

**COMMUNITY HEALTH AND EQUITY
COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETING
JANUARY 28, 2021 2:00PM
VIDEOCONFERENCE**

Members Present:	Councilmember Ana Sandoval, Chair, <i>District 7</i> Councilmember Roberto Treviño, <i>District 1</i> Councilmember Jada Andrews-Sullivan, <i>District 2</i> Councilmember Rebecca Viagran, <i>District 3</i> Councilmember Shirley Gonzales, <i>District 5</i>
Staff Present:	David McCary, <i>Assistant City Manager</i> ; Chris Hebner, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Monica Hernandez, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Douglas Melnick, <i>Director, Office of Sustainability</i> ; Dr. Anita Kurian, <i>Assistant Director, Metro Health</i> ; Jeff Coyle, <i>Director, Government & Public Affairs</i> ; Julia Murphy, <i>AICP Deputy Chief Sustainability Officer</i> ; Laura Mayes, <i>Assistant Director, Government & Public Affairs</i> ; Berta Rodriguez, <i>Census Administrator, Government & Public Affairs</i> ; Sonia Gonzales, <i>Marketing Manager, Metro Health</i> ; Nancy Cano, <i>Office of the City Clerk</i>
Others Present:	Adrienne Mendoza, <i>Vice President of Operations, South Texas Blood & Tissue Center</i> ; Molly Cox, <i>President & CEO, SA2020</i> ; Kiran Kaur Bains, <i>Director of Community Impact, SA2020</i> ; Ashley Landers, <i>Vice President Client Services, Texas Creative</i> ; Marcie Trevino Ripper, <i>Partner, Bell Ripper PLLC</i>

Call to order

Chairwoman Sandoval called the meeting to order.

POINT OF PERSONAL PRIVILEGE

Chairwoman Sandoval introduced Adrian Mendoza, Vice President of Operations, South Texas Blood & Tissue Center. Ms. Mendoza thanked everyone who participated in the San Antonio City Council District Challenge Blood Drive and reported that Council Districts 4, 7 and 9 were the three top contenders. She stated that Council District 7 was able to contribute 51 of the 250 blood products collected for that week and was the winner of the challenge. Chairwoman Sandoval noted that all the Council Districts together gathered 278 units of blood which was enough to save the lives of 834 people, with 71 first time donors participating.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Dr. Meredith McQuire stated that it was very important to move quickly to change the City’s greenhouse gases and air trajectory as greenhouse gases created air pollution, damaging residents’ health, and caused premature deaths. She emphasized that the faster the main sources of greenhouse-gases could be stopped was for the better, especially CPS Energy’s use of fossil fuels. She thanked Mayor Nirenberg for the creation of the CPS Energy Rate Advisory Committee to receive community input about the rate of reduction of greenhouse gases in proposed energy efficient homes and businesses which was important. She stated that CPS Energy’s current rate structure must change and highlighted that CPS Energy’s use of fixed charges disproportionately harmed low income households and small businesses that tried to conserve electricity.

Dr. Lyssa Ochoa stated that a COVID-19 vaccine hub was established on the Southside and noted that a City/County vaccine distribution plan was needed. She noted that many vulnerable populations did not have nearby access to vaccines nor means of transportation to travel to larger vaccine hubs and another goal would

be to enable smaller, local vaccine hubs through private medical clinics located within the Southside, Westside, and Eastside communities. She stated that a letter was drafted by local physicians that called for smaller, localized vaccine hubs for the targeted local communities. She called for the support of City and County Officials for the physicians to present their letter to the State.

1. Approval of the meeting minutes for the December 11, 2020 Community Health and Equity Committee Meeting.

Councilmember Viagran moved to approve the minutes for the December 11, 2020 Community Health and Equity Council Committee meeting. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

2. A briefing on providing updates regarding public participation analysis with SA2020. [Carlos Contreras, Assistant City Manager; Jeff Coyle, Director, Government & Public Affairs]

Jeff Coyle reported that the Government and Public Affairs (GPA) Department contracted with SA2020 to facilitate a review of public participation practices across the organization. He stated that SA2020 conducted an initial analysis of the City's public engagement efforts which included a survey issued by SA2020 to City staff, inclusive of executives and staff who conducted outreach activities, Mayor Nirenberg, and Council District offices.

Kiran Kaur Bains stated that civic engagement was the foundation of the City's shared community vision in order to achieve a vision of prosperity for San Antonio's diverse, vibrant and historic community. She stated that shared responsibility across City Departments and City Council required a comprehensive strategy that complemented the City's administrative directive with specific goals and performance metrics. She added that an understanding the different levels of community engagement was required and included two-way, public participation over multiple interactions. She noted that the capacity of the departments and internal coordination across departments were key and best practices utilized needed to be shared across the organization. She highlighted that accountability was the key final finding and that wrapping the administrative directive with a comprehensive strategy, performance metrics, and specific goals would align best public participation practices across the organization.

