HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

May 19, 2021

HDRC CASE NO:	2021-206
ADDRESS:	401 NORTH DR
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 7059 BLK 8 LOT 11
ZONING:	R-6,H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	7
DISTRICT:	Monticello Park Historic District
APPLICANT:	Patricia Wathen
OWNER:	Patricia Wathen
TYPE OF WORK:	Replacement of concrete walkway with flagstone
APPLICATION RECEIVED:	April 22, 2021
60-DAY REVIEW:	Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders
CASE MANAGER:	Stephanie Phillips

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the front concrete walkway with a new flagstone walkway.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

1. Topography

A. TOPOGRAPHIC FEATURES

i. *Historic topography*—Avoid significantly altering the topography of a property (i.e., extensive grading). Do not alter character-defining features such as berms or sloped front lawns that help define the character of the public right-of-way. Maintain the established lawn to help prevent erosion. If turf is replaced over time, new plant materials in these areas should be low-growing and suitable for the prevention of erosion.

ii. *New construction*—Match the historic topography of adjacent lots prevalent along the block face for new construction. Do not excavate raised lots to accommodate additional building height or an additional story for new construction.

iii. *New elements*—Minimize changes in topography resulting from new elements, like driveways and walkways, through appropriate siting and design. New site elements should work with, rather than change, character-defining topography when possible.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree. iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site.

Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

C. CURBING

i. *Historic curbing*—Retain historic curbing wherever possible. Historic curbing in San Antonio is typically constructed of concrete with a curved or angular profile.

ii. *Replacement curbing*—Replace curbing in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. Where in-kind replacement is not be feasible, use a comparable substitute that duplicates the color, texture, durability, and profile of the original. Retaining walls and curbing should not be added to the sidewalk design unless absolutely necessary.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 401 North Dr is a 2-story residential structure constructed in the Monterey style. The home features a stone façade on the first floor, a composition shingle hipped roof, a second story balcony, and an attached garage. The structure is contributing to the Monticello Park Historic District.
- b. FRONT WALKWAY REPLACEMENT The applicant has proposed to replace the existing concrete front walkway with limestone pavers. Guideline 5.A.i for Site Elements states that historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—should be retained and repaired in place. According to Guideline 5.A.ii for Site Elements, when replacing those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair, every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material. North Dr and this area of the district is characterized by gently curving concrete walkways leading from the public sidewalk and street to front doors. Staff finds the proposal inconsistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval of the limestone walkway installation based on finding b. Staff recommends that the applicant repairs and replaces the existing concrete walkway with in-kind material and matches the existing footprint and design.

City of San Antonio One Stop















