HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION May 01, 2020

HDRC CASE NO: 2020-130 **419 S HACKBERRY ST ADDRESS: LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 617 BLK 20 LOT N 45 FT OF 27 IDZ-2.HL **ZONING: CITY COUNCIL DIST.:** 2 **Historic Site** LANDMARK: **APPLICANT:** Michael Perez /MP2 Urban Development, LLC Michael Perez /MP2 Urban Development, LLC **OWNER:** Exterior modifications, fenestration modifications, partial demolition, **TYPE OF WORK:** construction of rear addition. **APPLICATION RECEIVED:** March 13, 2020 **60-DAY REVIEW:** May 12, 2020 **CASE MANAGER: Rachel Rettaliata**

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Restore storefront canopy,
- 2. Restore the cast stone pediment,
- 3. Restore the metal cooling tower on the roof,
- 4. Install exterior bi-fold doors,
- 5. Replace the existing window on the southeast elevation,
- 6. Demolish the 42-square-foot attached shed,
- 7. Construct a 193-square-foot rear addition.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.

ii. *Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or striping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing. iii. *Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.

iv. *Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See *General Paint Type Recommendations* in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information.

v. *Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue. B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.

ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.

iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

2. Materials: Masonry and Stucco

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Paint*—Avoid painting historically unpainted surfaces. Exceptions may be made for severely deteriorated material where other consolidation or stabilization methods are not appropriate. When painting is acceptable, utilize a water permeable paint to avoid trapping water within the masonry.

ii. *Clear area*—Keep the area where masonry or stucco meets the ground clear of water, moisture, and vegetation. iii. *Vegetation*—Avoid allowing ivy or other vegetation to grow on masonry or stucco walls, as it may loosen mortar and stucco and increase trapped moisture.

iv. *Cleaning*—Use the gentlest means possible to clean masonry and stucco when needed, as improper cleaning can damage the surface. Avoid the use of any abrasive, strong chemical, sandblasting, or high-pressure cleaning method. B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Patching*—Repair masonry or stucco by patching or replacing it with in-kind materials whenever possible. Utilize similar materials that are compatible with the original in terms of composition, texture, application technique, color, and detail, when in-kind replacement is not possible. EIFS is not an appropriate patching or replacement material for stucco.

ii. *Repointing*—The removal of old or deteriorated mortar should be done carefully by a professional to ensure that masonry units are not damaged in the process. Use mortar that matches the original in color, profile, and composition when repointing. Incompatible mortar can exceed the strength of historic masonry and results in deterioration. Ensure that the new joint matches the profile of the old joint when viewed in section. It is recommended that a test panel is prepared to ensure the mortar is the right strength and color.

iii. *Removing paint*—Take care when removing paint from masonry as the paint may be providing a protectant layer or hiding modifications to the building. Use the gentlest means possible, such as alkaline poultice cleaners and strippers, to remove paint from masonry.

iv. *Removing stucco*—Remove stucco from masonry surfaces where it is historically inappropriate. Prepare a test panel to ensure that underlying masonry has not been irreversibly damaged before proceeding.

3. Materials: Roofs

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Regular maintenance and cleaning*—Avoid the build-up of accumulated dirt and retained moisture. This can lead to the growth of moss and other vegetation, which can lead to roof damage. Check roof surface for breaks or holes and flashing for open seams and repair as needed.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Roof replacement*—Consider roof replacement when more than 25-30 percent of the roof area is damaged or 25-30 percent of the roof tiles (slate, clay tile, or cement) or shingles are missing or damaged.

ii. *Roof form*—Preserve the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs when replacement is necessary. iii. *Roof features*—Preserve and repair distinctive roof features such as cornices, parapets, dormers, open eaves with exposed rafters and decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, and brackets with shaped ends. iv. *Materials: sloped roofs*—Replace roofing materials in-kind whenever possible when the roof must be replaced. Retain and re-use historic materials when large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required (e.g., slate or clay tiles). Salvaged materials should be re-used on roof forms that are most visible from the public right-of-way. Match new roofing materials to the original materials in terms of their scale, color, texture, profile, and style, or select materials consistent with the building style, when in-kind replacement is not possible. v. *Materials: flat roofs*—Allow use of contemporary roofing materials on flat or gently sloping roofs not visible from the public right-of-way.

vi. *Materials: metal roofs*—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof. vii. *Roof vents*—Maintain existing historic roof vents. When deteriorated beyond repair, replace roof vents in-kind or with one similar in design and material to those historically used when in-kind replacement is not possible.

