #	2: Residential State Co	ode: A1	Living Area:	sqft Valu	e: \$68	
Туре	Description	Class CD	Exterior Wa	ll Year Built	SQFT	
RMS	Residential Misc Shed	A - NO		1980	1.0	

Land

#	Туре	Description	Acres	Sqft	Eff Front	Eff Depth	Market Value	Prod. Value	
1	RES	R/1 Family not Farm Single	0.2570	11194.00	58.00	193.00	\$100,890	\$	50

Roll Value History

Year	Improvements	Land Market	Ag Valuation	Appraised	HS Cap	Assessed
2020	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
2019	\$198,390	\$112,990	0	311,380	\$0	\$311,380
2018	\$124,110	\$100,890	0	225,000	\$0	\$225,000

2017	\$152,360	\$72,760	0	225,120	\$0	\$225,120
2016	\$138,220	\$59,660	0	197,880	\$0	\$197,880

Deed History - (Last 3 Deed Transactions)

#	Deed Date	Туре	Description	Grantor	Grantee	Volume	Page	Deed Number
1	6/29/2018	WD	Warranty Deed	GOMEZ MIGUEL	PETERSON AARON			20180126589
2	7/5/2011	GWD	General Warranty Deed	DALY SABINA	GOMEZ MIGUEL	15038	1154	20110119206
3	10/28/2005	Deed	Deed	GRANT EMOGENE	DALY SABINA	11740	2135	20050255135

2020 data current as of Sep 9 2019 1:32AM. 2019 and prior year data current as of Sep 6 2019 6:27PM For property information, contact (210) 242-2432 or (210) 224-8511 or email.

For website information, contact (210) 242-2500.

Website version: 1.2.2.28

Database last updated on: 9/9/2019 1:32 AM

© N. Harris Computer Corporation