

**ECONOMIC AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT
COUNCIL COMMITTEE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MARCH 3, 2020
2:00 PM
MUNICIPAL PLAZA BUILDING**

Members Present:	Councilmember Rebecca Viagran, <i>Chair, District 3</i> Councilmember Shirley Gonzales, <i>District 5</i> Councilmember Melissa Cabello Havrda, <i>District 6</i> Councilmember Manny Peláez, <i>District 8</i> Councilmember John Courage, <i>District 9</i>
Staff Present:	Carlos J. Contreras, III, <i>Assistant City Manager</i> ; Dr. Colleen Bridger, <i>Assistant City Manager</i> ; Katinka Howell, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Ben Gorzell, <i>Chief Financial Officer</i> ; Lori Steward, <i>Director, Human Resources</i> ; Alejandra Lopez, <i>Director, Economic Development Department</i> ; Melody Woosley, <i>Director, Human Services</i> ; Michael Sindon, <i>Assistant Director, Economic Development Department</i> ; Patrick Steck, <i>Interim Assistant Director, Department of Human Services</i> ; Shuchi Nagpal, <i>Interim Assistant Director, Economic Development Department</i> ; Jenny Hixon, <i>Violence Prevention Manager, Metro Health</i> ; Nancy Cano, <i>Office of the City Clerk</i>
Others Present:	Lily Casura, <i>Director of Equity, YWCA</i>

Call to Order

Chairwoman Viagran called the meeting to order.

1. Approval of the minutes from the Economic and Workforce Development Committee meeting on February 11, 2020.

Councilmember Cabello Havrda moved to approve the Minutes of the February 11, 2020 Economic and Workforce Development Committee Meeting. Councilmember Peláez seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

2. Approval of the minutes from the Special Economic and Workforce Development Committee meeting on February 26, 2020.

Councilmember Cabello Havrda moved to approve the Minutes of the February 26, 2020 Special Economic and Workforce Development Committee Meeting. Councilmember Peláez seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

3. **Briefing on the progress made on the Status of Women Report** [Carlos J. Contreras, III, Assistant City Manager; Alejandra Lopez, Director]

Jenny Hixon stated that the Status of Women Report was released in May 2019 and she reported on progress the City made in addressing specific initiatives within four categories:

1. **Overview of Health and Well-Being Category:** The infant mortality rate was higher in Bexar County than Travis, Dallas and Harris Counties. There were major racial disparities in mortality from heart disease, liver disease, cancer and stroke. Women in the highest income quartile had a life-expectancy of more than five years longer than women in the bottom income quartile.

New initiatives developed for the Health and Well-Being Category: Healthy Families Network Strategic Plan, Healthy Start Dad's Program, and South Trauma Informed Care Consortium.

2. **Overview of Violence and Safety Category:** The number of women murdered by male intimate partners tripled between 2012 and 2017. San Antonio consistently has a higher rape rate than Texas overall. San Antonio has the highest rape rate when compared to Austin, Dallas and Houston. The homicide rate of women in Bexar County doubled between 2012 and 2017.

New initiatives developed for the Violence and Safety Category: Collaborative Commission on Domestic Violence, Love Is . . . Domestic Violence Communications Campaign, Too Good for Violence School Based Violence Prevention, Trauma Informed Teaching Cohort, Pilot project at apartment complex in District 5.

3. **Overview of Political Participation Category – Boards and Commissions:** 44% of Committee Members across 81 San Antonio Boards and Commissions were women. Majority of City Councilmembers were women. 73% of Department of Human Services (DHS) Committee positions were held by women. DHS included coverage for childcare and travel support for Committee Members; and 60% of Small Business Advocacy Committee (SBAC) and 100% Diversity Action Plan Committee (DAP) were women.

Ms. Nagpal provided a status update on the progress made by the City in the category of Economic Opportunities.

4. **Overview of Economic Opportunities Category:** Women represent 47% of San Antonio workforce. At any given education level, median earnings of men were higher than women. Women were less likely than men to be employed (63% vs. 88%). Women were more likely than men to live in poverty (16% vs. 10%). Women experienced significant disparities by race/ethnicity in the high-school dropout rate, median earnings, and home ownership.

New initiatives developed for the Economic Opportunities Category: In FY 2020, EDD would apply subcontracting goals specifically for Women-Owned Businesses; FY 2021 and

FY 2022 Requests for Proposals (RFP) would request information from non-profit agencies regarding gender pay parity and gender awareness training policies and would prioritize services for women of color

Councilmember Gonzales requested data on the Cassiano Homes Pilot Project. Ms. Hixon replied that preliminary findings demonstrated the need for more awareness of available resources. She added that local ministries were able to identify targeted, specific goals, rather than focus on higher level risk factors.

