HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

September 18, 2019

2019-520
120 CALLAGHAN AVE
NCB 719 BLK 1 LOT N 1/2 OF 5
RM-4,H
1
Lavaca Historic District
Frank Telles/FT Builder Services LLC
MENDIOLA MARIO J
Construction of a 2-story rear addition, exterior modifications
August 30, 2019
October 29, 2019
Stephanie Phillips

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 2-story rear addition. The addition will require modifications to the existing side and rear elevations and the primary roofline of the historic structure.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.

ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.

iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
 iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.
 B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.

ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.

iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.

v. Height—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

2. Massing and Form of Non-Residential and Mixed-Use Additions

A. GENERAL

i. Historic context—Design new additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, additions should not fundamentally alter the scale and character of the block when viewed from the public right-of-way. *ii. Preferred location*—Place additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize the visual impact on the original structure from the public right of way. An addition to the front of a building is inappropriate.

iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, and orientation as the principal structure for additions, particularly for those that are visible from the public right-of-way.

iv. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design additions to historic buildings to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.

v. *Transitions between old and new*—Distinguish additions as new without distracting from the original structure. For example, rooftop additions should be appropriately set back to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. For side or rear additions utilize setbacks, a small change in detailing, or a recessed area at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

i. *Height*—Limit the height of side or rear additions to the height of the original structure. Limit the height of rooftop additions to no more than 40 percent of the height of original structure.

ii. *Total addition footprint*—New additions should never result in the doubling of the historic building footprint. Full-floor rooftop additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure. C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider characterdefining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

5. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, cable lines, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Where service areas cannot be located at the rear of the property, compatible screens or buffers will be required. B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. Freestanding equipment—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public

view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. Roof-mounted equipment-Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

6. Designing for Energy Efficiency

A. BUILDING DESIGN

i. Energy efficiency—Design additions and new construction to maximize energy efficiency.

ii. *Materials*—Utilize green building materials, such as recycled, locally-sourced, and low maintenance materials whenever possible.

iii. *Building elements*—Incorporate building features that allow for natural environmental control – such as operable windows for cross ventilation.

iv. *Roof slopes*—Orient roof slopes to maximize solar access for the installation of future solar collectors where compatible with typical roof slopes and orientations found in the surrounding historic district.

B. SITE DESIGN

i. *Building orientation*—Orient new buildings and additions with consideration for solar and wind exposure in all seasons to the extent possible within the context of the surrounding district.

ii. *Solar access*—Avoid or minimize the impact of new construction on solar access for adjoining properties. C. SOLAR COLLECTORS

i. *Location*—Locate solar collectors on side or rear roof pitch of the primary historic structure to the maximum extent feasible to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way while maximizing solar access. Alternatively, locate solar collectors on a garage or outbuilding or consider a ground-mount system where solar access to the primary structure is limited.

ii. *Mounting (sloped roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a sloped roof. Select collectors that are similar in color to the roof surface to reduce visibility.

iii. *Mounting (flat roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a flat roof to the maximum extent feasible. Where solar access limitations preclude a flush mount, locate panels towards the rear of the roof where visibility from the public right-of-way will be minimized.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 120 Callaghan St is a 1.5-story single family structure constructed circa 1915 in the Folk Victorian style. The home features a primary side-gable configuration, an asymmetrical front porch with turned columns, tall rectangular wood windows with a 2 over 2 configuration, and a primary front gable with decorative wood shingles. The structure is contributing to the Lavaca Historic District. A fire damaged the interior of the structure, along with a portion of the exterior roof and the rear façade, in March 2019. The applicant is requesting approval to remove fire damaged portions and construct a second story addition. The addition will require roof and elevation modifications to the primary structure.
- b. The applicant received conceptual approval from the Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) on September 18, 2019. The recommendation carried the following stipulations:
 - 1. That the existing gable on the east elevation be retained; this stipulation has been met.
 - 2. That the applicant submits an accurate line-of-sight study from the public right-of-way for final approval; this stipulation has been met.
 - 3. That the applicant submits accurate, comprehensive drawings for final approval, including an existing and proposed roof plan; this stipulation has been met.
 - 4. That the standing seam metal roof features panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches tall, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. Ridges are to feature a double-munch or crimped ridge configuration; no vented ridge caps or end caps are allowed. An on-site inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of work to verify that the roofing material matches the approved specifications. All chimney, flue, and related existing roof details must be preserved; **this**

stipulation applies to final approval.

