#### HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

#### November 20, 2019

HDRC CASE NO:	2019-683
ADDRESS:	1418 W ROSEWOOD AVE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 2763 BLK 68 LOT 8
ZONING:	R-4, H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	1
DISTRICT:	Keystone Park Historic District
APPLICANT:	David Rodriguez/J D ROMI GROUP LLC
OWNER:	David Rodriguez/J D ROMI GROUP LLC
TYPE OF WORK:	Window replacement
<b>APPLICATION RECEIVED:</b>	November 06, 2019
60-DAY REVIEW:	January 05, 2020
CASE MANAGER:	Huy Pham

#### **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Replace the six front-most sash windows with new wood windows (two on the north façade, two on the east side, and two on the west side)
- 2. Installed seven aluminum windows, including removal of two door openings on the side and rear façades.

#### **APPLICABLE CITATIONS:**

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. Doors-Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

iv. Screens and shutters-Preserve historic window screens and shutters.

v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

### B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. Muntins—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. Replacement glass—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

vii. Non-historic windows—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

viii. Security bars-Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.

ix. Screens—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

x. Shutters—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

#### Standard Specifications for Wood Window Replacement

- SCOPE: When individual elements such as sills, muntins, rails, sashes, or glazing has deteriorated, every effort should be made to repair or reconstruct that individual element prior to consideration of wholesale replacement.
- MATERIAL: If replacement is approved, the new windows must feature primed and painted wood exterior finish. Cladded, composition, or non-wood options are not allowed unless explicitly approved by the commission. Where original wood windows are found to be missing or replaced with nonconforming infill product by a previous owner, an alternative material to wood may be considered if the proposed window product is an improvement to the current condition.
- SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25".
- DEPTH: There should be a minimum of 2" in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash.

This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.

- TRIM: Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- GLAZING: Windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- COLOR: Wood windows should feature a painted finished. If a clad product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- INSTALLATION: Wood windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation. For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

### **FINDINGS:**

- a. The structure at 1418 W Rosewood was constructed circa 1925 with Tudor influences and first appears on the 1951 Sanborn map. The one-story structure features vinyl siding over wood lap siding, steep front-facing and turned gables, a subtle sweeping curved front porch cover, and an original porte-cochere. The property contributes to the Keystone Park Historic District.
- b. COMPLIANCE Staff conducted a site visit on July 2, 2019, and found that the property was subjected to a number of fenestration modifications including door removal and window relocation in the rear side bay as well as the installation of aluminum windows throughout the structure. On August 21, 2019, the Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) referred the request to a Design Review Committee (DRC) site visit. On August 28, 2019, the DRC advised the applicant to resubmit the request with an effort to maintain as many original wood windows and openings as possible. The applicant opted to appeal to the Board of Adjustment (BOA) for the original request prior to resubmitting a revised plan. The BOA denied the request and the applicant submitted a revised request to the HDRC thereafter.
- c. WINDOWS The applicant has proposed to replace the six front-most sash windows with new wood windows (two on the north façade, two on the east side, and two on the west side); a wood window product has not been submitted at this time. The applicant has also proposed to install seven aluminum windows, including removal of two door openings on the side and rear façades. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, historic windows should be preserved in-place and only considered for replacement when they have deteriorated beyond repair. Staff finds that the wood windows were in repairable condition at the time of the site visit and should have been restored to their original configuration and location. Given that the windows are permanently discarded, staff finds that all replacement should feature salvaged or reconstructed wood sash windows that meet the Standard Specifications for Window Replacement, rather than any featuring aluminum.
- d. FENESTRATION The applicant has proposed to remove the two door openings under the Tudor arch trim and

replaced with aluminum sash windows on the east side façade. Portions on both the side and rear elevations have had their vinyl and wood siding removed and featured construction wrap at the time of the site visit. Per the February 2019 photograph and the July 2019 site visit including the materials visible on site, staff finds that beside the vinyl siding, the structure has maintained almost all of its original features.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends approval of item 1, the replacement of existing windows with wood windows.

Staff does not recommend approval of item 2, the installation of aluminum windows and fenestration modifications. .

Given that the windows are permanently discarded, staff stipulated that *all* replacement should feature salvaged or reconstructed wood sash windows that meet the Standard Specifications for Window Replacement, rather than *any* featuring aluminum.

