

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

March 04, 2020

HDRC CASE NO: 2020-073
ADDRESS: 1434 W ROSEWOOD AVE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 2763 BLK 68 LOT 4
ZONING: R-4,H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.: 1
DISTRICT: Keystone Park Historic District
APPLICANT: Terry Lowry
OWNER: Jose Castro
TYPE OF WORK: Fenestration modifications, porch modifications, construction of a rear deck
APPLICATION RECEIVED: February 11, 2020
60-DAY REVIEW: April 11, 2020
CASE MANAGER: Stephanie Phillips

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace the existing front porch columns with new 6"x6" wood columns and modify the column location.
2. Relocate three windows on the rear elevation to accommodate new French doors.
3. Remove a side door and infill opening with siding to match the existing in-kind.
4. Construct a rear 10'x 23' deck of pressure-treated cedar.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.
- ii. *Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or stripping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing.
- iii. *Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.
- iv. *Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See *General Paint Type Recommendations* in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information.
- v. *Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Facade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.
- ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.
- iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
- iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.

v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure at 1434 W Rosewood is a 1-story residential structure constructed circa 1925 in the Tudor Revival style. The structure features decorative wood window screens, woodlap siding, two front gables, a stucco side chimney, and recessed front porch. The structure is contributing to the Keystone Park Historic District.
- b. **PORCH COLUMNS** – The applicant has proposed to remove two existing porch columns and install new Ionic columns in a modified placement. The existing columns are non-original to the structure, as they feature an uncommon proportionality, placement, and design compared to the style of the home. The 1911-1951 Sanborn Map indicates that the shed porch overhang in this location was not an original feature; it was likely added sometime after 1951. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, replacement porch elements should be designed to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Based on the non-original nature of the front porch overhang and existing columns, staff finds that new columns are consistent with the Guidelines, but does not find the style of the columns as proposed to be appropriate for the structure. Staff finds that wood columns measuring 6x6” square with square capital and base trim and chamfered corners would be most appropriate.
- c. **FENESTRATION MODIFICATIONS** – The applicant has proposed to remove three windows on the rear elevation and replace them with new French doors. One of the three windows will be relocated on the rear elevation. The applicant has also proposed to enclose a non-original side door with siding. Staff finds the proposal generally consistent and finds that replacement doors should be fully wood and should match the existing opening sizes as closely as possible.
- d. **REAR DECK** – The applicant has proposed to construct a rear deck from cedar to measure approximately 23’ by 10’, or 230 square feet. Staff finds the request eligible for administrative approval.

RECOMMENDATION:

Item 1, Staff recommends approval of the porch column modifications based on finding b with the following stipulations:

- i. That the wood columns be six inch (6”) square with capital and base trim, and feature chamfered corners. The applicant must submit a detail drawing with all relevant dimensions indicated to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Items 2 and 3, Staff recommends approval of the fenestration modifications based on finding c with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant submits a final door specification to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff finds a salvaged wood door or a fully wood new door to be most appropriate.
- ii. That the applicant salvages the windows and door and stores them onsite for reuse, or donates them to a salvage and reuse store.

Item 4, Staff recommends approval of the rear deck based on finding d.