4. Materials: Metal

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Cleaning*—Use the gentlest means possible when cleaning metal features to avoid damaging the historic finish. Prepare a test panel to determine appropriate cleaning methods before proceeding. Use a wire brush to remove corrosion or paint build up on hard metals like wrought iron, steel, and cast iron.

ii. *Repair*—Repair metal features using methods appropriate to the specific type of metal.

iii. *Paint*—Avoid painting metals that were historically exposed such as copper and bronze.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

Replacement—Replace missing or significantly damaged metal features in-kind or with a substitute compatible in size, form, material, and general appearance to the historical feature when in-kind replacement is not possible. *Rust*—Select replacement anchors of stainless steel to limit rust and associated expansion that can cause cracking of the surrounding material such as wood or masonry. Insert anchors into the mortar joints of masonry buildings. *New metal features*—Add metal features based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. Base the design on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns if no such evidence exists.

5. Architectural Features: Lighting

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Lighting*—Preserve historic light fixtures in place and maintain through regular cleaning and repair as needed. B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Rewiring*—Consider rewiring historic fixtures as necessary to extend their lifespan.

ii. *Replacement lighting*—Replace missing or severely damaged historic light fixtures in-kind or with fixtures that match the original in appearance and materials when in-kind replacement is not feasible. Fit replacement fixtures to the existing mounting location.

iii. *New light fixtures*—Avoid damage to the historic building when installing necessary new light fixtures, ensuring they may be removed in the future with little or no damage to the building. Place new light fixtures and those not historically present in locations that do not distract from the façade of the building while still directing light where needed. New light fixtures should be unobtrusive in design and should not rust or stain the building.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. Doors-Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

iv. Screens and shutters-Preserve historic window screens and shutters.

v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

viii. Security bars—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.

ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.

ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing. iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.

ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.

iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.

iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.

v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

8. Architectural Features: Foundations

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Details*—Preserve the height, proportion, exposure, form, and details of a foundation such as decorative vents, grilles, and lattice work.

ii. *Ventilation*—Ensure foundations are vented to control moisture underneath the dwelling, preventing deterioration. iii. *Drainage*—Ensure downspouts are directed away and soil is sloped away from the foundation to avoid moisture collection near the foundation.

iv. *Repair*—Inspect foundations regularly for sufficient drainage and ventilation, keeping it clear of vegetation. Also inspect for deteriorated materials such as limestone and repair accordingly. Refer to maintenance and alteration of applicable materials, for additional guidelines.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Replacement features*—Ensure that features such as decorative vents and grilles and lattice panels are replaced in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not possible, use features matching in size, material, and design. Replacement skirting should consist of durable, proven materials, and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact.

ii. Alternative materials—Cedar piers may be replaced with concrete piers if they are deteriorated beyond repair.

iii. Shoring—Provide proper support of the structure while the foundation is rebuilt or repaired.

iv. *New utilities*—Avoid placing new utility and mechanical connections through the foundation along the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

9. Outbuildings, Including Garages

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. Existing outbuildings—Preserve existing historic outbuildings where they remain.

ii. *Materials*—Repair outbuildings and their distinctive features in-kind. When new materials are needed, they should match existing materials in color, durability, and texture. Refer to maintenance and alteration of applicable materials above, for additional guidelines.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Garage doors*—Ensure that replacement garage doors are compatible with those found on historic garages in the district (e.g., wood paneled) as well as with the principal structure. When not visible from the public right-of-way, modern paneled garage doors may be acceptable.

ii. *Replacement*—Replace historic outbuildings only if they are beyond repair. In-kind replacement is preferred; however, when it is not possible, ensure that they are reconstructed in the same location using similar scale, proportion, color, and materials as the original historic structure.

iii. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct outbuildings based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the primary building and historic patterns in the district. Add permanent foundations to existing outbuildings where foundations did not historically exist only as a last resort.

10. Commercial Facades

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Character-defining features*—Preserve character-defining features such as cornice molding, upper-story windows, transoms, display windows, kickplates, entryways, tiled paving at entryways, parapet walls, bulkheads, and other features that contribute to the character of the building.

ii. *Windows and doors*—Use clear glass in display windows. See Guidelines for Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens for additional guidance.

iii. *Missing features*—Replace missing features in-kind based on evidence such as photographs, or match the style of the building and the period in which it was designed.

iv. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials or materials appropriate to the time period of the original commercial facade when making repairs.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *New features*—Do not introduce new facade elements that alter or destroy the historic building character, such as adding inappropriate materials; altering the size or shape of windows, doors, bulkheads, and transom openings; or altering the façade from commercial to residential. Alterations should not disrupt the rhythm of the commercial block. ii. *Historical commercial facades*—Return non-historic facades to the original design based on photographic evidence. Keep in mind that some non-original facades may have gained historic importance and should be retained. When evidence is not available, ensure the scale, design, materials, color, and texture is compatible with the historic building. Consider the features of the design holistically so as to not include elements from multiple buildings and styles.

11. Canopies and Awnings

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Existing canopies and awnings*—Preserve existing historic awnings and canopies through regular cleaning and periodic inspections of the support system to ensure they are secure.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. Replacement canopies and awnings-Replace canopies and awnings in-kind whenever possible.

ii. *New canopies and awnings*—Add canopies and awnings based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design of new canopies and awnings should be based on the architectural style of the building and be proportionate in shape and size to the scale of the building façade to which they will be attached. See UDC Section 35-609(j).

iii. *Lighting*—Do not internally illuminate awnings; however, lighting may be concealed in an awning to provide illumination to sidewalks or storefronts.

iv. *Awning materials*—Use fire-resistant canvas awnings that are striped or solid in a color that is appropriate to the period of the building.

v. *Building features*—Avoid obscuring building features such as arched transom windows with new canopies or awnings.

vi. *Support structure*—Support awnings with metal or wood frames, matching the historic support system whenever possible. Minimize damage to historic materials when anchoring the support system. For example, anchors should be inserted into mortar rather than brick. Ensure that the support structure is integrated into the structure of the building as to avoid stress on the structural stability of the façade.

12. Increasing Energy Efficiency

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Historic elements*—Preserve elements of historic buildings that are energy efficient including awnings, porches, recessed entryways, overhangs, operable windows, and shutters.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. Weatherization—Apply caulking and weather stripping to historic windows and doors to make them weather tight.

ii. *Thermal performance*—Improve thermal performance of windows, fanlights, and sidelights by applying UV film or new glazing that reduces heat gain from sunlight on south and west facing facades only if the historic character can be maintained. Do not use reflective or tinted films.

iii. *Windows*— Restore original windows to working order. Install compatible and energy-efficient replacement windows when existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Replacement windows must match the appearance, materials, size, design, proportion, and profile of the original historic windows.

iv. *Reopening*—Consider reopening an original opening that is presently blocked to add natural light and ventilation. v. *Insulation*—Insulate unfinished spaces with appropriate insulation ensuring proper ventilation, such as attics, basements, and crawl spaces.

vi. *Shutters*—Reinstall functional shutters and awnings with elements similar in size and character where they existed historically.

vii. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. viii. *Cool roofs*—Do not install white or —cooll roofs when visible from the public right-of-way. White roofs are permitted on flat roofs and must be concealed with a parapet.

ix. *Roof vents*—Add roof vents for ventilation of attic heat. Locate new roof vents on rear roof pitches, out of view of the public right-of-way.

x. Green Roofs—Install green roofs when they are appropriate for historic commercial structures.

Standard Specifications for Original Wood Window Replacement

- SCOPE OF REPAIR: When individual elements such as sills, muntins, rails, sashes, or glazing has deteriorated, every effort should be made to repair or reconstruct that individual element prior to consideration of wholesale replacement. For instance, applicant should replace individual sashes within the window system in lieu of full replacement with a new window unit.
- MISSING OR PREVIOUSLY-REPLACED WINDOWS: Where original windows are found to be missing
 or previously-replaced with a nonconforming window product by a previous owner, an alternative material
 to wood may be considered when the proposed replacement product is more consistent with the Historic
 Design Guidelines in terms of overall appearance. Such determination shall be made on a case-by-case
 basis by OHP and/or the HDRC. Whole window systems should match the size of historic windows on
 property unless otherwise approved.
- MATERIAL: If full window replacement is approved, the new windows must feature primed and painted wood exterior finish. Clad, composition, or non-wood options are not allowed unless explicitly approved by the commission.
- SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25". Top and bottom sashes must be equal in size unless otherwise approved.
- DEPTH: There should be a minimum of 2" in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.
- TRIM: Original trim details and sills should be retained or repaired in kind. If approved, new window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- GLAZING: Replacement windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- COLOR: Replacement windows should feature a painted finished. If a clad product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- INSTALLATION: Replacement windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation.

