

**AUDIT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETING
MINUTES**

**JANUARY 17, 2017 at 11:30 AM
CITY HALL, MEDIA BRIEFING ROOM**

Committee Present:	Councilmember Rey Saldaña, <i>District 4, Chair</i> Councilmember Alan E. Warrick II, <i>District 2</i> Councilmember Shirley Gonzales, <i>District 5</i> Citizen Member Tom Nichta
Committee Absent:	None
Staff Present:	Kevin Barthold, <i>City Auditor</i> ; Ben Gorzell, <i>Chief Financial Officer</i> ; Troy Elliott, <i>Deputy Chief Financial Officer & Director of Finance</i> ; Andy Segovia, <i>City Attorney</i> ; Mike Sawaya, <i>Director of Convention & Sports Facilities</i> ; William McManus, <i>Police Chief</i> ; Charles Hood, <i>Fire Chief</i> ; Steve Baum, <i>Assistant Police Director</i> ; Leticia Saenz, <i>Deputy City Clerk</i> ; Jon Kaplan, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Melanie Seale, <i>Assistant Director of Finance</i> ; Patricia Cantor, <i>Assistant Director of Convention & Sports Facilities</i> ; Kevin Goodwin, <i>Assistant IT Director</i> ; John Rodriguez, <i>Assistant IT Director</i> ; Michael Sindon, <i>Assistant Director of Economic Development</i> ; Tina J. Flores, <i>Compliance Auditor</i> ; Buddy Vargas, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Mark Bigler, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Sandra Paiz, <i>Audit Manager</i> ; Christopher Moreno, <i>Auditor</i> ; Reina Sandoval, <i>Auditor</i> ; Gabriel Trevino, <i>Auditor</i> ; Natasha Leach, <i>Auditor</i> ; Cecilia Gonzalez, <i>Auditor</i> ; Matt Howard, <i>Auditor</i> ; Victoria Roeder, <i>Controller</i> ; Norbert Dziuk, <i>Lead Procurement</i> ; Jeff Knippel, <i>Program Manager</i> ; Ryan Evans, <i>Contract Coordinator</i> ; Patsy Boozer, <i>ITSD</i> ; Rebecca De La Garza, <i>Office of the City Manager</i>

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Saldaña called the meeting to order. He noted that the Audit Committee had been allotted an hour for business and would then move to the High Profile Contracts Subcommittee.

1. Approval of the Minutes from the November 15, 2016 Meeting of the Audit Committee

Councilmember Warrick moved to approve the Minutes of the November 15, 2016 Audit Council Committee Meeting. Citizen Member Nichta seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

Final Reports to be Discussed

2. AU16-022 Audit of the Police and Fire Departments 9-1-1 Operations and Response Time.

Kevin Barthold stated that the objective of the Audit was to:

- Determine if the City's 9-1-1 Call Answering Process was properly managed
- Determine if the San Antonio Police Department's (SAPD) and the San Antonio Fire Department's (SAFD) response times were accurately calculated and properly reported

He stated that the Audit Scope was from October 2014 through January 2016. He noted that the following were reviewed:

- City Administrative Directives
- SAPD Policies and Procedures
- SAFD Policies and Procedures
- Information Technology Services Department (ITSD) Policies and Procedures
- Texas Department of Public Safety (DPS) Requirements
- Federal Bureau of Investigations (FBI) Requirements
- Criminal Justice Information Services (CJIS) Requirements
- National Emergency Number Association (NENA) Standards
- National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) Standards

Mr. Barthold stated that City 9-1-1 Call Center staffing and service levels were compared with generally accepted emergency answering standards. He noted that Management and Staff from ITSD, SAPD, SAFD, and external organizations were interviewed to gain an understanding of 9-1-1 Call Center Operations and Public Safety Response Time processes. He stated that generally, the City's 9-1-1 Call Answering Process was properly managed. He noted however, that the following areas were identified for action by SAPD and SAFD to further strengthen existing controls and processes surrounding the 9-1-1 call answering process:

Jointly, SAPD and SAFD should:

- Develop, document, and test a business continuity plan for the 9-1-1 Call Center
- Develop an aggressive outreach plan to educate the public on the appropriate use of 9-1-1 and non-emergency numbers
- Formalize responsibilities, expectations, obligations, and the nature of their arrangement with Bexar Metro 9-1-1 through a defined Service Level Agreement or Memorandum of Understanding

The Police Chief should:

- Evaluate and adjust staffing levels and schedules to meet NENA Call Answering Standards for emergency calls and internal standards for non-emergency calls
- Verify that every employee working in the Call Center had completed the required FBI and CJIS Security Awareness Training
- Develop and maintain a sufficient documentation process of all required training

- Develop and implement a call quality review process that: 1) Regularly reviews calls for compliance with standards; and 2) Provide feedback on a regular basis to individual Call Takers

The Fire Chief should:

- Evaluate and formally adopt a standard such as the NENA Standard for Call Taking Operations
- Evaluate and adjust staffing levels and schedules to meet the NENA call answering standards for emergency calls and internal goals for non-emergency calls
- Develop a process to periodically perform background checks on existing personnel working in the 9-1-1 Call Center
- Develop and implement a call quality review process that: 1) Regularly reviews calls for compliance with standards; and 2) Provide feedback on a regular basis to individual Call Takers
- Develop a plan to balance the cost of Call Takers and Dispatchers with the need to provide professional medical and fire call taking and dispatching services

Mr. Barthold stated that generally, SAPD and SAFD response times were accurately calculated and properly reported based on current departmental reporting models. He noted that however; the following recommendations were made to further enhance the transparency and accuracy of the SAPD and SAFD Response Time Reporting Process:

The Police Chief should:

- Expand the police response time definition of an “emergency” to include all life-threatening events
- Expand the categories of response times reported (i.e. life-threatening, non-life-threatening in progress, non-life-threatening, other service requests, etc.)