Molly Cox provided an assessment of the key survey findings. She stated that participants included 32 Council District staff from each Council District, 50 Executives from 27 departments (73%), and 43 City employees (non-executives) from 14 departments (38%). She reported that the key findings indicated that a majority 66% knew the City's mission and understood their own role in strengthening meaningful public engagement which increased to 88% for City Council staff. She noted that 70% of all respondents knew the purpose behind every single public engagement, process, project or plan, but the number declined when respondents were asked how success was measured. She added that 27% of the respondents stated that the City's COVID-19 outreach and engagement strategy was the most successful and noted that 1.2% of employees surveyed did not share demographic data which highlighted the importance of meaningful public engagement and participation. She indicated that the 125-person survey found that more time, capacity, skills and resource components were needed to properly implement and elevate strengthened levels of the public engagement strategy. She added that the survey identified the purpose of the 50-member focus groups that would be formed in February 2021 to create and prioritize tactics among community members with expertise in leading public engagement and who collectively represented San Antonio by race, gender, age, and Council District.

Chairwoman Sandoval referenced the concept of shared responsibility and ask how City Departments could do so with public engagement. She noted that focus group outcomes revealed a snapshot in time and asked

of the longevity of the process. Ms. Cox stated that sharing feedback frequently was a comprehensive strategy that was not overarching and frequently exchanged information served as a reminder of goals, strategies, measures of success, and highlighted the relationship between accountability and learning. She added that SA2020 had partnered with the City for over a year on the process and would collaborate and share information beyond the scope of the contract.

Councilmember Treviño stated that Spanish translation was crucial for local public participation and asked how the City could ensure that all local residents felt included in the process. Mr. Coyle reported that all primary City Council materials, most public facing materials, meetings, and press conferences were translated which was a fundamental change from several years ago. He recognized Carlos Valenzuela for his collaboration with City Departments to lend guidance and assistance in the usage of messaging and imagery to reach and reinforce how Spanish language content was utilized and language accommodations were included in marketing team performance metrics.

Carlos Valenzuela reported that since he joined the City in 2017, he collaborated with GPA to implement a Spanish translation plan and incorporated interpreter services for City Council meetings and then with other departments in terms of translating documents and better message communication. He added that a customized webpage was created for Spanish speakers and was posted on the City's website. He noted that language interpretation was a work in process and the City updated its Spanish webpage regularly to further include integral items of information such as airport flight arrival and departure times.

Berta Rodriguez reported that from an external affairs position, it was important to understand how community organizations served the Spanish speaking population on a daily basis and that the City would collaborate with SA2020 to develop an equity lens component to reach that audience mindset.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan asked what measures were taken to communicate to those with literacy or developmental barriers. Ms. Cox reported that SA2020 used a 'leading by race approach' to all of their work to ensure that different identities or groups of people that had been historically left out of the process were included.

3. A briefing on the status of the implementation of the SA Climate Ready Climate Action and Adaptation Plan and update on the TXC Texas Creative, Ltd. agreement for the SA Climate Ready Public Engagement & Communications Initiative. [David McCary, Assistant City Manager; Douglas Melnick, Chief Sustainability Officer]

Douglas Melnick reported that The SA Climate Ready Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP) was approved by City Council on October 17, 2019 to meet the City's commitments to climate action as outlined in City Council's resolution of support for the Paris Climate Agreement on June 22, 2017. He stated that the CAAP identified 28 community, 13 municipal climate mitigation strategies and 45 adaptation strategies to set the target of net carbon neutrality by 2050. He added that President Biden entered the U.S. back into the Paris Climate Agreement on January 20, 2021 that would go into effect in 30 days and included a climate and Federal environmental justice agenda with a Federal investment of \$1.7 trillion over the next 10 years. He noted that the City's CAAP was recognized by the Texas American Planning Association in the category of *Resilience - Gold* and was recognized for the first time as one of only 80 cities recognized for disclosing its climate plan. He added that the City was a beneficiary of \$2 million annually through the American Cities Climate Challenge. He provided dashboard metrics on CAAP initiatives.

Mr. Melnick reported that the City entered into an agreement with the TXC Texas Creative, Ltd. (TC) Agreement for the SA Climate Ready Public Engagement & Communications Initiative to inform the community about the benefits of CAAP activities. He added that the initiative was reviewed and approved

by the Audit & Accountability Committee on April 30, 2020 and received City Council approval on June 11, 2020. He stated that TC would provide recommended improvements to ensure deep and wide community engagement with stakeholders and residents, as CAAP commitments required significant changes in operations, behavior and support from the community. He reported that the fiscal impact was \$195,000 with two, one-year renewal options at a cost of \$195,000 per term for a total compensation value not to exceed \$585,000, and sub-contracts totaling \$39,000.00 (20%) each year would be awarded to organizations experienced in working with communities that were traditionally underserved, considered “hard to reach,” and that would be most impacted by climate change. He added that the City’s campaign objectives would be aligned to support current City priorities, including emergency response and preparedness, essential worker support, and workforce development.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan moved to approve Item 3. Councilmember Treviño seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