For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would beinappropriate.
ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.

iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.
B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.

ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.

iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.

v. Height—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

2. Massing and Form of Non-Residential and Mixed-Use Additions

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, additions should not fundamentally alter the scale and character of the block when viewed from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Preferred location*—Place additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize the visual impact on the original structure from the public right of way. An addition to the front of a building is inappropriate. iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, and orientation as the principal structure for additions, particularly for those that are visible from the public right-of-way.

iv. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design additions to historic buildings to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.

v. *Transitions between old and new*—Distinguish additions as new without distracting from the original structure. For example, rooftop additions should be appropriately set back to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. For side or rear additions utilize setbacks, a small change in detailing, or a recessed area at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

i. *Height*—Limit the height of side or rear additions to the height of the original structure. Limit the height of rooftop additions to no more than 40 percent of the height of original structure.

ii. *Total addition footprint*—New additions should never result in the doubling of the historic building footprint. Full-floor rooftop additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

3. Materials and Textures A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider characterdefining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

5. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, cable lines, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Where service areas cannot be located at the rear of the property, compatible screens or buffers will berequired. B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

6. Designing for Energy Efficiency

A. BUILDING DESIGN

i. *Energy efficiency*—Design additions and new construction to maximize energy efficiency.

ii. *Materials*—Utilize green building materials, such as recycled, locally-sourced, and low maintenance materials whenever possible.

iii. *Building elements*—Incorporate building features that allow for natural environmental control – such as operable windows for cross ventilation.

iv. *Roof slopes*—Orient roof slopes to maximize solar access for the installation of future solar collectors where compatible with typical roof slopes and orientations found in the surrounding historic district. B. SITE DESIGN i. *Building orientation*—Orient new buildings and additions with consideration for solar and wind exposure in all seasons to the extent possible within the context of the surrounding district.

ii. *Solar access*—Avoid or minimize the impact of new construction on solar access for adjoining properties. C. SOLAR COLLECTORS

i. *Location*—Locate solar collectors on side or rear roof pitch of the primary historic structure to the maximum extent feasible to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way while maximizing solar access. Alternatively, locate solar collectors on a garage or outbuilding or consider a ground-mount system where solar access to the primary structure is limited.

ii. *Mounting (sloped roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a sloped roof. Select collectors that are similar in color to the roof surface to reduce visibility.

iii. *Mounting (flat roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a flat roof to the maximum extent feasible. Where solar access limitations preclude a flush mount, locate panels towards the rear of the roof where visibility from the public right-of-way will be minimized.

Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions and New Construction

- GENERAL: New windows on additions should relate to the windows of the primary historic structure in terms of materiality and overall appearance. Windows used in new construction should be similar in appearance to those commonly found within the district in terms of size, profile, and configuration. While no material is expressly prohibited by the Historic Design Guidelines, a high-quality wood or aluminum-clad wood window product often meets the Guidelines with the stipulations listed below. Whole window systems should match the size of historic windows on property unless otherwise approved.
- o SIZE: Windows should feature traditional dimensions and proportions as found within the district.
- SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25". Top and bottom sashes must be equal in size unless otherwise approved.
- DEPTH: There should be a minimum of 2" in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash.
- This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.
- TRIM: Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- GLAZING: Windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- COLOR: Wood windows should feature a painted finished. If a clad product is approved, white ormetallic manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- INSTALLATION: Wood windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation. For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

FINDINGS:

- a. The structure at 419 S Hackberry is a 1-story Spanish Eclectic commercial structure constructed circa 1927 as an ice house. It is located in the Alamodome Gardens neighborhood of District 2. The structure is situated at the southwest corner of S Hackberry and Dashiell, previously the location of a residence addressed at 232 Dashiell between 1910 and 1920. The ice house at 419 S Hackberry is designated as an individual landmark.
- b. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL The applicant has proposed to restore the red barrel tile roof, restore the storefront canopy and existing wrought iron brackets, and restore the cast stone pediment featuring the word "ICE," and restore the existing metal cooling tower on the roof. The scope of the restoration work is eligible for administrative approval and it is not necessary for the Historic and Design Review Committee (HDRC) to review this scope of work.
- c. DOOR INSTALLATION The applicant has proposed to install exterior accordion-style bi-fold aluminum bronze doors on the front façade. Photos of the ice house from 2010 show previously existing bi-fold doors

installed on the front façade. The front façade currently features a faux divided lite French door and a large fixed window framed in Hardie board siding. The current fenestration pattern on the front façade facing S Hackberry is not original to the structure and is inappropriate. Guideline 10.B.ii for Exterior Maintenance and Repairs stipulates that for historic commercial facades, non-historic elements should be returned to the original design based on photographic evidence. When evidence is not available, ensure that scale, design, materials, color, and texture is compatible with the historic building. Consider the features of the design holistically so as to not include elements from multiple buildings and styles. While fenestration pattern featured in the 2010 photographs was likely not original to the structure, staff finds that the fenestration pattern existing in 2010 and the fenestration pattern proposed by the applicant is more appropriate to the period and style of the structure. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.

- d. WINDOW REPLACEMENT The applicant has proposed to install a new aluminum Ply-Gem window in bronze in the existing window opening on the southeast façade facing S Hackberry. The window opening is currently boarded and an existing window in currently not present. Guideline 6.B.iv for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations states that new windows should be installed to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.
- e. DEMOLITION: EXISTING REAR ADDITION The applicant has proposed to demolish the 42-square-foot attached wooden shed on the rear of the existing structure that once served as the restroom for the main structure. The existing 42-square-foot addition does not appear on the 1951 Sanborn map and is not original to the structure. The existing rear addition is in poor condition, is deteriorated beyond repair, and is not an historic element. Guideline 7.B.iii for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations states that features may be replaced when they are found to be deteriorated beyond repair. The applicant has proposed to replace the removed existing rear addition with a 193-square-foot addition. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.
- f. ADDITION: FOOTPRINT The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. The proposed addition will replace an existing, non-historic 42-square-foot addition that is not original to the structure and is deteriorated beyond repair. Guideline 2.B.ii for Additions states that new additions should never result in the doubling of the historic building footprint. The existing structure is 679 square feet. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.
- g. ADDITION: SCALE & MASS The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. Guideline 2.B.i for Additions states that the height of side or rear additions should be limited to the height of the original structure. The applicant has proposed that the rear addition meet the height of the original structure and continue the roof form, with a shorter rear extension. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.
- h. ADDITION: ROOF The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. The proposed roof will be flat with a red barrel tile roof parapet to match existing. Guideline 2.A.iii for Additions states that additions to non-residential structures should utilize a similar roof pitch, form, and orientation as the principal structure, particularly for those additions that are visible from the public right-of-way. Guideline 3.A.iii for Additions stipulates that the roof of additions should match the original in terms of form and materials. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.
- i. ADDITION: MATERIALS The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. The addition will be of wood-frame construction on a pier and beam foundation. The addition will be clad in stucco siding to match the texture and material of the existing building and will match the existing structure in color. Guideline 3.A.i for Additions stipulates that additions should use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. The applicant has expressed the intent to match the proposed addition to the original structure in material, color, and texture. Staff finds the proposal generally consistent with the Guidelines and suggests that the applicant explore treatments to provide a visual distinction between the old and new building forms.
- j. ADDITION: FENESTRATION The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. The addition will feature solid white exterior doors with a transom window above the door for natural light. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.
- k. ADDITION: ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. Guideline 4.A.i for Additions states that applicants should Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character-defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings. The

applicant has proposed to incorporate the red clay barrel tile roof parapets and stucco finish of the historic structure on the addition. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.

1. ADDITION: MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT – The applicant has proposed to construct a 193-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure. The HVAC mechanical equipment will be located on the roof of the addition. Guideline 5.A.i for Additions states that mechanical equipment should not be in locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way. Guideline 5.B.iii states that roof-mounted equipment should be screened and set back on the roof to avoid view from the public right-of-way. Staff finds the proposal consistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Item 1, staff recommends approval of the request to install exterior bi-fold doors on the front façade based on finding c with the following stipulation:

i. That the applicant submit final material specifications to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Item 2, staff recommends approval of the request to install a new aluminum Ply-Gem bronze window on the southeast elevation based on finding d with the following stipulation:

i. That there should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. The final material specifications should be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Item 3, staff recommends approval of the request to demolish the existing 42-square-foot attached shed at the rear of the structure based on finding e.

