HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION July 15, 2020

HDRC CASE NO: ADDRESS:	2020-302 619 BARBE ST
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 2877 BLK 2 LOT 14
ZONING: CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	RM-4,H
DISTRICT:	King William Historic District
APPLICANT: OWNER:	Ryan Alton/NEW HORIZONS ARC LLC NEW HORIZONS ARC LLC
TYPE OF WORK:	Installation of front yard fencing
APPLICATION RECEIVED:	June 18, 2020 Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders
60-DAY REVIEW: CASE MANAGER:	Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders Stephanie Phillips

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a new cattle panel-style front yard fence measuring three feet in height, to include a pedestrian gate and driveway gate.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

i. Preserve-Retain historic fences and walls.

ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.

iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.

ii. Location - Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 619 Barbe is a 1-story residential structure constructed circa 1920 in the Craftsman style. The structure features a symmetrical façade with a full-width front porch, a hipped roof with prominent brick chimneys, and a front facing gable. The structure is contributing to the King William Historic District.
- b. FENCING: LOCATION The applicant is requesting approval to add a fence along the left and front side of the home. The fence is requested to be three feet tall with a wood post and cattle panel design. The fencing will include a driveway gate and a pedestrian gate. The driveway gate will run along the sidewalk versus turning to meet the home. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, fences should be introduced in locations that historically featured them, or if new, in locations where fencing is appropriate for the district. Staff generally finds fencing in this location to be appropriate. While front gates along the sidewalk are typically not recommended, the driveway runs very close to the front of the home and the structure features a full width front porch. Based on these site-specific conditions, staff finds a driveway gate acceptable.
- c. FENCING: MATERIAL As noted in finding b, the fence is proposed to be constructed of wooden posts and cattle pattles. According to the Historic Design Guidelines, fences should feature designs and materials that are compatible with the historic structure or historically common in the specific historic district. Where fencing is present or common in King William, the material is most commonly wrought iron or wood picket. Staff does not find the proposed material appropriate for the district.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through c with the following stipulations:

- i. That the fencing material be modified to be more in keeping with the fence styles that are characteristic of the district, such as wood picket or wrought iron, as noted in finding c. The applicant is required to submit an updated design to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Front yard fences shall not exceed four (4) feet in height at any point. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.

City of San Antonio One Stop







Current pictures of the side and front of the house where the fence would be added:

South Elevation (sorry but car parked in front of my shot):



North Elevation



West Elevation pictures (white spray paint line indicates where the fence would go):



East Elevation (not building a fence on this side of the home):





Pictures of 619 Barbe Fence proposal:

Site Map and survey of 619 Barbe:





Proposed fence pictures:

Left side of home from the rear property line up to being in line with 1' behind the front of the house. This fence would be a 6' tall 1x6 Pressure treated pine privacy fence that looks like this:



The front left side of the property as well as the front of the property fence would be a 3' tall 2x4 and cattle panel fence that would look like this but the wood would be painted the same color(s) as the house:

