

Audit and Accountability Committee




Post Solicitation Briefing for Publicly Accessible Electric Vehicle (EVS) Charging Infrastructure on City Property


Date: January 19, 2021

Presented by: Douglas R. Melnick, AICP, ISSP-SA, CNU-A, Director
Office of Sustainability

Background

- 
- RFP for Publicly-Accessible Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure on City Property issued on July 1, 2020
 - Five proposals received on July 31, 2020 and deemed eligible for evaluation
 - Evaluation meeting held on September 3, 2020 and three firms were shortlisted for interviews
 - Interviews and final scoring completed on September 14, 2020
 - Staff recommendation presented to City Council on December 10, 2020 and action on the item was delayed
 - Item referred to the Audit & Accountability Committee for review

Background



Promote use of zero-emission vehicles, supporting EV drivers through convenient public charging and reducing range anxiety

- 4,400 registered EVs in CPS Energy service territory in June 2020
- CPS Energy estimates 50,000 EVs in San Antonio by 2030

City of San Antonio policies support electric vehicles:

- ✓ Climate Action & Adaptation Plan
- ✓ Ozone Attainment Master Plan
- ✓ American Cities Climate Challenge
- ✓ City of San Antonio's SA Tomorrow Sustainability Plan

Background



TxVEMP Grant Opportunity

- \$10.4 million in grants are available for Level 2 charging statewide
- TCEQ is the Lead Agency administering TxVEMP
- TCEQ reimburses grantee up to \$2500 per charging unit eligible project costs

Limited access to residential and workplace chargers across San Antonio

- Limited charging could mean delayed adoption of electric vehicles
- 44% of residents don't have access to at-home charging
- Project addresses inequitable access to EVSE

Solicitation Overview

Project Overview

- The City of San Antonio's Office of Sustainability requested cost neutral proposals for business models and partnership opportunities with third-party electric vehicle supply equipment (EVSE) providers who will install, operate, maintain and own publicly accessible electric vehicle (EV) charging infrastructure on City property.

Solicitation Type

- RFP

Estimated Value

- Cost Neutral

Proposed Term

- 1 year with 4, 1 year options

Evaluation Committee Members

Voting Members:

- Douglas Melnick, AICP, ISSP-SA, CNU-A, Director, Office of Sustainability
- Julia Murphy, Deputy Chief Sustainability Officer, Office of Sustainability
- Harley Hubbard, Sustainable Transportation Manager, Office of Sustainability
- Gopinath Akalkotkar, City Architect, Public Works Department
- Aurora Perkins, Parking Administrator, Center City Development and Operations Department
- Russell Huff, Assistant Director, Finance Department

Advisory Members:

- Valerie vonSchramm, Strategic Research and Innovation Manager, CPS Energy
- Andrew Higgins, Senior Director Products & Services, CPS Energy
- John Bailey, Climate Advisor, Natural Resources Defense Council
- Emily Royall, Smart City Coordinator, Office of Innovation
- Chris Hebner, City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

Initial Evaluation

Level 2 Chargers

RFP for Publicly Accessible EVSE L2 AC (RFP 20-076; 6100012932) Score Summary INITIAL EVALUATION September 3, 2020	Maximum Points	Blink Charging Co. 407 Lincoln Rd. Suite 704 Miami, Florida 33139	Dalkia Energy Solutions, LLC 200 Cummings Center, 177-C Beverly, MA 01915	Injoy Media 9714 Mid Walk Drive San Antonio, Texas 78230	PSI Energy Solutions 14833 Bulverde Rd. San Antonio, Texas 78247	Zeco Systems, Inc. d/b/a Greenlots 939 Emerald Buff Court Houston, Texas 77095
A - Experience, Background, Qualifications	30	18.83	9.83	7.67	23.33	24.83
B - Proposed Plan	35	27.00	13.00	7.33	22.67	28.17
C - Price	20	20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
D - Local Preference Program	10	0.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	0.00
E - Veteran-Owned Small Business Preference Program	5	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TOTAL SCORE	100	65.83	22.83	25.00	46.00	53.00
RANK BASED ON TOTAL SCORE		1	5	4	3	2

SBEDA Program: Not Applicable

Initial Evaluation

Level 3 Chargers

RFP for Publicly Accessible EVSE L3 DC (RFP 20-076; 6100012932) Score Summary INITIAL EVALUATION September 3, 2020	Maximum Points	Blink Charging Co. 407 Lincoln Rd., Suite 704 Miami, Florida 33139	Dalkia Energy Solutions, LLC 200 Cummings Center, 177-C Beverly, MA 01915	Injoy Media 9714 Mid Walk Drive San Antonio, Texas 78230	PSI Energy Solutions 14833 Bulverde Rd. San Antonio, Texas 78247	Zeco Systems, Inc. d/b/a Greenlots 939 Emerald Buff Court Houston, Texas 77095
A - Experience, Background, Qualifications	30	18.83	9.83	7.67	23.33	24.83
B - Proposed Plan	35	27.00	13.00	7.33	22.67	28.17
C - Price	20	20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
D - Local Preference Program	10	0.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	0.00
E - Veteran-Owned Small Business Preference Program	5	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TOTAL SCORE	100	65.83	22.83	25.00	46.00	53.00
RANK BASED ON TOTAL SCORE		1	5	4	3	2

