

**State of Texas
County of Bexar
City of San Antonio**



**Meeting Minutes
City Council B Session**

City Hall Complex
105 Main Plaza
San Antonio, Texas 78205

Wednesday, January 15, 2020

2:00 PM

Municipal Plaza Building

The City Council of San Antonio convened in the City Council Chambers of the Municipal Plaza Building.

ROLL CALL

City Clerk Leticia Vacek took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Councilmembers present:

PRESENT: Mayor Nirenberg, Treviño, Andrews-Sullivan, Viagran, Rocha Garcia, Gonzales, Cabello Havrda, Sandoval, Pelaez, Courage, and Perry.

1. Briefing on the Pre-K 4 SA Program and key considerations for 2020. [Carlos Contreras, Assistant City Manager; Sarah Baray, CEO, Pre-K 4 SA]

Dr. Sarah Baray stated that Pre-K 4 SA was a workforce initiative designed to develop a world-class workforce in one generation through high quality early learning. She noted that the education centers, professional learning, competitive grants, and family engagement assist in realizing that vision. She added that Pre-K 4 SA was authorized through the Better Jobs Act which authorized City Council to initiate certain types of workforce development programs, including early childhood education and to create a corporation to develop and implement them. She noted that the Better Jobs Act granted the City Council the authority to approve corporation bylaws, appoint Board Members, approve the corporation budget and levy a sales tax in support of the initiative. She stated that the sales tax levy

must be directed for use of the corporation, must not be less than 1/8 of one percent, and must be approved by a simple majority of voters in an election called for that purpose. She noted that the eight-year referendum was passed in 2012 and would end June 2021. She stated that the recommendation to invest in early learning was based on studies conducted by John Heckman who calculated that communities which invested in early learning could expect a 7-10% return on investment. She noted that four education centers were opened and have served over 14,000 students and a replication site was launched in the Edgewood Independent School District. She stated that \$21 million in grants have been awarded to schools and programs which have served over 13,000 students and supported 119 schools and programs throughout San Antonio. She noted that the professional learning division provided over 60,000 hours of professional development to more than 23,000 teachers and leaders in San Antonio and provided credentialing for 200 new early learning teachers for the child development centers. She reviewed the results of the long-term impact study conducted by the University of Texas at San Antonio (UTSA) in 2019. She stated that each year, Pre-K 4 SA was evaluated by an independent research team, and every year, children enter Pre-K 4 SA below the national average and leave Pre-K 4 SA above the national average. She provided the following comparison of Pre-K 4 SA with other programs regarding efficiencies:

	Pre-K 4 SA	Head Start	District average (San Antonio area)	National average
Annual cost/Student	\$11,470	\$9,173	\$9,109	\$12,903
Length of program day	10 hours	7 hours	7&10 hours (mixed)	7 hours
Cost/hour	\$6.48	\$7.40	\$6.24	\$10.41

Dr. Baray stated that by the end of the initiative, Pre-K 4 SA will have benefited over 450,000 children and families in San Antonio. She explained how Pre-K 4 SA differed from the Head Start Program and State-funded Pre-K. She noted that the Head Start Program and House Bill (HB) 3 did not expand the number of children in San Antonio who are eligible for Pre-K and 40% of four-year-olds do not qualify for free publicly funded Pre-K Programs. She stated that 3,000 families every year fall between those that qualify for free publicly funded Pre-K Programs and those that can afford it. She acknowledged the important role that policy makers have had on Pre-K 4 SA and noted that the results prove measureable benefits for children, families, and the community.

Elaine Mendoza stated that the Pre-K 4 SA Board of Directors requests consideration by the City Council to put Pre-K 4 SA before the voters for reauthorization on the May 2020 ballot.

Mayor Nirenberg acknowledged the hard work accomplished on behalf of Pre-K 4 SA by the City Manager's Office, Erik Walsh, Sheryl Sculley, and Peter Zaroni. He expressed support for the reauthorization of the Pre-K 4 SA Program and stated that the program benefited families, workforce, economy, environment, and overall health.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia expressed support for the reauthorization of the Pre-K 4 SA Program on the May 2020 ballot. She noted that holding the election in November of 2020 could double or triple

the costs.

Councilmember Cabello Havrda asked if the 1/8 sales tax would fund the 3,000 families which were not eligible for free Pre-K but could not afford a Pre-K Program in the private sector. Dr. Baray replied that the reauthorization of Pre-K 4 SA would fund 2,500 new seats for families which cannot afford high quality Pre-K Programs and who are not eligible for free Pre-K Programs.

Councilmember Viagran asked of the reasons why a May 2020 election was recommended. Ms. Mendoza replied that in addition to the reduced cost of holding the election in May 2020 and the large number of elections to be held in November 2020, Pre-K 4 SA Teachers would know whether or not the program would continue.

Councilmember Sandoval expressed support for the reauthorization of the Pre-K 4 SA Program on the May 2020 ballot. She stated that Pre-K 4 SA was important for the equity framework, health, and the issue of poverty.

Councilmember Peláez spoke of the benefits of the Pre-K 4 SA Program.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan expressed support for the reauthorization of the Pre-K 4 SA Program.

