

**AUDIT & ACCOUNTABILITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES
DECEMBER 17, 2019 at 10:00 AM
MUNICIPAL PLAZA BUILDING**

Committee Present:	Councilmember John Courage, <i>District 9, Chair</i> Councilmember Roberto C. Treviño, <i>District 1</i> Councilmember Adriana Rocha Garcia, <i>District 4</i>
Committee Absent:	Citizen Member Priscilla Soto Citizen Member Judy Treviño
Staff Present:	Andy Segovia, <i>City Attorney</i> ; Ed Guzman, <i>Deputy City Attorney</i> ; Katinka Howell, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Ray Rodriguez, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Tina J. Flores, <i>Interim Deputy City Clerk, Office of the City Clerk</i> ; Kevin Barthold, <i>City Auditor</i> ; Craig Hopkins, <i>Chief Information Officer</i> ; Troy Elliott, <i>Deputy Chief Financial Officer</i> ; Julia Murphy, <i>Deputy Chief Sustainability Officer</i> ; William McManus, <i>Police Chief, SAPD</i> ; Sergeant Chris Lutton, <i>Planning & Research Unit, San Antonio Police Department</i> ; Russ Handy, <i>Director, Aviation</i> ; John Jacks, <i>Director, Center City Development and Operations</i> ; Alex Lopez, <i>Interim Director, Economic Development Department</i> ; Veronica Carrillo, <i>Assistant Director, Center City Development and Operations</i> ; Veronica Garcia, <i>Assistant Director, Center City Development and Operations</i> ; Jessica Dovalina, <i>Assistant Director, Department of Human Services</i> ; Nikki Ramos, <i>Assistant Director, Parks & Recreation</i> ; Christine Chapman, <i>Assistant Director, Transportation & Capital Improvements</i> ; Shuchi Nagpal, <i>Interim Assistant Director, Economic Development Department</i> ; Maria Perez, <i>Compliance Auditor</i> ; Gabriel Treviño, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Buddy Vargas, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Mark Bigler, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Douglas Francis, <i>Auditor</i> ; Daniel Kuntzelman, <i>Auditor</i> ; Nastasha Leach, <i>Auditor</i> ; Abigail Medina, <i>Auditor</i> ; Susan VanHoozer, <i>Auditor</i> ; Sheryl Wardashki, <i>Auditor</i> ; Danny Zuniga, <i>Auditor</i> ; Nancy Cano, <i>Office of the City Clerk</i>
Others Present:	Ellen Berky, <i>League of Independent Voters, District 1</i> ; Stan Mitchell, <i>Vista Ridge Resolution Coalition</i>

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Courage called the meeting to order.

1. Approval of the Minutes from the Audit & Accountability Committee Meeting on November 19, 2019.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia moved to approve the Minutes of the November 19, 2019 Audit and Accountability Council Committee Meeting. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

CONSENT AGENDA

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Items

2. **Meal Preparation Services for Senior Nutrition Program** [Colleen M. Bridger, MPH, PhD, *Assistant City Manager*; Melody Woosley, *Director, Human Services*]
3. **Fully Insured Health Plans for Medicare-Eligible Retirees** [Ben Gorzell, *Chief Financial Officer*; Lori Steward, *Director, Human Resources*]
4. **Multifunctional Devices** [Ben Gorzell, *Chief Financial Officer*; Craig Hopkins, *Chief Information Officer, Information Technology Services*]
5. **Annual Contract for Custodial Services - Riverwalk** [Lori Houston, *Assistant City Manager*; John Jacks, *Director, Center City Development & Operations*]
6. **SA Climate Ready Public Engagement & Communications Initiative** [Roderick Sanchez, *Assistant City Manager*; Douglas Melnick, *Chief Sustainability Officer, Office of Sustainability*]
7. **River Walk Improvements Phase 6** [Roderick Sanchez, *Assistant City Manager*; Razi Hosseini, *Interim Director, Transportation & Capital Improvements*]
8. **Natural Creekway Maintenance** [Roderick Sanchez, *Assistant City Manager*; Razi Hosseini, *Interim Director, Transportation & Capital Improvements*]
9. **On-Call Professional Cultural Resources Consulting Services** [Roderick Sanchez, *Assistant City Manager*; Razi Hosseini, *Interim Director, Transportation & Capital Improvements*]
10. **On-Call Storm Water Engineering Services** [Roderick Sanchez, *Assistant City Manager*; Razi Hosseini, *Interim Director, Transportation & Capital Improvements*]