### CASE COMMENT:

Staff conducted a site visit on July 2, 2019, and found that the property was subjected to a number of fenestration modifications including door removal and window relocation in the rear side bay as well as the installation of aluminum windows throughout the structure. On August 21, 2019, the Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) referred the request to a Design Review Committee (DRC) site visit. On August 28, 2019, the DRC advised the applicant to resubmit the request with an effort to maintain as many original wood windows and openings as possible. The applicant opted to appeal to the Board of Adjustments (BOA) for the original request prior to resubmitting a revised plan. The BOA denied the request and the applicant submitted a revised request to the HDRC thereafter.

## 1418 W Rosewood







City of San Antonio GIS Copyright 8-13-2019





(4)

(21)

-

IEEN

1



🕥 • Street View - Feb 2019



1418 Wes Rosewoo d Ave W Lynwood Ave

W Elsmere Pi he Deco District





# 1415 W Rosewood Ave

**9** :

SVIDOT Official

San Antonio, Texas

100

1418 Wes Rosewoo

W Lynwood Ave

W Elsmere Pl ne Deco District

ullwood Ave

Ave



• Street View - Feb 2019

Google

ALC: NO



## **Board of Adjustment – Case No. 19-10300118**

Applicant: David Rodriguez/J D ROMI GROUP LLC

Legal Description: NCB 2763 BLK 68 LOT 8 Address: 1418 W ROSEWOOD AVE Zoned: "R-4" Residential, Keystone Historic District

**Request**: An appeal of the Historic Preservation Officer's decision to deny window replacement and fenestration modifications as proposed for the property at 1418 W Rosewood.

### **Applicable Code References**

Historic Design Guidelines

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. Doors-Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

iv. Screens and shutters-Preserve historic window screens and shutters.

v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. Muntins—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. Replacement glass—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

vii. Non-historic windows—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

viii. Security bars-Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.

ix. Screens—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

x. Shutters—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

The structure at 1418 W Rosewood was constructed circa 1925 with Tudor influences and first appears on the 1951 Sanborn map. The one story structure features vinyl siding over wood lap siding, steep front-facing and turned gables, a subtle sweeping curve front porch cover, and an original porte-cochere. The property contributes to the Keystone Park Historic District.

Staff conducted a site visit on July 2, 2019, and found that the property was subjected to a number of fenestration modifications including door removal and window relocation in the rear side bay as well as the installation of aluminum windows throughout the structure. A number of wood windows and an original door were visible on the site at the time of the site visit. Because work was completed without first obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness, the applicant was prompted to request approve from the Historic and Design Review Commission as an option to remedy the violation.

On August 2, 2019, staff received a Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) application from the applicant for the window replacement and fenestration modifications to be heard at the next available hearing. At the hearing on August 21, 2019, the HDRC referred the request to a Design Review Committee (DRC, subcommittee) site visit. At the site visit with the DRC on August 28, 2019, subcommittee members informed the applicant that wholesale wood window replacement with new vinyl or aluminum windows would not be supported by the present subcommittee members and advised the applicant to resubmit a request that maintains the original window sizes, locations, and materials. The applicant indicated to OHP staff that he preferred to appeal to the Board of Adjustment rather than pursuing a remedy through HDRC approval. OHP staff issued a denial letter which cites non-conformance with the Historic Design Guidelines.

#### **Staff Recommendation to the Board of Adjustment**

Staff recommends that the Board of Adjustment uphold the decision by the Historic Preservation Officer to deny window replacement and fenestration modifications as proposed for the property at 1418 W Rosewood.



Existing gravel driveway has severe erosion. Driveway to be paved with concrete. Exterior of house has had damaged original wood siding previously covered with vinyl siding.

The intent is to replace damaged vinyl siding with new vinyl siding and paint.

**North Elevation** 

Existing front steps have shifted and become a hazard. The intent is to adjust the existing steps to be flush with front walkway.



Previously enclosed porch was severely rotted as were the added walls and doors that completed the enclosure.

Walls reconstructed. Matching vinyl siding will be put on this wall to match the rest of the exterior.

New 35" x 35" **Aluminum Windows** 

Both installed on this wall to make the interior more functional

# **East Elevation**

Original wood windows (both)

Will leave in place



Previously added room wil be left in place.