- 5. That the applicant proposes a fully wood window product that meets the following stipulations: meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening; this stipulation applies to final approval.
- 6. That the applicant complies with all setback requirements as required by Zoning and obtains a variance from the Board of Adjustment, if applicable; **this stipulation applies to final approval.**
- c. DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE The applicant met with the Design Review Committee (DRC) on July 9, 2019. The DRC feedback included providing accurate existing and proposed elevations; treating the addition as a separate entity versus altering the existing primary structure; retaining the east-facing side gable and as much of the existing elevations as possible; and referencing the existing fenestration pattern on the historic structure to inform new windows on the addition. The applicant met again with the Design Review Committee on August 14, 2019, for a site visit to the property. The DRC again stressed the importance of fully accurate elevation drawings and suggested providing documentation that shows the addition's impact to the view from the public right-of-way, including a line of sight study and a street elevation that showed the proposal in context with existing historic structures on the block. The DRC emphasized aligning the roofline from the front elevation and simplifying rooflines to maintain the street configuration and minimize the visual impact from the public right-of-way.
- d. MASSING AND SCALE According to the Historic Design Guidelines for Additions, guideline 1.B.v stipulates that the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure, and the maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. The guidelines also stipulate that the height of an addition should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure. The existing small 1.5 story gable on the primary roofline facing Callaghan is not original and was a later alteration. Generally, staff finds the concept of a second story rear addition to be acceptable given the existing alterations and the limitations of the lot size, which prevent an extension to the rear.
- e. ALTERATIONS TO PRIMARY STRUCTURE The construction of a 2-story addition will require modifications to the existing primary structure. The front façade, aside from the roofline, will remain unchanged, and the side cross gable on the east façade will remain, which is a character defining feature of the Folk Victorian style. Minor alterations to the rear east and west facades will occur as a result of the addition. Staff finds the proposal to be generally appropriate based on the site-specific constraints, location of the alterations, and the limited interventions on the character defining features of the home.
- f. MATERIALS The applicant has proposed to utilize similar materials as the primary structure on the addition, including matching woodlap siding, wood windows, and a new standing seam metal roof. Staff finds the proposal generally appropriate.
- g. WINDOWS AND OPENINGS The applicant has proposed various window openings on the rear addition that will closely match existing configurations. Staff finds the proposal appropriate with the stipulations listed in the recommendation, which include the stipulation to install fully wood windows.
- h. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS The applicant has proposed to include or retain several existing architectural details, including materials, roof configuration, and window detailing. Staff finds the proposal generally appropriate with the stipulations listed in the recommendation.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends final approval based on findings a through h with the following stipulations:

- i. That the standing seam metal roof features panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches tall, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. Ridges are to feature a double-munch or crimped ridge configuration; no vented ridge caps or end caps are allowed. An on-site inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of work to verify that the roofing material matches the approved specifications. All chimney, flue, and related existing roof details must be preserved.
- ii. That the applicant proposes a fully wood window product that meets the following stipulations: meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of

the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

- iii. That the applicant complies with all setback requirements as required by Zoning and obtains a variance from the Board of Adjustment, if applicable.
- iv. That the applicant submits accurate, comprehensive drawing updates to staff for review and approval if modifications are required as determined in the field, if applicable. No modifications to the approved design by HDRC should occur prior to review and approval by staff and the issuance of an updated Certificate of Appropriateness. If substantial modifications are required, a new HDRC hearing may be required.

