HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

November 04, 2020

HDRC CASE NO:	2020-464
ADDRESS:	227 PALO BLANCO ST
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 6515 BLK 4 LOT 10
ZONING:	R-4, H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	3
DISTRICT:	Mission Historic District
APPLICANT:	Jerry Contreras/CONTRERAS JERRY
OWNER:	Jerry Contreras/CONTRERAS JERRY
TYPE OF WORK:	Siding repairs, window repairs, skirting installation
APPLICATION RECEIVED:	October 12, 2020
60-DAY REVIEW:	Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders
CASE MANAGER:	Huy Pham

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Replace 5 aluminum windows and 2 wood windows with new vinyl windows.
- 2. Replace of areas of damaged wood siding in-kind
- 3. Replace skirting throughout in-kind

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.

ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.

iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

vii. Non-historic windows—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

Standard Specifications for Original Wood Window Replacement

- SCOPE OF REPAIR: When individual elements such as sills, muntins, rails, sashes, or glazing has deteriorated, every effort should be made to repair or reconstruct that individual element prior to consideration of wholesale replacement. For instance, applicant should replace individual sashes within the window system in lieu of full replacement with a new window unit.
- MISSING OR PREVIOUSLY-REPLACED WINDOWS: Where original windows are found to be missing or previously-replaced with a nonconforming window product by a previous owner, an alternative material to wood may be considered when the proposed replacement product is more consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines in terms of overall appearance. Such determination shall be made on a case-by-case basis by OHP and/or the HDRC. Whole window systems should match the size of historic windows on property unless otherwise approved.
- o MATERIAL: If full window replacement is approved, the new windows must feature primed and painted wood

exterior finish. Clad, composition, or non-wood options are not allowed unless explicitly approved by the commission.

- SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25". Top and bottom sashes must be equal in size unless otherwise approved.
- DEPTH: There should be a minimum of 2" in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.
- TRIM: Original trim details and sills should be retained or repaired in kind. If approved, new window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- GLAZING: Replacement windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- COLOR: Replacement windows should feature a painted finished. If a clad product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- INSTALLATION: Replacement windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation. For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

8. Architectural Features: Foundations

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Replacement features*—Ensure that features such as decorative vents and grilles and lattice panels are replaced in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not possible, use features matching in size, material, and design. Replacement skirting should consist of durable, proven materials, and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary historic structure at 227 Palo Blanco was constructed in a Shotgun floorplan and contributes to the Mission Historic District. The one-story, single-family features a combination of original and replaced wood lap siding and wood and aluminum windows. The structure was also subjected to a side addition through the length of the entire house with the original Shotgun configuration visible in the front façade of the structure.
- b. COMPLIANCE A Stop Work Order was posted by Development Services Department for work without permits at the property at 227 Palo Blanco. Consequently, the applicant submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness on October 12, 2020, to be heard at the next available hearing.
- c. WINDOWS The applicant has proposed to replace all 7 windows on the structure with new vinyl window (PLYGEM). Staff found that the 2 wood windows remained on site that were in repairable conditions while the other 5 windows were previously replaced with non-conforming aluminum windows. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.iv. applicants should replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building. Per the *Standard Specifications for Original Wood Window Replacement*, where original windows are found to be missing or previously-replaced with a nonconforming window product by a previous owner, an alternative material to wood may be considered when the proposed replacement product is more consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines in terms of overall appearance. Staff finds the proposed new windows are inconsistent with the Standard Specifications regarding the sash profiles, faux divided lites, and nailing fin configuration. Staff finds the 2 wood windows should be restored or replaced in-kind if discarded, and that the other 5 windows should be replaced with a window product that meets the *Standard Specifications for Original Wood Window Replacement*, regardless of material.
- d. SIDING The applicant has proposed to replace of areas of damaged wood siding in-kind. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 1.B.iii., applicants should replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair. Staff finds the request to be appropriate if the scope is limited to only the rotten or missing areas to feature wood lap siding with 105 profile, and excludes wholesale replacement or non-conforming materials, such as composite siding.
- e. SKIRTING The applicant is requesting approval replace the existing skirting throughout in-kind. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 8.B.i., .replacement skirting should consist of durable,

proven materials, and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact. Staff finds that wood siding with 105 profile to be the appropriate skirting material and that the applicant may use a single member of Hardie or concealed metal flashing at grade.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend item 1. Window replacement as proposed based on finding b and c. Staff recommends restoration of the 2 wood windows remaining on site whereas the other 5 windows are eligible for replacement with a window product that adheres to *Standard Specifications for Original Wood Window Replacement* with the allowance of a non-wood product if all other specifications are met.

Staff recommends approval of items 2 and 3 based findings d and e with the following stipulations:

- i. That the scope of siding replacement is limited to only the identify rotten or missing areas to feature wood lap siding with 105 profile, and excludes wholesale replacement or non-conforming materials, such as composite siding.
- ii. That wood siding with 105 profile is used as skirting material and that the applicant may use a single member of Hardie or concealed metal flashing at grade.

227 Palo Blanco



October 28, 2020



City of San Antonio GIS Copyright 10-28-2020













mber 24, 2020 at 9:10 AM 229 Palo Blanco St San Antonio TX 78210 United States

Ny Ge m

ALLES BUS LISN

September 24, 2020 at 9:10 AM 221 Palo Blanco St San Antonio TX 78210 United States

September 24, 2020 at 9:10 AM 221 Palo Blanco St San Antonio TX 78210 United States

N.W.

September 24, 2020 at 9:11 AM 221 Palo Blanco St San Antonio TX 78210 United States

36405912































































NEW CONSTUCTION

NAIL FIN INSTALLATION

BEFORE BEGINNING INSTALLATION.

Follow your local building codes, customs and Juviding practices for additional installation requirements. The manufacturer will accept no responsibility for air or water leakage above, under, or anyond the window unit. These instructions are general in nature; for detailed installation instructions by product, contact Pty Gem Windows at 1-11 - PD-YCEM.

- 1 (Resired) The Rough Opening should be level, plumb, and square, and should be sized according to Figure 1.
- Oncommented) if a weather resistant barrier is used, follow the barrier manufacturer's recommendations for treatment of window openings.
- (Recentereded) If pan flashing is used, it should be installed at this time. Follow the pan flashing manufacture's recommendations or ASTM 202 standards), making sure that the product provides an adresute all giant builder to the interior.
- Oreganni A persentius amount of Exterior Crisis Cauty/ Sealant designed for Doors and Windows must be applied at all joints of the nalling flange interactions.





Figure 1

to include applying a powersor (at least 3/8") construction bead of exterior-grade seatiset to ensure an adequate seal between the back of the number for any the exchance surface of the nound concerns (indexence Figher 3). A H using pan flashing, do not seal the lower all halling fin to as to provide adequate drainage.

//>Ply Gem

- Oreared; With the window closed and tockad, place it in the rough opening and center it from side to side and top to bottom.
- 6. (Reserve) With a single approved fastariar (see Chart A), faster the window through the nailing near the top center of the window.
- Oregined Scuare the window side to side (chemming if necessary see Figure 2) to maintain source and plumb ambr. Make sure the window sill and head are level and not crowned and the pinots are not bowed. If your window is a horizontal blong window mains sure sect meeting nel is apported. A NOTE Over sharming can cause bowing and prevent program statements.
- Desired After checking the operation of the window, complete the fastering by instaining fasteriers through the nailing fin according to Chart A
- (Insenseded) Following the flasting imanufactures' recommendations, apply fashing to the hell firs and surrounding well surface starting with the bottom, then the sides, and finally the top, off-sting a shingle effect (infurness Figure 4).



ANOTE: Where pan flashing is present, do not up proper drainage of the pan me the Bottom.



reating is considered a format whether

Figure 3 - General Install

PRECAUTIONARY NOTES

Figure 2

-Store windows and doors horizontally) in a dry, well-se should be of similar size.

Keep window and door on its not of divisit survive and fermione protection lines immediately after

Parties to allow the approach. If when the is the only between the bottom (i) when a notice and brights".

Extensor was systems like
moisture around the words

Follow the siding manufal siding and window frames

 Ally Row-Expension form on minufacturity's requirements could by the insulation will be not block of said weep ho - Do not fasten through the said and confo and bindin covered und

AND ERSTAND

quiremet

tied in upri

and location

Chart A - Faster of Schedules for Native Faster on Schedules Schedules Patternet Schedules Schedules Brig Paternet Min. Correction Resolution

Note: Mulled units may have a

/

OPERTYI

BOAETT

LATION

INSTRUCTIONS NSTALLATION.

g practices for additional accept no responsibility he window unit. These tallation instructions by EM.



to include applying a generous (at least 3/8") continuous bead of exterior-grade sealant to ensure an adequate seal between the back of the nailing fin and the exterior surface of the rough opening (reference Figure 3). I using pan flashing, do not seal the lower sill nailing fin so as to provide adequate drainage.

Ply Gem

- (Required) With the window closed and locked, place it in the rough opening and center it from side to side and top to bottom.
- 6. (Required) With a single approved fastener (see Charles A), fasten the window through the nailfin near the top center of the window.