

APPLICATION FOR CHANGE OF ZONING

Request:

The Office of Historic Preservation requests a change of zoning to add "HL" Historic Landmark designation to 413 E Mistletoe and to waive all related fees. *OHP staff recommends approval*.

Case Comments:

On December 4, 2019, the Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) agreed with the applicant's request for a finding of historic significance and supported the designation of the property as a local landmark.

Case History:

February 4, 2020	Zoning Commission hearing
December 4, 2019	Historic & Design Review Commission (HDRC) hearing
November 7, 2019	Application for Historic Landmark Designation submitted to OHP

Applicable Citations:

<u>Note:</u> In accordance with the process for designation of a historic landmark, as outlined in Section 35-607 of the UDC, properties must meet three of sixteen criteria. This property meets four Criteria for Evaluation.

Unified Development Code Sec. 35-607. – Designation Criteria for Historic Districts and Landmarks.

- a. **Process for Considering Designation of Historic Districts and Landmarks.** Historic districts and landmarks shall be evaluated for designation using the criteria listed in subsection (b) and the criteria applied to evaluate properties for inclusion in the National Register. In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the criteria listed. Historic districts shall consist of at least two (2) or more structures within a legally defined boundary that meet at least three (3) of the criteria. Additionally, all designated landmarks and districts shall demonstrate clear delineation of the legal boundaries of such designated resources.
- b. Criteria for Evaluation.
 - 3. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state, or nation;
 - 5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;
 - 11. It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States;
 - 13. It bears an important and significant relationship to other distinctive structures, sites, or areas, either as an important collection of properties or architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to the plan based on architectural, historic or cultural motif.

Findings of Fact:

- a. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner.
- b. HISTORIC CONTEXT: The property at 413 E Mistletoe Ave is a one-story, single-family Craftsman residence built in 1914 for Fred C. Luna by the West End Lumber Company. It is located in the Tobin Hill neighborhood of City Council District 1. Yvonne M. Gonzales currently owns the property. The initial subdivision of E Mistletoe and E Magnolia avenues, originally called Broad and

1901 S. ALAMO ST, SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78204

210.207.0035 • Fax: 210.207.0199 • info@sapreservation.com • www.sapreservation.com



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

Rural streets, respectively, occurred in 1913 as part of Sarah F Ostrom's Addition, originally purchased by Jeremiah Brown from Sarah F. Ostrom in 1887. E Mistletoe began at McCullough St and ended at Rock Quarry Rd, now N St. Mary's. After the city purchased Rock Quarry Rd from Ostrom, the neighborhood was known as Rock Quarry, and remained so at least until the mid-1990s. Prior to 1914, Lot 11 on which the subject property sits was part of a double lot addressed 239 and 241 Broad St, owned by E and Arthela Tuller. In 1914, the Tullers sold Lot 11 to Fred C. Luna, who contracted the West End Lumber Company to build the subject structure. The Lunas owned and operated the Rock Quarry Meat Market, later listed as Fred Luna Market, located at 1705 Jones Ave. Fred lived on Mistletoe until his death on April 9, 1965; staff was unable to determine Mary's year of death, but Fred's obituary implies she passed before him. Ownership of the property was transferred to the Lunas' daughters in 1974. Quickly after establishing ownership, Sofia E. (Luna) Gomez, Stella M. (Luna) Haynes, and Mildred H. (Luna) Smith deeded ownership of the property to their sister Marie (Luna) Rodriguez. In 2003, Marie deeded the property to her daughter Yvonne Marie Gonzales, the current owner.

- c. SITE CONTEXT: The property at 413 E Mistletoe Ave is a one-story, single-family Craftsman residence built in 1914. It is located in the Tobin Hill neighborhood of City Council District 1. Its block is bounded to the south by E Mistletoe Ave, the west by Carleton Ct, the north by E Magnolia Ave, and the east by Kings Ct followed closely by N St. Mary's St. The neighborhood is surrounded by local historic districts: Monte Vista to the north and west, Tobin Hill and E French Place to the south, and River Road to the east. The north side of E Mistletoe Ave on this block lacks sidewalks, and houses are set about 15 feet back from the right-of-way. The lot is heavily landscaped with old-growth trees and bushes; the front yard is framed by a white wood picket fence with a gravel ribbon drive to the east and a concrete sidewalk leading from a gate in the fence to the front door.
- d. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION: The property has a front-gabled composition-shingle roof with wide eaves; rafter tails are exposed on the rear mass of the house. Clapboard siding covers the house from eaves to grade. The main front mass has a continuous sill line above the battered skirt and below one-over-one wood windows. A number of windows retain their historic six-over-one wood screens. The front porch is set below massive gable with a vent centered below the peak and with tapered columns and pilasters atop a solid knee-height wall. The columns and pilasters have geometric designs at the capital, typical of Craftsman-style homes. The porch decking is wood, but the front steps appear to be poured-in-place concrete. The front door, with side and transom lights and a wood-frame screen door, sits left of center; right of center is an oversized one-over-one wood window with one-over-one sidelights and one-over-one-wood screens. Character defining features of 413 E Mistletoe Ave include its front-facing gable, columns and pilasters with geometric design at the capitals
- e. EVALUATION: In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the 16 criteria listed. Staff evaluated the structure against all 16 criteria and determined that it was consistent with UDC sec. 35-607(b):
 - **3.** Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state, or nation; the house was built for Fred C. and Mary Rodriguez Luna, early Rock Quarry residents who also operated a business in the neighborhood, and remains in the Luna family.
 - 5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials; the structure is an example of the Craftsman style.

1901 S. ALAMO ST, SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78204



- 11. It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States; the property, owned by the same family since it was built, contributes to a pattern of multigenerational ownership of homes in San Antonio.
- 13. It bears an important and significant relationship to other distinctive structures, sites, or areas, either as an important collection of properties or architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to the plan based on architectural, historic or cultural motif; the building is located in the Tobin Hill neighborhood in an area not included in the Tobin Hill local historic district but which has been identified by staff as an eligible local historic district. Were the neighborhood to pursue designation, the home would be considered contributing.
- f. If the HDRC approves the Finding of Historic Significance, then the recommendation for designation is submitted to the zoning commission. The zoning commission will schedule a hearing and then forward its recommendation to the City Council. City Council has the ultimate authority to approve the historic designation zoning overlay.
- g. Per UDC Sec. 35-453, once the commission makes a recommendation for designation, property owners must receive a written approval (a Certificate of Appropriateness) for any exterior work until the City Council makes their final decision.

ATTACHMENTS:

HDRC recommendation HDRC published exhibits Letters of support from Tobin Hill Community Association and Conservation Society of San Antonio