City of San Antonio One Stop





User drawn lines









1911-1951 SANBORN MAP











	DIOLAF
120 CALLAGHA	AN AVE
	FRANK TELLES BUILDER SERVIC
	<u>Builders Se</u>
	San Antonio, To
	210.400.30
INDEX OF DRAWINGS	or Maro LP
COVER COVER SHEET, GENERAL NOTES CODE/BLDG. SUMMARY, MAPS	al Group
ADA REQUIREMENTS SITE SITE PLAN	Caballe
A101 1ST AND 2ND FLOOR PLAN A102 EXTERIOR FLEVATIONS	
A103 INTERIOR ELEVATIONS	
MEP	
E101 FLOOR PLAN - LIGHTING & POWER	
STRUCTRUAL	
A101 FOUNDATION FLOAOR PLAN AND DETAILS A102 FIRST LEVEL WALL BRACING	
A103 SECOND LEVEL WALL BRACING A104 FIRST LEVEL CEILING JOIST	
A105 SECOND LEVEL CEILING JOIST A106 BOOF FRAMING PLAN	
A107 DETAILS	
DO	
NTS BZ	
	PROJECT GENERAL NOTES
 THE OWNER WILL ASSUME RESPONSIBILITY FOR ADMINISTRATION OF THE CONTRACT FOR CONSTRUCTION AND FOR SUPERVISING THE EXECUTION OF THE CONTRACT DOCUMENTS (WORKING DRAWINGS). THE ARCHITECT IS NOT RESPONSIBLE FOR DAMAGES RESULTING FROM ERRORS AND OMISSIONS BY THOSE EXECUTING THE WORK, OR DAMAGES RESULTING FROM CHANGES IN THE WORK NOT SET FORTH IN THE CONTRACT DOCUMENTS, AND OR CHANGES NOT APPROVED IN WRITING TO THE ARCHITECT. CONTRACTOR SHALL HOLD ALL REQUIRED LICENCES IN THE MUNICIPALITY IN WHICH THE THE WORK IS TO BE PERFORMED. CONTRACTOR SHALL BE RESPONSIBLE FOR OBTAINING ALL PERMITS INCLUDING ANY AND ALL PERMITTING FEES. CONTRACTOR SHALL BE FULLY INSURED AND SUBMIT PROOF OF COVERAGE AND COVERAGE AMOUNTS WITH BID. CONTRACTOR SHALL CONTACT THE OWNER (OR ABCHITECT) AS SOON AS POSSIBLE FOR 	 DO NOT SCALE DRAWINGS FOR CONSTRUCTION PURPOSES, SEE WRITTEN DIMENSI ALL DIMENSIONS ARE TO FACE OF STUD, CONCRETE, OR TO CENTER LINE, UNLESS OTHERWISE NOTED. CONTRACTOR TO VERIFY ALL CODES, ORDINANCES, REQUIREMENTS AND INCORPOI INTO BIDS, PROPOSALS AND CONSTRUCTION. ALL NECESSARY AND REQUIRED CONTROLLED INSPECTIONS SHALL BE MADE AND FILED WITH THE APPROPRIATE DEPARTMENTS, BY AN AUTHORIZED OR QUALIFIED LI BUILDING INSPECTOR. ALL MATERTIALS AND CONSTRUCTION TO BE INCORPORATED IN THE WORK SHALL E IN STRICT ACCORDANCE WITH THE LATEST EDITION OF THE ASTM SPECIFICATIONS APPLICABLE AND TO CONFORM TO THE STANDARDS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE VARIOUS TRADE INSTITUTES (A.I.I., A.I.S.C., ETC.) WHERE APPLICABLE, ALL MATE
 WITH ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR DISCREPANCIES CONCERNING PLANS. 5. CONTRACTOR SHALL FEILD VERIFY AND BE RESPONSIBLE AND UNDERSTAND ALL DIMENSIONS AND CONDITIONS AT THE IOR SITE. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL NOTICY THE 	 INCORPATED INTO THE WORK SHALL BE NEW, UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE. 13. USE ONLY SKILLED AND EXPERIENCED PERSONEL. ALL WORK SHALL BE DONE IN A WORKMAN MANNED. ALL WORK TO DONE IN ACCORDANCE WITH INDUCTORY OTAMICAL.
ARCHITECT OF ANY DISCREPANCIES, VARIATIONS ETC. WITH THE DIMENSIONS AND OR CONDITIONS INDICATED OR NOT INDICATED ON THESE DRAWINGS. 6. EXISTING CONDITIONS, I.E. DIMENSIONS, I OCATIONS OF LITILITIES ETC. SUPPLIED BY	14. CONTRACTOR SHALL BE RESPONSIBLE FOR ADEQUATELY BRACING AND PROTECTIN ALL WORK DURING CONSTRUCTION AGAINST DAMAGE, BREAKAGE COLLAPSE, DIST
 ENGINEER. THE ARCHITECT IS NOT RESPONSIBLE FOR DISCREPANIES, ERRORS, DAMAGES, AND CHANGES RESULTING FROM INCORRECT INFORMATION. 7. BY SUBMITTING A BID, THE BIDDER AGREES AND WARRANTS THAT HE HAS VISITED THE 	AND MISALIGNMENT ACCORDING TO APPLICABLE CODES, STANDARDS AND GOOD PI 15. EACH CONTRACTOR SHALL BE HELD STRICTLY RESPONSIBLE FOR HIS WORK.
PROJECT SITE, EXAMINED THE DRAWINGS AND SPECIFICATIONS (IF PART OF CONTRACT) AND FOUND THAT THEY ARE ADEQUATE FOR THE PROPER COMPLETION OF PROJECT. 8. SHOULD CONFLICT ARISE BETWEEN GENERAL NOTES. HEREIN AND FOUL OWING AND	 16. PROTECT ALL MATERIALS, FIXTURES AND APPLIANCES FROM WEATHER AND OR THE 17. CONTRACTOR SHALL KEEP SITE (INSIDE AND OUTSIDE) NEAT AND ORDERLY THROUG CONSTRUCTION. COMPLETED WORK SHALL BE CLEAN.
SPECFICATIONS (IF PART OF CONTRACT), THE GENERAL NOTES SHALL HAVE PRECEDENCE. WRITTEN DIMENSIONS ON DRAWINGS HAVE PRECEDENCE OVER SCALED	18. PROVIDE ELECTRICAL REQUIRED FOR BURGLAR ALARM SYSTEM. CONTRACTOR TO COORDINATE INSTALLATION WITH THE SECURITY COMPANY SELECTED BY OWNER.