4. A briefing providing updates on the City of San Antonio’s COVID-19 marketing and communications effort [Carlos Contreras, Assistant City Manager; Jeff Coyle, Director, Government & Public Affairs]

Jeff Coyle reported that GPA and Metro Health solicited bids in July 2020 from marketing agencies to develop and implement an integrated marketing and communications campaign targeted to specific audiences most impacted by COVID-19. He stated that three agencies provided bids and ultimately the Giant Noise San Antonio Office, in partnership with MM Creative and C2G Strategies, was selected and created the *What Will it Take?* Campaign that featured original songs from local musicians. He added that the campaign included direct mail, grassroots outreach, digital advertisement creation and placement, securing placement and support of digital influencers, and other market specific tactics to communicate COVID-19 prevention messaging to the target audiences, which included Hispanics, Blacks, millennials, and Generation Z.

Mr. Coyle reported that the return on investment was excellent for digital and social media advertising and yielded 3.6 million impressions over an 8-week period that engaged 1.7 million residents across the city and across all social channels. He stated that Facebook required the largest investment at a cost of \$40,000 which represented only 5%-10% of the total advertising budget. He noted that the Spanish ads on Facebook performed nearly as well as the ads in English and it was determined that bilingual ads were necessary for the success of this campaign. He added that grassroots campaign efforts delivered over 21,000 bilingual flyers across Council Districts 1-7, including local school districts, the Alamo College District, and UTSA. He noted that a digital toolkit was posted on the City’s website for distribution to schools, non-profits, and community organizations including Meals on Wheels, Boys and Girls Club, the Food Bank, the Pride Center, the Girl Scouts, and YWCA. He stated that GPA worked closely with Metro Health, CPS Energy, SAWS, many Chambers of Commerce and Communicare.

Mr. Coyle reported that GPA emailed community media toolkits to over 300 Homeowner and Neighborhood Associations, made targeted Next Door App posts in Council Districts 1-7, rotated music videos on TVSA, distributed email blasts to over 1,500 places of worship, and placed graphics on the Alamodome marquee and on digital kiosks. He stated that GPA leveraged its community relationships and worked closely with the Mexican Consulate for outreach to immigrants, undocumented community members and the Spanish speaking community. He added that 1,500 face masks were distributed to leaders across the city, a robust influencer program reached millennials through Instagram and TikTok that yielded over 180,000 impressions with other 9,000 people engaged on 20 static postings, and outreach to the LGBTQIA community was achieved through visits at 42 venues across the City.

Mr. Coyle reported that GPA proposed a campaign extension for a second phase that would be focused on COVID-19 vaccines and a contract would be presented to City Council for approval in mid-February 2021.

Councilmember Viagran concurred that a targeted approach as proposed by Dr. Ochoa was key and asked what the metrics of success would be for the City's COVID-19 Vaccination Plan. Mr. Coyle replied that the entire premise of the City's COVID-19 campaign was to reach the vulnerable audiences that were targeted in the original Health Transition Team Report. He acknowledged that a steady vaccination supply was needed so that residents could be encouraged to get vaccinated and the community to get to a safe point and noted that this was just the paid, marketing campaign and that the City had all other communication and education efforts in place through Metro Health and the Community Health Program Workers on the ground to supplement the underlying media campaign. Berta Rodriguez added that the easiest performance metrics to share were from digital messaging and that a lot of Spanish radio time was purchased through the GPA's traditional media program to air during peak "Novella" times and peak airtimes for construction worker audiences. She stated that she would deliver 5,000 flyers to a list of local Churches to be provided.

Chairwoman Sandoval requested detailed information on the advertising purchased. Mr. Coyle stated that he would provide the information.

Councilmember Treviño requested a briefing on a second drafting of campaign advertising prior to the forwarding of contract extensions to City Council for consideration. He requested further data for the return on investment per focus demographic. He requested UTM tracking, IP address monitoring, and geo fencing tracking. He asked if funds from the \$13.9 million COVID-19 Relief and Response Act appropriated to the City would be divested for the *What Will It Take?* Campaign. Mr. Coyle reported that Dr. Bridger and her team would present the Committee with a proposed plan for the disbursement of funds. He noted the challenges for the entire Phase 2 to be built out prior to the February 18, 2021 timeline for City Council consideration and recommended that Committee approval on the campaign content could take place thereafter. Ms. Rodriguez stated that the original campaign report and metric data would be provided to the Committee.

Adjourn

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:30 pm.

Ana Sandoval, Chair

Respectfully Submitted,

Nancy Cano, Office of the City Clerk