Councilmember Gonzales asked of enrollment outreach for the program. Dr. Baray stated that the program had an enrollment team and an open house would be held on January 18, 2020. She noted that families were the best recruiters because they shared information with their neighbors, friends, and family.

Councilmember Courage asked which cohort was represented in the evaluation of graduates from Pre-K 4 SA Education Centers. Dr. Baray replied that the first cohorts of 750 children were represented in the evaluation. Councilmember Courage asked if the evaluation was an ongoing process. Dr. Baray replied that it was and the children could be tracked through high school and college.

Councilmember Viagran asked if a question could be put before voters on whether they would like to have a 1/8 of one cent sales tax support transportation or the aquifer. Andy Segovia replied that he would see if that was possible.

Councilmember Perry expressed concern that the election would be held in May 2020. He questioned whether the City should fund Pre-K 4 SA.

Councilmember Treviño asked of future growth of the program. Dr. Baray stated that San Antonio was growing and it was important to work in partnership with existing programs to meet the need. In response to Councilmember Viagran's question, Mr. Segovia noted that through a petition, voters could place items on the ballot but the City could not have an election to decide what to vote on later.

Mayor Nirenberg confirmed that this item would be brought before City Council in February 2020 to call for an election on the reauthorization of the Pre-K 4 SA Program in May 2020.

2. Briefing regarding City Council Staff Compensation Review and overview of recommendations.
[Ben Gorzell, Chief Financial Officer; Lori Steward, Director,
Human Resources]

Lori Steward stated that a Council Consideration Request (CCR) was submitted on City Council Staff pay in August 2019. She noted that during the Fiscal Year (FY) 2020 Budget process, City Council approved an amendment related to the compensation of City Council Staff to be implemented following a policy discussion. She stated that at the Governance Committee meeting on October 16, 2019, Mayor Nirenberg appointed an Ad Hoc Committee who authorized a third party compensation consultant to recommend a pay structure and salary grades based on data gathered and job descriptions created. She noted that the Ad Hoc Committee met with Human Resources and the City Attorney's Office to monitor the progress and provide feedback through a Council Staff Compensation Review Process.

Ms. Steward stated that the Human Resources Department facilitated the gathering of information on the duties and responsibilities of City Council Staff through questionnaires and individual meetings. She noted that 21 questionnaires were submitted and 46 staff members participated in individual meetings. She stated that information gathered was utilized to develop draft job descriptions which were reviewed by the Ad Hoc Committee on November 15, 2019. She noted that the Ad Hoc Committee met individually with Councilmembers to obtain additional input and nine job descriptions were developed and approved by the Ad Hoc Committee.

Ms. Steward presented the draft job descriptions and requirements and noted that the job descriptions and other information gathered in the process were provided to the compensation consultant, Werling Associates, Inc. for analysis and recommendations. She stated that the consultant's initial recommendations were presented to the Ad Hoc Committee on December 20, 2019 and following consultation, Councilmembers requested that the consultant review additional positions and requested that Human Resources review and provide alternate recommendations utilizing internal knowledge. She noted that the final recommendations were presented to the Ad Hoc Committee on January 10, 2020.

Ms. Steward presented the recommendations made by the compensation consultant and staff and stated that the staff recommendations provided: 1) Written job descriptions to provide structure for recruitment and hiring; 2) Multiple job options to provide a flexible structure which could be customized to each office; and 3) A salary structure unique to Council Staff which promoted consistency in staff compensation. She noted that the staff recommendation included annual adjustment of the pay ranges based on a Council approved Cost of Living Adjustment (CoLA). She stated that on January 30, 2020, the City Council would consider the following modifications to the FY 2020 Budget Ordinance: 1) Adopt the staff-recommended City Council Staff pay ranges; 2) Increase the cap on an individual's salary to match the maximum for the Chief of Staff pay range; and 3) Add \$79,116 to each Council Office's Budget. She noted that upon approval by the City Council, the recommendations would be implemented on February 1, 2020.

Mayor Nirenberg stated that he respected the decisions of his colleagues and how they structure their offices. He noted that there was still more work to be accomplished regarding benefits and total compensation.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia expressed support for the final recommendations made and thanked everyone for their work.

Councilmember Viagran recommended that the required education for a Constituent Services Representative II be changed to high school diploma/GED, or an Associate Degree, or some college. Ms. Steward noted that a substitution ratio was recommended for all jobs and a lot of flexibility was included in the requirements.

Councilmember Cabello Havrda asked if the Ad Hoc Committee would continue to meet regarding total compensation for Council Aides such as healthcare, retirement, etc. Ms. Steward replied that the Ad Hoc Committee would continue to meet.

Councilmember Perry asked if staff benchmarked with other cities. Ms. Steward replied that staff surveyed other cities but the information was not useful because it demonstrated how different all of the organizations were.

Councilmember Treviño asked if the individual pay cap and the number of allotted Full-Time Employees (FTEs) could be removed or raised. Ms. Steward replied that there was no recommendation at this time to change the number of FTEs but it could be revised later. Erik Walsh stated that the individual pay cap would be adjusted and would be included in the Ordinance presented for consideration on January 30, 2020.

Councilmember Peláez asked if there was a reason why Council Staff shouldn't get the same benefits as City Staff. Ms. Steward replied that staff intends to work with the Ad Hoc Committee to explore that issue.

Councilmember Gonzales stated that Councilmembers could use discretion to utilize their Budgets effectively and as transparently as possible.

Councilmember Sandoval recommended that at a minimum, full time Council Staff should be paid a living wage. She asked of the Budget amount was for Council Office salaries. Justina Tate stated that the FY 2020 Budget for Council Office salaries was \$375,760. Councilmember Sandoval asked of the existing benefits. Ms. Tate stated that the Budget also included funding for payroll taxes, health, parking, IRA match, tuition allowance, and vehicle allowance. Councilmember Sandoval requested a breakdown of each line item which would increase in the Budget. She added that she did not support a salary cap.

Councilmember Courage spoke of the need to address benefits for Council Staff. He recommended that the word "required" be changed to "recommended" regarding the requirements.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mayor Nirenberg recessed the meeting at 4:54 pm to discuss the following items:

- A. Economic development negotiations pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.087 (economic development).

- B. The purchase, exchange, lease or value of real property pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.072 (real property).
- C. Legal issues related to collective bargaining pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney).
- D. Legal issues related to litigation involving the City pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney).
- E. Legal issues related to interpretation of contract language pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney).
- F. Discuss legal options pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney)
- G. Deliberate the appointment, evaluation, and duties of Municipal Court Judges and discuss related legal issues pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.074 (personnel matters) and Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney).
- H. Deliberate the appointment, evaluation and duties of public officers and discuss legal issues pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.074 (personnel matters) and Texas Government Code Section 551.071 (consultation with attorney)

Mayor Nirenberg reconvened the meeting at 5:32 pm and announced that no action was taken.

CEREMONIALS

PRESENTATION: Mayor's Light Up Downtown Awards

The Mayor's 6th Annual "Light Up Downtown" Holiday Lights Contest Winners were recognized. Businesses in the downtown area competed for the best and brightest holiday lights display during the holiday season. The goal of the contest was to create an illuminated view of the downtown skyline and showcase the heart of the city to locals and visitors for a unique holiday experience.

CERTIFICATE: 40th Anniversary of North Star Boots

January 16, 2020, marks 40 years of the creation of the North Star Mall Boots. Artist Bob "Daddy-O" Wade created the Texas-themed sculpture to be featured in an empty lot just a few blocks from the White House. Shortly after the creation, a bidding war ensued, and the owners of North Star mall purchased the iconic structure for a whopping \$20,000. The boots have been used in commercials, garnered state and national attention, and been used as the subject of a master's thesis. Guinness Book confirmed the landmark as the "World's Largest Cowboy Boots" sculpture in 2016. Each boot can hold upwards of 300,000 gallons of beer, just in case anyone was inclined to fill them. Wade passed away on December 23, 2019, but his larger than life-size art will continue to be enjoyed for many years to come.

PROCLAMATION: Martin Luther King, Jr. March

The San Antonio MLK Commission hosted the Annual Martin Luther King, Jr. March on Monday, January 20, 2020. The three-mile journey began at 10:00 am at the MLK Freedom Bridge (3500 MLK Drive) and ended at Pittman-Sullivan Park (1101 Iowa Street). The Alamo City is host to one of the largest marches in the United States which celebrates the accomplishments and legacy of Dr. King. A commemorative program was held in the park immediately following the march, along with other activities and food trucks. The MLK Commission scheduled other events and activities throughout the month of January paying tribute to Dr. King.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Nazirite Ruben Flores Perez stated that the Governor would not admit Refugees and has requested Federal funds to keep them out. He noted that there are big problems in Persia with Refugees coming from Africa and Persia.

Sebastian Garcia stated that students were working on a project regarding the elimination of plastic bags. She noted that other cities have banned them and the students would like San Antonio to do the same. She added that micro plastics were bad for the environment and were contaminating us and stores could give credit to people bringing reusable bags.

Rose Hill stated that she has an issue with City allowing two or more neighborhood associations to represent the same area. She noted that this would cause chaos in the districts.

Sylvia Alaniz stated that she was opposed to having multiple neighborhood associations in the same area. She spoke on behalf of Maria De la Garza, another neighborhood association president, who also opposes multiple neighborhood associations in the same area.

Southwest Workers Union asked the City Council to prohibit use of City facilities for the Border Security Expo scheduled at the Convention Center on March 11-13, 2020.

Greg Harman stated that the City made the decision to destroy the bird habitat at Elmendorf Lake Park without talking to the public. He noted that healthy ecosystems were needed and he requested a moratorium on bird harassment.

Steve Versteeg stated that he had a zoning issue in Government Hill and noted that he opposes change to commercial zoning in Government Hill. He added that individuals were afraid to speak before City Council.

ADJOURNED

There being no further discussion, Mayor Nirenberg adjourned the meeting at 6:40 pm.

APPROVED

RON NIRENBERG
MAYOR

Attest:

LETICIA M. VACEK TRMC/CMC/MMC
City Clerk