



# CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

## HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION COMMISSION ACTION

**This is not a Certificate of Appropriateness and cannot be used to acquire permits**

February 5, 2020

**HDRC CASE NO:** 2020-041  
**ADDRESS:** 931 HAYS ST  
**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 1654 BLK B LOT S 140 FT OF 16  
**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Dignowity Hill  
**APPLICANT:** Nik VILLARREAL/JAS Development - 4725 college park  
**OWNER:** LOWRY ALAN J & JOHNSON FAITH E - 115 EATON ST  
**TYPE OF WORK:** Exterior alterations

### REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to amend a previously approved design for new construction. Within this request, the applicant has proposed the following:

1. Install vinyl windows in place of the approved aluminum clad wood windows.
2. Modify the previously approved fenestration pattern by installing a large picture window on the west façade.
3. Install white, vinyl garage doors.

### FINDINGS:

a. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to amend a previously approved design for new construction at 931 Hays, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District. OHP staff performed a site visit on January 22, 2020, and determined that the orientation of the structure's garage, window profiles and materials, and the installed garage doors were inconsistent with the design previously approved by the Commission. Staff finds the garage modifications to be more consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, and processed that amendment administratively.

b. VINYL WINDOWS – The applicant has installed vinyl windows in place of the previously approved aluminum clad wood windows. The installed vinyl windows feature a brown colored frames and faux divided lites. Due to a nailing fin, the windows are not recessed at least two (2) inches within the façade. The windows do not comply with staff's windows specifications in regards to material, installation depth, and profile. Staff finds that a window that meets staff's standard specifications should be installed.

c. FENESTRATION – The applicant has installed a large picture window in place of a transom window on the west façade. While the installation of a larger window is more consistent with those found historically in the district, the profile of the proposed window is inconsistent with the Guidelines and staff's specifications for windows. Staff finds that the window opening should be modified to be more consistent with those found historically within the district.

d. GARAGE DOORS – The applicant has installed two, white vinyl garage doors in place of those that were shown in the approved construction documents. The doors noted in the construction documents included window lites. Staff finds

that the applicant should install doors that are consistent with those approved in the construction documents. If the

Commission finds the installed doors to be appropriate, staff recommends that they be painted a dark color.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the installation of vinyl windows. Staff recommends that a window that meets staff's standard specifications be installed, as previously approved. The windows should be double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the installation of a large picture window as noted in finding c. Staff finds that the applicant should install a window that is sized appropriately for the district.
3. Staff does not recommend approval of item #3, the installation of white, vinyl garage doors. Staff recommends that the applicant install doors that are consistent with those approved in the construction documents. If the Commission finds the installed doors to be appropriate, staff recommends that they be painted a dark color.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

Item #1, the installation of vinyl windows and item #3, the installation of vinyl garage doors were denied. Item #2, the installation of a large picture window was approved as submitted.



Shanon Shea Miller  
Historic Preservation Officer