HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

July 07, 2021

HDRC CASE NO: 2021-299

ADDRESS: 236 KING WILLIAM

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 740 BLK 3 LOT SW 11 FT OF 8,NE 22.5 OF NW 132 OF 10,9 EXC

SE 7.2 OF SW 7.5

ZONING: RM-4,H

CITY COUNCIL DIST.:

DISTRICT: King William Historic District Joshua Calzada/ArchitecturaSA **APPLICANT:**

OWNER: Susan Likovich/LIKOVICH JOHN & SUSAN

TYPE OF WORK: Construction of rear and side additions

APPLICATION RECEIVED: June 17, 2021

Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders **60-DAY REVIEW:**

CASE MANAGER: Stephanie Phillips

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to:

1. Construct a 1-story side addition measuring approximately 155 square feet. The addition will be located within an existing exterior alcove on the side of the house.

2. Construct a 1-story rear addition measuring approximately 550 square feet.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. Minimize visual impact—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block.

For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.

- iii. Similar roof form—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. Transitions between old and new—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. Subordinate to principal facade—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. Rooftop additions—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. Dormers—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. Footprint—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. Height—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.
- 2. Massing and Form of Non-Residential and Mixed-Use Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, additions should not fundamentally alter the scale and character of the block when viewed from the public right-of-way. ii. *Preferred location*—Place additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize the visual impact on the original structure from the public right of way. An addition to the front of a building is inappropriate. iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, and orientation as the principal structure for additions, particularly for those that are visible from the public right-of-way.
- iv. Subordinate to principal facade—Design additions to historic buildings to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- v. *Transitions between old and new*—Distinguish additions as new without distracting from the original structure. For example, rooftop additions should be appropriately set back to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. For side or rear additions utilize setbacks, a small change in detailing, or a recessed area at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Height*—Limit the height of side or rear additions to the height of the original structure. Limit the height of rooftop additions to no more than 40 percent of the height of original structure.
- ii. *Total addition footprint*—New additions should never result in the doubling of the historic building footprint. Full-floor rooftop additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. Other roofing materials—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. Salvage—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character-defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.
- ii. Architectural details—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

5. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, cable lines, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Where service areas cannot be located at the rear of the property, compatible screens or buffers will be required.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. Roof-mounted equipment—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

6. Designing for Energy Efficiency

A. BUILDING DESIGN

- i. *Energy efficiency*—Design additions and new construction to maximize energy efficiency.
- ii. *Materials*—Utilize green building materials, such as recycled, locally-sourced, and low maintenance materials whenever possible.
- iii. *Building elements*—Incorporate building features that allow for natural environmental control such as operable windows for cross ventilation.
- iv. *Roof slopes*—Orient roof slopes to maximize solar access for the installation of future solar collectors where compatible with typical roof slopes and orientations found in the surrounding historic district.

B. SITE DESIGN

- i. *Building orientation*—Orient new buildings and additions with consideration for solar and wind exposure in all seasons to the extent possible within the context of the surrounding district.
- ii. Solar access—Avoid or minimize the impact of new construction on solar access for adjoining properties.