Post-Solicitation High Profile Items

11. **On-Call General Technology Consulting Services** [Carlos Contreras, *Assistant City Manager*; Russell Handy, *Director, Aviation*]

Final Internal Audit Reports

12. AU19-006 Audit of DHS Delegate Agency Group – Youth Success
13. AU19-023 Audit of Parks Pools Inspections
14. AU19-F02 Follow-up Audit of Aviation Parking Revenues
15. AU19-024 Audit of SAPD Growdon Road Vehicle Impound Lot
16. AU19-F06 Follow-up Audit of SAPD Detention Center

17. AU19-002 Audit of ACS Dangerous Dog Permits and Inspections

Councilmember Rocha Garcia moved to approve Items 2 through 15, and Item 17. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The Motion carried unanimously by those present.

ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

16. AU19-F06 Follow-up Audit of SAPD Detention Center

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked if the SAPD Detention Center employed medical staff and if so, how many. Kevin Barthold replied that the University Hospital System provided on-call medical staff in partnership with the Detention Center. She asked when the two pending action plans would be fully implemented. Mr. Barthold replied that both action plans would be in place by the end of this year. She questioned the reported excessive length of custody for arrestees prior to transfer. Mr. Barthold stated that the average length of custody for FY 2019 was now 6 hours, compared to the average of 18 hours found in the prior audit.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia moved to approve the Follow-Up Audit of SAPD Detention Center. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The Motion carried unanimously by those present.

Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

**18. Sale of Continental Hotel Property [Lori Houston, *Assistant City Manager*;
John Jacks, *Director, Center City Development & Operations*]**

Veronica Garcia discussed the sale of the Continental Hotel Property. She stated that the building had been vacant since 2016 and that a Redevelopment Request for Proposal (RFP) called for maximization of housing density to include income-restricted affordable units, anticipated non-residential uses on the ground floor, and opportunities for public parking. She added that the Finance and Audit Departments conducted due diligence and 190 vendors were notified of the RFP solicitation and 20 vendors attended a pre-submittal conference. She reported that the City received one response which met all minimum RFP requirements and the due diligence conducted resulted in no findings. She stated that the Evaluation Committee met on December 3, 2019 and by consensus recommended awarding a contract to the respondent. She stated that this item was scheduled for City Council consideration on January 16, 2020.

Chairman Courage asked of the sale price. Ms. Garcia replied that the sale price was \$4.7 million. He asked why a 2015 market value was used to assess the sale price instead of a current market value. Ms. Garcia replied that a Request for Information (RFI) was issued in 2015 but that no interest was generated for the stated property value. Ray Rodriguez added that in this case the RFP did not reflect a market rate, but instead included affordable housing and other factors that would not necessarily reflect a market rate price for the property. He asked how much money was spent to ready the property for sale. Ms. Garcia stated that she would provide the information.

Councilmember Treviño asked of the evaluation process. Ms. Garcia stated that the Evaluation Committee evaluated the bid noting that it met the minimum sale price, the requested residential

affordability mix, and it included pedestrian friendly amenities and a building design which aligned with the character of local surroundings.

Executive Session

Chairman Courage recessed the meeting into Executive Session at 10:22 am.