New 35" x 59" Aluminum Windows (both)

Rotted wood windows to be replaced by Aluminum windows. Sill will be slightly adjusted and rotted wood frame will be repaired to match original.

**South Elevation** 



West Elevation

The sizes will be restored with the request to replace with aluminum.



David Rodriguez

P.O. Box 15585

San Antonio, TX 78212

Reference: Historic & Design Review Commission Application \_\_\_\_\_

Windows

To Whom It May Concern:

Enclosed is the Historic & Design Review Commission Application information that includes required documents, current color photos and a site plan for use of proposed windows.

Also, I visited with my neighbor across the street at 1431 W. Rosewood who in the recent two months you approved a similar aluminum window to be installed. Looks good. And enclosed with this note are five pictures of similar windows proposed to be used at 1418 W. Rosewood taken from the immediate four-block area of the following addresses: #1) 1307 W. Rosewood, #2) 1427 W. Rosewood, #3) 1411 W. Lynwood, #4) 1431 W. Lynwood, and #5-A) & #5-B) 1438 W. Lynwood.

Also, I am including pictures referencing white aluminum windows (specifications included) proposed for 1418 W. Rosewood that I used last year 2018 on a similar style house in the Monte Vista area. Please find these windows to be in keeping with the style of the house on W. Rosewood.

Thank you for your consideration.

0320



1418 W. ROSEWOOD 78201

Home / Doors & Windows / Windows / Single Hung Windows Internet #203647784 Model # 310F Store SKU #643879 Store SO SKU #752849



Share Save to Favorites Print

#### **Ply Gem**

### 35.25 in. x 35.25 in. Single Hung Aluminum Window - White

★★★★ (2) → Write a Review Questions & Answers (1)

## \$**106**00

Save up to \$100 on your qualifying purchase. Apply for a Home Depot Consumer Card

#### **Overview**

310F Aluminum Single Hung Windows are available in singles, twins, triples and stack options with a wide selection of architectural shapes. They are made to fit all standard size openings and ... See Full Description

Pick Up In Store Today		We'll Deliver It to You
Add to Cart		Express Delivery
6 in stock at N San Antonio		Get it as soon as tomorrow
Alsie 23, Bay 006 Text to Me Check Nearby Stores		Schedule delivery to your home or jobsite at your convenience for as low as \$8.99
Dr buy now with <b>PayPal</b>	Your local store: N San Antonio Store Details & Services	Easy returns in store and online Learn about our return policy
oduct Overview		
Aluminum Single Hung Windows are available in singles, twins,		Info & Guides
ction of architectural shapes. They are made to fit all standard size om sizes. These windows feature color-coordinated sash lock har		Instructions / Assembly
ter seal, sloped sill drains and an integral nailing fin.		You will need Adobe® Acrobat® Reader to view PDF documer

Side load removable bottom sash

6 Live Chat

https://www.homedepot.com/p/Ply-Gem-35-25-in-x-35-25-in-Single-Hung-Aluminum-Window-White-310F...

#### None

Jamb Depth (in.)

#### 1.0625

Product Depth (in.)

2.4375

Product Height (in.)

35.25

Product Width (in.)

35.25

Rough Opening Height (In.)

36

Rough Opening Width (In.)

36

Width (in.) x Height (in.)

35.25 x 35.25

#### Details

Exterior Color/ Finish

White

Exterior Color/Finish Family

White

Features

Insect Screen

Frame Material

Aluminum

Frame Type

Nail Fin

Glass Type

Low-E Glass

**Glazing Type** 

Double-Pane

Grid Pattern

No Grid

Grille Type

No Grille

Hardware Color/Finish Family

White

Included

Hardware,Screen

Insect screen included

Yes

Interior Color/Finish Family

White

🕢 Live Chat

https://www.homedepot.com/p/Ply-Gem-35-25-in-x-35-25-in-Single-Hung-Aluminum-Window-White-310F...

	Lock Type
	Cam Action
	Number of Grids
	No Grid
l	Number of Locks
	2
	Privacy glass
	No
	Product Weight (Ib.)
	271b
	Solar Heat Gain Coefficient
	.32
:	Storm window
1	No
	Tilt-in cleaning
1	No
	Tinted glass
1	No
1	U-Factor
	30
1	Window Type
	Single Hung
1	Mindow Use Type
1	New Construction

	1
-bul	L
10	L
5	L
9	Ĺ
e.	L
4	L
_	Į.
<b></b>	L
чÇļ	L

#### Warranty / Certifications

Energy Star Qualified	
Not Qualified	
Manufacturer Warranty	
20 yr glass	

How can we improve our product information? Provide feedback

## **Recently Viewed Items**

القابقانية.