Item 4, staff recommends approval of the request to construct a 193-square-foot addition at the rear of the structure based on findings f through l with the following stipulation:

i. That the applicant submit final window and door specifications to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

City of San Antonio One Stop



March 31, 2020

		1:2,000	
0	0.015	0.03	0.06 mi
-			
0	0.0275	0.055	0.11 km

User drawn lines



Imagery ©2020 Google, Imagery ©2020 Maxar Technologies, Map data ©2020 20 ft













. . . .



DASHIELL STREET



ഗ

 \neg



DASHIELL STREET

SITE PLAN KEY NOTES

- I) EXISTING BUILDING TO REMAIN
- 2 EXISTING CONCRETE WALK TO REMAIN
- 3 EXISTING CONCRETE APRON TO REMAIN
- (4) NEW CONCRETE PATIO
- 5 NEW CONCRETE WALK
- 6 CRUSHED GRANITE WALK
- (7) EXISTING 4" WOOD FENCE TO REMAIN
- B EXISTING 4" WOOD GATE TO BE MOVED Project managment
- (9) BELOW GRADE GREASE TRAP
- (10) WALK IN COOLER
- (II) I.5" CALIPER CRAPE MYRTLE
- (12) 1.5" CALIPER MONTEREY OAK
- (B) COMMON BERMUDA SOD
- (14) PARKING SPACE



1016 State Highway 46 East Boerne, Texas 78006 www.aparchitects.weebly.com 210.986.0218

Alvin G. Peters, Architect #15199

AP Architects, All Rights Reserved. This drawing and its reproductions are the property of AP Architects and may not be reproduced, published, or used in any way without the written permission of AP Architects.



03.11.2020



The Ice House Renovation Addition

419 S. Hackberry St. San Antonio, TX design phase

PROJECT DATE: SHEET:	No:		0

RE∨ISIDNS:

2020.026 03.11.2020 of

DATE

HDRC





NORTH 03 landscape plan SCALE: 1/8" = 1'- 0"



s. hackberry elevation



dashiell elevation SCALE: N.T.S.















419 S. Hackberry (232 Dashiell Street) Former Ice House











HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

August 17, 2016 Agenda Item No: 22

HDRC CASE NO: ADDRESS: CITY COUNCIL DIST.: APPLICANT: OWNER:	2016-332 227 ARANSAS 227 BROADWAY 604 CAROLINA 850 W CINCINNATI 1509 CLARK 1502 E COMMERCE 3126 S FLORES 5314 S FLORES 5314 S FLORES 6010 S FLORES 6010 S FLORES 6010 S FLORES 202 FREDERICKSBURG 820 FREDERICKSBURG 820 FREDERICKSBUG 103 FRIO CITY RD 419 S HACKBERRY 2353 E HOUSTON 1502 MCCULLOUGH 1903 MCCULLOUGH 1903 MCCULLOUGH 203 N NEW BRAUNFELS 2418 S PRESA 3920 S PRESA 550 RUIZ 2334 N ST MARY'S 3011 N ST MARY'S 301 VINE 1001 S ZARZAMORA 1, 2, 3, 5 Office of Historic Preservation Various
TYPE OF WORK:	Finding of Historic Significance

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Finding of Historic Significance for 34 properties that were surveyed as part of the Gas Station Resource Survey and identified as architecturally, historically and culturally significant.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

UDC Section 35-607 – Designation Criteria for Historic Districts and Landmarks:

a. Process for Considering Designation of Historic Districts and Landmarks. Historic districts and landmarks shall be evaluated for designation using the criteria listed in subsection (b) and the criteria applied to evaluate properties for inclusion in the National Register. In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the criteria listed. Historic districts shall consist of at least two (2) or more structures within a legally defined boundary that meet at least three (3) of the criteria. Additionally, all designated landmarks and districts shall demonstrate clear delineation of the legal boundaries of such designated resources. b. Criteria for Evaluation.