- 20.** Discuss legal issues relating to Sale of Hotel Continental Property pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney)
- 21.** Deliberate the purchase, exchange, lease of value of real property pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.072 (real property)

Chairman Courage reconvened the meeting at 10:39 am and announced that no action was taken.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked of the Evaluation Committee selection process. Ms. Garcia replied that the Members consisted of local community stakeholders with interest in the area including a UTSA Vice President, the CEO of Centro San Antonio, a local architect, a bank Vice President, and a stakeholder from the development community.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked of the consensus within the Evaluation Committee and asked of the recusal process. Ms. Garcia stated that early in the process a Committee Member recused himself because of a potential conflict of interest. She added that all Evaluation Committee Members were informed of the required due diligence process and were required to sign a confidentiality form.

Councilmember Treviño moved to recommend and forward the selection of the responsive bidder to the City Council for consideration on January 30, 2020. Councilmember Rocha Garcia seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

Final Internal Audit Reports to be discussed

19. AU18-022 Audit of SAPD Body Worn Cameras

Mr. Barthold stated that an audit of the SAPD Body Worn Camera Program was performed to determine if the body camera initiative was effective and operating as intended. He noted that SAPD began piloting the program in 2014 with a phased-in approach, and that by May 2017 deployment was completed and all SAPD officers had been issued Body Worn Cameras (BWC). He stated that there were over 2,000 BWC in operation with over half a million hours of recorded BWC footage collected. He noted that BWC videos were stored in a cloud-based application called Evidence.com which provided unlimited storage capacity and robust application features. He stated that the audit found BWC deployment to be effective and working as intended.

Mr. Barthold noted that 99.9% of BWC video was uploaded within 9 days, which was much earlier than the 14-day deadline set out in the Policy and Procedure Manual. He stated that by April 2019, 96.3% of all SAPD service calls had associated BWC videos. He added that video quality also

improved with BWCs activated at the right times and without ending prematurely, and that authorized muting times were documented with much more frequency.

Mr. Barthold stated that the audit process recommended the following areas for improvement:

Supervisory Review: The audit found that quarterly reviews of BWCs were not consistent. A recommendation was made to improve the non-compliance range of 3.7% to 7.4% and to hold supervisors accountable to ensure video of their staff was reviewed quarterly.

User Access Control Issues: The audit found there to be excessive users on the system including some users who were no longer employed, and 383 users who had not used the system in over 90 days. The audit found that excessive administrative privileges were given to many users. A recommendation was made to work with ITSD to reduce the number of users, and to reduce the number of users with access to administrative privileges.

Password complexity: The audit found Evidence.com. to be a very good system with very good audit controls; however the actual application password did not meet typical standard password requirements, nor did it meet the City's password requirements. A recommendation was made to request the vendor to provide increased password complexity at its next release.

Mr. Barthold concluded his report by stating that SAPD staff worked extensively on the audit and that Chief McManus had addressed all the stated issues with corrective action plans.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked if criteria has been established for meaningful quarterly supervisory reviews of BWCs. Sergeant Lutton replied that he worked with City Auditor Susan VanHoozer to implement best practice procedures for SAPD Command Staff. He stated that the policies went into effect at the beginning of December 2019. Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked if there was a procedure for addressing non-compliance in performing quarterly BWC reviews. Sergeant Lutton stated that non-compliance would be addressed through the Chain of Command. Chief McManus added that violations would be addressed with each individual found to be in non-compliance.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia moved to approve the AU18-022 Audit of SAPD Body Worn Cameras. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

Public Comment

Ellen Berky requested two corrections be made to the November 10, 2019 Audit and Accountability Council Committee Meeting Minutes. She asked for the name of Colleen G. Waring to be added to the list of Others Present. Ms. Berky stated she was a member of the League of Independent Voters and asked that the word "Individual" be replaced with the word "Independent".

Consideration of Items for Future Meetings

There were no items considered for future meetings.

Adjourn

There being no further discussion, Chairman Courage adjourned the meeting at 10:59 am.

ATTEST:

John Courage, Chairman

Nancy Cano
Office of the City Clerk