DIMENSIONS.













LEGEND







REMODEL MAIN FLOOR PLAN 11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"





REMAIN

SHEET





11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"



EXISTING FRONT ELEVATION

11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"







EXISTING REAR ELEVATION 11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"



NEW <u>RIGHT ELEVATION</u> 11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"



EXISTING RIGHT ELEVATION 11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"





EXISTING FRONT ELEVATION



EXISTING ROOF LINE



NEW FRONT ELEVATION 11" x 17" - GCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - GCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"



EXISTING FRONT ELEVATION 11" x 17" - SCALE 1/8" = 1'-0" 24" x 36" - SCALE 1/4" = 1'-0"





	Historic and Design Review Commission
	CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION
	DATE: WIMPARAMAN HDRC Case#
	ADDRESS: 120 CALLAGHAN Meeting Location: 04P
	APPLICANT: FRANK TELLES
	DRC Members present: GPUBE, FETZER
	Staff present: STEPHANIE PHILLIPS
	Others present:
	REQUEST: EXTEPION MODIFICATIONS. 2-STORY
	PEAR ADDITION
	COMMENTS/CONCERNS:
AM	ONE DORMER VS. 3? PREFER TO NOT MAKE CHANGES
	TO THE FRANT.
JL:	IDENTRY EXISTING VS. PROPOSED HEIGHT IN
	DO CUMENTS.
AM:	SEPARATE / DEFINE ADDITION.3
JL	TOP HEAVY & OUT OF SCALE (2ND STORY)
AM	: PECTANCULAR WINDOWS ARE NOT COMMIN, AND
	CHANGET IN FEWENDATION: COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE [] DISAPPROVE [] APPROVE WITH COMMENTS/STIPULATIONS:
	Committee Chair Signature (or representative) 7/8//9 Date

FECYCLE WINDOWS THE FROM PEAR & ETT ELSEWHERE. SHOW FXISANG CONDININS ON DRAWING

- JF: SIDE PITCH IS COMPLETELY CHANGING. SIDE GABLE IS BEING ELIMINATED.
- AM: MAIN TAIN FRONT & SIDES AJ MUCH AS POSSIBLE, AND MAINTAIN GABLE.
 - JF: USE EXISTING WINDOW PRECEDENTS/SIZES VS. HORTZONTAL WINDOWS.

POOF FORMS, SCALE, ETC. INTO NEW DEJIGN.

SHOW PERATIONSHIP TO CARPORT.