Its value as a visible or archaeological reminder of the cultural heritage of the community, or a national event;
 Its historical, architectural or cultural character as a particularly fine or unique example of a utilitarian structure, including but not limited to, bridges, acequias, gas stations, transportation shelters, or other commercial structures;

7. Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature;

8. Its historical, architectural, or cultural integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship;

11. It is distinctive in character, interest or value; strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of San Antonio, Texas or the United States;

FINDINGS:

- a. These eligible properties were identified through a comprehensive survey of historic gas stations undertaken in 1983 by the San Antonio Conservation Society that was updated and expanded beginning in 2012. In addition to producing documentation about hundreds of historic gas stations located in San Antonio, the organization published an online portal allowing public access to the survey results. Volunteers reviewed the properties to identify those potentially eligible for landmark designation.
- b. On May 3, 2016, the Office of Historic Preservation and San Antonio Conservation Society co-hosted an event called "San Antonio or Bust: Historic Landscapes of the American Road Trip" at Deco Pizzeria, a historic gas station and local landmark on Fredericksburg Road. The Preservation Month event celebrated the rich collection of local roadside architecture by asking guests to share their thoughts and stories about the properties.
- c. Consistent with the UDC sec. 35-607(b)(1), these properties are a reminder of the cultural heritage of San Antonio as a crossroads for many historic routes such as the Old Spanish Trail and the Meridian Highway.
- d. Consistent with the UDC sec. 35-607(b)(6), these utilitarian structures maintain their historic, architectural, and cultural character as pervasive vernacular building types.
- e. Consistent with the UDC sec. 35-607(b)(7), the locations and physical characteristics of these gas stations are significant. Placed strategically along popular thoroughfares into downtown San Antonio, these properties trace the history of transportation in the early twentieth century prior to the arrival of the interstate system. Their physical characteristics reflect the brands of oil companies, many of which were first established in Texas.
- f. Consistent with the UDC sec. 35-607(b)(8), the properties maintain a high level of historical, architectural, and cultural integrity related to their locations along historic roadways, original designs reflecting oil company brands, and authentic materials and decorative features including brick, wood, tile, and stucco.
- g. Consistent with the UDC sec. 35-607(b)(11), gas stations exemplify the economic heritage of the oil industry that played an important role in the economic growth of the state in the early twentieth century. They also represent a societal shift from older transportation methods to a reliance on personal automobiles. Finally, these properties document San Antonio's role as a destination city included on several historic cross-country routes.
- h. Historic landmarks possess cultural and historical value and contribute to the overall quality and character of the City. The City offers a tax incentive for the substantial rehabilitation of historic properties. If historic designation is approved, rehabilitation and restoration work may be eligible for this incentive.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of a Finding of Historic Significance for the 34 properties specified above.

CASE MANAGER:

Lauren Sage











419 S Hackberry					
	DN James Gas Station c. 1924 Modern Use: vacant Stucco with flat tile roof, this Spanish Eclectic station has no canopy and its original windows and doors have been removed.				
2353 E Houston					
	Magnolia Petroleum Co. Station No. 1053 c. 1931 Modern Use: vacant This craftsman style filling station was operated under the Magnolia Petroleum Company. Distinguishing features include square columns, original picture windows with transoms, and flat tile roof.				
1502 McCullough					
	Humble Oil Station c. 1931 Modern use: La Morenita This filling station opeated under the Humble brand through the 1960s. Canopy supports are tapered, likely modified from the original piers. The interior, however, still has a number of original details intact, including the mirror and tile on the bathroom floor and walls.				





550 Ruiz



2334 N St. Mary's

Reserved and the second and the seco

3502 N St. Mary's



Modern Use: PikNik Foods & Gas Station

Lighting Service Station c. 1929

Colonial Revival station still in use with original sign post extant. Brick supports for the flat roofed canopy have decorative cornice below roofline.

Gulf Oil Station c. 1931

Modern use: Hot Spot BBQ

Several of the restaurants along the St. Mary's Strip are former gas stations. This structure was a Gulf Refining Co. filling station, but has lived many lives including as a plant orphanage in the 1980s.

Boug Brothers No. 1 c. 1926 Modern Use: Pugel's This stucco station boasts a brown barrel tile roof with exposed rafters under the canopy and a tower. Decorative blue floral tile can be found on the base of the square columns and the main building, and surrounding the entryway. For many years it was home to Snow White Cleaners & Tailors, but today you can buy hot dogs and craft beer at Pugel's.



This small brick box has no canopy but features a hipped barrel tile roof and unique statue of Our Lady of Guadalupe suspended in the center of the front façade.