Councilmember Peláez noted that 47% of residents were renters and that women make up 47% of the San Antonio workforce. He requested comparison data between renters and homeowners in the areas of poverty, education, domestic violence, and public participation to better inform targeted outreach and investment efforts.

4. Briefing and possible action on Gender Pay Parity for the City of San Antonio
[Carlos J. Contreras III, Assistant City Manager; Alejandra Lopez, Director, Economic Development Department]

Alejandra Lopez reported that in November 2018, the City of San Antonio unanimously approved a Resolution on Women's Equity which reaffirmed the commitment of the City to improve the status of women. She stated that a report on the status of women indicated that women in San Antonio were less likely than men to drop out of high school and were more likely to complete a bachelor's degree; she noted that such educational gains did not close the earnings gap between men and women. She added that women without high school diplomas, with bachelor's degrees, and with graduate or professional degrees earned 64 cents, 81 cents, and 72 cents, respectively, for every dollar earned by men and earning disparities were further compounded when race and ethnicity were considered.

Ms. Lopez explained that gender pay parity was a multi-faceted issue that involved more than equal pay for equal work, with a number of factors that contributed to men earning more than women, even when education and expertise, marital status and parental status were all controlled. She stated that job or industry choices were a factor, with male dominated occupations earning higher wages than female dominated occupations and where new employee salary was based on earning history.

Recommendations: FY 2021 and FY 2022 RFPs would request information from non-profit organizations regarding gender pay parity and gender awareness training. RFPs would prioritize services for women of color that promote economic mobility and independence. Gender wage parity best practices would be included in the FY 2020 Tax Abatement Policy Program update.

Lori Steward presented an overview of the City's gender pay equity best practices and an update to the City's 2013 Compensation Report.

City Compensation Best Practices:

- Salary Administration Guidelines: Standardized criteria for compensation
- Compensation transparency: Online posting of total compensation reporting
- All salary preference and past salary history questions were removed from employment applications
- Human Resources Department regularly conducts in depth individual analysis for salary adjustment and exceptional hire requests

City Focused Recruiting & Development: Women's Leadership Mentoring Program: 216 participants; 68.9% retained with City, 47.3% promoted; Management Fellowship Program: 29 Fellows to date, 60% female; targeted outreach to women in non-traditional and hard to fill positions.

City Employee Demographics:

- Full-time Uniformed Employees: Male: 68%; Female: 32% (2013: 28%)
- Executive Uniformed Employees: Male: 92%; Female: 8% (2013: 7%)
- Full-time Civilian Employees: Male: 55%; Female: 45% (2013: 42%)
- Executive Civilian Employees: Male: 52%; Female: 48% (2013: 37%)

Ms. Steward reported that the average male and female salaries in each pay range were calculated and further evaluated where the average female salary was lower than the overall average salary by more than 2%. She identified seven pay ranges where the average male salary was lower than the average female salary. Ms. Steward noted that the combined total average of all 38 City pay ranges reviewed showed that females made an average of \$1,000 more in base pay than males. She stated that the review found compliance with salary administration guidelines, and differences in salary were the result of factors other than gender.

Ms. Steward presented the following performance evaluation statistics: 1) The average female score for the City's Step Pay Plan was 2.28 and the male average score was 2.20; and 2) The average female score for the City's Performance Pay Plan was 2.78 and the male average score was 2.76.

Chairwoman Viagran requested employee data analysis for CPS Energy and SAWS. Ms. Steward replied that SAWS would update its 2014 study, but CPS Energy reported that it had not conducted a pay parity analysis.

Councilmember Cabello Havrda requested employee data analysis by department. Carlos Contreras replied that it would be provided but that it would take some time to glean and process data as it was categorized in accordance with the City's Step Pay Plan.

Councilmember Courage expressed concern that a true differential between the salaries of men and women was not properly reflected. He requested data that reflected direct representation of women and men's salaries, and not data compared as an overall average. Ms. Steward replied that data generated was based on statistical best practices of comparing the two distinct groups (female and male) to a common factor (the overall pay average for that job range), and not directly to each other.

Chairwoman Viagran requested that staff provide outreach to Lift Fund, a local non-profit small business lender, to request increases in loans made to women-owned businesses. She requested that collaborative target goals and initiatives for the issues of domestic violence, gender pay parity, and public safety recruitment strategies for gender equity be presented to the Public Safety Committee.

5. Briefing on the findings and recommendations provided in the report "Status of Poverty in San Antonio" [Carlos J. Contreras III, Assistant City Manager; Alejandra Lopez, Director, Economic Development]

Melody Woosley reported that the U.S. Census Bureau released 2018 American Community Survey one-year estimate data which ranked San Antonio as having the highest poverty rate among the 25 most populous metropolitan areas. She stated that the Department of Human Services and Metro Health collaborated to develop the Status of Poverty Report (SPR) which was released in December 2019 as follows:

Overview of Poverty in San Antonio: Nearly 20% of San Antonio residents live in poverty with the poverty rate higher for Hispanics and African Americans. 54% of San Antonio households living in poverty were female and a higher percentage of San Antonio residents were women, compared to Texas and the US. The City invests approximately \$454 million to reduce barriers to socioeconomic mobility.