The Fire Chief should:

- Track and report the average initial answer and SAFD call process times for medical and fire related calls as an element of SAFD’s response time reporting to the public

Chief McManus provided a response to the actions implemented in response to the audit.

Chairman Saldaña asked of the relationship of Bexar Metro 9-1-1 in the process. Mr. Barthold stated that Bexar Metro 9-1-1 provided equipment and software and was tasked with routing calls to the proper dispatch center. Erik Walsh stated that a Service Level Agreement had been in effect since December 2016. Chairman Saldaña asked of Call Center Staffing. Mr. Barthold replied that a minimum of 113 Call Takers were needed. Chief McManus added that they had hired 122 call takers.

Councilmember Gonzales entered the meeting at this time.

Mr. Walsh noted that there would be third wave of civilian positions added.

Chairman Saldaña asked of personnel in the Call Center. Mr. Walsh noted that there were not any Uniform Police Officers and the Call Center was staffed by Civilians. Chairman Saldana asked of the definition of "abandoned calls". Mr. Barthold stated that an abandoned call occurred when the caller disconnected the call before it could be answered. Steve Baum noted that on average; it took the Call Center 8 seconds to answer a call.

Councilmember Warrick asked of the Continuity Plan. Mr. Barthold stated that a Continuity Plan was a checklist for routing calls to an external Call Center if necessary. He mentioned that Bexar County Dispatch would be utilized as backup for the City of San Antonio and would open in April 2017. Councilmember Warrick asked if they had an idea on where the calls were coming from throughout the city. Mr. Barthold stated that they had not conducted an analysis of where the calls were coming from. Councilmember Warrick asked if there was a national standard for abandoned calls. Mr. Baum replied that there was not a national standard for abandoned calls.

Steve Nichta asked of Call Centers of small cities. Mr. Baum noted that most smaller cities had a combined Call Center. Mr. Nichta asked if they utilized standard software. Mr. Baum replied that there was a standardized system throughout the country. Mr. Nichta asked if a Call Taker can pause a non-emergency call to take an emergency call. Mr. Baum stated that there was not a way to differentiate calls from non-emergency and emergency. Mr. Nichta asked if call takers worked 8-hour shifts. Mr. Baum replied that the city utilized shifts of 8 and 10 hours in length.

Councilmember Gonzales spoke of an incident that occurred and noted that the Call Center had identified where she was located based on the call. She noted that SAPD had arrived before she even got out of the car. Mr. Baum noted that it was due to the fact that she called from a cell phone and they were able to get location information that way. Councilmember Gonzales stated that she was pleased with the fast response times.

Chief Hood stated that in Phoenix, they ran a Civilian Call Center; however, San Antonio utilized a Uniform System. He noted that the benefit of using Uniform Officers was that they were Certified Paramedics and could provide additional information while dispatching was occurring. He mentioned that it was against his recommendation to move from Uniform to Civilian Staffing.

Chairman Saldaña asked of overtime. Chief Hood stated that they only had a certain number of trained call takers. He noted that they did everything they could to balance personnel and overtime; but there were challenges. Chairman Saldaña asked if Call Takers only fulfilled that duty. Chief Hood confirmed that Call Taking was their only role and that 44 staff members were assigned to the Call Center. He provided an example of when a Paramedic was able to assist an individual over the phone that was having a heart attack. Chairman Saldaña asked of a potential hybrid. Chief Hood stated that he was concerned with that concept but was willing to hire a consultant to look at same.

Mr. Nichta asked of the breakdown of medical versus fire calls. Chief Hood replied that 84% of calls were for medical emergencies. Mr. Nichta asked if there was a concern with a 24-hour shift and fatigue. Chief Hood stated that they had a kitchen, a gym, and other things to help address fatigue.

Mr. Nichta moved to adopt the Audit as presented. Councilmember Warrick seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

FY 2017 Audit Plan Status

3. FY17 Annual Audit Plan Status as of December 31, 2016

Mr. Kevin Barthold reported that they were on schedule with the Audit Plan.

No action was required for Item 3.

High Profile Contracts Subcommittee Items

FY17 Annual High Profile Report

4. Howard W. Peak Greenway Trails System Design Services (Parks/TCI)

Xavier Urrutia presented information on the Howard W. Peak Greenway Trails System Design Services Request for Qualifications. He explained that the estimated value of the project was \$3.1 million and included a three-year term with the option of two additional years. Troy Elliott presented the procurement overview and noted that there were no findings. Mr. Barthold added that there were no findings for a conflict of interest determined by the Auditor's Office.

Councilmember Gonzales moved to forward the Howard W. Peak Greenway Trails System Design Services to the full City Council for consideration. Councilmember Warrick seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Consideration of High Profile Solicitations for Release

5. Annual JOC Contract for On-Call HVAC Services (Aviation) Dangerous Premises Lot Clearing (DSD) Dental Health Plans (HR) Household Hazardous Waste Collection (SWMD) On-Call Civil Engineering (TCI)

Ben Gorzell noted that due diligence would be performed at a later time as they were scheduled to be released within the next month. Councilmember Warrick asked of the Dangerous Premises Lot Clearing. Mr. Elliott stated that said contract would seek a contractor(s) to provide mowing, cleaning, and securing of vacant structures and painting over graffiti.

No action was required for Item 5.

ADJOURN

There being no further discussion, Chairman Saldaña adjourned the meeting at 1:17 pm.

ATTEST:


Leticia Y. Saenz
Deputy City Clerk
Rey Saldaña, Chairman