SBEDA Program: Not Applicable

Recommended Award

Level 2 Chargers

RFP for Publicly Accessible EVSE L2 (RFP 20-076; 6100012932) Score Summary FINAL EVALUATION September 14, 2020	Maximum Points	Blink Charging Co. 407 Lincoln Rd., Suite 704 Miami, Florida 33139	PSI Energy Solutions 14833 Bulverde Rd. San Antonio, Texas 78247	Zeco Systems, Inc. d/b/a Greenlots 939 Emerald Buff Court Houston, Texas 77095
A - Experience, Background, Qualifications	30	23.17	19.00	18.50
B - Proposed Plan	35	28.17	8.17	9.17
C - Price	20	20.00	0.00	0.00
D - Local Preference Program	10	0.00	0.00	0.00
E - Veteran-Owned Small Business Preference Program	5	0.00	0.00	0.00
TOTAL SCORE	100	71.34	27.17	27.67
RANK BASED ON TOTAL SCORE		1	3	2

SBEDA Program: Not Applicable

Recommended Award

Level 3 Chargers

RFP for Publicly Accessible EVSE L3 DC (RFP 20-076; 6100012932) Score Summary FINAL EVALUATION September 14, 2020	Maximum Points	Blink Charging Co. 407 Lincoln Rd., Suite 704 Miami, Florida 33139	PSI Energy Solutions 14833 Bulverde Rd. San Antonio, Texas 78247	Zeco Systems, Inc. d/b/a Greenlots 939 Emerald Buff Court Houston, Texas 77095
A - Experience, Background, Qualifications	30	23.67	19.00	18.50
B - Proposed Plan	35	30.00	8.17	9.17
C - Price	20	20.00	0.00	0.00
D - Local Preference Program	10	0.00	0.00	0.00
E - Veteran-Owned Small Business Preference Program	5	0.00	0.00	0.00
TOTAL SCORE	100	73.67	27.17	27.67
RANK BASED ON TOTAL SCORE		1	3	2

SBEDA Program: Not Applicable

Agreement with Blink Charging

- Turn-key ownership model
- Cost-neutral to City
 - Blink responsible for all expenses related to site prep, installation, software, marketing, customer interface
 - Infrastructure ownership reverts to City in the event of contract default
 - 50/50 Revenue share after project costs are met
- Level 2 Chargers and DC Fast Chargers on City property
 - Garages, Surface lots, libraries, parks, Pre-K 4 SA centers are potential sites

Project Timeline



Due Diligence Review Process

Review includes:

- Respondent Background Check
 - Texas Secretary of State, State Comptroller, State Debarment Listing, Federal Debarment Listing
 - SAP Accounts, City Permit Fees, Google News, Google
- Respondent References
 - Minimum 3 reference letters requested with proposal submission
- Financial Statement Review
 - Review of D&B Report, Audited Financial Statements (if required), SEC Filings (if applicable)
- Proof of Insurability Review
 - Insurance Provider's Letter
 - Certificate of Insurance

Due Diligence Review Process

Timing of Due Diligence Reviews:

- Prior to evaluation meeting
- Prior to City Council consideration on December 10, 2020
- Call with City and Blink executives prior to Audit Committee briefing
- Refresh prior to Audit Committee meeting
- Refresh prior to scheduling for “A” Session consideration

Due Diligence

Finance and Audit Departments – Due Diligence Results

Number of vendors notified:	56
-----------------------------	----

Number of vendors at pre-submittal conference:	11
------------------------------------------------	----

Number of responses received:	5
-------------------------------	---

Results of Minimum Requirements Review:	No Material Findings
-----------------------------------------	----------------------

Results of Due Diligence Review: Article found relating to lawsuit filed by shareholder of Blink Charging Company alleging company misrepresented size of network to increase stock investment.

Additional Due Diligence Review

On January 7, the City Manager's Office, the City Attorney's Office, the Office of Sustainability and Finance met with the Executive leadership team at Blink Charging to review questions related to class-action derivative lawsuits, maintenance of equipment, and other public perception issues related to the company.

Blink's executive leadership and legal counsel provided background on the class action lawsuit. Blink expects a favorable resolution of the lawsuit given the nature of the claimant and lack of substance on the claims.

Blink Charging was ranked on Forbes 2021 top 100 "America's Best Small Companies" list on December 4, 2020.

Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this item for full City Council consideration at the February 4, 2021 “A” Session meeting