C. SOLAR COLLECTORS

- i. Location—Locate solar collectors on side or rear roof pitch of the primary historic structure to the maximum extent feasible to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way while maximizing solar access. Alternatively, locate solar collectors on a garage or outbuilding or consider a ground-mount system where solar access to the primary structure is limited.
- ii. *Mounting (sloped roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a sloped roof. Select collectors that are similar in color to the roof surface to reduce visibility.
- iii. *Mounting (flat roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a flat roof to the maximum extent feasible. Where solar access limitations preclude a flush mount, locate panels towards the rear of the roof where visibility from the public right-of-way will be minimized.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 236 King William is a 2-story residential structure constructed circa 1915 in the Neoclassical style with Craftsman influences. The structure features a limestone façade, a recessed front porch with Doric columns, and a standing seam metal roof. The structure is contributing to the King William Historic District.
- b. SIDE ADDITION The applicant has proposed to construct a 1-story side addition measuring approximately 155 square feet within an existing exterior alcove located on the side of the house between the main house structure and an existing rear addition. As proposed, one new wall will be added between the two structures and add a single slope roof to align and match the roof profile of the existing addition. In the new addition, two new windows are proposed that will be of similar size and appearance to the existing windows of the accessory structure. Staff generally finds the request appropriate due to scale, materiality, design, and location, and its square footage qualifies the request for administrative approval.
- c. REAR ADDITION: FOOTPRINT The applicant has proposed to construct a s1-story rear addition measuring approximately 550 square feet. The addition is a proposed replacement to a smaller, non-contributing rear addition located at the very back of the property. To distinguish the new from the old, a roof "step-up" is proposed where the new roof addition will connect to the existing roof and will be finished with a similar standing seam metal roof. The

Historic Design Guidelines for Additions stipulate that new additions should not double the footprint of the primary structure in plan and should follow footprint and location precedents in the vicinity and district. Staff finds that the proposal meets this guideline.

- d. REAR ADDITION: ORIENTATION AND SETBACK The applicant has proposed to construct an addition to the rear of the structure measuring approximately 500 square feet. The addition will replace an existing smaller, non-original and non-contributing rear addition. According to the Guidelines, additions should be located at the rear of the structure whenever possible and follow similar historic development patterns in the district. Staff finds the orientation and setback consistent with the Guidelines. The applicant is responsible for complying with setback requirements and obtaining a variance from the Board of Adjustment if applicable.
- e. REAR ADDITION: SCALE The proposed addition is 1-story and based on the submitted renderings, the height and ridgeline will be a full visual story shorter than the primary structure. The rear addition will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The Historic Design Guidelines state that new construction should be consistent with the height and overall scale of nearby historic buildings. Staff finds a 1-story addition generally consistent with the Guidelines in terms of height.
- f. REAR ADDITION: FENESTRATION According to the Historic Design Guidelines, openings in new construction should use traditional dimensions and profiles found on the primary structure or within the historic district. Staff finds that the applicant should add additional fenestration on the rear elevation to avoid a fully blank wall. The rear elevation wall measures approximately 31' feet wide, and the Guidelines encourage utilizing fenestration to break up the visual mass of long walls. Staff finds the use of individual pairs or ganged windows, similar in proportion and configuration to those utilized on the primary structure and the proposed west elevation of the addition, to be appropriate. Staff also finds that the proposed small horizontal fixed windows proposed on the east elevation should be modified to feature more traditional sizes, proportions, and configurations.
- g. REAR ADDITION: MATERIALITY The applicant has proposed to use stucco siding in a finish to match the existing structure and standing seam roofing. The specific window materials are not indicated. Staff finds this generally appropriate with the stipulations listed in the recommendation.
- h. REAR ADDITION: ROOF FORM The proposed rear addition will utilize a gable roof form with a gable vent. Staff finds the rear roof form to be appropriate.
- i. REAR ADDITION: ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS According to the Guidelines for Additions, new additions should feature architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition. Staff finds the details consistent.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the proposed additions based on findings a through i with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant modifies the proposed horizontal windows and installs windows on the rear elevation of the rear addition as noted in finding f. The windows should feature a one over one configuration and be vertically oriented with proportions that are similar to those found on the primary historic structure. The applicant is required to submit updated elevations that reflect these changes prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant submits a detailed specification for all proposed new windows on the additions. All new windows must meet the following stipulations: windows must be fully wood windows. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. The applicant is required to submit a detailed drawing and specification for the new front window to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- iii. That any windows concealed by additions be retained in place, reused in the new additions, or stored on site for future use. The applicant is responsible for submitting documentation illustrating how these windows are to be treated to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

City of San Antonio One Stop





