Educational Attainment in San Antonio: 18% of San Antonio residents do not have a high school diploma and only 16% of Hispanics and 25% of African Americans in Bexar County have a Bachelor's Degree. A lower average educational attainment was reported in the west, south, and east areas of the City of San Antonio.

Employment and Income: Over 25% of workers in the San Antonio-New Braunfels area have occupations with median wages less than \$25,000. The median household income in San Antonio was lower, and poverty rates higher, than in Bexar County, Texas, and the U.S.

Wealth, Assets, and Financial Health in San Antonio: San Antonians have low median credit scores, high delinquent debt, and limited savings. Median credit score of residents in predominately non-White zip codes was lower (615) than in predominately White zip codes (721). 35% of predominately non-White zip codes had medical debt in collection status, compared to 18% of predominately White zip codes. The medical debt gap between Whites and Non-Whites was larger in Bexar County than in Texas and the U.S. overall.

Small Business/Entrepreneurship: States with a larger share of entrepreneurs had larger declines in poverty. Disparities in business formation and retention rates were related to those that exist for poverty, education, income, and wealth in San Antonio. Minority-owned firms were less likely to receive loans as compared to non-minority-owned firms; and only 22% of business in the San Antonio-New Braunfels area were women-owned.

Employment Investments - \$73.4 million: Child Care Services: \$ 68.7 million; Training for Job Success: \$1 million; Workforce Development: \$3.7 million.

EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT INVESTMENTS (in millions)					
Program	Federal Funds:	State Funds:	Local Funds:	Other:	Total Funds:
Pre-K 4SA	\$1.5	\$46.2			\$47.65
Early HeadStart	\$26.3	\$6.6			\$32.9
After School Care			\$2.8		\$2.8
Juvenile Truancy			\$1.1		\$1.1
Parks & Recreation	\$1.5		\$6.9		\$8.4
Healthy Start			\$1.1		\$1.1
San Antonio Education Program			\$3.4		\$3.4
Other	\$0.56		\$48.7	\$2.18	\$51.8
Total:					\$149.1

City of San Antonio Wealth, Assets, and Financial Health Investments \$6.1 million: Emergency Financial Assistance: \$2.2 million; Senior Financial Security: \$2 million; Other: \$1.9 million.

Small Business/Entrepreneurship Investments - \$2.7 million: Mentorship & Resources \$1.3 million; Community Investment & Revitalization: \$1.4 million.

Recommendations: 1) Focus on highest need geographies and populations; 2) Foster integration of asset-building and social safety net services; 3) Enhance safety-net for low-income families; 4) Expand access to products and services that support asset-building and preservation; and 5) Offer organizational support to non-profits to enhance long-term viability and outcomes.

Specific recommendations and charge for oversight by the Economic & Workforce Development Committee (EWD): 1) Invest in workforce training and in expansion of programs that offer wrap-around financial supports for single mothers attending job training/higher education; 2) Expand availability and access to low-cost financial products and services; and 3) Nurture the development of innovative and affordable alternatives to tax time loans.

Ms. Woosley stated that staff would brief all City Council Committees and conduct a SASpeakUp Survey with emphasis on outreach to low-income residents. She concluded by noting that final recommendations would be presented to City Council at a B session in April 2020.

Councilmember Gonzales stated that outreach to private sector banks was ideal for obtaining low-cost financial products and services for low-income families and spoke of several local banks and mortgage lenders willing to host financial literacy and credit score rating seminars. She proposed setting a goal to obtain more private sector support. Ms. Woosley agreed and added that the Human Services Department had a number of available financial partners that assisted with the Volunteer Income Tax Assistance (VITA) program and the City's financial counseling program.

Councilmember Courage asked of available low-cost financial product alternatives. Ms. Woosely stated that River City Credit Union offered a refund-anticipation loan for \$15. She proposed employer-based 18% loans with payroll deductions spread out over twelve months as an alternative to predatory payday lenders with 90-120 day payment plans and interest payments upwards of 400-700%.

Chairwoman Viagran observed that homeownership in low-income areas was often the only wealth-building asset low-income families would ever own. She proposed that measures be taken to further protect their asset such as providing assistance with wills, titles and homestead exemptions. She requested data on the number of title loan and payday loan businesses in San Antonio and referenced a 2006 report of more title loan and payday loan businesses in the San Francisco area than McDonald's and Starbucks combined. Ms. Woosley agreed.

Future Agenda Items

None.

Adjourn

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 3:49 pm.

Rebecca Viagran, Chairwoman

Respectfully Submitted,

***Nancy Cano
Office of the City Clerk***