(60)

(513)

Home / Doors & Windows / Windows / Single Hung Windows Internet #203647780 Model # 310F Store SKU #640480 Store SO SKU #752649



Share Save to Favorites Print

#### **Ply Gem**

## 35.25 in. x 59.25 in. Single Hung Aluminum Window - White

★★★★★ (1) - Write a Review Questions & Answers (1)

## **\$139**<sup>00</sup>

Save up to \$100 on your qualifying purchase Apply for a Home Depot Consumer Card

#### **Overview**

310F Aluminum Single Hung Windows are available in singles, twins, triples and stack options with a wide selection of architectural shapes. They are made to fit all standard size openings and ... See Full Description

Pick Up In Store Today		We'll Deliver It to You
Add to Cart		Express Delivery
5 in stock at N San Antonio		Get it as soon as tomorrow
Aisle 23, Bay 008 Text to Me Check Nearby Stores		Schedule delivery to your home or jobsite at your convenience for as low as \$35.00
Ir buy now with <b>PayPal</b>	Your local store: N San Antonio Store Details & Services	Easy returns in store and online Learn about our return policy
oduct Overview		
DOUCT OVERVIEW Numinum Single Hung Windows are available in singles, tw on of architectural shapes. They are made to fit all standard		Info & Guides • Instructions / Assembly

· Side load removable bottom sash

Download a free copy from the Adobe Web site.

ပါ Live Chat

https://www.homedepot.com/p/Ply-Gem-35-25-in-x-59-25-in-Single-Hung-Aluminum-Window-White-310F...

## Specifications

imensions	
Grid Width (in.)	
None	
Jamb Depth (in.)	
1 0625	
Product Depth (in.)	
2.4375	
Product Height (in.)	
59.25	
Product Width (in.)	
35 25	
Rough Opening Height (In.)	
30	
Rough Opening Width (In.)	
36	
Mdth (in.) x Height (in.)	
35.25 x 59.25	
etails	
Exterior Color/ Finish	
White	
Exterior Color/Finish Family	
White	
Teatures	
nsect Screen	
rame Material	
Numinum	
гате Туре	
lail Fin	
Slass Type	
.ow-E Glass	
Slazing Type	
Double-Pane	
Srid Pattern	
lo Grid	
Grille Type	
lo Grille	
lardware Color/Finish Family	
Vhite	

🔂 Live Chat

Hardware,Screen		
	Insect screen included	
	Yes	
	Interior Color/Finish Family	
	White	
	Lock Type	
	Cam Action	
	Number of Grids	
	No Grid	
	Number of Locks	
	2	
	Privacy glass	
	No	
	Product Weight (b.)	
	42lb	
	Solar Heat Gain Coefficient	
	32	
	Storm window	
	No	
	Tilt-in cleaning	
	No	
	Tinted glass	
	Νο	
	U-Factor	
	.30	
	Window Type	
	Single Hung	
	Window Use Type	
	New Construction	

# 🔂 Live Chat

#### Warranty / Certifications

Energy Star Qualified Not Qualified Manufacturer Warranty 20 yr glass

How can we improve our product information? Provide feedback.



























# **Investigation Report**

Address	1418 W Rosewood	
District/Overlay	Keystone Park	
Owner Information	J D ROMI GROUP LLC	
Location Map		
	ood Ave	Neer Ave
	ood Ave	W Rosev
	od Ave	
	Omepbox	© OpenStreetMap

## Site Visit

Date	07/02/2019
Time	02:39 PM (-5 GMT)
Context	citizen report
Present Staff	Huy Pham, Edward Hall
Present Individuals	None
Types of Work Observed	Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Additions
Amount of Work Completed	75%
Description of work	Window replacement with modified size and material. Rear addition. Door replacement. Wood window sashes and door are still on site.
Action Taken	

Violation Type	No Certificate of Appropriateness (Code 35-451a)
OHP Action	Posted "Notice of Investigation"


Other field notes	DSD SWO for work without permits also posted.
Will post-work application fee apply?	Yes
Documentation	
Photographs	<image/>



























































































